

Zuckerman, Elaine

Working Paper

Why engendering PRSPs reduces poverty, and the case of Rwanda

WIDER Discussion Paper, No. 2001/112

Provided in Cooperation with:

United Nations University (UNU), World Institute for Development Economics Research (WIDER)

Suggested Citation: Zuckerman, Elaine (2001) : Why engendering PRSPs reduces poverty, and the case of Rwanda, WIDER Discussion Paper, No. 2001/112, ISBN 9291900478, The United Nations University World Institute for Development Economics Research (UNU-WIDER), Helsinki

This Version is available at:

<https://hdl.handle.net/10419/52912>

Standard-Nutzungsbedingungen:

Die Dokumente auf EconStor dürfen zu eigenen wissenschaftlichen Zwecken und zum Privatgebrauch gespeichert und kopiert werden.

Sie dürfen die Dokumente nicht für öffentliche oder kommerzielle Zwecke vervielfältigen, öffentlich ausstellen, öffentlich zugänglich machen, vertreiben oder anderweitig nutzen.

Sofern die Verfasser die Dokumente unter Open-Content-Lizenzen (insbesondere CC-Lizenzen) zur Verfügung gestellt haben sollten, gelten abweichend von diesen Nutzungsbedingungen die in der dort genannten Lizenz gewährten Nutzungsrechte.

Terms of use:

Documents in EconStor may be saved and copied for your personal and scholarly purposes.

You are not to copy documents for public or commercial purposes, to exhibit the documents publicly, to make them publicly available on the internet, or to distribute or otherwise use the documents in public.

If the documents have been made available under an Open Content Licence (especially Creative Commons Licences), you may exercise further usage rights as specified in the indicated licence.



United Nations
University

WIDER

World Institute for Development Economics Research

Discussion Paper No. 2001/112

Why Engendering PRSPs Reduce Poverty, and the Case of Rwanda

Elaine Zuckerman *

October 2001

Abstract

To achieve the poverty reduction goal, HIPC countries need to mainstream gender considerations into their PRSPs (poverty reduction strategy papers). Mounting worldwide evidence that greater gender equality correlates with high economic growth and less poverty means that to succeed, poverty reduction strategies must invest in reducing gender disparities. An analysis of completed PRSPs demonstrates that so far the PRSP engendering track record has been disappointing. This paper discusses why PRSPs must address gender concerns, PRSP engendering track records, strategies and deliberate steps necessary to mainstream gender into PRSPs and Rwanda's attempts to produce a gender-sensitive PRSP.

Keywords: gender, gender equality, poverty, PRSPs, empowering women

JEL classification: D31, I32, J16, J22

Copyright © Author(s) 2001

* Gender Action (Washington, DC), ezuck@sprynet.com

This is a revised version of the paper originally prepared for the UNU/WIDER development conference on Debt Relief, Helsinki, 17-18 August 2001.

UNU/WIDER gratefully acknowledges the financial contribution from the governments of Denmark, Finland and Norway to the 2000-2001 Research Programme.

UNU World Institute for Development Economics Research (UNU/WIDER) was established by the United Nations University as its first research and training centre and started work in Helsinki, Finland in 1985. The purpose of the Institute is to undertake applied research and policy analysis on structural changes affecting the developing and transitional economies, to provide a forum for the advocacy of policies leading to robust, equitable and environmentally sustainable growth, and to promote capacity strengthening and training in the field of economic and social policy making. Its work is carried out by staff researchers and visiting scholars in Helsinki and through networks of collaborating scholars and institutions around the world.

UNU World Institute for Development Economics Research (UNU/WIDER)
Katajanokanlaituri 6 B, 00160 Helsinki, Finland

Camera-ready typescript prepared by Liisa Roponen at UNU/WIDER
Printed at UNU/WIDER, Helsinki

The views expressed in this publication are those of the author(s). Publication does not imply endorsement by the Institute or the United Nations University, nor by the programme/project sponsors, of any of the views expressed.

ISSN 1609-5774
ISBN 92-9190-046-X (printed publication)
ISBN 92-9190-047-8 (internet publication)

1 Introduction

To achieve the poverty reduction goal of the heavily indebted poor countries (HIPC) initiative, HIPC countries need to mainstream gender considerations into their poverty reduction strategy papers (PRSPs). Mounting evidence that greater gender equality correlates with higher economic growth and less poverty means that to succeed, poverty reduction strategies must pay serious attention to reducing gender disparities (World Bank 2001a).¹ However, to date PRSPs have hardly mainstreamed gender concerns and the PRSP track record indicates that good intentions to engender PRSPs are insufficient. Only deliberate steps to engender PRSPs will translate good intentions into gender-equal policies and interventions, which contribute to poverty reduction. Failure to engender PRSPs does not merely reinforce the gender-unequal status quo, but entrenches it further, as projects benefit males more than females and development is perceived as a process which does not have to alter unequal gender relations.

This paper explains:

- Why PRSPs must address gender concerns, based on compelling evidence correlating greater poverty reduction and economic growth with greater gender equality;
- Which strategies can best engender PRSPs;
- How attempts to engender IPRSP and PRSPs have not been successful; and
- What steps Rwanda is taking to produce an engendered PRSP.

This paper does not address the controversial questions of whether the HIPC and PRSP initiatives are well designed and are likely to make a difference in reducing debt and poverty.² Rather, the starting point of this paper is that since PRSPs are being prepared, they must mainstream gender considerations in order enhance the likelihood that poverty reduction strategies will succeed.

Box 1
Gender and gender equality

Gender: Gender is a social category that establishes one's life chances and shapes one's participation in society and in the economy, as do race, ethnicity and class. Some societies do not experience racial or ethnic divides but all societies experience gender asymmetries to varying degrees.

Gender equality: Gender equality refers to equality under the law, equality of opportunity, including of rewards for work and in access to human, financial and other productive resources that enable opportunity and equality of voice to influence and contribute to the development process.

Source: World Bank (2001a).

¹ Definitions of gender and gender equality can be found in Box 1.

² Critiques of HIPC and PRSP initiatives are raised in subsection 3.2. Detailed critiques can be found in CRS (2001); Jubilee South (2001); Marshall (2001); and Mbilinyi (2001). In addition, several other WIDER discussion papers (at www.wider.unu.edu/conference/conference-2001-2/conference-2001-2.htm) question the potential effectiveness and legitimacy of PRSPs.

2 Why engendering PRSPs matters

Although women and men share many of the burdens of poverty, they frequently experience poverty differently, have different poverty reduction priorities and are affected differently by development interventions. These gender differences are insufficiently captured in conventional poverty analyses, designs and monitoring systems. This deficiency weakens the chances of success of poverty reduction interventions. Addressing the gender dimensions of poverty and creating gender responsive interventions will enhance the likelihood of success of poverty reduction strategy efforts (Bamberger *et al.* 2001).

Recent research compellingly correlates greater gender equality with greater poverty reduction and economic growth. The latest World Bank annual flagship Policy Research Report, *Engendering Development*, presents extensive evidence to demonstrate these linkages (World Bank 2001a). Through analysing micro, country, and cross-country gender-differentiated data and reviewing empirical work from several social science disciplines, *Engendering Development* concludes that although women's status has improved in most countries in the last half century, gender disparities persist everywhere and remain most acute in the poorest countries. Across and within countries, gender disparities in education, mortality rates, health and other social and economic indicators are greatest within poorer income groups. Gender inequalities impose large costs on the well-being and health of the poor, diminishing productivity and the potential to reduce poverty and ensure economic growth. In most societies women have more limited opportunities to improve economic conditions and to access services than do men.

To substantiate the arguments that gender inequality is costly to development and that HIPC countries must mainstream gender considerations into their PRSPs to reduce poverty, the remainder of this section presents select sectoral and thematic examples. The examples are drawn mostly from Africa, where 18 of the 22 HIPC countries are located and they represent common PRSP sectors and themes.

