Stark, Oded; Fan, C. Simon

Working Paper
International migration and educated unemployment

ZEF Discussion Papers on Development Policy, No. 110

Provided in Cooperation with:
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung / Center for Development Research (ZEF), University of Bonn

Suggested Citation: Stark, Oded; Fan, C. Simon (2006) : International migration and educated unemployment, ZEF Discussion Papers on Development Policy, No. 110, University of Bonn, Center for Development Research (ZEF), Bonn

This Version is available at:
http://hdl.handle.net/10419/32276

Terms of use:
Documents in EconStor may be saved and copied for your personal and scholarly purposes.
You are not to copy documents for public or commercial purposes, to exhibit the documents publicly, to make them publicly available on the internet, or to distribute or otherwise use the documents in public.
If the documents have been made available under an Open Content Licence (especially Creative Commons Licences), you may exercise further usage rights as specified in the indicated licence.
The Center for Development Research (ZEF) was established in 1995 as an international, interdisciplinary research institute at the University of Bonn. Research and teaching at ZEF aims to contribute to resolving political, economic and ecological development problems. ZEF closely cooperates with national and international partners in research and development organizations. For information, see: http://www.zef.de.

ZEF – Discussion Papers on Development Policy are intended to stimulate discussion among researchers, practitioners and policy makers on current and emerging development issues. Each paper has been exposed to an internal discussion within the Center for Development Research (ZEF) and an external review. The papers mostly reflect work in progress.


ISSN: 1436-9931

Published by:
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF)
Center for Development Research
Walter-Flex-Strasse 3
D - 53113 Bonn
Germany
Phone: +49-228-73-1861
Fax: +49-228-73-1869
E-Mail: zef@uni-bonn.de
http://www.zef.de

The authors:
Oded Stark, Center for Development Research (ZEF), University of Bonn, Bonn, Germany (contact: ostark@uni-bonn.de).
C. Simon Fan, Lingnan University, Tuen Mun, Hong Kong and University of Klagenfurt, Klagenfurt, Austria (contact: fansimon@ln.edu.hk).
# Contents

Acknowledgements

Abstract

Kurzfassung

1 Introduction 1

2 Migration and "Educated Unemployment" 3

3 The Choice of Acquiring Higher Education 8

4 A Brain Drain versus a "Brain Gain" 12

5 Conclusions 15

References 17
Acknowledgements

We are grateful to Gordon Hanson and to an anonymous referee for helpful advice, enlightening comments, and constructive suggestions. Financial support from the Humboldt Foundation, the Sohmen Foundation, and the International Centre for the Study of East Asian Development is gratefully acknowledged.
Abstract

This paper provides a novel explanation of “educated unemployment,” which is a salient feature of the labor markets in a number of developing countries. In a simple job-search framework we show that “educated unemployment” is caused by the perspective of international migration, that is, by the possibility of a “brain drain.” In addition, the analysis shows that a developing country may end up with more educated workers despite the brain drain and educated unemployment.
Kurzfassung

Dieser Aufsatz liefert einen neuen Erklärungsansatz für Arbeitslosigkeit bei gebildeten Personen, einem hervorstechenden Kennzeichen des Arbeitsmarktes in vielen Entwicklungsländern. In einem einfachen Stellensuchmodell wird gezeigt, dass die Arbeitslosigkeit von gebildeten Personen durch die Aussicht auf internationale Migration verursacht ist, d.h. durch die Möglichkeit der Abwanderung hoch qualifizierter Arbeitskräfte. Darüber hinaus zeigt die Untersuchung, dass ein Entwicklungsland trotz der Abwanderung hoch qualifizierter Arbeitskräfte und trotz der Arbeitslosigkeit von gebildeten Personen letztendlich dennoch über eine größere Anzahl gebildeter Arbeitskräfte verfügen könnte.
1. Introduction

There are two salient features of many writings on human capital in developing countries. First, a fraction of the educated workforce migrates to developed countries. Since educated workers are one of the scarcest resources in developing countries, it has been argued that the migration of educated workers is a “brain drain” for the developing countries (for a systematic review see Bhagwati and Wilson 1989). Second, in a number of developing countries, a large fraction of the educated workforce is unemployed. For example, in their influential development economics textbook, Gillis et al. (1996) allude to the Sri Lankan experience as a striking example, noting that half of the country’s new university graduates were unemployed in the 1970s.1 The phenomenon of educated unemployment in those developing countries contrasts sharply with the pattern of unemployment in developed countries. In the latter, the unemployment rate and educational attainment are strongly negatively correlated (Ashenfelter and Ham, 1979).

