

A Service of

ZBW

Leibniz-Informationszentrum Wirtschaft Leibniz Information Centre for Economics

Ganly, Rachel; Lehner, Lukas; Nguyen, P. Linh; Sutherland, Alex

Working Paper Replication Report: A Comment on "Politicians' Private Sector Job and Parliamentary Behavior"

I4R Discussion Paper Series, No. 203

Provided in Cooperation with: The Institute for Replication (I4R)

Suggested Citation: Ganly, Rachel; Lehner, Lukas; Nguyen, P. Linh; Sutherland, Alex (2025) : Replication Report: A Comment on "Politicians' Private Sector Job and Parliamentary Behavior", I4R Discussion Paper Series, No. 203, Institute for Replication (I4R), s.l.

This Version is available at: https://hdl.handle.net/10419/311308

Standard-Nutzungsbedingungen:

Die Dokumente auf EconStor dürfen zu eigenen wissenschaftlichen Zwecken und zum Privatgebrauch gespeichert und kopiert werden.

Sie dürfen die Dokumente nicht für öffentliche oder kommerzielle Zwecke vervielfältigen, öffentlich ausstellen, öffentlich zugänglich machen, vertreiben oder anderweitig nutzen.

Sofern die Verfasser die Dokumente unter Open-Content-Lizenzen (insbesondere CC-Lizenzen) zur Verfügung gestellt haben sollten, gelten abweichend von diesen Nutzungsbedingungen die in der dort genannten Lizenz gewährten Nutzungsrechte.

Terms of use:

Documents in EconStor may be saved and copied for your personal and scholarly purposes.

You are not to copy documents for public or commercial purposes, to exhibit the documents publicly, to make them publicly available on the internet, or to distribute or otherwise use the documents in public.

If the documents have been made available under an Open Content Licence (especially Creative Commons Licences), you may exercise further usage rights as specified in the indicated licence.



WWW.ECONSTOR.EU

INSTITUTE for **REPLICATION**

No. 203 I4R DISCUSSION PAPER SERIES

Replication Report: A Comment on "Politicians' Private Sector Job and Parliamentary Behavior"

Rachel Ganly Lukas Lehner P. Linh Nguyen Alex Sutherland

February 2025



I4R DISCUSSION PAPER SERIES

I4R DP No. 203

Replication Report: A Comment on "Politicians' Private Sector Job and Parliamentary Behavior"

Rachel Ganly¹, Lukas Lehner², P. Linh Nguyen^{3,4,5}, Alex Sutherland¹

¹University of Oxford/Great Britain ²University of Edinburgh/Great Britian ³University of Essex, Colchester/Great Britain ⁴University of Mannheim/Germany ⁵French Institute for Demographic Studies, Aubervilliers/France

FEBRUARY 2025

Any opinions in this paper are those of the author(s) and not those of the Institute for Replication (I4R). Research published in this series may include views on policy, but I4R takes no institutional policy positions.

I4R Discussion Papers are research papers of the Institute for Replication which are widely circulated to promote replications and metascientific work in the social sciences. Provided in cooperation with EconStor, a service of the <u>ZBW – Leibniz Information Centre for Economics</u>, and <u>RWI – Leibniz Institute for Economic Research</u>, I4R Discussion Papers are among others listed in RePEc (see IDEAS, EconPapers). Complete list of all I4R DPs - downloadable for free at the I4R website.

I4R Discussion Papers often represent preliminary work and are circulated to encourage discussion. Citation of such a paper should account for its provisional character. A revised version may be available directly from the author.

Editors

Abel Brodeur University of Ottawa Anna Dreber Stockholm School of Economics Jörg Ankel-Peters RWI – Leibniz Institute for Economic Research

E-Mail: joerg.peters@rwi-essen.de	Hohenzollernstraße 1-3	www.i4replication.org
RWI – Leibniz Institute for Economic Research	45128 Essen/Germany	

Replication Report A comment on "Politicians' Private Sector Job and Parliamentary Behavior"*

Rachel Ganly, Lukas Lehner, P. Linh Nguyen, Alex Sutherland

January 17, 2025

Abstract

Weschle (2024) examines the effect of UK legislators taking private sector jobs while holding office on their parliamentary behaviour. The published analysis employs two-way fixed effects and difference-in-differences as an identification strategy. In that analysis, which we were able to computationally reproduce from the data and code provided, the author found that holding a private sector job meant that: (i) overall MPs are 0.1% more likely to rebel against their party, with most of that effect driven by Conservative MPs who are 0.2% more likely to rebel but overall there is a minimal impact on rebellion and this is significant at the 10% level (p 0.069). The original results also show (ii) that 'moonlighting' MPs are also likely to attend more votes, estimated at 2.2% more compared to pre-employment levels (b 0.022, se 0.008, p (0.008), with the result again driven by Conservative MPs ($b \ 0.028$, se (0.011), p 0.010). The final set of results show that (iii) overall MPs who are employed are statistically significantly more likely to ask parliamentary questions (b 0.375, se 0.079, p 0.00001, with the effect again concentrated in Conservative MPs who were 60% more likely to ask a parliamentary question following employment (b 0.455, se 0.098, p 0.00001).

Overall, the replication package was well-organized, and the analysis could be fully reproduced using the provided cleaned data. Further, the main outcomes proved consistent across a number of robustness checks.

Alex Sutherland, University of Oxford. alex.sutherland@spi.ox.ac.uk

^{*}Authors (alphabetically): Rachel Ganly, University of Oxford rachel.ganly@stcatz.ox.ac.uk Lukas Lehner, University of Edinburgh. lukas.lehner@ed.ac.uk

P. Linh Nguyen, University of Essex / University of Mannheim / French Institute for Demographic Studies. plnguy@essex.ac.uk

None of the authors received financial support or has indicated a conflict of interest. None of the authors has a relationship to the author of the original study. This report was done during the UKRN community project's replication games on December 5th, 2024.

1 Introduction

Weschle (2024) studies the impact on UK parliamentarians' behaviour from holding outside employment "in the private sector" alongside their full-time jobs as MPs. UK MPs, as in other countries, are allowed to take outside employment, but the additional workload, distraction or conflict of interest arising might then influence parliamentary behaviour. This paper tries to assess the causal impact of outside employment on MP behaviour using a difference-in-differences design that compares MPs before and after their employment to MPs "whose work status remains the same" (p.395), i.e. do not take up outside employment. The outcomes for the study are (i) voting rebellion, which is where an MP votes against their party; (ii) voting participation, i.e. how many votes an MP takes part in, regardless of vote; (iii) the number of parliamentary questions asked by an MP. The author then devotes considerable effort on assessing the various results using a series of robustness checks and "supporting" data to assess claims.