2.1 Agriculture

Women are significantly more active in African agriculture than are men. Women comprise over 70 per cent of total African agricultural labour and up to 90 per cent of the labour engaged in food production (Blackden and Bhanu 1999). But men have much greater access to farm inputs and earn much more farm income than do women. Blackden and Bhanu estimate that more equal control of inputs and farm income by female and male farmers in countries such as Burkina Faso, Cameroon and Kenya could raise farm yields by as much as a fifth of current output.

PRSPs need to analyse men's and women's structural roles in agriculture, their respective control of agricultural resources and promote women's access to and control of farming inputs and income. They need to ensure that agricultural research and extension institutions recognize and respond to gender-differentiated roles. This might alter research priorities that are identified and pursued, the selection and development of agricultural technologies, the prioritization of crops and tasks, and the extension messages that are developed and delivered. As gender experts have long advocated, the tiny proportion of African female extension agents needs to be vastly increased in

countries where customs dictate that male extension agents cannot easily mingle with women farmers. PRSPs could create monitoring indicators on the proportions of males and females controlling production, the amount of income each garners, and the proportion of agricultural extension agents by gender.

2.2 Credit

Because microcredit programmes targeted to poor women have gained deserved fame, it might appear that women's access to credit is more substantial than the reality suggests. In African countries, women still receive less than 10 per cent of all credit reaching small farmers and only 1 per cent of the total credit reaching the agricultural sector (Blackden and Bhanu 1999). When females access credit, average loan sizes are smaller than those loaned to males. PRSPs should promote expanding poor women's access to microcredit and create a monitoring indicator on the proportion of credit loaned to men and women. Monitoring should continue until accessing credit is no longer gender-discriminatory.

2.3 Social capital

Compared to men, women generally have more limited social and business networks of the type that facilitate access to financial services and income (Bamberger *et al.* 2001). PRSPs could promote mentoring programmes and public-private partnerships to support the establishment of networks involving women.

2.4 Time burden

Women worldwide are subject to heavier time burdens than are men due to simultaneous productive, reproductive and community roles. Women's multiple roles limit their flexibility and ability to benefit from poverty reduction strategy interventions, unless women are especially targeted. Even where women have equal education and experience as do men, their heavier domestic work burden reduces their opportunities for economic participation and they continue to earn less than men in the labour market. The combination of visible paid work time and invisible unpaid work time results in women being overworked. The more limited capacity of women than of men to reallocate their time to shifts in labour market incentives has to be seen within the context of multiple and continuous demands on their time.

In HIPC countries, women's heavier time burden is especially onerous. 'Time—women's time in particular—can be the scarce production factor in a development process' (Bamberger *et al.* 2001). For example, time-use pattern studies reveal that:

- In Uganda, women work 12-18 hours per day and men 8-10 hours per day;
- In Kenya, women work 50 per cent more hours than do men on agricultural tasks; and
- In Tanzania, women have two hours leisure per day while men have 4.5 hours leisure per day.

2.5 Time costs on children

Time allocation data reveal that children are closely integrated into household production systems. Poor households need their children's labour, sometimes in ways that also disadvantage boys, but more often it is girls who are disadvantaged. While girls perform essential household tasks like carrying water, agricultural production, and other economic tasks, boys usually go to school. Domestic chores, notably fetching water, are a major factor limiting girls' access to schooling. African girls spend four times more hours on productive tasks than do boys (Blackden 2001).

PRSPs need to address women's and children's onerous time burden. They need to design interventions to expand women's time for income-earning activities and leisure, and children's opportunities to attend school and obtain better long-term income-earning opportunities.

2.6 Technology

A major reason for poor women's and children's excessive time burden in HIPC countries is the almost total absence of basic technology in rural areas. For example:

- Few African rural households have access to piped water. Women and girls walk several hours per day to fetch (usually contaminated) water;
- Women collect firewood regularly, often three or four times a week, in some cases daily. These trips can take several hours;
- Low-efficiency cooking stoves aggravate the need for frequent trips to collect fuelwood;
- Almost all domestic transport tasks are performed by women in Africa (Malmberg Calvo 1994). But women lack access to basic transport technology—to bicycles, wheelbarrows and pull-carts. Men frequently do have access to such vehicles although their carrying burden is much smaller than women's. In Zambia, 96 per cent of domestic travel time is attributed to women, only 1 per cent to men and 3 per cent to children. In Tanzania, 80 per cent of domestic travel time is attributed to women, only 6 per cent to men and 14 per cent to children. Women's lack of transport technology makes their carrying tasks arduous and extremely time-consuming. African women carry most domestic loads, usually on their heads, while walking;
- Limited availability or affordability of simple hand grinders or shellers makes manual food processing, especially of hard grains such as maize and rice, another time-consuming chore for women and female children.

PRSPs should give the highest priority to targeting appropriate technology to women and children to reduce their time-burden and weight loads, including improved access to means of transport for carrying wood and water and labour-saving technologies for household tasks. PRSPs also need to promote greater gender balance in domestic work and ensure school-aged children attend school.

2.7 Structural adjustment

Poor men and women suffer the consequences of structural changes differently, for example, when they lose their traditional sources of livelihood or migrate to inhospitable cities or mines in search of new employment (Bamberger *et al.* 2001). Structural transformation of economies, demographic changes and informalization, redefine working conditions for both women and men and modify gender roles in the labour market. Women tend to be more vulnerable, finding themselves in the least-protected sectors of the economy, often the first to be laid off and the last to be hired because of cultural norms valuing men as the main breadearners. With the growth of female-headed households due to migration, divorce, and abandonment, the insecurity of women's employment more directly affects children and other dependants.

When men are made redundant during structural changes and no longer are able to make an important economic contribution to the household budget, their frustration and depression often results in family conflicts and domestic violence (Hahn 1999). Although domestic violence is a leading cause of injury and death to women worldwide, many states ignore or even condone it on the grounds that it is a private matter (Shrader 2000).

PRSPs must analyse the different impacts of structural adjustment measures on men and women and design gender-responsive programmes to protect all family members.

2.8 Education

African women have experienced the lowest average annual growth in total years of schooling between 1969 and 1990 of all regions. Their years of schooling have risen over this period by a mere average 1.2 years (Blackden and Bhanu 1999). Gender disparities in education increase acutely at successively higher levels of schooling. These disparities are a drag on economic growth and poverty reduction. It is estimated that had Sub-Saharan African countries closed the education gender gap at the rate achieved by East Asia from 1960 to 1992, their income per capita could have grown by more than 0.5 per cent higher per year, a substantial increase over actual growth rates (Klasen 1999). A worldwide analysis concluded that if the share of women in secondary schooling increases by one per cent, per capita income increases by 0.3 per cent (Dollar and Gatti 1999).

Many studies demonstrate that better educated women contribute to the welfare of the next generation by reducing infant and child mortality, lowering fertility, and improving the nutritional status of children (Hill and King 1995; Klasen 1999; Smith and Haddad 1999). Both better educated women and men command higher earnings. Although women's earnings remain lower than men's, women invest more in their children (Birdsall and Sabot 1991). To attain their poverty reduction and growth objectives, poverty reduction strategies must prioritize reducing gender gaps in education.

2.9 Health

Although women have different health needs and priorities than do men including distinct reproductive health and HIV/AIDS prevention needs, health services often are not as accessible to them. This is seen in the enormous gender differential in Africa's

sexual and reproductive burden of disease. For example, data for Uganda indicate that the AIDS incidence is six times greater among young girls aged 15-19 compared with boys of the same age (Bamberger *et al.* 2001). PRSPs should target health interventions according to gender needs.

