Teng, Fei; Gu, Alun

Working Paper
Climate Change: National and Local Policy Opportunities in China

Nota di Lavoro, Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei, No. 74.2007

Provided in Cooperation with:
Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei (FEEM)

Suggested Citation: Teng, Fei; Gu, Alun (2007) : Climate Change: National and Local Policy Opportunities in China, Nota di Lavoro, Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei, No. 74.2007, Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei (FEEM), Milano

This Version is available at:
http://hdl.handle.net/10419/74153

Standard-Nutzungsbedingungen:
Die Dokumente auf EconStor dürfen zu eigenen wissenschaftlichen Zwecken und zum Privatgebrauch gespeichert und kopiert werden. Sie dürfen die Dokumente nicht für öffentliche oder kommerzielle Zwecke vervielfältigen, öffentlich ausstellen, öffentlich zugänglich machen, vertreiben oder anderweitig nutzen. Sofern die Verfasser die Dokumente unter Open-Content-Lizenzen (insbesondere CC-Lizenzen) zur Verfügung gestellt haben sollten, gelten abweichend von diesen Nutzungsbedingungen die in der dort genannten Lizenz gewährten Nutzungsrechte.

Terms of use:
Documents in EconStor may be saved and copied for your personal and scholarly purposes.
You are not to copy documents for public or commercial purposes, to exhibit the documents publicly, to make them publicly available on the internet, or to distribute or otherwise use the documents in public.

If the documents have been made available under an Open Content Licence (especially Creative Commons Licences), you may exercise further usage rights as specified in the indicated licence.
Climate Change: National and Local Policy Opportunities in China

Fei Teng and Alun Gu

NOTA DI LAVORO 74.2007

JULY 2007

CCMP – Climate Change Modelling and Policy

Fei Teng and Alun Gu, Global Climate Change Institute, Tsinghua University, China

This paper can be downloaded without charge at:

The Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei Note di Lavoro Series Index:
http://www.feem.it/Feem/Pub/Publications/WPapers/default.htm

Social Science Research Network Electronic Paper Collection:
http://ssrn.com/abstract=999926

The opinions expressed in this paper do not necessarily reflect the position of Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei
Corso Magenta, 63, 20123 Milano (I), web site: www.feem.it, e-mail: working.papers@feem.it
Climate Change: National and Local Policy Opportunities in China

Summary
Climate Change poses a wide range of potentially very severe threats in China. This aggravates the existing vulnerability of China and is one of the big challenges faced by the Chinese government. Adaptation programmes and projects are being developed and implemented at national and local level. As China is engaged in heavy investment in infrastructure development as a consequence of the rapid process of development and urbanization, mainstreaming adaptation into such development process is a priority for China. China has also made positive contributions to reducing greenhouse gas emissions through participations in the CDM under the Kyoto Protocol framework. Although mitigation is not a priority at national or local level, it has been integrated into national and local development plans explicitly. This paper addresses the following questions: What is the policy space for climate change mitigation and adaptation policy at national and local level and what is already being done? The three case studies at local level - Beijing, Guangdong and Shanghai – presented here, highlight the local benefits in terms of local pollution of integrating mitigation policies into local development. However, financial constraints usually prevent such a positive policy integration. National policies and international cooperation aiming at bridging the financial gap and promoting technology transfer would help in integrating local pollution control and mitigation efforts in China today.

Keywords: Climate Change, Local Policy, National Policy, Mitigation, Local Pollution

JEL Classification: H7, Q54, Q56, O53

This paper has been produced within the CLIMA Project, with the financial assistance of the European Union AsiaLink Programme. The contents of this document are the sole responsibility of the author and can under no circumstances be regarded as reflecting the position of the European Union.

The authors gratefully acknowledge the Euro-Asian research and training in CLImate change MAngement (CLIMA) who organized the first training session in Amsterdam, the Netherlands. The authors also would like to thank Prof. Joyeeta Gupta and Dr. Emanuele Massetti for thier valuable suggestions during the preparation of this paper.

Address for correspondence:
Fei Teng
Global Climate Change Institute
Tsinghua University
Beijing 100084
China
Phone: +86 10 62784805
Fax: +86 10 62771150
E-mail: tengfei@tsinghua.edu.cn
1 Introduction

Global climate change is one of the key common concerns of international community, which has and will continue to have significant negative impact on the global, national and local ecosystem and social-economic development. Developing countries and poor people living in developed countries will be hit hardest by the negative effects of climate change. Although climate change is already an urgent issue, China is facing other serious challenges as a consequence of its rapid economic growth. Among them bottlenecks in energy supply and local environmental degradation rank highest. Although energy efficiency and environmental protection are priority concerns of the Chinese government, the efforts to prompt energy conservation and reduce pollutions also lead to reduced greenhouse gases (GHGs) and thereby contribute to the global GHGs reduction efforts. The central government of China has set ambitious targets on energy efficiency and on environmental quality that above mentioned large positive spillovers on mitigation efforts, but inconsistent activities of local government may prevent the attempt from succeeding.

It is thus crucial to understand how national and local policies can be integrated in a coherent, unified framework so that energy efficiency is increased, local pollution is reduced and global climate mitigation effort enhanced. In order to address this issue, the paper surveys the existing literatures on national and local policies that, despite being primarily addressed to achieve national priorities, have also strong impact on carbon emissions of China. Opportunities for further actions and greater coordination are identified and discussed.

The rest of the paper is organized as follows. Section 2 provides a brief overview of China’s climate policy at national level. Section 3 describes the institutional arrangement and division of responsibilities between the central and local government. Section 4, section 5 and section 6 provide three case studies about policies at local level with strong relevance for climate change in the areas of Beijing city, Guangdong province and Shanghai city. Section 7 offers concluding observations and policy suggestions.