Weschle (2024) finds that private employment does affect MP behaviour, albeit differently in different behavioural domains. The reported impact on voting rebellion is small, and is concentrated in members of the Conservative party, who were continuously in government during the period of the study data (2010-2016):

When MPs hold a private sector job, they are about 0.1 percentage points more likely to cast a floor vote in defiance of their party's leadership. This effect is driven by Conservative MPs, who are about 0.2 percentage points more likely to rebel. Given that on average thereare about 250 divisions per year, this implies that among Conservatives, moonlighting affects only about 0.5 votes annually. In addition, the effect is only statistically significant at the 10% level. For Labour MPs, rebellions do not change significantly when they have a private sector job. Overall, then, the content of MPs' policy decisions changes modestly, if at all, when they hold a private sector job (p.396, emphasis added).

For voting behaviour - the proportion of votes participated in - there is a small but statistically significant increase in voting prevalence following employment, equivalent to 2.2% overall. This again was concentrated among Conservative MPs, who increase their voting prevalence by 2.8% post-employment on average (p.397). The author states that this translates to their voting in roughly "seven divisions [votes] per year" (p.397).

Finally for the number of parliamentary questions asked, this increases substantially, again primarily for Conservative MPs:

"holding a private sector job, members of the governing Conservative Party, who earn the vast majority of outside income, change whether and how they vote on the floor of parliament as well as increase the number of written parliamentary questions they ask by 60%. For the latter, I demonstrate a targeted pattern suggesting that the increase relates to their employment." (p.390)

In the present report prepared for the Institute for Replication, we investigate whether the analytical results presented in Weschle (2024) are computationally reproducible and further test their replicability and robustness to: (1) leave-out analysis for the main analysis that assesses the impact of changing the control variables which are included; (2) robustness due to sample variations; and (3) undertaking some basic checks on data and analysis. We are grateful to the author of the original study for providing the analytical data and code in the replication depository.

In terms of computational reproducibility we successfully reproduced the main results and all the analytical outputs from the published paper using the code provided, with the exception of Figure 2.B that relies on the use of the R package "rgdal" which is no longer available as a package and requires an older version of R.¹

We found no problems with basic checks on data and analysis. We then turn to sensitivity analysis [i.e. robustness reproduction]. We test the robustness of the results to changing a) model specification and b) sample variations. Overall, the original analysis remained largely unchanged during our robustness checks.

¹https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/rgdal/index.html.

2 Computational Reproducibility

The replication package was deposited on the Harvard Dataverse.² The R-codes were made available for the main analysis, as well as analyses described in the paper and supplied in an online appendix. There is one main data set which consist of 4,714 observations at Member of Parliament (MP)-year level and 132 variables. In addition, there are nine data sets providing supporting information, as well as shape-files for the British map used in Figure 2b in the paper.

As the data were hand-coded from publicly available information and registers, e.g., on attendance and voting records, the raw data had to be compiled without this step being reflected in the R-scripts.

According to the author's own explanation, the main independent variable (bin.1000) was "created by going through the register of interest and manually tallying up the earnings reported for each MP-year" to capture the MPs' yearly earnings.

Within the R-code for the main analysis, the four following data sets were loaded for analysis: the main data (data_mpyear.rda), the data set containing both constituencies and employer addresses (employ_coords.rda), the data set on the written parliamentary questions (data_questions_topic.rda), and selected characteristics of government ministries (department_characteristics.csv). Another supporting data set is (employment_all_traced.csv) recording the job characteristics of each MP's employment spells with its respective start and end date.

We successfully computationally reproduced all the main results from *Table 1* of the original paper from the analysis data (presented in Appendix Table A1). See Table 1 for a summary of the replication package materials made available by the author. Our code is available on the Open Science Framework (OSF) at https://osf.io/rg8qk/.

²https://dataverse.harvard.edu/dataset.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/RKMKXU.

Replication Package Item	Fully	Partial	No
Raw data provided Analysis data provided	\checkmark		
Cleaning code provided Analysis code provided	\checkmark		\checkmark
Reproducible from raw data Reproducible from analysis data	\checkmark	\checkmark	

Table	1:	Replication	Package	Contents	and	Repro	ducibility	V
			()				•/	

Notes: This table summarizes the replication package contents contained in Weschle (2024).

2.1 No Pre-analysis Plan Found

To our knowledge, the author did not create or register a pre-analysis plan (PAP). Thus, we present our reproduction results and robustness checks, reported below.

3 Robustness Reproduction

For our analysis, we began by using the same model specification as the original analysis, using the code provided in the replication package.

3.1 Model specification (exclusion of control variables)

The main analysis presented in *Table 1* of the original paper includes nine timevarying variables that are not controlled for already by using MP and year fixed effects. We grouped these controls into two main sets: (1) a series of dummies indicating whether an MP held a certain position in parliament or in his or her party in a given year, and (2) two dummy variables indicating whether the MP was entering or leaving parliament in the given year. In Tables A3, A5 and A7 we tested whether the main results were affected by removing each MP position control in turn, and all MP control variables. In Tables A4, A6 and A8 we tested whether removal of entry and exit variables substantially affected the outcome and whether removal of all control variables affected the final results. We found that the results remain robust to changes in the inclusion or exclusion of control variables. The direction, magnitude and significance of the estimates are generally consistent with the original results for Vote Rebellion (Share) and Vote Participation (Share). For

I4R DP No. 203

the outcome related to Number of Parliamentary Questions, removal of all position related controls suggest a larger effect size for the treatment, but the direction and significance do not change.

3.2 Sample variation

To assess robustness with respect to the sample used for analysis, we compare the main outcomes from the original sample to analyses where the sample has been restricted. Specifically, we reproduce the values reported in Table 1 of the original study (columns 1, 4, and 7) and compare them to the restricted samples in Appendix Tables A9 for Vote Rebellion (Share), A10 for Vote Participation (Share), and A11 for log(Number of Parliamentary Questions + 1). For our robustness tests, we adjust the sample period by shifting the starting year from 2010 to 2011 (column 2), the end year from 2016 to 2015 (column 3), and estimate effects using a bootstrapped version of the dataset (column 4).

Overall, the results remain highly robust to sample variations. Both the significance and magnitude of the estimates are consistent with the original sample, except for Vote Rebellion (Share) and Vote Participation (Share), which lose significance in the bootstrapped sample. However, this is likely attributable to the random sampling process, as simulations with 1,000 bootstraps (not included in our commentary) suggest no substantive change in significance compared to the original results.

4 Conclusion

Overall, the replication package was well-organized, and the analysis could be fully reproduced using the provided cleaned data. While some of the raw data was included, we did not find any code to replicate the data cleaning process. Further, the main outcomes proved very robust to a number of robustness checks.

References

Weschle, S.: 2024, Politicians' private sector jobs and parliamentary behavior, American Journal of Political Science 68(2), 390–407.