However, while there has been extensive research on the “brain drain,”2 the issue of “educated unemployment” has attracted little attention in the economics literature, despite references to its importance in development economics textbooks. A notable exception is an article by Bhagwati and Hamada (1974). In a fixed-wage framework, Bhagwati and Hamada argue that a high foreign wage

---

1 Also, Mathew (1997) reports that in urban Kerala, India in 1983, the unemployment rate of university graduates was 11.34 percent for males and 25.69 percent for females, which is much higher than the unemployment rate of those who had no education (3.52 percent for males, and 1.52 percent for females), and the unemployment rate of those who had up to primary education (6.73 percent for males, and 8.43 percent for females). More recently, Boudarbat (2004) shows that in 2000, the unemployment rate of university graduates in Morocco was about four times that of individuals who had acquired less than six years of schooling.

2 The topic of the brain drain is also regularly taken up in the informed press (see the short overview in Stark (2004)).
can increase the fixed wage rate of the educated in the home country by affecting people’s psychology and that, in turn, the higher fixed wage increases unemployment. However, since educated unemployment is not a serious problem in all the developing countries, Bhagwati and Hamada could not explain why a high foreign wage affects the psychology of people in some countries but not in others.

The current paper provides an alternative model of “educated unemployment”. In the model developed in this paper, “educated unemployment” is caused by the perspective of international migration, that is, by the possibility of a “brain drain.” In a simple job-search framework we show that an individual’s reservation wage in the labor market of the home country increases with the probability of working abroad. Consequently, workers who fail to line up employment abroad are less likely to immediately immerse themselves in work in their home country. Instead, they enter unemployment in order to engage in a repeated attempt to secure foreign employment. Thus, we provide a new explanation for the phenomenon of “educated unemployment” observed in developing countries. Our theoretical analysis provides a basis and a rationale for rigorous empirical tests of this important phenomenon which, to the best of our knowledge, are absent in the received literature. Moreover, our main argument that international migration and “educated unemployment” are closely linked seems to be consistent with considerable anecdotal evidence and policy-related research.

We integrate the “educated unemployment” - international migration perspec-

---

3 For example, Bhagwati and Hamada (1974, p. 20) state: “The presence of international income-inequality implies that, for the educated elite which is better informed about the developed world, and more integrated therewith regarding the notions of a ‘good life’ and related values, the salary levels demanded and fixed by the elite groups tend to reflect the salary levels of comparable groups in the more developed countries.”

4 For example, see King (1987) and Tullao (1982).
tive with the recent literature on the “beneficial brain drain,” which contends that compared to a closed economy, an economy open to migration differs not only in the opportunities that workers face but also in the structure of the incentives that they confront: higher prospective returns to human capital in a foreign country impinge favorably on human capital formation decisions at home. The analysis of this paper shows that a developing country may end up with more educated workers despite the brain drain and educated unemployment. In other words, the average level of human capital in the country may well be higher under migration than in the absence of migration. This higher level can play a critical positive role in determining long-run, future output growth, the present-day gloom of “educated unemployment” notwithstanding.

Sections 2 and 3 set up the basic analytical framework and present a model of educated unemployment. Section 4 presents an analysis demonstrating that the perspective of international migration can lead to a “brain gain” despite “brain drain” and the possibility of being unemployed after acquiring a higher level of education. Section 5 offers conclusions and complementary reflections.

2. Migration and “educated unemployment”

Consider a world that consists of two countries: home, H, and foreign, F. Country H is developing and is poorer than developed country F. Due to a policy of selective migration by F, only educated individuals (say university graduates) of H have a chance of working in, hence migrating to, F.

In this section we analyze the behavior of the home country’s educated indi-

\[5\] For example, see Stark, Helmenstein, and Prskawetz (1997, 1998), Mountford (1997), and Stark and Wang (2002).
viduals. In the next section we incorporate into the model the cost of education and we analyze the decision to acquire education.

In this section we assume that everyone in $H$ is educated. The decision making process of an educated individual is illustrated by Figure 1:

Figure 1 is to be inserted here

An educated individual makes decisions in (at most) three stages:6

1. The first stage. When an individual graduates from a university, the individual participates in a draw that results in probable work in $F$. If the individual obtains a winning ticket, his income will be $w_f$.

   The probability of being selected into work in $F$ is $p$.

2. The second stage. (Note that there is no second stage for individuals who win the draw.) An individual who graduates and fails to secure work in $F$ faces the following choices: to work or to wait for another draw. Waiting for another draw frees time to search for a job in $F$. Alternatively, if the individual were to work, little time (and energy) would be available for preparing applications and, in addition, the individual’s academic qualifications could depreciate, thereby lowering the probability of being picked up for work in $F$.7

---

6 We assume that relative to the duration of the individual’s working life, the duration of the three stages is short.

7 Schaafsma and Sweetman (2001) show that “working experience in the source country yields virtually no return in the host country.”
The assumption that individuals choose unemployment while waiting for another draw of going abroad is particularly consistent with the job-search theory. In fact, the assumption that the probability of finding a (new) job is higher when an individual does not hold a job, but instead concentrates on searching for a job, is at the heart of the literature on job search and the natural rate of unemployment (see, for example, Mortensen (1986), Acemoglu and Shimer (1999), and Rogerson, Shimer, and Wright (2005)). The rationale underlying this assumption is that searching for a job requires time and effort. The received job-search theory refers to domestic markets. It is reasonable to assume that finding a job in a foreign labor market requires even more time and effort.8

For simplicity, we assume that if the individual works, he cannot participate in any additional draw so that his probability of ending up working in F is zero. If the individual does not work and awaits another draw, his chances of going abroad are

\[ p' \].