2.10 Voice and empowerment

With few exceptions, poor women, even more than poor men, do not participate in decision-making on matters that directly affect their lives, whether these relate to public institutions, civil society organizations, or the household. Gender inequity and powerlessness are learned from early childhood around the world. Women lack power to influence resource allocation and investment decisions in the home, community and nation. Although the need for beneficiary consultations is now widely acknowledged and is a required process in every PRSP preparation, experience demonstrates that socially and economically weak and voiceless groups are frequently marginalized or excluded in the consultation process.³ In societies where community councils and local political bodies are largely run by men, or where men are considered to speak for the whole family, often women are voiceless in development projects. For example, social funds are frequently praised for their community demand-driven project selection. However, in many countries, women hardly participate in the community meetings selecting social fund projects (Zuckerman 1998). Focus group interviews with women make clear that the opinions of men rarely represent the interests of all household members. PRSP consultations need to take measures to ensure women's and men's voices are heard equally.

2.11 Rights

In numerous countries, women lack rights to own land, manage property, conduct business or even travel without their husband's consent. Although legislation granting women these rights is a critical step forward, often such legislation is not implemented because of insufficient information dissemination and persistent social discrimination against women based on entrenched customs (Gopal and Salim 1998). Men often resist losing their old privileges and women often remain ignorant about their new rights (Zuckerman 2000a). Since inequalities in gender rights weaken a country's governance (World Bank 2001a), PRSPs need to include measures, including information campaigns, to promote gender-equal laws.

2.12 Poverty

The essence of the PRSP analysis concerns poverty. Poverty is multidimensional, encompassing all the issues raised above and many more. Traditional poverty analyses rarely acknowledge that different household members experience poverty's many aspects differently. For example, the Rwandan IPRSP analysed the poor, the poorest, poor people, poorer families, poor households, people, vulnerable/disadvantaged/at-risk groups, households, communities, the population, rural households, rural producers,

³ See subsection 3.2.

farmers' groups, traders, Rwandese, etc., but very rarely poor women and men, girls and boys.

Typically, poverty analyses use generic household consumption and welfare data, which do not disaggregate intra-household income and resource distribution. Household level poverty analysis is based on the false assumption that households pool income and allocate resources for consumption, production and investment equitably. In many countries intra-household distribution is unequal but traditional survey data do not reveal if men or women and girls or boys receive more or less access to education, nutrition, health care and other needs. Average household or average per capita estimates of consumption and expenditure often underestimate poverty among certain household members, particularly women and girls. Some household members suffer deprivation within households with average per capita incomes above the poverty line.

Some poverty analyses do not even examine the generic household. For example, Chinese poverty data are usually collected down to the county level, rarely down to the household level and hardly within the household where the most meaningful sex-disaggregated individual data would exist. Thus, several recent World Bank China rural poverty studies analyse poverty down to the county level without analysing the differential effects of poverty on male and female household members. As a result, these poverty studies fail to acknowledge the feminization of poverty in poor areas, burgeoning trafficking in poor rural women, and soaring suicide rates among them (Zuckerman 2000a).

PRSPs should carefully analyse sex-disaggregated data to distinguish how poverty and its component elements affect men and women and boys and girls differently. Sex-disaggregated poverty data analysis is an essential foundation for gender analysis and for targeting the poor to reduce poverty. The next section argues that these data are usually available but are not analysed. An example portraying lack of analysis of existing sex-disaggregated data is presented in the section below on the Rwanda case.

2.13 National budgets

PRSPs contain national budget or 'costing' data for priority interventions. In determining PRSP budgets, it is important to ensure that (i) both women and men are involved in the budget development process; and (ii) resources are allocated for priority investments that respond to the needs of both women and men. To achieve these goals, increasing numbers of countries are undertaking gender budgeting exercises (Esim 1999; Budlander 2000). PRSPs should incorporate gender budget analyses to achieve their goals.

3 Strategies for engendering PRSPs

The main tool available for demonstrating how poverty affects men and women differently is gender analysis and it is suitable for PRSPs. Gender analysis examines the access and control that men and women have over resources. This includes analysing the sexual division of labour and the control women and men have over labour inputs, and outputs or benefits. Gender analysis also refers to systematically determining men's and women's differing development needs and preferences, and the different impacts of

development on women and men. Ideally, it takes into account how class, race, ethnicity, or other factors interact with gender to produce discriminatory results (Bamberger *et al.* 2001).

PRSPs can use a range of data collection methods to address the gender dimensions of poverty. No single method can cover all of the issues, and it is important to combine quantitative and qualitative methods. Conventional poverty research and analysis tools can address most gender issues. Sex-disaggregated data can be collected through standard data collection methods including household and labour market surveys, focus groups, direct observation, clinic records, anthropometric studies, time-use records and diaries.

Table 1
Data collection methods for a gender-sensitive PRSP

Method type	Method	Comments
Quantitative	Household surveys	Can include sex-disaggregated questions at no cost. However, applying sub-modules to individual household members increases interview time and often requires a second visit.
	Attitude surveys	Measures men's and women's attitudes toward gender roles, behaviour, access to services etc. Useful for prioritizing needs by gender. An attitude survey can be integrated into a household survey or can be collected separately.
	Willingness and capacity to pay	Measures men's and women's willingness and capacity to pay for services. Frequently a component of household surveys or can be an independent questionnaire.
	Time-use studies	Estimates the time women and men spend collecting water and fuel, travelling to work, performing domestic activities and other unpaid and paid productive activities. Time-use studies can be included in household surveys or can be conducted independently but should be combined with focus group consultations.
Qualitative	Stakeholder analysis	Consists of individual or group interviews.
	Institutional analysis	Evaluates the efficiency and client-friendliness of the main public- and private-sector institutions providing services to the poor. Focus group and household survey data should be combined with institutional analyses.
	Focus groups and community fora	Seeks the opinions of community groups on their problems and priority needs, and their experience with interventions.
	Participatory poverty assessments (PPA), participatory rural appraisals (PRA) and other participatory consultations	Tries to understand the world of the poor by listening to their concerns and priorities rather than by asking them to respond to a set of survey questions prepared by outsiders. To capture gender differences, in many cultures it is important to listen to men and women in separate settings.
	Photos and videos	Can provide a powerful complement to written reports to effectively document physical and economic changes over time.

Source: Bamberger *et al.* (2001).

All data collection methods, whether quantitative or qualitative, participatory or non-participatory, can be gender-sensitive. When gender issues are not addressed in poverty analyses, this is likely more due to lack of awareness of the importance of gender than to limitations in data collection methods. Absence of gender analysis tends to signify a lack of knowledge or recognition by policymakers and planners of the importance of gender as a key development issue.

To facilitate obtaining robust short-term data, data collectors must include trained women surveyors and facilitators. Recommended data collection methods for a gender-sensitive PRSP are listed in Table 1.⁴

Sex-disaggregated data collection might incur additional costs but will enhance understanding of the needs and attitudes of all stakeholders, some of whom are not heard using conventional techniques, and will sharpen the ability to target the poor. If special household survey modules are relatively short, and if women and other household members can be interviewed immediately following the survey, the additional cost may be quite small.

Sometimes, gender-relevant questions are included in household surveys but the information is not collected from the right person or in the right way (Bamberger 2001). Often, information about needs, attitudes, time-use or consumption patterns of all household members is obtained from a single interview—usually with the male ‘household head’ or other male. He may not have full information, or may claim that all household members have the same opinion or priorities as himself. Men often underestimate, or under-value the multiple tasks which women undertake, and consequently put a low value on projects needed to save time and energy. Frequently, when women are asked about sensitive topics in the presence of other household members, they are unlikely to reveal much information. Thus, interviewing women and men separately can sharpen poverty analyses. Logistically, it is often difficult for women to flexibly attend focus group and participatory consultations and they may not be permitted to participate with men in meetings in many cultures. Thus, PRSPs should organize special sessions designed to accommodate women’s needs.

In many countries, sex-disaggregated data have been collected in surveys and other socio-economic studies but have not been analysed. As discussed below, this is the case in Rwanda. Therefore, all poverty analyses should evaluate the existence and quality of sex-disaggregated data before commissioning new surveys.