2 China’s national policies to cope with climate change

The trend of climate change in China in the past century is corresponding to the general trend of global climate change. The average surface air temperature in China has increased by between 0.5 and 0.8 °C over the 20th century, with a more marked temperature rise in North China and Tibetan Plateau compared to southern regions [1]. In China, adaptation to climate change is a priority because the threats from climate change in the short term are serious. China has also made positive contributions to relieving the increase of greenhouse gas emissions and protecting global climate by adjusting its economic structure, improving its energy efficiency, developing and
using hydropower and other renewable energy and strongly implementing total pollutants amount control policies and measures. Although most of the efforts are driven by energy efficiency and environmental consideration, large co-benefits in terms of mitigation have been achieved. Through clean development mechanism (CDM), China is also the largest Certified Emission Reductions (CERs) supplier in the World.

Adaptation

Adaptation is one of the big challenges faced by the Chinese government, not only because of its heavy investment in infrastructure as part of its development process, but also because of the growing water shortages caused by temperature increase in its north region which require investment in reservoirs and diversion system to manage the dwindling water resources. Despite at this time there is still no systematic strategy for adaptation to climate change at the national level in China, some adaptation activities have been partly integrated into development policy and planning at country level.

In 2005, China invested around 48% of its Gross Domestic Product (GDP) or roughly 8860 billion RMB in fixed capital, of which 17.7% was invested in buildings and 3.5% in transportation infrastructures [2]. Assuming a 10-20% adaptation cost for making buildings and infrastructures more able to adapt to the changing climate [3], the additional costs would amount to 188-376 billion RMB each year (1%-2% of GDP). Compared with China, the additional cost of adapting in OECD is only 0.05-0.5% of GDP [4]. For example, the recent Qinghai-Tibet railway tracks cross 550km of permafrost and are highly vulnerable to even moderate warming. During the construction of Qinghai-Tibet railway, the impact of global warming in the coming 50 years was taken into account. Contingency measures were put in place to protect the track from the negative effects of global warming including changing routes, building railway bridges and roadbed cooling systems. According to the estimation, the ventilated sheet-stone roadbed, only one of many roadbed cooling systems put in place, cost more than 300 million RMB (1% of the total cost) [5].

Hydro projects form another significant part of extra spending for adaptation. For example, the South-North Water Diversion Project (SNWDP) has been launched in 2002 to alleviate the lack of water resources in North China. As the largest project of its kind, SNWDP will cost about 500 billion RMB. Moreover, stronger flood defenses to protect infrastructures from flooding account for about 40% of the total hydro investment or about 30 billion RMB in 2005 [6]. Regarding other adaptation activities in agriculture, terrestrial ecosystems and coastal zones, the adaptation cost for developing countries like China is going to be substantial.

Energy Intensity target

China has taken actions and ambitious policies that will reduce the rate of growth of GHGs. For a long time, the government of China has persisted in the principle of “developing and conserving energy simultaneously, with conservation put in the first
place” [1]. After the 1980s, the State Council and government departments in charge at various levels formulated and implemented a series of energy conservation rules and regulations, set up a three-tier energy conservation management system at the central, local/industrial and enterprise levels and implemented a series of policies on energy conservation technologies. From 1990 to 2002, China’s energy intensity of GDP went down by an average annual rate of 5.6% [7].

The new National 11th Five-Year Plan (2006-2010) [8] aims to ensure that energy consumption per unit of GDP will decrease by 20% within 5 years. It gives a quantified target on energy efficiency for the first time in five-year plans and divides the total target among provinces, large industrial groups, cities and large energy consumers. Those target groups are expected to implement these policies.

In June 2006, the National Bureau of Statistics of China released provincial data of energy consumption in 2005. This could be used as a baseline for calculating provincial energy consumption reduction rate per unit of GDP during the 11th five-year period. The national energy intensity per 10⁴ yuan RMB is 1.22 tce in 2005 (based on year 2005 price), which means national target of energy consumption per 10⁴ yuan RMB GDP will be 0.976 tons in 2010 (based on year 2005 price).

Currently, there are 10 provinces whose energy consumption per unit of GDP are lower than national level (see Figure 1). Most of these provinces are located in East China. Most of them have a high economic growth rate and can adopt advanced technology to adjust energy mix and promote energy efficiency.

[Figure 1 here]

**Total amount control of pollutants**

In the national 11th five year plan, the Chemical Oxygen Demand (COD) and SO₂ also have been identified as two major pollutants which will be reduced 10% compared with year 2005 level [8]. Almost half SO₂ emissions come from coal-fired power plants in China. The total amount control of SO₂ can be achieved partly through fuel switching and by replacing small units with larger ones, which offers an opportunity to reduce carbon emission at the same time, leading to co-benefits.

**Clean development mechanism**

With 37 registered projects and more than 40 million tonnes of CO₂e reduction per year, China has become the biggest CERs suppliers in the World. To prompt the CDM at national level, the policy document, “Measures for the Operation and Management of CDM Projects”, was released first in June 2004 and then amended in October 2005 [9]. In the Measures, the priority areas for CDM projects are energy efficiency improvement, development and utilization of new and renewable energy and methane recovery and utilization. National Development and Reform Committee (NDRC) is the Designated National Authority (DNA) in China responsible for the approval of CDM project applications. The Chinese government also collects a levy on the CER revenue of CDM projects (65% for HFC23 project, 30% for NO₂ and 2% for others)
The charge collected from CDM project will be transferred to a CDM fund aiming at helping and financing national wide actions to address climate change. The detailed enforcement rules for CDM fund are being developed.

**Policy instruments at national level: legislation, plans and incentive-based policy**


Nevertheless, China lacks a basic energy law which reflects the national energy strategy and policy, and coordinates ties between energies and energy-related activities compressively. Moreover, there are still not specific laws for oil, natural gas and atomic energy. The Chinese government has realized the importance to formulate a basic and comprehensive energy law system to cope with these challenges and issues. The Energy Law are drafting by an inter-ministerial team which will formulate the compressive and long term energy policy. The amendment of “Energy Conservation Law” and “Program on Energy Saving Technology Policies in China” are also ongoing at the central level.