(3) The third stage. (Note that the third stage only applies to those who waited for another draw in the second stage.) If an individual wins this draw, he will go abroad. Otherwise, he will work at home, receiving the home country’s mean wage rate.

The job offers in the second and the third stage follow an independently identical distribution. The cumulative distribution function of the wage offer, \( \tilde{w} \), is

---

8Information on the employment status of migrants at home in developing countries prior to migration is scanty. Rudimentary studies suggest that on several occasions, nearly half of the migrants from India were unemployed prior to migration (Srivastava and Sasikumar, 2003). Additional empirical work on the employment status of individuals prior to their international migration would be of considerable interest.
We assume that $F(\bullet)$ is differentiable. We also assume that

$$\bar{w} \in [w^l, w^h]$$

and that the density function, $\frac{dF(w)}{dw} \equiv F'(w)$, is strictly positive in its domain, that is

$$F'(w) > 0 \quad \forall w \in [w^l, w^h].$$

The expected income of the (risk-neutral) individuals in the third stage is

$$(1 - p^l)\bar{w} + p^l w^f \quad (2.1)$$

where $\bar{w}$ is the mean wage in H, namely,

$$\bar{w} = \int_{w^l}^{w^h} w dF(w).$$

In the second stage, if the individual receives a wage offer $w$ at H, he will accept it if and only if

$$w > \frac{1}{1 + r}[(1 - p^l)\bar{w} + p^l w^f], \quad (2.2)$$

where $r$ is the individual’s discount rate.

We define

$$w^c \equiv \frac{1}{1 + r}[(1 - p^l)\bar{w} + p^l w^f]. \quad (2.3)$$

Then, the individual will accept the wage offer at H if and only if

$$w > w^c.$$  

Thus, $w^c$ is the individual’s reservation wage at H.
Further simplifying, we assume that

\[ w^l \geq \frac{1}{1 + r} \]  

(2.4)

educated unemployment will not exist in the absence of an additional possibility of migration (that is, when \( p' = 0 \)).

Then, the fraction of the educated who are unemployed is

\[ u \equiv P(\tilde{w} \leq w^e) = F(w^e) \]  

(2.5)

Clearly,

\[ \frac{du}{dp'} = \frac{du}{dw^e} \frac{dw^e}{dp'} \]

\[ = \frac{F'(w^f - \tilde{w})}{1 + r} \]  

(2.6)

Note that the assumption that \( F \) is developed and \( H \) is developing naturally implies that \( w^f > \tilde{w} \). Since \( F' > 0 \),

\[ \frac{du}{dp'} > 0 \]  

(2.7)

In addition, noting that \( w^e \equiv \frac{1}{1 + r} [\tilde{w} + p'(w^f - \tilde{w})] \),

\[ \frac{du}{d(w^f - \tilde{w})} = F' \frac{p'}{1 + r} > 0 \]  

(2.8)

In summary, we have the following proposition.

**Proposition 1:** (1) The unemployment rate of university graduates in a developing country will increase as the probability of migration rises. (2) The unemployment rate of university graduates in a developing country will increase as the wage gap between the developed country and the developing country increases.

---

9 Although this assumption is not necessary, resorting to it highlights the notion that “educated unemployment” is caused by the prospect of migration.

10 Note that in the current model, to facilitate our concentrating on essentials, unemployment applies only to stage 2 of the individuals’ decision making processes.
Proposition 1 implies that in a developing country, “educated unemployment” is caused by the prospect of international migration, that is, by the possibility of a “brain drain.” The greater the probability of being selected for work in the foreign country and the greater the wage gap between the foreign country and the developing country, the more serious the “educated unemployment” problem. The intuition underlying the proposition is straightforward. From (2.3) we can see that \( w^c \) increases with \( p^f \) and with \( w^f \), and that it decreases with \( \pi \), which means that the individual’s reservation wage in the home labor market increases with the probability of working abroad and with the international wage gap. Consequently, the unemployment rate will increase as the reservation wage rises.

Moreover, we have assumed for the sake of simplicity that only educated individuals (say university graduates) of the home country have a chance of working in, hence migrating to, the foreign country. If we modify this assumption slightly, such that a better educated individual in a developing country faces a higher probability of working abroad, then by similar logic to Proposition 1, we will obtain the result that the unemployment rate is higher for individuals with higher education.