After collecting sex-disaggregated quantitative and qualitative data, the next step is to identify the practices causing observed gender differentials. This entails analysing the kinds of issues raised in the previous section, for example, time-use differentials in men’s and women’s remunerated and non-remunerated labour.

PRSPs also must include gender-disaggregated monitoring and evaluation indicators to assess outcomes and impacts of policies and interventions by gender and to determine the extent to which improvements in gender outcomes are due to specific interventions. Gender considerations tend to be absent or minimal in traditional monitoring and evaluation. Special efforts are needed to determine how PRSP interventions are

⁴ Table 1 is an adapted summary of Table 5 in Bamberger *et al.* (2001).

perceived by male and female end users (Bamberger *et al.* 2001). Indicators need to be developed to monitor:

- Economic roles that men and women play, their distribution across productive sectors, and their remuneration;
- Time allocation data highlighting the ‘double workday’ of women and resulting trade-offs affecting their income-earning opportunities;
- Gender inequalities in access to and control of human, financial, and social assets; and
- The extent to which poor women and men have a voice in decision-making and in the poverty reduction strategy process.

Monitoring is a continuous process, which tracks changes in results over time and across groups. PRSP monitoring involves tracking progress in achieving PRSP goals, for example, reductions in infant and maternal deaths, improvements in literacy rates and the nutritional status of children, expanded access to credit and reduction in the incidence of poverty. Since measuring and tracking the gender outcomes and impacts of all PRSP policy and priority interventions could be time-consuming and expensive, it is more practical to monitor select objectives with strong gender implications determined by the gender analysis.

3.1 PRSP engendering

Although PRSPs are supposed to be ‘country-owned’, the World Bank has offered technical assistance to HIPC country officials preparing PRSPs.⁵ This technical assistance has included verbal advice and written guidelines in the form of the PRSP Sourcebook (World Bank 2001b). Over the last two years, Bank sector and cross-sector teams including senior managers and staff have worked intensively to produce the Sourcebook which was sent in hard copy to all HIPC countries and also is posted and updated on the Internet.

To ensure the PRSP Sourcebook addresses gender issues, the Bank’s gender division (PRMGE) reviewed draft chapters and provided suggestions on how to engender them. PRMGE also contributed a cross-cutting chapter, ‘Integrating Gender into Poverty Reduction Strategies’ (Bamberger *et al.* 2001; World Bank 2001b). It underlines that mainstreaming gender in PRSPs is essential to achieve poverty reduction targets. PRMGE also sent gender resource people to a Bank-Fund co-sponsored PRSP workshop for HIPC country officials in 2000. The gender resource people ensured each session integrated gender issues. Overall, the Bank has invested heavily in staff time in an effort to influence PRSP content including trying to ensure it is engendered.

3.2 So far, to what extent have PRSPs been engendered?

To date, the payoff of this World Bank investment has not been great. Overall, PRSPs have neither mainstreamed gender nor contained significant gender content. A reason

⁵ Civil society views challenging the extent to which PRSPs are country-owned can be found in Jubilee South (2001); Marshall (2001); and Mbilinyi (2001) and at www.challengeglobalization.org.

for this neglect of gender in PRSPs has been insufficient participatory consultations with women's and other civil society groups. PRSPs are supposed to be based on wide participatory consultations with citizens but lack of genuine civil society participation in the preparation of virtually all PRSPs has been a major problem (Jubilee South 2001; Marshall 2001; Mbilinyi 2001). Examples from Bolivia and Tanzania demonstrate this weakness.

Bolivian civil society groups complained that they had insufficient opportunity to participate in the PRSP consultative and drafting processes; that they lacked a voice in deciding who would participate in the consultations; that a meeting the government organized to solicit civil society comments on the draft PRSP was limited to a small circle of capital-based civil society groups; that the PRSP was drafted by a government technical team with little transparency and responsiveness to inputs requested by civil society groups; that the government posted the draft PRSP on the Internet to solicit popular feedback, insensitive to the fact that the vast majority of Bolivians lack access to the Internet; that the PRSP was not distributed to civil society groups who received a copy from a European government; and that therefore international donors had access to the PRSP before Bolivian citizens did, contradicting the principle of national PRSP ownership (Catholic Relief Services 2001).

Tanzanian civil society organizations, including women's groups, complained that PRSP participatory consultations were limited. In the rush to produce the PRSP, the government sent last-minute invitations to women's groups for consultations and failed to distribute background documents. Thus, women's groups lacked sufficient time and background materials to contribute meaningfully to the consultative process and to organize transport and babysitters in order to attend meetings. Civil society organizations felt participation was token since the government invited only a few select civil society groups to the table. They complained that participation felt like 'consultative workshopping' rather than a process of genuine participation by grassroots groups. They raised concern that gender mainstreaming would possibly become another form of cooptation of women's groups into structural adjustment reforms since PRSPs are similar to their structural adjustment programme forerunners in HIPC countries (Mbilinyi 2001).

Reviewing existing IPRSPs and PRSPs indicates that so far the PRSP engendering track record has been disappointing. As Table 2 suggests, none of four PRSPs completed by May 2001 contain much gender analysis or mainstream gender. They all discuss the generic poor, grassroots population, citizens' participation, etc. but they do not distinguish men's and women's needs or target interventions to men and women as needed.

The World Bank Gender Division (PRMGE) analysed the extent to which gender issues were addressed in a sample of 15 Interim PRSPs (IPRSPs) and the 4 PRSPs completed by early 2001. PRMGE rated how gender issues were addressed in the poverty diagnosis; the selection of priority public actions; the definition of targets and the indicators for monitoring and evaluation; and the participation and consultation processes. Each of these areas, and sub-categories within each area, were rated according to whether: (i) there was no reference to gender issues, (ii) there was a brief reference to gender issues, or (iii) there was a more detailed discussion of gender issues. The rating results are presented in Table 3 (Bamberger 2001).

Table 2
The extent of gender analysis in PRSPs

PRSP	Extent of gender analysis
Burkina Faso	Education and reproductive health are engendered but none of the other sectors are such as agriculture, cash crops, livestock, extension services, water, clothing industry, employment generation, rural roads, governance, etc.
Mauritania	There are two small add-on gender paragraphs. Most sectors lack gender analysis and the monitoring indicators are not sex-disaggregated.
Tanzania	There are only a few, inconsistent gender references.
Uganda	There is surprisingly little gender mainstreaming given the relatively high level of gender awareness and multitude of available gender analyses.

Table 3
Treatment of gender issues in the first 15 IPRSPs and 4 PRSPs

Stage of the PRSP	Reference to gender issues:		
	[1] No reference	[2] A brief reference	[3] More detailed discussion
Poverty diagnosis	4	7	8
Gender differences in the incidence of poverty	4	7	8
Labour markets, income and employment	7	7	5
Health	5	9	5
Education	4	9	6
Priority public actions	3	10	6
Safety nets	11	6	2
Labour markets, income and employment	9	8	2
Health	3	11	5
Education	5	8	6
Targets and monitoring and evaluation indicators	6	11	2
Participation and the consultation process	10	5	4

Source: Bamberger (2001).

The World Bank analysis shows that less than half of the documents included a detailed discussion of gender issues: 42 per cent for poverty diagnosis, 31 per cent for selection of priority public actions, 10 per cent for monitoring and evaluation and 21 per cent for participatory consultations. A significant proportion of the documents contained no reference at all to gender for many areas. Moreover, few if any reports mainstreamed gender.

By sector, the analysis found that gender discussion was very uneven. As would be expected, the most concentrated PRSP gender focus was on education and health. In contrast, infrastructure sectors included no gender discussion despite the critical gender gaps among the poor discussed in section 2. Table 4 indicates the extent to which gender issues were discussed by sector.