5 Appendix Tables

5.1 Computational reproducibility

Table A1: Table 1, computationally reproduced results, similar format to original table

		Dependent variable:									
	Vote Rebellion (Share)			Vote	e Participation (Sh	are)	log(Numb	log(Number Parliamentary Questions+1)			
	All	Conservative	Labour	All	Conservative	Labour	All	Conservative	Labour		
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)		
Earnings \geq £1,000	0.001^{*} (0.001)	0.002^{*} (0.001)	$0.001 \\ (0.001)$	0.022^{***} (0.008)	0.028^{***} (0.011)	0.008 (0.009)	0.375^{***} (0.079)	0.455^{***} (0.098)	$\begin{array}{c} 0.015 \\ (0.133) \end{array}$		
Outcome Mean Observations	$0.008 \\ 4,691$	0.010 2,214	$0.004 \\ 1,861$	$0.736 \\ 4,691$	$0.803 \\ 2,214$	$0.687 \\ 1,861$	$2.823 \\ 4,714$	2.293 2,219	3.489 1,874		
Note:								*p<0.1; **p<0.0	5; ***p<0.01		

5.2 Computational reproducibility with p-values

Table A2: Table 1, computationally reproduced results including all controls, with p-values

	Dependent variable:									
		Vote Rebellion (Share))	١	ote Participation (Shar	e)	log(Num	ber Parliamentary Que	stions+1)	
	All	Conservative	Labour	All	Conservative	Labour	All	Conservative	Labour	
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	
Earnings \geq £1,000	0.001*	0.002*	0.001	0.022***	0.028***	0.008	0.375***	0.455***	0.015	
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.008)	(0.011)	(0.009)	(0.079)	(0.098)	(0.133)	
	p = 0.069	p = 0.066	p = 0.275	p = 0.008	p = 0.010	p = 0.404	p = 0.00001	p = 0.00001	p = 0.912	
minister	-0.001^{*}	-0.002		-0.043^{***}	-0.054^{***}		-1.183^{***}	-1.223^{***}		
	(0.001)	(0.001)		(0.012)	(0.012)		(0.140)	(0.154)		
	p = 0.079	p = 0.135		p = 0.0003	p = 0.00001		p = 0.000	p = 0.000		
minister.state	-0.003^{**}	-0.0001		0.007	-0.012		-1.207^{***}	-1.065^{***}		
	(0.001)	(0.001)		(0.012)	(0.014)		(0.150)	(0.194)		
	p = 0.015	p = 0.884		p = 0.563	p = 0.403		p = 0.000	p = 0.00000		
undersec	-0.002^{***}	-0.001		-0.023^{**}	-0.028^{***}		-1.291^{***}	-1.227^{***}		
	(0.001)	(0.001)		(0.009)	(0.010)		(0.089)	(0.100)		
	p = 0.005	p = 0.160		p = 0.011	p = 0.005		p = 0.000	p = 0.000		
frontbench.team	-0.002^{***}	-0.0004	-0.004^{*}	0.013	0.014	-0.028	-0.829^{***}	-1.057^{***}	-0.616^{***}	
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.002)	(0.013)	(0.017)	(0.025)	(0.126)	(0.136)	(0.218)	
	p = 0.007	p = 0.620	p = 0.090	p = 0.306	p = 0.409	p = 0.263	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.006	
shadow.cabinet	-0.002^{***}		-0.001^{*}	0.008		0.034***	0.714***		0.243***	
	(0.001)		(0.001)	(0.007)		(0.008)	(0.081)		(0.087)	
	p = 0.0001		p = 0.079	p = 0.246		p = 0.00003	p = 0.000		p = 0.006	
com.chair	-0.0004	0.001	-0.0001	0.006	-0.016	0.035^{*}	-0.074	0.151	-0.325^{**}	
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.013)	(0.014)	(0.019)	(0.135)	(0.137)	(0.165)	
	p = 0.747	p = 0.718	p = 0.907	p = 0.627	p = 0.252	p = 0.066	p = 0.582	p = 0.270	p = 0.050	
com.member	0.001***	0.001**	0.0003	0.007	0.013**	0.019**	0.213***	0.288***	0.060	
	(0.0004)	(0.001)	(0.0004)	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.009)	(0.063)	(0.086)	(0.086)	
	p = 0.002	p = 0.015	p = 0.433	p = 0.160	p = 0.041	p = 0.035	p = 0.001	p = 0.001	p = 0.486	
enter	-0.005^{***}	-0.005^{***}	-0.002^{***}	0.042***	0.065***	0.009	-0.711^{***}	-1.199^{***}	-0.735^{***}	
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.006)	(0.007)	(0.009)	(0.075)	(0.118)	(0.129)	
	p = 0.000	p = 0.00001	p = 0.002	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.278	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.00000	
leave	0.005***	0.009***	0.002	-0.071^{***}	-0.092^{***}	-0.030	-0.745^{***}	-0.492^{***}	-1.160^{***}	
	(0.001)	(0.003)	(0.001)	(0.013)	(0.024)	(0.020)	(0.098)	(0.187)	(0.144)	
	p = 0.00004	p = 0.0003	p = 0.115	p = 0.00000	p = 0.0002	p = 0.126	p = 0.000	p = 0.009	p = 0.000	
Outcome Mean	0.008	0.010	0.004	0.736	0.803	0.687	2.823	2.293	3.489	
Observations	4,691	2,214	1,861	4,691	2,214	1,861	4,714	2,219	1,874	
\mathbb{R}^2	0.685	0.732	0.534	0.754	0.727	0.731	0.782	0.744	0.793	
Adjusted R ²	0.614	0.674	0.429	0.698	0.668	0.670	0.734	0.689	0.747	
Residual Std. Error	0.010 (df = 3830)	0.012 (df = 1820)	0.006 (df = 1518)	0.087 (df = 3830)	0.077 (df = 1820)	0.080 (df = 1518)	0.952 (df = 3853)	0.984 (df = 1825)	0.846 (df = 1531)	
Note:								*p<0.1	**p<0.05; ***p<0.01	