3. The choice of acquiring higher education

The benefit that education without migration confers is simply H’s mean wage rate of educated workers

\[ \bar{w} . \]

When migration is a possibility, the expected payoff from the three stages
described in the preceding section is

\[ V \equiv pw^f + (1 - p^0)\left\{ \int_{w^c}^{w^h} wdF(w) + F(w^c)[\frac{p'w^f + (1 - p')\overline{w}}{1 + r}] \right\} \]

\[ = pw^f + (1 - p^0)\left[ \int_{w^c}^{w^h} wF'(w)dw + F(w^c)w^c \right] . \quad (3.1) \]

Clearly,

\[ \frac{dV}{dw^f} = p + (1 - p)[-F'(w^c)w^c + F'(w^c)w^c + F(w^c)] \frac{dw^c}{dw^f} \]

\[ = p + (1 - p)F(w^c) \frac{p'}{1 + r} > 0 . \quad (3.2) \]

Let us assume that

\[ p' = p(1 + \alpha) \quad (3.3) \]

where \( \alpha \) is a fixed parameter. To ensure that \( 0 < p' < 1 \), we assume that

\[ -1 < \alpha < \frac{1}{p} - 1 . \]

Then,

\[ \frac{dV}{dp} = w^f - \left[ \int_{w^c}^{w^h} wdF(w) + F(w^c)w^c \right] \]

\[ + (1 - p)[-F'(w^c)w^c + F'(w^c)w^c + F(w^c)] \frac{(w^f - \overline{w})(1 + \alpha)}{1 + r} \]

\[ = w^f - \left[ \int_{w^c}^{w^h} wdF(w) + F(w^c)w^c \right] + (1 - p)F(w^c) \frac{(w^f - \overline{w})(1 + \alpha)}{1 + r} . \quad (3.4) \]

We further assume that

\[ w^f > w^h . \quad (3.5) \]

To rule out the unreasonable possibility that all the educated are unemployed, we assume that

\[ w^c < w^h . \quad (3.6) \]
Then, we have that
\[
\int_{w^c}^{w^h} wdF(w) + F(w^c)w^c \leq \int_{w^c}^{w^h} w^h dF(w) + F(w^c)w^h \\
= w^h \int_{w^c}^{w^h} dF(w) + F(w^c)w^h \\
= w^h (F(w^h) - F(w^c)) + F(w^c)w^h \\
= w^h .
\]

Therefore,
\[
w^I > \left[ \int_{w^c}^{w^h} wdF(w) + F(w^c)w^c \right], \tag{3.7}
\]
and it then follows from (3.4) that
\[
\frac{dV}{dp} > 0, \tag{3.8}
\]
the benefit of acquiring a university education in H increases as the probability of migration rises.

We next incorporate the cost of acquiring education. Our idea is that individuals differ in their abilities and familial background, hence in their cost of acquiring education. We normalize the size of the (pre-migration) population of H to be Lebesgue measure 1. Suppose that an individual’s cost of obtaining education, \( c \), follows the uniform distribution
\[
\tilde{c} \in [0, \Omega].
\]

We assume that the (lifetime) income of an uneducated individual is constant, and we denote it by \( \Phi \). Then, recalling the assumption that only individuals
with university degrees have any chance of migrating, an individual will choose to acquire a university education if and only if

\[ V - c \geq \Phi \]  

(3.9)

Let us define

\[ c^* \equiv V - \Phi \]  

(3.10)

It follows that an individual will obtain a university education if and only if his cost of education maintains

\[ c \leq c^* \]

Since \( \bar{c} \) follows a uniform distribution and the population size of the economy is of Lebesgue measure 1, both the proportion and the number of educated individuals are given by

\[ \frac{c^*}{\Omega} \]  

(3.11)

From (3.10) we get

\[ \frac{d(c^*/\Omega)}{dp} = \frac{1}{\Omega} \frac{dV}{dp} > 0 \]  

(3.12)

where the inequality sign in (3.12) follows from (3.8). We thus have the following proposition.

**Proposition 2:** The number of individuals undertaking university education will increase as the probability of migration rises.

This proposition implies that while the prospect of migration causes the unemployment rate of educated individuals in the home country to increase (2.7), it also induces more individuals to acquire education (3.12). The end result may be an increase in the number of unemployed university graduates. Thus, Propositions 1
and 2 provide an explanation for the phenomenon of educated unemployment by linking it to migration.

4. A brain drain versus a “brain gain”

In this section, akin to Stark, Helmenstein, and Prskawetz (1997, 1998), we seek to examine whether the prospect of migration can result in a larger number of educated individuals in the home country. Since in our model only educated individuals have a positive probability of migration, it follows that if the prospect of migration results in a larger number of educated individuals in the home country, then it will a fortiori result in a higher fraction of educated individuals in the home country.

The following proposition shows that the “brain gain” caused by the prospect of migration may be larger than the loss from the brain drain.

**Proposition 3:** There exists a positive level of $p$ at which the number of university graduates remaining in the developing country is higher than the number of university graduates in the developing country when $p = 0$, for any given $\alpha$, if $w^f > (3 + \alpha)\bar{w}$.