Table 4
PRSP discussion of gender by sector

More detailed discussion of gender	– Education – Health
Some discussion of gender	– Labour markets, employment and micro-enterprise development
Very limited discussion of gender	– Agriculture, land rights and rural development – Environment and natural resource management – Safety nets and food security – Water supply and sanitation – Violence
No discussion of gender	– Urban development – Transport – Energy

Source: Bamberger (2001).

The World Bank analysis also concluded that while most IPRSPs and PRSPs identify gender issues as being important in at least some sectors, there was limited or no attempt to prioritize, select and design interventions according to gender-differentiated needs.

Interestingly, PRSP treatment of gender is consistent with multilateral development bank (MDB) treatment of gender in investments. Although MDB studies conclude that gender analysis and gender-responsive interventions are extremely important for poverty reduction, recent analyses of World Bank projects across sectors and regions reveal that aside from girls' education, reproductive health and microcredit projects, few Bank investments in other sectors pay much attention to gender disparities (OED 2000; Zuckerman 2000a; Zuckerman 2000b; Zuckerman 2000c; Zuckerman 2001a).⁶

4 The Rwanda case: A likely engendered PRSP

In contrast to other countries, Rwanda may produce an engendered PRSP. This is because Rwanda has initiated a series of deliberate steps, discussed below, to engender its PRSP. If Rwanda succeeds, it could provide a model of how a PRSP can be gender sensitive. However, the proof will be in the pudding when the Rwandan PRSP appears in late 2001.

Rwanda's IPRSP, published in November 2000, was not more engendered than were other countries' PRSPs (Republic of Rwanda 2000). Rwanda's Ministry of Finance and Economics (MINECOFIN) national poverty reduction programme (NPRP), charged with preparing the I/PRSPs, desired an engendered IPRSP, but time-pressured, did not

⁶ The author is establishing a new non-profit advocacy organization, Gender Action, to eliminate the disconnect between MDBs' persuasive arguments favouring gender equality and the lack of engendered MDB investments. Gender Action's advocacy is modelled on the relatively successful environmental campaign, which resulted in mandatory environmental impact analyses of all donor agency projects. For more information on Gender Action, email ezuck@sprynet.org.

take the necessary steps to produce one. It confined the IPRSP engendering consultation to a single round of meetings with Ministry of Gender and Women and Development (MIGEPROFE) officials and Pro-Femmes/Twese Hamwe, the umbrella group of women's NGOs, members.⁷ Pressured by deadlines, NPRP did not solicit feedback from the women's community on the draft IPRSP. As a result, the IPRSP included only scattered references to gender issues, for example, typical add-on paragraphs and ad-hoc references, but it did not mainstream gender concerns. A summary analysis of the extent of gender attention in the Rwandan IPRSP is presented in Annex 1 (Zuckerman 2001b).

Based on this IPRSP experience, MIGEPROFE decided to actively promote an engendered PRSP. This became a MIGEPROFE priority for the following reasons: First, it was convinced that Rwanda should not miss the opportunity to ensure that the PRSP identifies and addresses the gender-differentiated needs of women and men and contributes to poverty reduction. Second, it was aware that other countries' PRSPs inadequately addressed gender concerns and wished Rwanda's PRSP would be gender sensitive. Third, it knew that the pressured production schedule of the PRSP meant that gender could fall between the cracks without special measures. Therefore, MIGEPROFE decided to formulate a more effective PRSP gender mainstreaming strategy. MIGEPROFE took the following steps to promote an engendered PRSP:

In early 2001, MIGEPROFE, with UK Department for International Development (DFID) support, contracted an external gender expert to recommend how to successfully integrate gender into the PRSP.⁸ The consultant visited Rwanda twice during the first half of 2001. At MIGEPROFE's request, the consultant analysed in depth the extent to which gender was integrated into the IPRSP and proposed detailed engendering tools and monitoring indicators for every PRSP chapter. As an example, an IPRSP analysis and PRSP engendering proposal for the 'Economic Growth and Transformation for Poverty Reduction' chapter are presented in Annex 2 (Zuckerman 2001c).⁹

In addition, MIGEPROFE, NPRP and the gender expert formulated a process to facilitate engendering the PRSP. Two main elements of this process were a training workshop and the PRSP engendering committee, which took the following forms.

⁷ More than in most other countries, in Rwanda there is a partnership and fluidity between MIGEPROFE—the Gender Ministry, and Pro-Femmes—grouping women's NGOs. At least one person serves as a senior manager in both organizations. This close government-NGO alliance has the value added of strengthening women's voice and contrasts with countries where mistrust between government and NGOs is greater. MIGEPROFE is reorganizing to become a policy centre advocating and regulating services delivered by women's NGOs and other grassroots organizations.

⁸ MIGEPROFE obtains significant support from DFID as well as from the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA), and in the past the Dutch government provided substantial assistance. MIGEPROFE has a strong but slim core staff who do excellent policy and advocacy work inter alia. It relies on complementary external services for specific work like the PRSP gender analysis.

⁹ The Handout (Zuckerman 2001c) addressed engendering every paragraph, sector and issue in the IPRSP. With a high proportion of economists among the UNU/WIDER debt reduction conference participants to whom this paper was presented, the chapter selected for Annex 2 example covers economic issues.

4.1 The PRSP engendering workshop

MIGEPROFE and NPRP co-sponsored a workshop to promote engendering the PRSP for some 50 representatives from a broad range of sectors. Participants included core and line ministry and parliamentary officials (63 per cent); NGO representatives (24 per cent); donor agency staff and consultants (11 per cent); and academics (2 per cent). In addition, several journalists covered the workshop. Two dynamic civil society activists co-facilitated the workshop. Presentations focused on the importance of integrating gender into the PRSP in order to achieve poverty reduction, and tools for engendering the PRSP. Participants tested these PRSP engendering tools through a teamwork exercise. Teams focused on engendering IPRSP sectors, particularly poverty and vulnerability; macroeconomics, debt, privatization and export promotion; agriculture, rural development, food security and microcredit; infrastructure—transport, water and sanitation; health, education and information technology; and justice, human and legal rights, violence and the police. Teams had an opportunity to formulate recommendations on how to engender the IPRSP text using tools provided.

Rwandan commitment to engender the PRSP and longer-term national poverty reduction strategy was signalled by the participation of MIGEPROFE Minister Angelina Muganza and MINECOFIN Minister Donald Kuberuka. Their talks emphasized that gender analysis is not an add-on but an integral and essential part of poverty reduction work. The workshop was covered in the national press and was broadcast on national television.

Through the workshop, it is hoped that the PRSP drafting team has become more sensitive to the need to engender the PRSP as an input into an effective poverty reduction strategy. According to feedback from participants, the workshop convinced those participants needing convincing of the importance of engendering the PRSP and familiarized all participants with engendering tools. However, the workshop was not a substitute for PRSP consultations, which remain a concern as discussed in the PPA subsection below.

4.2 The PRSP engendering committee

Although the workshop deepened awareness of the need for an engendered PRSP and provided tools for doing so to some critical stakeholders, by itself the workshop will not translate into an engendered PRSP. Therefore, a further step was taken of establishing an inter-agency PRSP engendering committee. Committee members consist of the director of NPRP—the office taking the lead in drafting the PRSP, the director of the gender and development department at MIGEPROFE, and a Pro-Femmes representative from civil society.¹⁰ The inter-agency PRSP engendering committee intended to meet periodically to ensure the PRSP is engendered and each member has the responsibility to review and comment on PRSP drafts. During the fall of 2001, when PRSP drafts are expected to be produced, each committee member will be responsible for assessing and contributing to gender mainstreaming of the report.

¹⁰ The director of NPRP, formerly the administrative department director at MIGEPROFE, is a strong proponent of gender equality. Pro-Femmes elected a representative from one its member organizations, the Réseau des Femmes, to serve on the PRSP engendering committee.

In addition, MIGEPROFE's external gender expert who worked on the preparatory PRSP engendering stages hopes to have the opportunity to review and comment of drafts.