5.3 Robustness replication: specification variation

					Depen	dent variable:			
					Vote Re	bellion (Share)			
	Original	Remove Minister	Remove Minister State	Remove Undersec	Remove Frontbench Team	Remove Shadow Cabinet	Remove Committee Chair	Remove Committee Member	Remove all Job Related Controls
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
Earnings \geq £1,000	0.001*	0.001**	0.001**	0.002**	0.001*	0.001*	0.001*	0.001*	0.002***
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
	p = 0.069	p = 0.047	p = 0.044	p = 0.033	p = 0.053	p = 0.058	p = 0.069	p = 0.061	p = 0.005
minister	-0.001*		-0.002^{*}	-0.001	-0.001	-0.001*	-0.001*	-0.002**	
	(0.001)		(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
	p = 0.079		p = 0.078	p = 0.106	p = 0.142	p = 0.091	p = 0.081	p = 0.035	
minister.state	-0.003**	-0.003**		-0.002^{**}	-0.002^{**}	-0.002^{**}	-0.003**	-0.003***	
	(0.001)	(0.001)		(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
	p = 0.015	p = 0.015		p = 0.024	p = 0.020	p = 0.019	p = 0.015	p = 0.007	
undersec	-0.002^{***}	-0.002^{***}	-0.002***		-0.002***	-0.002***	-0.002***	-0.003***	
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)		(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
	p = 0.005	p = 0.006	p = 0.008		p = 0.005	p = 0.008	p = 0.005	p = 0.001	
frontbench.team	-0.002***	-0.002**	-0.002**	-0.002***		-0.002***	-0.002***	-0.002***	
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)		(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
	p = 0.007	p = 0.011	p = 0.011	p = 0.008		p = 0.007	p = 0.007	p = 0.005	
shadow.cabinet	-0.002^{***}	-0.002***	-0.002***	-0.002***	-0.002***		-0.002***	-0.003***	
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)		(0.001)	(0.001)	
	p = 0.0001	p = 0.0001	p = 0.0001	p = 0.0002	p = 0.0001		p = 0.0001	p = 0.00001	
com.chair	-0.0004	-0.0003	-0.0003	-0.0004	-0.0003	-0.0001		-0.00002	
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)		(0.001)	
,	p = 0.747	p = 0.774	p = 0.780	p = 0.750	p = 0.760	p = 0.896		p = 0.985	
com.member	0.001	0.001	0.002***	0.002***	0.001	0.002***	0.001		
	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	(0.0004)		
	p = 0.002	p = 0.001	p = 0.0005	p = 0.0002	p = 0.001	p = 0.0001	p = 0.002		
enter	-0.005***	-0.005***	-0.005***	-0.004	-0.005***	-0.004***	-0.005***	-0.005***	-0.004***
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
1	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000
leave	(0.005	0.005	(0.006	(0.001)	(0.005	0.006	(0.005	0.005	0.006
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
	p = 0.00004	p = 0.00004	p = 0.00003	p = 0.00005	p = 0.00003	p = 0.00002	p = 0.00004	p = 0.0001	p = 0.00001
Outcome Mean	0.008								
Observations	4,691	4,691	4,691	4,691	4,691	4,691	4,691	4,691	4,691
\mathbb{R}^2	0.685	0.685	0.684	0.684	0.684	0.684	0.685	0.684	0.681
Adjusted R ²	0.614	0.614	0.613	0.613	0.613	0.613	0.614	0.613	0.610
Residual Std. Error	0.010 (df = 3830)	0.010 (df = 3831)	0.010 (df = 3831)	0.010 (df = 3831)	0.010 (df = 3831)	0.010 (df = 3831)	0.010 (df = 3831)	0.010 (df = 3831)	0.010 (df = 3837)
Note:									*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table A3: Robustness Replication: Sequential removal of MP Job controls for Vote Rebellion (Share)

Table A4: Robustness Replication: Sequential removal of Enter Leave controls forVote Rebellion (Share)