In central level, the core department also uses the plans, notices and enforcement regulations as a policy instrument to set the national goals related to energy development. In year 2005, NDRC launched the China Medium and Long-term Energy Conservation Plan (CMLECP) [7] which covers two phases: 2005-2010 and 2010-2020. In this plan, the detailed energy conservation targets were set up. In the CMLECP, ten key project were put forward including coal-fired boiler renovation, regional cogeneration, waste heat and pressure utilization, petroleum conservation and substitution, motor system energy conservation, energy system optimization, building energy conservation, green lighting, energy conservation in governmental agencies and creation of energy conservation monitoring and technical service systems. The target of these ten key projects is to achieve 240 million tce saving. In the first half year of 2006, the NDRC arranged 540 million RMB from the national debt to support 98 energy saving projects. It is estimated that 7.2 million tce saving can be achieved from the implementation of these energy saving projects thus around 20 million tons of CO₂ reduction.

In March 2006, NDRC and four other governmental agencies jointly issued the Notice on strengthening resource conservation in governmental agencies. According to this notice, a target of 20% reduction of energy consumption was adopted. In April 2006, the NDRC also launched the Top-1000 Enterprise Energy Conservation Action Plan. In this action plan, 1008 enterprises have been identified and asked to improve the energy efficiency to achieve a 100 million tce saving by 2010.
A year ago, in March 2005, NDRC and General Administrative of Quality Supervision, Inspection and Quarantine announced a joint Energy Efficiency Labeling Management Directive. According to this Directive, energy efficiency labels will be provided to qualified products to help the users to identify the energy efficiency grades of these products. The labeling system has been used for household refrigerators and air conditioners (see Figure 2).

In these laws and regulations, the central government uses pricing, taxation and financial support to prompt the development of renewable energy and improvement of energy efficiency. The Renewable Energy Law confirms the government’s support of the pricing of renewable energy. And the “Tentative management measures for price and sharing of expenses for electricity generation from renewable energy” provides a concrete guidance to the pricing of renewable generation: the price of wind generation is basically based on a bidding procedure while the price of biomass generation is set as the average feed-in tariff plus a 25 cents subsidy per kWh. Regarding taxation, the government provides tax reduction to the projects covered by the Guidance Catalog for the Development of Renewable Energy. For example, the Value Added Tax (VAT) is 3% for artificial gas project and 6% for hydropower, while the current general VAT is 17%. The central government also provides fund, interest subsidies or treasure loans to renewable projects covered by the Guidance Catalog for the Development of Renewable Energy.

3 Institution and responsibility between central and local government

Institutional arrangement at national and local level

The government of China has a five-tier hierarchical structure with central government in Beijing at the top. The four tiers of local government include provincial-level government, prefecture-level government, county-level government and township-level government. At national level, the NDRC and State Environment Protection Agency (SEPA) are the two of key ministries which are responsible for energy conservation, energy project planning, environment protection and climate change. The environment and energy conservation policies can also be categorized into three levels: laws and general guidance, development and action plans, and practical or managerial guidelines. Generally speaking, the first level is set by central government, the second level is also decided by central government but delegated to sub-national government, while the third level is always set by local government.

At the national level, China also has established the inner-ministerial National Climate Change Policy Coordinating Committee in 1990, making it responsible for policies and measures to address climate change. However, there is no clear division of activities with lower level organizations. Some provinces have adopted the climate
change actions and some provinces have not. The local EPA and DRC are key department to implement national energy, environment and forthcoming climate policy at local level. They are under the leadership of both the local government and the same department in the higher level government (e.g SEPA and NDRC). But the local government determines the hiring and firing of the departmental employees.

Corresponding to the government structure, the fiscal system of China also has five levels. The central government has a direct relation with provincial governments while the provincial governments determine their relations with sub-provincial governments. The central government also determines the assignment of expenditure responsibilities between national government and sub-national government. Environmental protection and its budget is a purely local responsibility which is assigned further to prefecture, county and township government.

The environment responsibility arrangement between central government and local government in China is the institutional basis for decomposing a national energy reduction target and pollutants total amount target into local level.

Target plan and its decomposition to local level

To ensure the goals of 11th Five Year Plan, the State Council issued a circular in August 2006. In the circular, a 20% reduction in energy intensity, 10% reduction in major pollutants and other six targets are regarded as obligatory targets which have legal effects and must be achieved. NDRC and SEPA are appointed as the department in charge of the reduction target of energy intensity and major pollutants at national level. These two targets are also translated into targets for provincial level. According to the circular of State Council, the NDRC submitted a reduction target plan to State Council. In this target plan, the provincial targets are set according to provincial target in their own 11th five year plans and national balance, and range from 30% reduction for Jilin province and 12% reduction for Tibet. In September 2006, the State Council approved the NDRC’s reduction target plan for energy intensity and asked the provincial government to further allocate targets to city and county level, as well as to the industry sectors and major enterprises. In the mean time, a communiqué system will also be established to publish the provincial energy intensity and major pollutants data every half year. In August 2006, the SEPA, National Bureau of Statistics of China (NBSC), NDRC and Office of National Energy Leading Group (ONELG) published the communiqué of energy intensity and major pollutants in the first half of 2006. Although the energy intensity and pollutant total amount are set as obligatory targets by the central government, the first half year energy intensity communiqué shows a 0.8% increase of energy intensity over the last year which makes the 4% reduction target of year 2006 more difficult to achieve. One reason for the 0.8% increase lies in the fact that some project with high energy intensity planned in 10th five year are just put into operation in 2006 and it takes time to switch the industrial structure and reverse the trend. It is also worth mentioning that the current system of local government organization and finance in China are not always conductive to the achievement of such a target.
Local fiscal system in China and implementation of central policies at local level

According to the assignment of responsibilities between the central and local government, local capital construction and environment protection belongs to local responsibilities which are funded by local finance. The fiscal system in China is characterized by tax sharing scheme (TSS) between central and local government. Taxes are divided into central government taxes, local government taxes and taxes shared between the central and local government. The revenue of local government mainly comes from tax assigned to local government and other extra-budgetary revenues. Shared taxes are one of the major revenue for local government which mainly include domestic value added tax (VAT, 75% for central government and 25% for local government) and income tax (60% for central government and 40% for local government) [10]. The central government also returns part of its tax revenue to local government then an intergovernmental fiscal transfer. The income tax is a major source of local revenue which gives an improper incentive for local government to protect the local industry even inconsistent with the national policy.