**Proof.** We first note that $c^*$ is a function of $V$ and hence of $p$, so we define

$$c^* = c(p).$$

Then, under the migration prospect, the number of university graduates remaining in the developing country is

$$\frac{c(p)}{\Omega} - \left[ p \frac{c(p)}{\Omega} + (1 - p)p' \frac{c(p)}{\Omega} F(w^c) \right]$$

$$= \frac{c(p)[(1 - p)(1 - (1 + \alpha)F(w^c))]}{\Omega}.$$  

12
Let us define

\[
\frac{K(p)}{\Omega} \equiv \frac{c(p)(1 - p)[1 - p(1 + \alpha)F(w^e)]}{\Omega} - \frac{c(0)}{\Omega},
\]

that is, \(\frac{K(p)}{\Omega}\) is the difference between the number of educated individuals in the home country when \(p > 0\), and the number of educated individuals in the home country when \(p = 0\).

Since

\[
K(p) \equiv c(p)(1 - p)[1 - p(1 + \alpha)F(w^e)] - c(0),
\]

we know that

\[
K(0) = 0
\]

and that

\[
K'(p) = c'(p)(1 - p)[1 - p(1 + \alpha)F(w^e)]
\]

\[
- \{1 - p(1 + \alpha)F(w^e) + (1 - p)(1 + \alpha)[F(w^e) + pF'(w^e)\frac{(w^f - \bar{w})(1 + \alpha)}{1 + r}]\}c(p).
\]

We seek to show that \(K'(0) > 0\) which, by the continuity of \(K(p)\), will imply that \(K(p) > K(0)\) in the small (positive) neighborhood of \(p = 0\). Note that

\[
K'(0) = c'(0) - [1 + (1 + \alpha)F(w^e)]c(0).
\]

When \(p = 0\), we know from assumptions (2.4) and (3.3) that educated unemployment will not exist in the absence of an additional possibility of migration, which implies that \(w^e = w^f\). Then, from the last line of (3.4) and upon noting
that $F(w^f) = 0$, we get

$$
\frac{dV}{dp}|_{p=0} = w^f - \left[ \int_{w^c}^{w^h} wdF(w) + F(w^c) w^c \right] + (1 - p)F(w^c) \frac{(w^f - \bar{w})(1 + \alpha)}{1 + r} \\
= w^f - \left[ \int_{w^f}^{w^h} wdF(w) + F(w^f) w^f \right] + (1 - p)F(w^c) \frac{(w^f - \bar{w})(1 + \alpha)}{1 + r} \\
= w^f - \bar{w}.
$$

(4.3)

Then, from the equality in (3.12), we know that $\frac{dc}{dp} = \frac{dc}{dp}|_{p=0} = \frac{dV}{dp}|_{p=0} = w^f - \bar{w}$.

When $p = 0$, $V = \bar{w}$. Hence, from (3.10) and the definition $c^* = c(p)$

$$
c(0) = V - \Phi \\
= \bar{w} - \Phi.
$$

(4.4)

Therefore, $K'(0) > 0$ if and only if

$$
w^f - \bar{w} - [1 + (1 + \alpha)F(w^c)][\bar{w} - \Phi] > 0.
$$

(4.5)

Since

$$
1 + (1 + \alpha)F(w^c) < 2 + \alpha,
$$

(4.5) will be satisfied if

$$
w^f - \bar{w} - (2 + \alpha)(\bar{w} - \Phi) > 0,
$$

that is, if

$$
w^f > (3 + \alpha)\bar{w} - (2 + \alpha)\Phi.
$$

(4.6)

Since $\Phi > 0$, it follows that when $w^f > (3 + \alpha)\bar{w}$, (4.6) will be satisfied, in which case we will have that

$$
K'(0) > 0.
$$
Hence, by the continuity of $K(p)$, we must have that $K(p) > K(0)$ in the small (positive) neighborhood of $p = 0$.

Proposition 3 shows that a developing country may end up with more university graduates despite the brain drain of university graduates. Noting that there is a reduction of the population in the wake of migration, the proposition also implies that the developing country may end up with a higher fraction of educated individuals, despite the brain drain of university graduates.

Combining Propositions 1 and 3 yields the following corollary.

**Corollary 1:** A positive level of educated unemployment in a developing country co-exists with a larger number of university graduates in the country than the number of university graduates in the country under no educated unemployment if $w^f > (3 + \alpha)\overline{w}$.

Since there are fewer individuals in the country under feasible migration, and since there are more educated individuals in the country under feasible migration, it must follow that the average level of human capital in the country is higher under migration than in the absence of migration. This higher level can play a critical role in determining long-run output growth, an issue to which we will turn in a follow-up paper.