$\begin{tabular}{ c c c c } \hline Vote Robellion (Share) \\ \hline Original Remove Leave Remove Enter and Leave Remove al Controls (0.001) (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) \\ \hline () (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) \\ p = 0.069 P = 0.056 P = 0.122 P = 0.105 P = 0.010 \\ minister - 0.001^* -0.001 -0.002^{**} -0.001^* & -0.001^* \\ (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) \\ p = 0.079 P = 0.192 P = 0.029 P = 0.086 \\ minister.state -0.003^{**} -0.002^{**} -0.003^{**} & -0.003^{**} \\ (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) \\ merces -0.002^{**} -0.002^{**} -0.003^{**} & -0.002^{**} \\ (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) \\ moderse & -0.002^{**} & -0.002^{**} & -0.002^{**} \\ (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) \\ p = 0.05 P = 0.023 P = 0.002 P = 0.007 \\ ronthench.team -0.002^{**} -0.002^{**} & -0.002^{**} \\ (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) (0.001) \\ p = 0.007 P = 0.026 P = 0.003 P = 0.012 \\ shadow.cabinet & -0.002^{**} & -0.001^* & -0.003^{**} \\ (0.001) (0.0005) (0.001) (0.0001) \\ p = 0.001 P = 0.077 P = 0.0001 P = 0.018 \\ com.chair & -0.0004 & -0.0005 & -0.001 & -0.001^{**} \\ (0.001) (0.0005) & 0.0011 P = 0.018 \\ com.chair & -0.0004 P = 0.0077 P = 0.00001 P = 0.018 \\ com.chair & -0.0004 P = 0.0002 P = 0.0001 P = 0.018 \\ com.chair & -0.0004 P = 0.0002 P = 0.0001 P = 0.018 \\ com.chair & -0.0005^{**} & 0.001^{**} & 0.001^{**} \\ (0.001) (0.0001) (0.0001) (0.0001) \\ p = 0.007 P = 0.0002 P = 0.0009 P = 0.002 \\ enter & -0.005^{**} & -0.002^{**} & 0.001^{**} \\ (0.001) (0.0001) (0.0001) \\ p = 0.000 P = 0.0001 P = 0.001^{**} \\ P = 0.000 P = 0.0001 P = 0.0001 \\ P = 0.0000 P = 0.0001 P = 0.002 P = 0.0001 \\ P = 0.0000 P = 0.0001 P = 0.002 \\ enter & -0.005^{**} & 0.006^{**} \\ (0.001) (0.001) \\ (0.001) \\ P = 0.0000 P = 0.0000 P = 0.0002 \\ enter & 0.005^{**} & 0.006^{**} \\ (0.001) & (0.001) \\ P = 0.0000 P = 0.0001 \\ \hline Decome Mean 0.008 \\ P = 0.0000 P = 0.0001 \\ \hline Decome Mean 0.008 \\ P = 0.0000 P = 0.0001 \\ \hline Decome Mean 0.008 \\ P = 0.0000 P = 0.0001 \\ \hline Decome Mean 0.008 \\ P = 0.0000 P = 0.0000 P \\ \hline P = 0.0000 P = 0.0001 \\ \hline Decome Mean 0$				Dependent varia	ble:	
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$				Vote Rebellion (S	hare)	
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		Original	Remove Enter	Remove Leave	Remove Enter and Leave	Remove all Controls
$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	Earnings $\geq \pounds 1,000$	0.001^{*}	0.001*	0.001	0.001	0.002***
$\begin{array}{c cccc} & p = 0.069 & p = 0.056 & p = 0.122 & p = 0.105 & p = 0.010 \\ minister & -0.001^* & -0.001 & -0.002^{**} & -0.001^* & \\ & 0.001 & 0.001 & 0.001 & 0.001 \\ & p = 0.079 & p = 0.192 & p = 0.029 & p = 0.086 \\ minister.state & -0.003^{**} & -0.003^{**} & -0.003^{**} & -0.003^{**} & \\ & 0.001 & 0.001 & 0.001 & 0.001 \\ & p = 0.015 & p = 0.042 & p = 0.003 & p = 0.016 \\ mindersec & -0.002^{**} & -0.003^{**} & -0.003^{**} & -0.002^{**} \\ & 0.001 & 0.001 & 0.001 & 0.001 \\ & p = 0.003 & p = 0.023 & p = 0.002 & p = 0.007 \\ frontbench.team & -0.002^{**} & -0.002^{**} & -0.002^{**} & -0.002^{**} \\ & 0.001 & 0.001 & 0.001 & 0.001 \\ & p = 0.007 & p = 0.026 & p = 0.003 & p = 0.012 \\ & p = 0.007 & p = 0.026 & p = 0.003 & p = 0.012 \\ & p = 0.007 & p = 0.003 & p = 0.012 \\ & 0.001 & 0.0001 & 0.0001 & 0.0001 \\ & 0.0001 & 0.0005 & -0.001 & -0.001^{**} \\ & 0.0001 & p = 0.077 & p = 0.00001 & p = 0.018 \\ & com.chair & -0.002^{**} & 0.0001 & p = 0.018 \\ & com.chair & -0.0004 & -0.00005 & -0.001 & -0.001 \\ & p = 0.77 & p = 0.0001 & p = 0.018 \\ & com.chair & -0.005^{***} & 0.002^{***} & 0.001^{***} & 0.001^{***} \\ & 0.001^{**} & 0.002^{***} & 0.001^{***} & 0.001^{***} \\ & (0.0004) & (0.0004) & (0.0004) & (0.0004) \\ & p = 0.002 & p = 0.009 & p = 0.002 \\ & p = 0.000 & p = 0.009 & p = 0.002 \\ & enter & -0.005^{***} & 0.006^{***} \\ & (0.001) & (0.001) \\ & p = 0.0000 & p = 0.0000 \\ & p = 0.0000 & p = 0.0000 \\ & p = 0.0000 & p = 0.0000 \\ & p = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 \\ \hline \end{array}$		(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		p = 0.069	p = 0.056	p = 0.122	p = 0.105	p = 0.010
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	minister	-0.001^{*}	-0.001	-0.002^{**}	-0.001^{*}	
$\begin{array}{c cccc} & p = 0.079 & p = 0.192 & p = 0.029 & p = 0.086 \\ \mbox{minister.state} & -0.003^{**} & -0.003^{**} & -0.003^{**} & -0.003^{**} \\ (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) \\ \mbox{minister.state} & -0.002^{***} & -0.002^{***} & -0.003^{***} & -0.002^{***} \\ (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) \\ \mbox{minister.state} & -0.002^{***} & -0.002^{***} & -0.002^{***} \\ (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) \\ \mbox{minister.state} & -0.002^{***} & -0.002^{***} & -0.002^{***} \\ (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) \\ \mbox{minister.state} & -0.002^{***} & -0.002^{***} & -0.002^{***} \\ (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) \\ \mbox{minister.state} & -0.002^{***} & -0.002^{***} & -0.002^{***} \\ (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) \\ \mbox{minister.state} & -0.002^{***} & -0.001^{**} & -0.001^{***} \\ (0.001) & (0.005) & (0.001) & (0.0005) \\ \mbox{minister.state} & -0.001^{**} & -0.001 & p = 0.018 \\ \mbox{minister.state} & -0.002^{***} & 0.001^{***} & 0.001^{***} \\ (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) \\ \mbox{minister.state} & -0.002^{***} & 0.001^{***} \\ \mbox{minister.state} & 0.001^{***} & 0.001^{***} \\ \mbox{minister.state} & 0.001^{***} & 0.001^{***} \\ \mbox{minister.state} & -0.002^{**} & 0.001^{***} \\ \mbox{minister.state} & 0.001^{***} \\ \mbox{minister.state} & 0.005^{***} \\ \mbox{minister.state} & 0.005^{***} \\ \mbox{minister.state} & 0.006^{***} \\ \mbox{minister.state} & 0.000^{**} \\ \mbox{minister.state} &$		(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
$\begin{array}{ccccc} {\rm minister.state} & -0.003^{**} & -0.003^{**} & -0.003^{**} & -0.003^{**} & \\ & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & \\ & (0.001) & 0.002^{**} & -0.003^{**} & -0.002^{**} & \\ & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & \\ & p = 0.005 & p = 0.023 & p = 0.002 & p = 0.007 & \\ & p = 0.005 & p = 0.023 & p = 0.002^{**} & -0.002^{**} & \\ & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & \\ & p = 0.007 & p = 0.026 & p = 0.003 & p = 0.012 & \\ & p = 0.007 & p = 0.026 & p = 0.003 & p = 0.012 & \\ & p = 0.007 & p = 0.026 & p = 0.003 & p = 0.012 & \\ & p = 0.001 & p = 0.077 & p = 0.0001 & p = 0.018 & \\ & & (0.001) & (0.0005) & (0.001) & (0.001) & \\ & & p = 0.0001 & p = 0.077 & p = 0.0001 & p = 0.018 & \\ & & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & \\ & & p = 0.0001 & p = 0.452 & p = 0.621 & \\ & com.chair & -0.002^{**} & 0.002^{**} & 0.001^{**} & 0.001^{**} & \\ & & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & \\ & & p = 0.747 & p = 0.965 & p = 0.452 & p = 0.621 & \\ & com.member & 0.001^{**} & 0.002^{**} & 0.001^{**} & 0.001^{**} & \\ & & (0.001) & (0.004) & (0.0004) & (0.0004) & \\ & p = 0.002 & p = 0.0002 & p = 0.009 & p = 0.002 & \\ & enter & -0.005^{**} & -0.005^{**} & \\ & & (0.001) & (0.001) & \\ & p = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & p = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & p = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & p = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & p = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & p = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & P = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & P = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & P = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & P = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & P = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & P = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & P = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & P = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & P = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & P = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & P = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & P = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & P = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & P = 0.0000 & p = 0.0001 & \\ & P = 0.00004 & p = 0.00001 & \\ & P = 0.00004 & p = 0.00001 & \\ & P = 0.00004 & p = 0.00001 & \\ & P = 0.00004 & P & 0.00001 & \\ & P = 0.00004 & P & 0.00001 & \\ & P = 0.00004 & P & 0.00001 & \\ & P & 0.00004 & P & 0.00001 & \\ & P & 0.00004 & P & 0.00001 $		p = 0.079	p = 0.192	p = 0.029	p = 0.086	
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	minister.state	-0.003^{**}	-0.002^{**}	-0.003^{***}	-0.003^{**}	
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		p = 0.015	p = 0.042	p = 0.005	p = 0.016	
$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	undersec	-0.002^{***}	-0.002^{**}	-0.003^{***}	-0.002^{***}	
$\begin{array}{c cccc} & p = 0.005 & p = 0.023 & p = 0.002 & p = 0.007 \\ frontbench.team & -0.002^{***} & -0.002^{***} & -0.002^{**} & -0.002^{**} \\ & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) \\ & p = 0.007 & p = 0.026 & p = 0.003 & p = 0.012 \\ & (0.001) & (0.0005) & (0.001) & (0.0005) \\ & & (0.001) & (0.0005) & (0.0001) & p = 0.018 \\ & & (0.001) & p = 0.077 & p = 0.00001 & p = 0.018 \\ com.chair & -0.0004 & -0.00005 & -0.001 & -0.001 \\ & & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) \\ & & p = 0.747 & p = 0.965 & p = 0.452 & p = 0.621 \\ com.member & 0.001^{***} & 0.002^{***} & 0.001^{***} & 0.001^{***} \\ & & (0.0004) & (0.0004) & (0.0004) & (0.0004) \\ & & p = 0.002 & p = 0.009 & p = 0.002 \\ enter & -0.005^{***} & -0.005^{***} \\ & & (0.001) & (0.001) \\ & & p = 0.000 & p = 0.000 \\ enter & (0.001) & (0.001) \\ & & p = 0.000 & p = 0.000 \\ enter & (0.001) & (0.001) \\ & & p = 0.000 & p = 0.000 \\ \end{array}$		(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		p = 0.005	p = 0.023	p = 0.002	p = 0.007	
$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	frontbench.team	-0.002^{***}	-0.002^{**}	-0.002^{***}	-0.002^{**}	
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		p = 0.007	p = 0.026	p = 0.003	p = 0.012	
$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	shadow.cabinet	-0.002^{***}	-0.001*	-0.003^{***}	-0.001^{**}	
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		(0.001)	(0.0005)	(0.001)	(0.0005)	
$\begin{array}{cccc} {\rm com.chair} & -0.0004 & -0.0005 & -0.001 & -0.001 \\ & (0.001) & (0.001) & (0.001) \\ {\rm p} = 0.747 & {\rm p} = 0.965 & {\rm p} = 0.452 & {\rm p} = 0.621 \\ {\rm com.member} & 0.001^{***} & 0.002^{***} & 0.001^{***} & 0.001^{***} \\ & (0.0004) & (0.0004) & (0.0004) & (0.0004) \\ {\rm p} = 0.002 & {\rm p} = 0.009 & {\rm p} = 0.002 \\ {\rm enter} & -0.005^{***} & -0.005^{***} \\ & (0.001) & (0.001) \\ {\rm p} = 0.000 & {\rm p} = 0.000 \\ {\rm leave} & 0.005^{***} & 0.006^{***} \\ & (0.001) & (0.001) \\ {\rm p} = 0.00004 & {\rm p} = 0.00001 \\ \end{array} $		p = 0.0001	p = 0.077	p = 0.00001	p = 0.018	
$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	com.chair	-0.0004	-0.00005	-0.001	-0.001	
$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		p = 0.747	p = 0.965	p = 0.452	p = 0.621	
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	com.member	0.001^{***}	0.002***	0.001^{***}	0.001***	
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		(0.0004)	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	(0.0004)	
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		p = 0.002	p = 0.0002	p = 0.009	p = 0.002	
$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	enter	-0.005^{***}		-0.005^{***}		
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		(0.001)		(0.001)		
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		p = 0.000		p = 0.000		
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	leave	0.005^{***}	0.006***			
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		(0.001)	(0.001)			
		p = 0.00004	p = 0.00001			
	Outcome Mean	0.008				
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	Observations	4,691	4,691	4,691	4,691	4,691
Adjusted \mathbb{R}^2 0.614 0.610 0.611 0.606 0.603 Residual Std. Error 0.010 (df = 3830) 0.010 (df = 3831) 0.010 (df = 3831) 0.010 (df = 3832) 0.010 (df = 3839)	\mathbb{R}^2	0.685	0.682	0.682	0.678	0.675
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	Adjusted R ²	0.614	0.610	0.611	0.606	0.603
	Residual Std. Error	$0.010 \ (df = 3830)$	$0.010 \ (df = 3831)$	$0.010 \ (df = 3831)$	$0.010 \; (df = 3832)$	$0.010 \ (df = 3839)$