The TSS also provides strong incentives for local government to focus more on local development and GDP. The new investment enables local governments to enlarge their tax bases and improves the performance evaluation of local officials which is a major consideration for promotion. This makes the local government pursue local development regardless of environmental damage and energy efficiency target because the evaluation system consists 17 items with only one for environment and none for energy efficiency.

A new evaluation system is being developed in three provinces to give more weight to environmental concerns and to relate them to the performance of local officials. The State Council also asked the Ministry of Personnel to include the energy intensity reduction and target for pollutants into the performance evaluation system for local officials. The new performance evaluation system will be expected to provide sufficient incentives for local governments to follow the policies of central government.

Barriers and obstacles at local level

The central government has been reforming the performance evaluation system and “Green GDP” is also used by the Chinese leadership to take into account the environmental damage of development. Local governments are changing their behavior because environmental issues are becoming increasingly political issues especially in coastal region of China. At local level, the finance disparities between west and east make the reduction target more difficult for local government in the west region since the energy intensity reduction and environment protection target also means a heavy investment in the renovation of existing facilities and new investment in energy sectors. For local government, there are still barriers to overcome.

Lack of an independent budget for energy saving, environment protection and
adaptation at local level: To finance the activities of energy saving, environment protection and adaptation in a stable manner, a separate account and budget for such activity is necessary to make it a transparent and long run effort by the local government.

Lack of an intergovernmental transfer aiming at improving the energy efficiency and environmental standard in the western region: Compared with eastern China, western China has limited local revenue and capacity to play a leading role in making investment. A special intergovernmental transfer aiming at energy efficiency and environment quality improvement is crucial for local government of western China to collect enough fiscal input.

Lack of financing mechanism to support SMEs to improve their energy and environmental performance: Almost half of the emission and pollutions came from Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) who has very limited ability to access financial resource. The government should play an active role in SMEs energy efficiency and environment protection financing.

4 Case study 1: Beijing

Beijing is the capital of China with more than 15 million inhabitants. Beijing is one of the relative developed provinces in China with GDP of 772 billion RMB in 2005 or more than 6000$ per capita [11]. The local revenue of Beijing government in 2005 is 111.7 billion RMB. Air quality is the major challenge for Beijing municipal government which should meet the World Health Organization (WHO) standard before 2008 according to the bidding commitment for the Olympics. Dust pollution and vehicle emissions are still key pollutants need to be controlled.

Green Olympic action plan and the 11th five years plan of Beijing

In year 2002, Beijing released the first Olympic Action Plan: Sub-plan for environmental protection. The main guidance of Sub-plan on Energy Development and Energy Mix Readjustment (Sub-plan on EDEMR) [12] includes readjustment of the primary energy structure in “a cost-effective manner in the fuel switch from coal-dominance to more shares of clean energy”, restructure the industrial and product structure to reduce the growth rate of energy consumption and improve the energy efficiency by promoting the application of new and quality technologies. The primary objective of energy mix readjustment is to decrease the share of coal and coke in the energy mix. In line with the Sub-plan on EDEMR, the 11th five year plan of Beijing Municipal also set local goals and policies for energy switch and conservation. The 11th five year plan of Beijing Municipal consists six sub plans related to energy: Sub-plan for Energy Development and Conservation, Sub-plan for Electricity Development, Sub-plan for Heating, Sub-plan for Construction, Sub-plan for Transportation and Sub-plan for Circular Economy. The concrete goals for energy development and energy saving has been raised in different sub-plans. For example, in the Sub-plan for Electricity Development, it is planned to increase the share of
renewable capacity to around 6% in total capacity [13]. To achieve this objective, Beijing will invest about 13 billion RMB into renewable energy. The building sector and transportation sector will be the key to meet the Olympic commitment while concrete goals and policies have been included in the corresponding sub-plans. The local policies on improving energy efficiency and emission standard will be discussed in the following paragraphs.

**Local policies on energy efficiency and pollutant control**

The Beijing government will adopt a series of policies and programs to improve energy efficiency and reduce energy intensity in all sectors. These policies and programs include local regulation and financial subsidies.

**Regulations and guidelines:**

**Building Sector:** The energy consumption in building sector has accounted for 28% of the total energy consumption in Beijing [14]. From 2005-2010, 175 million m² low energy building has been built while about 40% of them were designed to meet a 30% energy savings target compared with no energy efficient measures and other 60% were designed based on a 50% energy saving target. The Beijing municipal government also adopts a more strict energy efficiency design standard than the national one. According to the 11th five year plan on building energy conservation, the target of 65% energy savings will be met by new public buildings in 2010.

**Transportation Sector:** As a leading city to control vehicle emission in China, Beijing is the first city which adopt Euro IV standard 1 January 2007 while Euro I, II and III standard were already adopted in 1999, 2003 and 2005. The local government also launched an environment labeling system for vehicles which will be labeled by stars according to their emission standard. The environment label of vehicles will determine the permitted region for driving. To control vehicle emissions, a tight fuel quality standard (National Standard III) also has been implemented from year 2005.

**Financial subsidies:**

**Green Lighting Project:** From the year 2004 to the year 2007, the Beijing government launched a green lighting project to prompt energy saving lamps. The government provided 30% subsidies for the consumers who purchased energy saving lamps. During these three years, 20 million RMB are paid to the consumer and 1.8 million lamps are installed in public toilet, schools and metro stations. It is estimated that the Green Lighting Project saves 39 GWh per year which means around 40,000 tons CO₂ reduction annually.

**Subsidies for heating system:** The coal-fired heating system is a major pollution source in Beijing during cold season. Since 1998, the Beijing government has invested heavily to renovate about 10,000 coal-fired boilers with boilers using gas or electricity. During the 11th five years, the last 2800 coal-fired boilers will also be renovated. The Beijing government also encourages the usage of heat pump and clean energy (e.g natural gas) in buildings as heating or cooling facilities by providing
subsidies. The subsidies to heat pump project will be 35 RMB/m² for water source heat pump and 50 RMB/m² for ground source heat pump.