5. Conclusions

Since the late 1960s (Todaro, 1969), the development economics literature has pointed to a stark connection between migration and unemployment: workers
change their location, but not their productive attributes, in response to an expected wage at destination that is higher than their wage at origin, only to end up unemployed. We propose a different connection between migration and unemployment wherein workers move into unemployment at origin in response to an expected wage at destination; workers improve their productive attributes. While the flight of human capital and the unemployment of human capital occupied the center stage of development economics at about the same time (the 1970s), analysts and policymakers did not make a causal connection between the two phenomena except for noting that unemployment induced a desire to migrate. Our analysis considers a link: in a simple job-search framework we show that an individual’s reservation wage in the home labor market increases with the probability of working abroad. Thus, our model implies that such unemployment would be smaller in the absence of the migration possibility. Furthermore, we integrate our model into the recent literature of “beneficial brain drain.” The analysis shows that a developing country may end up with more educated individuals despite the brain drain and educated unemployment. Our theoretical analysis provides a basis and a rationale for rigorous empirical tests of the link between international migration and educated unemployment, which are absent in the received literature. Such empirical endeavors will constitute an interesting topic for future research.
References


Figure 1: Stages in the decision making process of an educated individual

Stage 1
Stage 2
Stage 3

Graduation

p

1-p

w^f

Work

w(w > w^c)

Wait

p'

1-p'

w^f

w
The following papers have been published so far:

| No. 1 | Ulrike Grote, Arnab Basu, Diana Weinhold | Child Labor and the International Policy Debate  
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, September 1998, pp. 47. |
| No. 2 | Patrick Webb, Maria Iskandarani | Water Insecurity and the Poor: Issues and Research Needs  
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, Oktober 1998, pp. 66. |
| No. 3 | Matin Qaim, Joachim von Braun | Crop Biotechnology in Developing Countries: A Conceptual Framework for Ex Ante Economic Analyses  
| No. 4 | Sabine Seibel, Romeo Bertolini, Dietrich Müller-Falcke | Informations- und Kommunikationstechnologien in Entwicklungsländern  
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, January 1999, pp. 50. |
| No. 5 | Jean-Jacques Dethier | Governance and Economic Performance: A Survey  
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, April 1999, pp. 62. |
| No. 6 | Mingzhi Sheng | Lebensmittelhandel und Kosumtrends in China  
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, May 1999, pp. 57. |
| No. 7 | Arjun Bedi | The Role of Information and Communication Technologies in Economic Development – A Partial Survey  
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, May 1999, pp. 42. |
| No. 8 | Abdul Bayes, Joachim von Braun, Rasheda Akhter | Village Pay Phones and Poverty Reduction: Insights from a Grameen Bank Initiative in Bangladesh  
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, June 1999, pp. 47. |
| No. 9 | Johannes Jütting | Strengthening Social Security Systems in Rural Areas of Developing Countries  
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, June 1999, pp. 44. |
| No. 10 | Mamdouh Nasr | Assessing Desertification and Water Harvesting in the Middle East and North Africa: Policy Implications  
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, July 1999, pp. 59. |
| No. 11 | Oded Stark, Yong Wang | Externalities, Human Capital Formation and Corrective Migration Policy  
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, August 1999, pp. 17. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, Month Year, pp. Page(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Arnulf Heuermann</td>
<td>Die Bedeutung von Telekommunikationsdiensten für wirtschaftliches Wachstum</td>
<td>September 1999, pp. 33.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Authors</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, Month, Year, pp.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Mahendra Dev</td>
<td>Economic Liberalisation and Employment in South Asia</td>
<td>August 2000, pp. 82.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Kakoli Roy, Susanne Ziemek</td>
<td>On the Economics of Volunteering</td>
<td>August 2000, pp. 47.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Publisher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Oded Stark</td>
<td>On a Variation in the Economic Performance of Migrants by their Home Country's Wage</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Ramón López</td>
<td>Growth, Poverty and Asset Allocation: The Role of the State</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Kazuki Taketoshi</td>
<td>Environmental Pollution and Policies in China's Township and Village Industrial Enterprises</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Claudia Ringler</td>
<td>Optimal Water Allocation in the Mekong River Basin</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>Ulrike Grote, Stefanie Kirchhoff</td>
<td>Environmental and Food Safety Standards in the Context of Trade Liberalization: Issues and Options</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Renate Schubert, Simon Dietz</td>
<td>Environmental Kuznets Curve, Biodiversity and Sustainability</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Stefanie Kirchhoff, Ana María Ibañez</td>
<td>Displacement due to Violence in Colombia: Determinants and Consequences at the Household Level</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Francis Matambalya, Susanna Wolf</td>
<td>The Role of ICT for the Performance of SMEs in East Africa - Empirical Evidence from Kenya and Tanzania</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Oded Stark, Ita Falk</td>
<td>Dynasties and Destiny: On the Roles of Altruism and Impatience in the Evolution of Consumption and Bequests</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Assefa Admassie</td>
<td>Allocation of Children's Time Endowment between Schooling and Work in Rural Ethiopia</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 46</td>
<td>Torsten Feldbrügge, Joachim von Braun</td>
<td>Is the World Becoming A More Risky Place? - Trends in Disasters and Vulnerability to Them – Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, May 2002, pp. 42</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 47</td>
<td>Joachim von Braun, Peter Wobst, Ulrike Grote</td>
<td>“Development Box” and Special and Differential Treatment for Food Security of Developing Countries: Potentials, Limitations and Implementation Issues Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, May 2002, pp. 28</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 49</td>
<td>L. Adele Jinadu</td>
<td>Ethnic Conflict &amp; Federalism in Nigeria Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, September 2002, pp. 45</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 50</td>
<td>Oded Stark, Yong Wang</td>
<td>Overlapping Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, August 2002, pp. 17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 51</td>
<td>Roukayatou Zimmermann, Matin Qaim</td>
<td>Projecting the Benefits of Golden Rice in the Philippines Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, September 2002, pp. 33</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 52</td>
<td>Gautam Hazarika, Arjun S. Bedi</td>
<td>Schooling Costs and Child Labour in Rural Pakistan Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn October 2002, pp. 34</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 53</td>
<td>Margit Bussmann, Indra de Soysa, John R. Oneal</td>
<td>The Effect of Foreign Investment on Economic Development and Income Inequality Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, October 2002, pp. 35</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 54</td>
<td>Maximo Torero, Shyamal K. Chowdhury, Virgilio Galdo</td>
<td>Willingness to Pay for the Rural Telephone Service in Bangladesh and Peru Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, October 2002, pp. 39</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. 55</td>
<td>Hans-Dieter Evers, Thomas Menkhoff</td>
<td>Selling Expert Knowledge: The Role of Consultants in Singapore’s New Economy Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, October 2002, pp. 29</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
No. 56 Qiuxia Zhu
Stefanie Elbern
Economic Institutional Evolution and Further Needs for
Adjustments: Township Village Enterprises in China
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,
November 2002, pp. 41