	Dependent variable:								
					Vote Part	icipation (Share)			
	Original	Remove Minister	Remove Minister State	Remove Undersec	Remove Frontbench Team	Remove Shadow Cabinet	Remove Committee Chair	Remove Committee Member	Remove all Job Related Controls
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
Earnings \geq £1,000	0.022***	0.025***	0.021***	0.024***	0.021**	0.022***	0.022***	0.022***	0.027***
	(0.008)	(0.008)	(0.008)	(0.008)	(0.008)	(0.008)	(0.008)	(0.008)	(0.008)
	p = 0.008	p = 0.003	p = 0.009	p = 0.004	p = 0.013	p = 0.009	p = 0.008	p = 0.008	p = 0.002
minister	-0.043^{***}		-0.043***	-0.042^{***}	-0.045***	-0.043***	-0.043***	-0.044***	
	(0.012)		(0.012)	(0.011)	(0.011)	(0.012)	(0.011)	(0.012)	
	p = 0.0003		p = 0.0003	p = 0.0004	p = 0.0002	p = 0.0002	p = 0.0002	p = 0.0002	
minister.state	0.007	0.007		0.009	0.006	0.007	0.007	0.005	
	(0.012)	(0.012)		(0.012)	(0.012)	(0.012)	(0.012)	(0.012)	
	p = 0.563	p = 0.567		p = 0.455	p = 0.608	p = 0.578	p = 0.568	p = 0.651	
undersec	-0.023^{**}	-0.022^{**}	-0.024***		-0.024**	-0.024***	-0.023**	-0.025***	
	(0.009)	(0.009)	(0.009)		(0.009)	(0.009)	(0.009)	(0.009)	
	p = 0.011	p = 0.016	p = 0.010		p = 0.011	p = 0.010	p = 0.011	p = 0.006	
frontbench.team	0.013	0.017	0.013	0.014		0.013	0.013	0.013	
	(0.013)	(0.013)	(0.013)	(0.013)		(0.013)	(0.013)	(0.013)	
	p = 0.306	p = 0.199	p = 0.315	p = 0.296		p = 0.298	p = 0.306	p = 0.326	
shadow.cabinet	0.008	0.008	0.007	0.008	0.008		0.007	0.006	
	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.006)		(0.006)	(0.006)	
	p = 0.246	p = 0.228	p = 0.252	p = 0.202	p = 0.229		p = 0.259	p = 0.356	
com.chair	0.006	0.007	0.006	0.006	0.006	0.005		0.008	
	(0.013)	(0.012)	(0.013)	(0.013)	(0.013)	(0.013)		(0.012)	
,	p = 0.627	p = 0.563	p = 0.634	p = 0.624	p = 0.633	p = 0.667		p = 0.527	
com.member	0.007	0.009*	0.007	0.010*	0.007	0.006	0.008		
	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)		
	p = 0.160	p = 0.076	p = 0.177	p = 0.071	p = 0.182	p = 0.212	p = 0.140	0.011	0.011
enter	(0.042	0.044	(0.042	(0.000)	0.041	0.039	(0.042	(0.041	0.041
	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.003)	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.003)
1	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000
icave	(0.012)	-0.009	(0.012)	-0.009	(0.012)	(0.012)	(0.012)	(0.012)	-0.011
	(0.013) n = 0.00000	(0.013) n = 0.00000	(0.013) p = 0.00000	n = 0.00000	n = 0.00000	n = 0.00000	(0.013) n = 0.00000	(0.013) n = 0.00000	(0.013) p = 0.00000
	p = 0.00000	p = 0.00000	p = 0.00000	p = 0.00000	p = 0.00000	p = 0.00000	p = 0.00000	p = 0.0000	p = 0.0000
Outcome Mean	0.736								
Observations	4,691	4,691	4,691	4,691	4,691	4,691	4,691	4,691	4,691
R ²	0.754	0.752	0.753	0.753	0.753	0.753	0.753	0.753	0.751
Adjusted R ²	0.698	0.697	0.698	0.697	0.698	0.698	0.698	0.698	0.695
Residual Std. Error	0.087 (df = 3830)	0.087 (df = 3831)	0.087 (df = 3831)	0.087 (df = 3831)	0.087 (df = 3831)	0.087 (df = 3831)	0.087 (df = 3831)	0.087 (df = 3831)	0.087 (df = 3837)
Note:									*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table A5: Robustness Replication: Sequential removal of MP Job controls for Vote Participation (Share)