**Subsidies for public transportation:** During the 10th five year plan period, the Beijing municipal government has provided subside to the public transportation sector to promote Compact Natural Gas (CNG) buses, the building of CNG fueling stations and retrofitting of buses and taxis. There are around 3000 CNG buses in Beijing’s public transportation system which makes Beijing the city with the most CNG buses in the world.

**Brief Conclusion**

Climate change is not a priority area in local development, energy and environment plan of Beijing city. The main environment challenge of Beijing is to improve its air quality and environmental quality to achieve the environmental commitments made in its bidding report for the Olympic Games 2008. At the local level, Beijing city has no clear climate change policy, and mitigation action has been integrated into these local plans although it is not stated explicitly. The Olympic games are an important external incentive for Beijing to improve its air and environmental quality. As the dominant share of coal in its energy mix, fuel switching and energy efficiency improvement will be crucial to achieve the goal of air environmental quality improvement then GHGs will also be reduced as a consequence of these activities. Local regulation or guidelines and financial subsidies are the major policies and measures adopted by the Beijing municipal government to improve energy efficiency and environment quality. The relatively high local revenue of Beijing makes it possible to invest heavily into renewable energy and provide subsidies to public transportation.

In August 2006, Beijing Statistics Bureau published the first communiqué of energy and water consumption in first half of year 2006, the energy intensity is 0.8 tce/10⁴ RMB, 7% lower than that of year 2005 [15].

**5 Case study 2: Guangdong Province**

In the first national communiqué on provincial energy intensity, Guangdong province has the lowest energy intensity in China: 0.69 tce per 10⁴ RMB of GDP and only 66% of the national average. At the per capita level, Guangdong’s reserve of conventional energy is only 1/20th of the nation and 90% energy needs to be imported form other provinces or abroad. Due to the lack of energy resources, the energy price in Guangdong is higher than in most of other provinces in China. For example, the retail electricity price of Guangdong is about 0.65 RMB/kWh, the highest in China and 30% higher than the national average. The low energy reserve and high energy price make Guangdong search for an innovative way to energy saving.

**11th five year plan of Guangdong Province**

In the 1990s, Guangdong’s industrial blueprint was directed towards lower energy consuming industries and high-tech industries. Since the start of the reform process
and opening-up of China, Guangdong’s growth in its service industries has outstripped that of manufacturing industry. In the 11th five year plan, the Guangdong government aims to increase the share of high-tech industries in the GDP from 9% in 2005 to 18% in 2010. The energy intensity will be reduced by 13% compared with the level of 2005, lower than the national target. The Guangdong government plans to optimize the industry layout, focusing on “high value and low energy consumption” industries like automobiles, electronic appliance, information technology and medicine. Together with the Closer Economic Partnership Arrangement (CEPA) and concept of “Pan Pearl Delta Cooperation”, the Guangdong government aims to be center of the service industry along with Hong-Kong government.

**LNG project in Guangdong Province**

As one of the richest regions in China (GDP per capita are more than 3000$ in 2006), Guangdong suffered from air pollution caused by coal-fired plant and is planning to diversify its generation capacity at an affordable cost. From 1993, Guangdong province had undertaken preliminary research on Liquefied Natural Gas (LNG) market. In 1998, the Guangdong provincial government submitted a project proposal about Guangdong LNG terminals and transmission systems together with China National Offshore Oil Corporation (CNOOC). At end of 1998, the central government approved the pilot LNG project in Guangdong but asked the Guangdong province to reorganize the project proposal to include not only LNG terminal and transmission project, but also gas utilization projects. Five LNG power plants and four city gas projects are grouped together to meet the requirement of central government. The NDRC approved the LNG power plants project with the requirement that they must compete with other conventional coal fired power plant in Southern China grid. The higher generation cost of LNG plant (30% higher coal-fired plant even 10% higher than nuclear plant) make them difficult to compete with other power plants in competitive market. Compared with conventional coal-fired power plant, the four LNG plants in Guangdong can achieve about 5 million tons of CO2 reduction per year. These plants are also seeking finance from CDM, but it is still not clear how many CERs can be claimed by these projects.

**Local policies**

**Regulations and guidelines [16]:** The Guangdong government has passed “The Regulation on Energy Saving in Guangdong Province” in 2003 and is amending the Regulation to include energy standard for high energy consuming industries such as iron & steel, chemical and paper industry. The energy consumption standard will be compulsory. Guangdong also will adopt the Euro III emission standard for vehicles in July 2007.

**Financial subsidies:** Although Guangdong government is one of the richest provinces in China, it looks like the Guangdong government relies on macro-control policies and market-based mechanism than financial subsidies. The provincial government is planning to provide subside for energy conservation project to achieve the assigned energy intensity target while the scale of such financial subsides is still not clear. At
city level, some cities have planned to provide subsidies to energy conservation activities. For example, the Shenzhen government provides subsidies of 8 million RMB to qualified energy conservation project to pay interest. The Zhuhai city is also planning to provide 6.8 million RMB to energy conservation project as subsidies.

**SO₂ emission trading:** Cross border pollution is a major concern of Hong-Kong and Guangdong government. In April 2002, the Guangdong government and Hong-Kong government signed an agreement to reduce sulfur dioxide emissions by 40%, nitrogen oxide by 20% and Respirable Suspended Particulates (RSPs) by 55% by 2010. To achieve this target cost-effectively, these two government plan to design a market-based mechanism, a trading system. In 2006, the implementation plan of “emission trading pilot programme on coal-fired power plants of pearl river delta” has been prepared. The trading system will be in place by 2010. The trading system between Guangdong and Hong-Kong can not only achieve the reduction target of sulfur dioxide but also achieve a co-benefit of GHGs reductions.

**Brief conclusion**

As a province with less energy resource, the higher energy prices became the best incentives to restructure industry and improve energy efficiency in Guangdong. Like Beijing, Guangdong is also facing environmental pressure and air quality problems. But the Guangdong government relies more on macro-control policies and market based mechanism to adjust the energy structure, industry layout and reduce pollutants. Although those means cannot lead to a sharp improvement of energy efficiency and environment quality, it can provide a long-term solution for the local government.