4.3 Risks

Although the above mechanisms were instituted for engendering the Rwandan PRSP, nevertheless, a few risks arising in the IPRSP process need to be addressed. These include the following.

4.3.1 Engendered monitoring indicators

Since IPRSP social indicators were not at all engendered, there is a risk that not all PRSP indicators will be engendered. However, this risk is low since PRSP draft team members expressed their intention to engender PRSP indicators. They plan to include three rows corresponding to total, male and female data for every PRSP monitoring indicator. The PRSP drafting team is trying to limit indicators to a few meaningful ones that realistically are monitorable. Still, the team will try to include a few additional sex-disaggregated indicators that workshop participants recommended, for example, a possible indicator reflecting the transportation time women, men and children spend fetching household water and fuel since typically women and children spend several hours per day on this unremunerated work. Such indicator data could monitor a possible PRSP priority intervention to reduce the transportation distance and time spent fetching household water and fuel. A corresponding PRSP objective could be, 'providing water access within 20 metres of every household'.

4.3.2 Sex-disaggregated data

It was expected to be difficult to find recent Rwandan sex-disaggregated data but a quick review of select household and other survey data already collected or being compiled indicated that much sex-disaggregated data already have been collected, and

Table 5
Examples of Rwandan survey instruments containing sex-disaggregated data

Survey instruments	Indicative sex-disaggregated data
Core Welfare Indicator Questionnaire (CWIQ)	Household head and member access to and levels of health, water, sanitation, fuel, education, employment, assets, etc.
Demographic and Health Survey (DHS)	Population, health, HIV-AIDs, STDs, vaccinations, marital status, education, literacy, access to media, employment, and behaviour habits like alcohol consumption, contraception use, etc.
Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey (MICS)	Health, water, sanitation and other data.
Household Living Conditions Integrated Survey (EICV)	Expenditure and consumption data including time use on remunerated productive activities and unremunerated domestic activities such as cooking, cleaning, childcare, and water and fuel collection.

Note: Copies of these surveys are available in the NPRP Poverty Observatoire: spnrp@rwanda1.com.

other desirable data, such as those monitoring men's and women's time use, is being collected and will be available soon. Examples of Rwandan survey instruments containing sex-disaggregated data are presented in Table 5. Importantly, available sex-disaggregated data have been underused. These data need to be cleaned, sorted and analysed. GOR should make cleaning, sorting, analysing and publishing sex-disaggregated data a priority. Table 5 shows that availability of sex-disaggregated data is not an issue. However, these data will not be usable unless experts clean, sort and analyse them.

4.3.3 The PPA: a possible loose end?

A loose end might be the critical participatory poverty assessment (PPA), the consultative mechanism for hearing citizen's inputs for the PRSP. The country-owned PRSP is supposed to be forged through an iterative, continuous participatory process of consultations, feedback, planning and implementation among all sectors of society (Bamberger *et al.* 2001; Joseph 2001). The PPA methodology encourages participants to raise any issues including those related to gender disparities. The Rwandan PPA consultations were preceded by training sessions for facilitators. A couple of the trainees suggested that the PPA process lacks gender sensitivity.¹¹ Hopefully, the PPA consultations were held separately with women's and men's groups to learn the genuine needs and feelings of each group. Even if sex-disaggregated consultations were held, concern exists that the process does not permit the facilitators to introduce gender-related issues. In cultures where women are not socialized to speak their minds, women might not independently raise sensitive issues affecting their welfare. Without having had the opportunity to ascertain whether the Rwandan PPA is dividing participants by sex, nor to experience the Rwandan PPA process first hand, hopefully these concerns are misplaced. However, since the risk exists that the PPA process might not be sufficiently gender-sensitive, the inter-agency PRSP engendering committee intends to follow up on this issue.¹²

5 Conclusions

Because gender inequality is costly to development and undermines achieving the PRSP poverty reduction objective, HIPC countries must mainstream gender considerations into their PRSPs. However, the PRSP track record indicates that few, if any, completed IPRSPs and PRSPs have mainstreamed gender. The most concentrated PRSP gender analysis has been in the education and health sectors. However, other sectoral and thematic analyses including those on poverty, macroeconomic and infrastructure issues have neglected gender considerations.

The PRSP track record also highlights that good intentions alone to engender PRSPs are insufficient. Only deliberate steps to engender PRSPs will make a difference. To mainstream gender concerns, PRSP processes need to incorporate the following types of steps:

¹¹ Interviews with PPA facilitators.

¹² Interview with the MIGEPROFE PRSP engendering committee member.

- Conduct genuinely participatory consultations with women's and other civil society groups and take their feedback into account. PRSP drafting teams could include civil society members to ensure civil society views are reflected in PRSPs;
- Sensitize all PRSP stakeholders, including policy-makers and planners, to the importance of gender as a key development issue;
- Analyse gender issues comprehensively throughout the PRSP along the lines proposed in the example in Annex 2. Such integrated gender analysis will highlight how poverty affects men and women differently and their differential access and control over resources;
- Prioritize, select and design interventions according to gender-differentiated needs; and
- Include gender-disaggregated monitoring and evaluation indicators to assess outcomes and impacts by gender of policies and interventions proposed in the PRSP and to determine the extent to which improvements in gender outcomes are due to specific interventions.

All future PRSPs should mainstream gender concerns accordingly. Otherwise, PRSPs will not only reinforce gender-unequal relations but could deepen them further since project benefits by default accrue more to males than to females. Moreover, without engendering PRSPs, development is perceived as a process, which does not have to alter unequal gender relations.

Rwanda has initiated a series of deliberate steps to engender its PRSP, which will hopefully result in a more gender-sensitive PRSP than those already produced. Since the Rwanda PRSP is still under preparation, the proof will be in the pudding when the Rwandan PRSP appears in late 2001.

Annex 1
Gender analysis of the Rwandan interim PRSP

Parts	Gender analysis
Part I	
Introduction and context	It is acceptable that this brief broad chapter does not flag gender concerns.
Part II	
Poverty in Rwanda: characteristics and constraints	More than any other part, Part II mainstreams gender (12, 13, 17, 19, 21 and 24, 28, 31). However, Part II does not mainstream gender sufficiently for a successful poverty reduction strategy, eg, it presents aggregate rather than sex-disaggregated data for school enrolment, drop out and repetition statistics (14), life expectancy, literacy, gross primary, secondary and tertiary enrolment, access to safe water and health care, infant mortality rate (Table 1), AIDS prevalence, malaria rates (16), poor households (18) structural problems in a range of sectors (20), HIV prevalence (21), safety net, solidarity and umuganda characteristics (22), and donor emergency transfers (27). The IPRSP could have used sex-disaggregated data available from national household surveys which have not been analysed and from the World Bank Genderstats. The planned PRSP participatory poverty assessment hopefully will be gender responsive (9).
Part III	
Building an enabling environment	Part III never mentions gender needs until the final paragraph, "Promoting gender equality" (57). This is a traditional add-on gender paragraph but gender is not mainstreamed within the preceding text. Lost opportunities to mainstream gender include the discussions on popular participation, human rights and capacity building, the Commission on Legal and Constitutional Affairs, the medium-term expenditure framework, monitorable outputs, decentralization (43), land policy and the labour code (44), security (45), privatization of tea factories and plantations, Rwandatel and Electrogaz (47), training teachers, technical and vocational education (49), civil service retrenchment, rehiring, streamlining, job classification, grading, civil society consultations on public administration reform (51), infrastructure (52-55), and the environment (56).
Part IV	
Economic growth and transformation for poverty reduction	There are no gender considerations in Part IV despite scope to engender the issues discussed. For example, it is important to mention the possible differentiated impacts on men and women of taxation and inflation (64), the Rwanda Investment Promotion Agency and Private Sector Federation activities (78-79), rural production technologies (80), public enterprise privatization or liquidation (81-82), shortage of credit and financial services for rural areas (83), formation of trade associations and peer savings and loan groups (84), credit union and micro finance institutional support (86), increasing loans for agriculture (87), modernizing the coffee and tea sectors and increasing horticultural, textile, banana, beer, hide, skin and semi-processed food exports (88), boosting agricultural incomes (89-96), developing tele-data processing and financial services (98), information and communications technology (99), natural gas and tourism (100) and promoting vocational and technical education (101).
Part V	
Sectoral policies for economic growth and poverty reduction	A gender analysis of Part V is presented in detail in Annex 2 along with proposed gender issues and monitoring indicators for the PRSP. Suffice it to say here that gender is little considered.
Part VI	
Costing and prioritizing actions for poverty reduction	Part VI does not address potential gender impacts. For example, it proposes to assess the incidence of benefits to poor people generically (152). The output indicators in Table 2 of Part VI should be gender-disaggregated.
Part VII	
Institutional framework for preparing and implementing the PRSP	Participatory consultations with MIGEPROFE and Pro-femmes are mentioned but more could be said about institutional mechanisms. Part VII's discussion of statistical surveys and participatory research on land should also explicitly state the extent to which the various surveys will incorporate sex-disaggregated data and the research will feature gender considerations (175).