Table A6: Robustness Replication: Sequential removal of Enter Leave controls for Vote Participation (Share)

			Dependent varia	ible:	
			Vote Participation	(Share)	
	Original	Remove Enter	Remove Leave	Remove Enter and Leave	Remove all Controls
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
Earnings $\geq \pounds 1,000$	0.022***	0.021**	0.024***	0.024***	0.029***
	(0.008)	(0.008)	(0.008)	(0.008)	(0.008)
	p = 0.008	p = 0.011	p = 0.004	p = 0.005	p = 0.001
minister	-0.043^{***}	-0.046^{***}	-0.039^{***}	-0.042^{***}	
	(0.012)	(0.012)	(0.012)	(0.012)	
	p = 0.0003	p = 0.0001	p = 0.002	p = 0.0005	
minister.state	0.007	0.003	0.013	0.009	
	(0.012)	(0.012)	(0.012)	(0.012)	
	p = 0.563	p = 0.788	p = 0.263	p = 0.420	
undersec	-0.023^{**}	-0.027^{***}	-0.018^{**}	-0.022^{**}	
	(0.009)	(0.009)	(0.009)	(0.009)	
	p = 0.011	p = 0.003	p = 0.050	p = 0.016	
frontbench.team	0.013	0.010	0.016	0.013	
	(0.013)	(0.013)	(0.013)	(0.013)	
	p = 0.306	p = 0.419	p = 0.210	p = 0.307	
shadow.cabinet	0.008	-0.005	0.013^{**}	-0.001	
	(0.007)	(0.006)	(0.007)	(0.006)	
	p = 0.246	p = 0.442	p = 0.050	p = 0.875	
com.chair	0.006	0.003	0.013	0.010	
	(0.013)	(0.012)	(0.013)	(0.013)	
	p = 0.627	p = 0.789	p = 0.321	p = 0.432	
com.member	0.007	0.005	0.011^{**}	0.009	
	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)	
	p = 0.160	p = 0.319	p = 0.046	p = 0.113	
enter	0.042***		0.048***		
	(0.006)		(0.006)		
	p = 0.000		p = 0.000		
leave	-0.071^{***}	-0.077^{***}			
	(0.013)	(0.013)			
	p = 0.00000	p = 0.000			
Outcome Mean	0.736				
Observations	4,691	4,691	4,691	4,691	4,691
\mathbb{R}^2	0.754	0.751	0.748	0.745	0.742
Adjusted R ²	0.698	0.695	0.692	0.688	0.685
Residual Std. Error	0.087 (df = 3830)	0.087 (df = 3831)	$0.088 \ (df = 3831)$	$0.088 \ (df = 3832)$	0.089 (df = 3839)
Note:				*p<	<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