**6 Case Study 3: Shanghai**

Shanghai is the biggest city in China and it is also one of the richest cities. In 2005, GDP in Shanghai reached 915.418 billion yuan RMB while the total energy consumption was about 80.69 million tce with a growth rate of 8% annually since the year 2000 [17]. Like Guangdong province, there is almost no primary resource in Shanghai and the pressure for environment is increasing. To satisfy energy demand and reduce pollutant emissions is a challenging task for Shanghai government while keeping its fast economic development. In the year 2005, the Energy intensity in Shanghai was 0.88 tce/10⁴ yuan, about 16.5% lower than that of 2000 [18].

**Local policies**

**Regulations and guidelines:**

Shanghai has published a series of regulations and guidelines to prompt energy conservation. For example, Shanghai government has issued the energy conservation measurement in building sector. Shanghai is also the first city in china to publish the distributed heating system engineering technology standards. Shanghai government also implement measures to make the public aware of the problems of energy efficiency and energy conservation.
Shanghai government asks that every department takes the lead in saving energy and sets a good example for the whole society in energy conservation. Energy saving technologies and energy management activities have been taken in government offices to reduce the energy consumption of electricity and oil. In governmental offices, green lighting facilities and natural lighting design have been adopted.

26°C action: In Shanghai, the air-conditioners are required to be set at a temperature not lower than 26°C in summer and not higher than 20°C in winter. The aim of 26°C action is not only to save electricity in peak time but also to keep the local citizens aware of energy conservation and create a good atmosphere of energy conservation through joint efforts of the whole society.

Energy Conservation Supervision Center [19]

Authorized by the local government, Shanghai Energy Conservation Supervision Center (SECSC) is the first non-profit energy conservation administrative organization in China. It is affiliated to Shanghai Economic Commission.

SECSC takes an active part in the dissemination of energy conservation information, good case studies, technological consultation and energy conservation popularization and training, etc. It has been given the title of the advanced unit of energy conservation in Shanghai and in China.

Financial subsidies:

Green electricity [20]

The Shanghai Green Electricity Scheme offers electricity consumers in Shanghai the opportunity to “green” their electricity consumption by buying some amount of green electricity for which a premium needs to be paid. The scheme was developed with the support of the Municipal Government, the electric power company and consumers. Through the green electricity project, Shanghai citizens can directly contribute to improve the environment in Shanghai and to build a sustainable future for their children. This project is part of a series of measures to which the city committed during when applying for the World Exposition.

The Municipal Government guarantees that the additional payment for Green Electricity will be used to develop additional renewable electricity generating capacity in the Shanghai Municipality such as wind farms. Participants will be awarded a certificate of participation as a proof of participation and to show that they care about the environment in Shanghai.

To maintain trust in the scheme, a transparent mechanism has been developed to verify and certify that all green electricity sold has actually been produced. This will be done by an independent supervising body who will audit the green electricity accounts and publish the audit results. The Shanghai Energy Conservation Supervision Center holds the information about purchase and sale of Green Electricity and submits relevant reports to the Shanghai Economic Commission.
**Brief conclusion**

The total energy consumption and total electricity demand of Shanghai city increase respectively about 5% - 7% every year. But the coal still plays an important role in the energy mix of Shanghai, accounting for 52.82% in 2005. To improve the energy efficiency in Shanghai, the Shanghai government not only adopted macro-control policies to address energy issues but also promote energy conservation idea from public awareness. The Shanghai experience shows that it is important to keep the local residence aware of the problem of energy conservation and environment pressures. The public awareness makes it possible to meet the energy and environment challenge through the joint effort of the whole society.

**7 Analysis & Conclusion**

The Chinese government is developing an overarching energy strategy to address the country’s current energy shortage and environmental degradation issues. To cope with these challenges, the Chinese government has set an ambitious target to achieve a deep reduction target for energy intensity and major pollutants. Although climate change is not a priority at national and local level, there are opportunities to achieve GHGs reductions through integrating the emission reduction into energy and environment target.

The central and local governments in China have their own different responsibilities in policy making, fiscal right and fiscal expenditure. In China, the role of central government is to set national target, laws and general guidelines. The existing fiscal system and performance evaluation system is adequate for promoting the development of the local economy but is unfavorable for supporting the choice of a sustainable development path. The central government has been reforming the performance evaluation system to change the behavior of local government.

The Beijing case shows the investment and fiscal input are crucial for improving energy efficiency and air quality through supplying public services. Such measures need huge amount of financial subsidies and are unaffordable for most of the province in the western region. To help the western province achieve their target, a special fiscal transfer from central government to local government may be important. A special account at local budget is also necessary to make the fiscal transfer a stable and long-term financing solution.

The Guangdong case shows the energy price itself may be the best incentive to improve energy efficiency. There are only five provinces with an electricity retail price higher than 0.5 RMB/kWh in 2005: Guangdong, Hainan, Shanghai, Jiangsu and Zhejiang. There five provinces are also the five most efficient province in energy intensity (except Beijing). The pricing of energy resource is the responsibility of central government in China. The central government should adjust the pricing mechanism of energy as soon as possible to include the environment cost of energy into account and make it a signal to reflect the supply and demand. A tax reduction
scheme for energy conservation project or products is also an policy option for central government to set an incentive based policy at national level.

Shanghai case shows that the government is not the only stakeholder to energy and environment issues. The public awareness and the efforts of the whole society is extremely important to achieve the target of energy saving and pollutant control. In local level, the local government is only not the policymaker of local regulations and guidelines but also a messenger to keep the local citizens aware of the challenge of energy and environmental problems.

Finally, macro-control policies at national level should be strengthened to induce the national industry layout. Coordination by central government is also needed to avoid the transfer of high energy consumption industry between provinces.