No. 57 Ana Devic
Prospects of Multicultural Regionalism As a Democratic Barrier
Against Ethnonationalism: The Case of Vojvodina, Serbia’s
“Multiethnic Haven”
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,
December 2002, pp. 29

No. 58 Heidi Wittmer
Thomas Berger
Clean Development Mechanism: Neue Potenziale für
regenerative Energien? Möglichkeiten und Grenzen einer
verstärkten Nutzung von Bioenergieträgern in
Entwicklungsländern
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,
December 2002, pp. 81

No. 59 Oded Stark
Cooperation and Wealth
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,
January 2003, pp. 13

No. 60 Rick Auty
Towards a Resource-Driven Model of Governance: Application
to Lower-Income Transition Economies
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,
February 2003, pp. 24

No. 61 Andreas Wimmer
Indra de Soysa
Christian Wagner
Political Science Tools for Assessing Feasibility and
Sustainability of Reforms
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,
February 2003, pp. 34

No. 62 Peter Wehrheim
Doris Wiesmann
Food Security in Transition Countries: Conceptual Issues and
Cross-Country Analyses
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,
February 2003, pp. 45

No. 63 Rajeev Ahuja
Johannes Jütting
Design of Incentives in Community Based Health Insurance
Schemes
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,
March 2003, pp. 27

No. 64 Sudip Mitra
Reiner Wassmann
Paul L.G. Vlek
Global Inventory of Wetlands and their Role
in the Carbon Cycle
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,
March 2003, pp. 44

No. 65 Simon Reich
Power, Institutions and Moral Entrepreneurs
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,
March 2003, pp. 46