Annex 1 continues

Annex 1 (con't)
Gender analysis of the Rwandan interim PRSP*

Parts	Gender analysis
Part VIII	
Follow-up and monitoring	Gender is not mentioned despite several critical opportunities to flag it including the Table 4 monitoring indicators and Table 5 indicators such as the poverty headcount, under 5 child malnutrition, infant and under 5 mortality rates, adult literacy and life expectancy rates. If it is not feasible to engender the Table 5 IDTs, then the cross-referenced Annex 1 Table 6 indicators for Rwanda must be engendered. The discussion on publicizing poverty information should address how the PRSP draft will be disseminated to illiterates, the majority of whom are women. The IPRSP emphasizes using the Internet and perhaps a national documentation centre but these media cannot reach illiterates (188). Part VIII should also discuss radio and other media accessible to illiterates and to remote men and women generally.
Part IX	
Policy matrix for the full PRSP	Policy Matrix 1: Overall governance framework—gender is not mentioned although it could be mainstreamed eg by discussing women's and men's roles in issues like national reconciliation, by including related monitoring indicators and by disaggregating the category civil society. Policy Matrix 2: Macroeconomic management, fiscal and monetary policy and private sector development—gender is not mentioned although it could be mainstreamed eg in the need to target women's and men's needs in policy areas to increase efficiency of public spending (gender budgeting) and to improve the poverty focus of public expenditures, with corresponding monitoring indicators; and monitoring indicators on the impact of men and women of private sector development restructuring, retrenchment and enterprise privatization including tea and coffee estates and factories. Policy Matrix 3: Sectoral actions to enable poor people to find employment opportunities and raise their incomes—gender is not mentioned although it should be mainstreamed in all of the sectoral issues addressed. Policy Matrix 4: Human resource development and improving the quality of life—gender is hardly mentioned although it should be mainstreamed in all of the issues flagged. Policy Matrix 5: Specific measures for vulnerable and disadvantaged groups and safety nets—gender is not mentioned although it should be mainstreamed in all of the issues flagged. Policy Matrix 6: Coordination and monitoring of the PRSP—gender is not mentioned but the specific needs of women and men in the participatory process, in all stages of PRSP preparation through approval, in monitoring, implementation and capacity building, need to be specified.
Annex I	
Selected social, financial and economic data	Table 3: Education performance indicators include only a couple of sex-disaggregated data. Sex-disaggregated data for completion, transition, repetition, drop-out, national exam passers, higher education enrolees, KIE student enrolment rates and number of qualified teachers should be provided. If these data are unavailable, sex-disaggregated categories should have been listed to signal the need to collect these data. Table 4: Health Sector Performance Indicators 1997-99 includes standard female reproductive health indicators but neglects sex-disaggregated data on the number of doctors and nurses, access to curative and preventive health services, populations in health districts, immunization coverage as well as the proportion of men using contraceptives. Table 5: Provisional List of Priority Programmes for 2001 needs to engender activities as appropriate. Table 6: Outcome Indicators for Poverty Reduction in Rwanda needs to mainstream gender throughout the table categories rather than present a separate short Gender section.
Annex 2	
Timeline for the full PRSP	NA
Note: Numbers in parentheses refer to numbered paragraphs and tables in Republic of Rwanda (2000). Source: Zuckerman (2001b).	

Annex 2
IPRSP gender analysis and proposed PRSP gender issues and monitoring indicators

	PRSP parts*	Comments on extent of gender integration into IPRSP	Gender issues that should be addressed in the PRSP	Related monitoring indicators
	Economic growth and transformation for poverty reduction (Part IV)	There are no gender considerations in Part IV despite scope to engender the issues discussed.		
	Economic structure and performance (58-60)	There are no gender considerations.	Economic structure data needs to be analysed by per cent of female and male population working in each sector—agriculture including food crops and production for exports, services including wholesale and retail trade and public administration and industry including manufacturing and construction (58).	Per cent of female and male employment in each sector—agriculture including food crops and production for exports, services including wholesale and retail trade and public administration and industry including manufacturing and construction as well as any emerging sectors.
21	Macroeconomic performance and objectives (61-65)	There are no gender considerations.	It would be valuable to disaggregate the extent to which men and women bear the tax and inflation burdens on 'the poor' (64). Have men or women traditionally had a greater incidence of the direct tax burden from earnings and the indirect tax burden consumption taxes? Have men and women been taxed equitably or have laws penalized men or women more? Has inflation contributed to feminizing or masculinizing poverty because purchasing power deteriorates?	Have taxation provisions that discriminate against women or men been eliminated? Have measures been undertaken to protect poor women and men from the harmful effects of inflation?
	Debt management and HIPC (66-68), Internal debt (69), Monetary policy (70)	There are no gender considerations.	Has Rwanda's heavy debt burden impacted women and men differently, eg as a result of constrained social expenditures?	What measures have been taken to ensure that debt consequences are mitigated on a gender equal basis?
	Trade liberalization and regional integration (71-77)	There are no gender considerations.	Rwanda's membership in various regional trade groups and liberalizing trade regime entail labour market shifts with gender consequences that should be analysed.	Who by gender are winners and losers in shifting employment markets stimulated by Rwanda's membership in various regional trade groups and liberalizing trade regime?

Annex 2 continues

Annex 2 (con't)

IPRSP gender analysis and proposed PRSP gender issues and monitoring indicators

PRSP parts*	Comments on extent of gender integration into IPRSP	Gender issues that should be addressed in the PRSP	Related monitoring indicators.
Encouraging investment, competitiveness and enterprise development (78-80)	There are no gender considerations.	Is RIPA's one stop window and technical assistance for investors targeting men and women as needed? Will the study on small-scale enterprises target men and women? Will the technical innovation for small rural producers accommodate women or ignore them as in the past although most small rural producers are women?	How many and what percentages of RIPA and PSF beneficiaries are women and men? How many men and women small rural producers have benefited from new technologies?
Privatization (81-82)	There are no gender considerations.	Will the venture capital trust fund target women as well as men entrepreneurs encouraging enterprises like the South African Women's Investment Portfolio? What is the gender impact of privatizing enterprises? Will compensatory measures for newly unemployed target women and men as needed?	What are the gender characteristics of privatization gender tenders? What is the breakdown of male and female winners and losers of privatization? What compensatory measures have targeted women and men who have lost employment and income because of privatization? How many men and women have been beneficiaries of compensatory measures?
Strengthening the financial sector (83-87)	There are no gender considerations.	Have men and women been affected differently by credit constraints? Do the Banques Populaires rural financial services help men and/or women? Do trade associations and savings and loan groups benefit men and women? How will the new legislation on micro-credit and BP restructuring affect potential men and women clients? How will possible increased loans for agriculture target female and male farmers?	What measures have been taken to ensure that men and women do not face credit constraints? How have the Banques Populaires rural financial services helped men and/or women? What measures have trade associations and savings and loan groups taken to benefit men and women? How has the new legislation on micro-credit and BP restructuring affected men and women clients? Have loans for agriculture targeted female and male farmers? How many women and men have benefited from micro and other credit?
Sources of growth in the Rwandan economy (88-90)	There are no gender considerations.	What are the gender implications of modernizing the coffee and tea sectors, increasing horticultural, textile, banana, beer, hide, skin and semi-processed food exports and boosting agricultural incomes?	How many women and men have lost and gained jobs and income from modernizing the coffee and tea sectors, increasing horticultural, textile, banana, beer, hide, skin and semi-processed food exports?