References


Tables and Figures

Figure 1 Energy Intensity of different province in China

Figure 2 China Energy Label
NOTE DI LAVORO DELLA FONDAZIONE ENI ENRICO MATTEI

Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei Working Paper Series

Our Note di Lavoro are available on the Internet at the following addresses:
http://www.feem.it/Feem/Pub/Publications/WPapers/default.htm
http://www.repec.org
http://agecon.lib.umn.edu
http://www.bepress.com/feem/

NOTE DI LAVORO PUBLISHED IN 2007


PRCG 3.2007  Cesare Dosi and Michele Moretto: Concession Bidding Rules and Investment Time Flexibility


PRCG 5.2007  Bernardo Bortolotti, William Megginson and Scott B. Smart: The Rise of Accelerated Seasoned Equity Underwritings

CCMP 6.2007  Valentina Bossetti and Massimo Tavoni: Uncertain R&D, Backstop Technology and GHGs Stabilization


CCMP 8.2007  Mónica Serrano (lxxxi): The Production and Consumption Accounting Principles as a Guideline for Designing Environmental Tax Policy


CCMP 10.2007  Valentina Bossetti, Emanuele Massetti, and Massimo Tavoni: The WITCH Model. Structure, Baseline, Solutions

SIEV 11.2007  Margherita Turvani, Aline Chiabai, Anna Albertini and Stefania Tonin: Public Policies for Contaminated Site Cleanup: The Opinions of the Italian Public


NRM 13.2007  Francesco Bosello, Barbara Buchner, Jacopo Crimi, Carlo Giapponi and Andrea Povellato: The Kyoto Protocol and the Effect of Existing and Planned Measures in the Agricultural and Forestry Sector in the EU25

NRM 14.2007  Francesco Bosello, Carlo Giapponi and Andrea Povellato: A Review of Recent Studies on Cost Effectiveness of GHG Mitigation Measures in the European Agro-Forestry Sector

CCMP 15.2007  Massimo Tavoni, Brent Sohngen, and Valentina Bosetti: Forestry and the Carbon Market Response to Stabilize Climate

ETA 16.2007  Erik Ansink and Arjan Ruijs: Climate Change and the Stability of Water Allocation Agreements

ETA 17.2007  François Guizard and Stéphane Hallegatte: Compact or Spread-Out Cities: Urban Planning, Taxation, and the Vulnerability to Transportation Shocks

NRM 18.2007  Giovanni Bella: A Bug’s Life: Competition Among Species Towards the Environment

IEM 19.2007  Valeria Termini and Laura Cavallo: "Spot, Bilateral and Futures Trading in Electricity Markets, Implications for Stability"

ETN 20.2007  Stéphane Hallegatte and Michael Ghi: Endogenous Business Cycles and the Economic Response to Exogenous Shocks

CCMP 21.2007  Thierry Bréchet, François Gerard and Henry Tulkens: Climate Coalitions: A Theoretical and Computational Appraisal


CCMP 24.2007  Massimiliano Mazzanti, Anna Montini and Roberto Zoboli: Economic Dynamics, Emission Trends and the EKC Hypothesis New Evidence Using NAMEA and Provincial Panel Data for Italy

ETA 25.2007  Joan Canton: Redealing the Cards: How the Presence of an Eco-Industry Modifies the Political Economy of Environmental Policies

ETA 26.2007  Joan Canton: Environmental Taxation and International Eco-Industries

CCMP 27.2007  Oscar Cacho and Leslie Lipper (lxxxi): Abatement and Transaction Costs of Carbon-Sink Projects Involving Smallholders

CCMP 28.2007  A. Caparrós, E. Cerdá, P. Ovando and P. Campos (lxxxi): Carbon Sequestration with Reforestations and Biodiversity-Scenic Values

Pricing in a Multi-dimensional Setting

Exchange Networks

Heterogeneous Agents

and Wisdom of Crowds

Benjamin Golub and Matthew O. Jackson

Approach

Fossil Fuel Use and to Preserve Biodiversity

and Pareto Improvements?

Overview

Edwin van der Werf and Sonja Peterson

Change

Integration in Europe: What Can We learn from the EU Emission Trading Scheme?

Technologies

ICZM Stakeholders

Model

Kelly C. de Bruin, Rob B. Dellink and Richard S.J. Tol

Growth

A Politico-Economic Model of Aging, Technology Adoption and Dynamic Panel Analysis

Climate Change

Veronica Ronchi

Electoral Support in Mexico and Argentina in the '90s

Productivity: Trade-Off or Joint Dynamics? Empirical Evidence Using NAMEA Panel Data

Projections of Anthropogenic Carbon Dioxide Emissions?

Klaus Keller, Louise I. Miltich, Alexander Robinson and Richard S.J. Tol

for Green Growth Accounting

Exploration of Company Characteristics

Beliefs in Contingent Valuation

Interaction Between Environmental Taxes and Innovation Externalities

Degradation and Food Security in Agricultural and Forested Lands in Developing Countries

Conventions through Land Use Changes: Carbon Sequestration, Biodiversity Conservation, Prevention of Land Degradation and Food Security in Agricultural and Forested Lands inDeveloping Countries

ETA 31.2007

Michele Moretto and Gianpaolo Rossini: Are Workers’ Enterprises Entry Policies Conventional

KTHC 32.2007


CCMP 33.2007

Royer Gerlagh and Onno Kaik: Carbon Leakage with International Technology Spillovers

CCMP 34.2007

Richard S.J. Tol: The Impact of a Carbon Tax on International Tourism

CCMP 35.2007


SIEV 36.2007

Anna Albertini and Alberto Longo: Valuing the Cultural Monuments of Armenia: Bayesian Updating of Prior Beliefs in Contingent Valuation

CCMP 37.2007

Roeland Bracke, Tom Verbeke and Veerle Dejonckheere: What Distinguishes EMAS Participants? An Exploration of Company Characteristics

CCMP 38.2007


CCMP 39.2007


CCMP 40.2007


PRCG 41.2007

Veronica Ronchi: Populism and Neopopulism in Latin America: Clientelism, Trade Union Organisation and Electoral Support in Mexico and Argentina in the '90s

PRCG 42.2007

Veronica Ronchi: The Neoliberal Myth in Latin America: The Cases of Mexico and Argentina in the '90s