No. 66 Lukas Menkhoff
Chodechai Suwanaporn
The Rationale of Bank Lending in Pre-Crisis Thailand
Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn,
April 2003, pp. 37
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Institution and Location</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>68</td>
<td>Arnab K. Basu Nancy H. Chau Ulrike Grote</td>
<td>On Export Rivalry and the Greening of Agriculture – The Role of Eco-labels</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>April 2003</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>69</td>
<td>Gerd R. Rücker Soojin Park Henry Ssali John Pender</td>
<td>Strategic Targeting of Development Policies to a Complex Region: A GIS-Based Stratification Applied to Uganda</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>May 2003</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70</td>
<td>Susanna Wolf</td>
<td>Private Sector Development and Competitiveness in Ghana</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>May 2003</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71</td>
<td>Oded Stark</td>
<td>Rethinking the Brain Drain</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>June 2003</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72</td>
<td>Andreas Wimmer</td>
<td>Democracy and Ethno-Religious Conflict in Iraq</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>June 2003</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73</td>
<td>Oded Stark</td>
<td>Tales of Migration without Wage Differentials: Individual, Family, and Community Contexts</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>September 2003</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74</td>
<td>Holger Seebens Peter Wobst</td>
<td>The Impact of Increased School Enrollment on Economic Growth in Tanzania</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>October 2003</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
<td>Benedikt Korf</td>
<td>Ethnicized Entitlements? Property Rights and Civil War in Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>November 2003</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>76</td>
<td>Wolfgang Werner</td>
<td>Toasted Forests – Evergreen Rain Forests of Tropical Asia under Drought Stress</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>December 2003</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>77</td>
<td>Appukuttannair Damodaran Stefanie Engel</td>
<td>Joint Forest Management in India: Assessment of Performance and Evaluation of Impacts</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>October 2003</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Authors</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Institution and Year</td>
<td>Pages</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80</td>
<td>Anil Markandya</td>
<td>Gains of Regional Cooperation: Environmental Problems and Solutions</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, January 2004, pp. 24</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>82</td>
<td>John M. Msuya, Johannes P. Jütting, Abay Asfaw</td>
<td>Impacts of Community Health Insurance Schemes on Health Care Provision in Rural Tanzania</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, January 2004, pp. 26</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>83</td>
<td>Bernardina Algieri</td>
<td>The Effects of the Dutch Disease in Russia</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, January 2004, pp. 41</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84</td>
<td>Oded Stark</td>
<td>On the Economics of Refugee Flows</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, February 2004, pp. 8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>86</td>
<td>Qiuxia Zhu</td>
<td>The Impact of Rural Enterprises on Household Savings in China</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, May 2004, pp. 51</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>87</td>
<td>Abay Asfaw, Klaus Frohberg, K.S. James, Johannes Jütting</td>
<td>Modeling the Impact of Fiscal Decentralization on Health Outcomes: Empirical Evidence from India</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, June 2004, pp. 29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>88</td>
<td>Maja B. Micevska, Arnab K. Hazra</td>
<td>The Problem of Court Congestion: Evidence from Indian Lower Courts</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, July 2004, pp. 31</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Authors</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn, Date, Pages</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>89</td>
<td>Donald Cox, Oded Stark</td>
<td>On the Demand for Grandchildren: Tied Transfers and the Demonstration Effect</td>
<td>September 2004, pp. 44</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90</td>
<td>Stefanie Engel, Ramón López</td>
<td>Exploiting Common Resources with Capital-Intensive Technologies: The Role of External Forces</td>
<td>November 2004, pp. 32</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>91</td>
<td>Hartmut Ihne</td>
<td>Heuristic Considerations on the Typology of Groups and Minorities</td>
<td>December 2004, pp. 24</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>92</td>
<td>Johannes Sauer, Klaus Frohberg, Heinrich Hockmann</td>
<td>Black-Box Frontiers and Implications for Development Policy - Theoretical Considerations</td>
<td>December 2004, pp. 38</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95</td>
<td>Oded Stark</td>
<td>Status Aspirations, Wealth Inequality, and Economic Growth</td>
<td>February 2005, pp. 9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>97</td>
<td>Ramon Lopez, Edward B. Barbier</td>
<td>Debt and Growth</td>
<td>March 2005, pp. 30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>98</td>
<td>Hardwick Tchale, Johannes Sauer, Peter Wobst</td>
<td>Impact of Alternative Soil Fertility Management Options on Maize Productivity in Malawi’s Smallholder Farming System</td>
<td>August 2005, pp. 29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Authors</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Institute</td>
<td>Month</td>
<td>Pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>99</td>
<td>Steve Boucher, Oded Stark, J. Edward Taylor</td>
<td>A Gain with a Drain? Evidence from Rural Mexico on the New Economics of the Brain Drain</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>October</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100</td>
<td>Jumanne Abdallah, Johannes Sauer</td>
<td>Efficiency and Biodiversity - Empirical Evidence from Tanzania</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>November</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>101</td>
<td>Tobias Debiel</td>
<td>Dealing with Fragile States - Entry Points and Approaches for Development Cooperation</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>December</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>102</td>
<td>Sayan Chakrabarty, Ulrike Grote, Guido Lüchters</td>
<td>The Trade-Off Between Child Labor and Schooling: Influence of Social Labeling NGOs in Nepal</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>February</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>103</td>
<td>Bhagirath Behera, Stefanie Engel</td>
<td>Who Forms Local Institutions? Levels of Household Participation in India's Joint Forest Management Program</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>February</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>104</td>
<td>Roukayatou Zimmermann, Faruk Ahmed</td>
<td>Rice Biotechnology and Its Potential to Combat Vitamin A Deficiency: A Case Study of Golden Rice in Bangladesh</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>March</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>105</td>
<td>Adama Konseiga</td>
<td>Household Migration Decisions as Survival Strategy: The Case of Burkina Faso</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>April</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>106</td>
<td>Ulrike Grote, Stefanie Engel, Benjamin Schraven</td>
<td>Migration due to the Tsunami in Sri Lanka - Analyzing Vulnerability and Migration at the Household Level</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>April</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>107</td>
<td>Stefan Blum</td>
<td>East Africa: Cycles of Violence, and the Paradox of Peace</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>April</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>108</td>
<td>Ahmed Farouk Ghoneim, Ulrike Grote</td>
<td>Impact of Labor Standards on Egyptian Exports with Special Emphasis on Child Labor</td>
<td>Zentrum für Entwicklungsforschung (ZEF), Bonn</td>
<td>April</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>