Annex 2 (con't)

IPRSP Gender analysis and proposed PRSP gender issues and monitoring indicators

PRSP parts*	Comments on extent of gender integration into IPRSP	Gender issues that should be addressed in the PRSP	Related monitoring indicators.
Promoting exports (91-96)	There are no gender considerations.	Are there gender disparities male and female composition of farm owners and workers in structurally problematic traditional export sectors, tea and coffee, exported food crops and non-traditional exports such as cut flowers, exotic fruits etc?	What is the male and female composition of farm owners and workers in structurally problematic traditional export sectors, tea and coffee, exported food crops and non-traditional exports such as cut flowers, exotic fruits etc?
Diversifying the economy (97-100)	There are no gender considerations.	To what extent would females and males be likely to work in the sectors identified for economic diversification, notably tele-data processing, financial services, ICT, natural gas and tourism? Would females and males be likely to benefit equally from related managerial, vocational and technical education?	How many females and males have been employed in sectors promoted such as tele-data processing, financial services, ICT, natural gas and tourism? How many females and males have benefited from related managerial, vocational and technical education?
Building a competitive skilled labour force (101)	Only the population is discussed, not males and females.	The roles of male and female labour force participants need to be addressed.	How many males and females have received vocational and technical education? Have been trained in marketable skills? Have received jobs as a result of this training?

Note: * Numbers in parentheses refer to numbered paragraphs and tables in Republic of Rwanda (2000).

Source: Zuckerman (2001c).

References

- Bamberger, Michael (2001). 'Integrating Gender into the PRSP: Key Issues and Lessons from Cambodia'. Slide Presentation. PREM Quality Enhancement Series—The Importance of Gender in the PRSPs. World Bank Gender and Development PREM Network. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Bamberger, M., M. Blackden, V Manoukian, and Lucia Fort (2001). 'Integrating Gender into Poverty Reduction Strategies'. Gender Chapter of the PRSP Sourcebook (World Bank 2001b). Also available at www.worldbank.org/topics/gender/ .
- Birdsall, Nancy, and Richard Sabot (eds) (1991). *Unfair Advantage: Labor Market Discrimination in Developing Countries*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Blackden, Mark (2001). 'Integrating Gender into Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs) in Sub-Saharan Africa: A 'Win-Win' Scenario'. Slide Presentation. World Bank Office of the Chief Economist. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Blackden, C. Mark, and Chitra Bhanu (1999). 'Gender, Growth, and Poverty Reduction: Special Program of Assistance for Africa, 1998 Status Report on Poverty in Sub-Saharan Africa'. Technical Paper 428. Washington, DC: World Bank, Poverty Reduction and Social Development, Africa Region.
- Budlander, Debbie (2000). 'The Political Economy of Women's Budgets in the South'. *World Development*, 28 (7).
- Catholic Relief Services (CRS) (2001). Letter from Kenneth Hackett, Executive Director, CRS, to Ms Jan Piercy, US Executive Director, World Bank, with accompanying documentation. May 25.
- Dollar, David, and Roberta Gatti (1999). 'Gender Inequality, Income, and Growth: Are Good Times Good for Women?' Working Paper Series 1, Policy Research Report on Gender and Development. Washington, DC: World Bank, Development Research Group/Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network.
- Esim, Simel (1999). 'Gender Budget Initiatives for Latin America: A Tool for Improving Accountability and Implementation of Government Policy and Programmes'. New York: UNIFEM. Mimeo.
- Gopal, Gita, and Maryam Salim (eds) (1998). *Gender and Law: Eastern Africa Speaks*. Proceedings of a World Bank-Economic Commission for Africa Conference. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Hahn, Minna (1999). 'Korea: Country Gender Profile'. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Hill, M. Anne, and Elizabeth King (1995). 'Women's Education and Economic Well-Being'. *Feminist Economics*, 1.
- Joseph, Sam (2001). 'Rwanda Poverty Reduction Concept Note/Participatory Poverty Assessment'. Mimeo.
- Jubilee South (2001). 'Jubilee South Pan-African Declaration on PRSPs'. Kampala, 10-12 May 2001.
- Klasen, Stephan (1999). 'Does Gender Inequality Reduce Growth and Development? Evidence from Cross-Country Regressions'. Working Paper Series 7, Policy Research Report on Gender and Development. Washington, DC: World Bank,

Development Research Group/Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network.

Malmberg Calvo, Christina (1994). 'Case Study on the Role of Women in Rural Transport: Access of Women to Domestic Facilities'. Sub-Saharan Africa Transport Policy Program, World Bank and Economic Commission for Africa. Washington, DC: World Bank.

Marshall, Alison (2001). 'A Campaigner's Perspective on PRSPs'. Paper presented at the WIDER Conference on Debt Relief, 17-18 August. Helsinki, Finland: UNU/WIDER. Mimeo.

Mbilinyi, Marjorie (2001). 'PRSP in Tanzania'. Paper presented at the Public Forum on Women, Debt and Poverty, April. Accra, Ghana: GERA.

Operations Evaluation Department (OED) (2000). 'Integrating Gender in World Bank Assistance'. Washington, DC: World Bank.

Republic of Rwanda (2000). 'The Interim PRSP: An Approach to the Poverty Reduction Action Plan for Rwanda'. Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning. November.

Shrader, Elizabeth (2000). 'Gender Violence: Economic Policy and its Impact Globally and Locally'. World Bank Latin America and Caribbean Region Working Paper Series. Washington, DC: World Bank. Mimeo.

Smith, Lisa C., and Lawrence Haddad (2000). 'Explaining Child Malnutrition in Developing Countries: A Cross-country Analysis'. Research Report 111. Washington, DC: International Food Policy Research Institute. Available online at www.ifpri.cgiar.org/index1/htm .

World Bank (2001a). *Engendering Development: Through Gender Equality in Rights, Resources, and Voice*. Policy Research Report. Oxford University Press. Summary available at www.worldbank.org/gender/prr .

World Bank (2001b). PRSP Sourcebook. Available in English, Spanish, French and Russian at www.worldbank.org/poverty/strategies .

Zuckerman, Elaine (1998). 'Integrating WID/Gender Issues into Social Investment Funds'. Washington, DC: Inter-American Development Bank.

Zuckerman, Elaine (2000a). 'China Country Gender Review'. Washington, DC: World Bank. Mimeo.

Zuckerman, Elaine (2000b) 'Country Gender Review Guidelines'. Washington, DC: World Bank.

Zuckerman, Elaine (2000c) 'Macroeconomic Policies and Gender in the World Bank'. Background paper for the World Bank Gender Strategy. Washington, DC: World Bank.

Zuckerman, Elaine (2001a). 'Gender Action: Concept Paper'.

Zuckerman, Elaine (2001b). Rwanda Post Mission Report. February 2001.

Zuckerman, Elaine (2001c). 'Gender Analysis of "An Approach to the Poverty Reduction Action Plan for Rwanda: The Interim PRSP (IPRSP)" and Engendering the PRSP'. Workshop Handout. Rwanda.