CCMP 43.2007

David Anthoff, Cameron Hepburn and Richard S.J. Tol: Equity Weighting and the Marginal Damage Costs of Climate Change

ETA 44.2007

Bouwe R. Dijkstra and Dirk T.G. Rübbelke: Group Rewards and Individual Sanctions in Environmental Policy

KTHC 45.2007


CCMP 46.2007

Enrica De Cian, Elisa Lanzi and Roberto Rosson: The Impact of Temperature Change on Energy Demand: A Dynamic Panel Analysis

CCMP 47.2007

Edwin van der Werf: Production Functions for Climate Policy Modeling: A Numerical Analysis

KTHC 48.2007

Francesco Lancia and Giovanni Prarolo: A Politico-Economic Model of Aging, Technology Adoption and Growth

NRM 49.2007

Giulia Minoia: Gender Issue and Water Management in the Mediterranean Basin, Middle East and North Africa

KTHC 50.2007

Susanna Mancinelli and Massimiliano Mazzanti: SME Performance, Innovation and Networking Evidence on Complementarities for a Local Economic System

CCMP 51.2007

Kelly C. de Bruin, Rob B. Dellink and Richard S.J. Tol: AD-DICE: An Implementation of Adaptation in the DICE Model

NRM 52.2007

Frank van Kouwen, Carel Dieperink, Paul P. Schot and Martin J. Wassen: Interactive Problem Structuring with ICZM Stakeholders

CCMP 53.2007

Valeria Costantini and Francesco Crespi: Environmental Regulation and the Export Dynamics of Energy Technologies

CCMP 54.2007

Barbara Buchner, Michela Catenacci and Alessandra Sgobbi: Governance and Environmental Policy Integration in Europe: What Can We learn from the EU Emission Trading Scheme?

CCMP 55.2007

David Anthoff and Richard S.J. Tol: On International Equity Weights and National Decision Making on Climate Change

CCMP 56.2007

Edwin van der Werf and Sonja Peterson: Modeling Linkages Between Climate Policy and Land Use: An Overview

CCMP 57.2007

Fabien Prieur: The Environmental Kuznets Curve in a World of Irreversibility

KTHC 58.2007

Roberto Antonietti and Giulio Cainelli: Production Outsourcing, Organizational Governance and Firm’s Technological Performance: Evidence from Italy

SIEV 59.2007

Marco Percoli: Urban Transport Policies and the Environment: Evidence from Italy

ETA 60.2007


CCMP 61.2007


CCMP 62.2007

Jordi Roca and Mònica Serrano: Atmospheric Pollution and Consumption Patterns in Spain: An Input-Output Approach

CCMP 63.2007

Derek W. Bunn and Carlo Fezzi (lxxxi): Interaction of European Carbon Trading and Energy Prices

CTN 64.2007

Benjamin Golub and Matthew O. Jackson (lxxxiii): Naive Learning in Social Networks: Convergence, Influence and Wisdom of Crowds

CTN 65.2007

Jacob K. Goeree, Arno Riedl and Aljaž Ule (lxxxiii): In Search of Stars: Network Formation among Heterogeneous Agents

CTN 66.2007

Gönül Doğan, M.A.L.M. van Assen, Arnout van de Rijt, and Vincent Buskens (lxxxiii): The Stability of Exchange Networks

CTN 67.2007

Ben Zissimos (lxxxiii): Why are Trade Agreements Regional?

CTN 68.2007

Jacques Drèze, Michel Le Breton, Alexei Savvateev and Shlomo Weber (lxxxiii): «Almost» Subsidy-free Spatial Pricing in a Multi-dimensional Setting

CTN 69.2007

Ana Babus (lxxxiii): The Formation of Financial Networks
(lxxxiii) This paper was presented at the EAERE-FEEM-VIU Summer School on "Computable General Equilibrium Modeling in Environmental and Resource Economics", held in Venice from June 25th to July 1st, 2006 and supported by the Marie Curie Series of Conferences "European Summer School in Resource and Environmental Economics".

(lxxxii) This paper was presented at the Workshop on "Climate Mitigation Measures in the Agro-Forestry Sector and Biodiversity Futures", Trieste, 16-17 October 2006 and jointly organised by The Ecological and Environmental Economics - EEE Programme, The Abdus Salam International Centre for Theoretical Physics - ICTP, UNESCO Man and the Biosphere Programme - MAB, and The International Institute for Applied Systems Analysis - IIASA.

(lxxxiii) This paper was presented at the 12th Coalition Theory Network Workshop organised by the Center for Operation Research and Econometrics (CORE) of the Université Catholique de Louvain, held in Louvain-la-Neuve, Belgium on 18-20 January 2007.

2007 SERIES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Series</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Editor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CCMP</td>
<td>Climate Change Modelling and Policy</td>
<td>Marzio Galeotti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIEV</td>
<td>Sustainability Indicators and Environmental Valuation</td>
<td>Anil Markandya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NRM</td>
<td>Natural Resources Management</td>
<td>Carlo Giupponi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KTHC</td>
<td>Knowledge, Technology, Human Capital</td>
<td>Gianmarco Ottaviano</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IEM</td>
<td>International Energy Markets</td>
<td>Matteo Manera</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSRM</td>
<td>Corporate Social Responsibility and Sustainable Management</td>
<td>Giulio Sapelli</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRCG</td>
<td>Privatisation Regulation Corporate Governance</td>
<td>Bernardo Bortolotti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ETA</td>
<td>Economic Theory and Applications</td>
<td>Carlo Carraro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTN</td>
<td>Coalition Theory Network</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Andrea Galeotti and Sanjeev Goyal: A Theory of Strategic Diffusion
Francesco Bosello, Enrica De Cian and Roberto Roson: Climate Change, Energy Demand and Market Power in a General Equilibrium Model of the World Economy
Gaston Giordana and Marc Willinger: Fixed Instruments to Cope with Stock Externalities An Experimental Evaluation
Oguzhan Dincer and Eric Uslaner: Trust and Growth
Fei Teng and Alun Gu: Climate Change: National and Local Policy Opportunities in China