					Depen	dent variable:			
					log(Number Parli	amentary Questions+1)			
	Original	Remove Minister	Remove Minister State	Remove Undersec	Remove Frontbench Team	Remove Shadow Cabinet	Remove Committee Chair	Remove Committee Member	Remove all Job Related Controls
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
Earnings \geq £1,000	0.375***	0.465***	0.449***	0.503***	0.419***	0.354***	0.375***	0.381***	0.690***
	(0.079)	(0.085)	(0.083)	(0.085)	(0.082)	(0.082)	(0.079)	(0.081)	(0.096)
	p = 0.00001	p = 0.00000	p = 0.00000	p = 0.000	p = 0.00000	p = 0.00002	p = 0.00001	p = 0.00001	p = 0.000
minister	-1.183***		-1.186***	-1.109***	-1.080***	-1.196***	-1.181***	-1.228***	
	(0.140)		(0.138)	(0.143)	(0.141)	(0.144)	(0.140)	(0.142)	
	p = 0.000		p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	
minister.state	-1.207***	-1.209***		-1.087***	-1.159***	-1.233***	-1.205^{***}	-1.250^{***}	
	(0.150)	(0.161)		(0.162)	(0.153)	(0.150)	(0.150)	(0.150)	
	p = 0.000	p = 0.000		p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	
undersec	-1.291^{***}	-1.250^{***}	-1.219***		-1.280^{***}	-1.324***	-1.290^{***}	-1.348^{***}	
	(0.089)	(0.092)	(0.091)		(0.097)	(0.088)	(0.089)	(0.089)	
	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000		p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	
frontbench.team	-0.829^{***}	-0.739^{***}	-0.784^{***}	-0.813^{***}		-0.808***	-0.829***	-0.846***	
	(0.126)	(0.130)	(0.128)	(0.127)		(0.126)	(0.125)	(0.126)	
	p = 0.000	p = 0.00000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000		p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	
shadow.cabinet	0.714***	0.722***	0.733***	0.753***	0.698***		0.717***	0.668***	
	(0.081)	(0.083)	(0.082)	(0.082)	(0.082)		(0.081)	(0.080)	
	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000		p = 0.000	p = 0.000	
com.chair	-0.074	-0.043	-0.051	-0.071	-0.067	-0.144		-0.023	
	(0.135)	(0.138)	(0.140)	(0.141)	(0.128)	(0.136)		(0.131)	
	p = 0.582	p = 0.759	p = 0.714	p = 0.617	p = 0.603	p = 0.292		p = 0.859	
com.member	0.213***	0.269***	0.270***	0.338***	0.236***	0.128**	0.210***		
	(0.063)	(0.066)	(0.064)	(0.066)	(0.065)	(0.064)	(0.062)		
	p = 0.001	p = 0.0001	p = 0.00004	p = 0.00000	p = 0.0003	p = 0.046	p = 0.001		
enter	-0.711	-0.667***	-0.656***	-0.615^{***}	-0.667***	-0.970***	-0.709***	-0.735***	-0.774***
	(0.075)	(0.076)	(0.077)	(0.078)	(0.076)	(0.077)	(0.075)	(0.075)	(0.082)
	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000
leave	-0.745***	-0.694***	-0.665***	-0.637***	-0.705***	-0.840^{***}	-0.740^{***}	-0.778***	-0.630***
	(0.098)	(0.099)	(0.100)	(0.102)	(0.099)	(0.097)	(0.097)	(0.098)	(0.104)
	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000
Outcome Mean	2.823								
Observations	4,714	4,714	4,714	4,714	4,714	4,714	4,714	4,714	4,714
\mathbb{R}^2	0.782	0.775	0.774	0.768	0.776	0.775	0.782	0.781	0.739
Adjusted R ²	0.734	0.725	0.724	0.716	0.726	0.725	0.734	0.732	0.681
Residual Std. Error	0.952 (df = 3853)	0.968 (df = 3854)	0.969 (df = 3854)	0.983 (df = 3854)	0.965 (df = 3854)	0.967 (df = 3854)	0.952 (df = 3854)	0.954 (df = 3854)	1.041 (df = 3860)
Note:									in<0.1: iin<0.05: iiin<0.01
27070L.									p<0.1, p<0.03, p<0.01

Table A7: Robustness Replication: Sequential removal of MP Job controls for Log(Number Parliamentary Questions+1)

Table A8: Robustness Replication: Sequential removal of Enter Leave controls for Log(Number Parliamentary Questions+1)

			Dependent varia	ıble:	
		log(Number Parliamentary	Questions+1)	
	Original	Remove Enter	Remove Leave	Remove Enter and Leave	Remove all Controls
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
Earnings \geq £1,000	0.375***	0.388***	0.403***	0.412***	0.695***
	(0.079)	(0.079)	(0.079)	(0.078)	(0.095)
	p = 0.00001	p = 0.00000	p = 0.00000	p = 0.00000	p = 0.000
minister	-1.183^{***}	-1.128^{***}	-1.138^{***}	-1.092^{***}	
	(0.140)	(0.140)	(0.139)	(0.140)	
	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	
minister.state	-1.207^{***}	-1.143^{***}	-1.140^{***}	-1.090^{***}	
	(0.150)	(0.149)	(0.149)	(0.148)	
	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	
undersec	-1.291^{***}	-1.224^{***}	-1.237^{***}	-1.181^{***}	
	(0.089)	(0.090)	(0.089)	(0.090)	
	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	
frontbench.team	-0.829^{***}	-0.781^{***}	-0.798^{***}	-0.757^{***}	
	(0.126)	(0.125)	(0.124)	(0.124)	
	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	
shadow.cabinet	0.714^{***}	0.924^{***}	0.770***	0.957***	
	(0.081)	(0.082)	(0.081)	(0.082)	
	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	
com.chair	-0.074	-0.028	-0.008	0.028	
	(0.135)	(0.134)	(0.134)	(0.133)	
	p = 0.582	p = 0.837	p = 0.955	p = 0.833	
com.member	0.213***	0.249***	0.249***	0.279***	
	(0.063)	(0.062)	(0.063)	(0.062)	
	p = 0.001	p = 0.0001	p = 0.0001	p = 0.00001	
enter	-0.711^{***}		-0.647^{***}		
	(0.075)		(0.076)		
	p = 0.000		p = 0.000		
leave	-0.745^{***}	-0.656^{***}			
	(0.098)	(0.097)			
	p = 0.000	p = 0.000			
Outcome Mean	2.823				
Observations	4,714	4,714	4,714	4,714	4,714
\mathbb{R}^2	0.782	0.777	0.778	0.773	0.729
Adjusted R ²	0.734	0.727	0.729	0.723	0.669
Residual Std. Error	$0.952 \ (df = 3853)$	$0.964 \ (df = 3854)$	$0.961 \ (df = 3854)$	0.971 (df = 3855)	1.061 (df = 3862)

Note:

5.4 Robustness replication: sample variation

		Dependen	t variable:	
		Vote Rebel	lion (Share)	
	Original	>=2011	<=2015	Bootstrap
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Earnings $\geq \pounds 1,000$	0.001^{*}	0.002**	0.001**	0.001
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
	p = 0.069	p = 0.033	p = 0.050	p = 0.199
minister	-0.001^{*}	-0.002^{**}	-0.001	-0.002^{*}
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
	p = 0.079	p = 0.033	p = 0.414	p = 0.062
minister.state	-0.003^{**}	-0.003^{**}	-0.003^{**}	-0.002^{**}
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
	p = 0.015	p = 0.023	p = 0.019	p = 0.033
undersec	-0.002^{***}	-0.002^{**}	-0.002^{**}	-0.003^{***}
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
	p = 0.005	p = 0.030	p = 0.017	p = 0.008
frontbench.team	-0.002^{***}	-0.002**	-0.001	-0.001**
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
	p = 0.007	p = 0.035	p = 0.112	p = 0.035
shadow.cabinet	-0.002^{***}	-0.001	-0.003^{***}	-0.001^{*}
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
	p = 0.0001	p = 0.103	p = 0.0002	p = 0.090
com.chair	-0.0004	0.0002	-0.0001	-0.0003
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
	p = 0.747	p = 0.877	p = 0.943	p = 0.826
com.member	0.001***	0.002***	0.002***	0.002***
	(0.0004)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
	p = 0.002	p = 0.003	p = 0.002	p = 0.003
enter	-0.005^{***}	-0.005^{***}	-0.004^{***}	-0.004^{***}
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.00001	p = 0.00000
leave	0.005***	0.006***	0.006***	0.006***
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.002)
	p = 0.00004	p = 0.00002	p = 0.00002	p = 0.006
Outcome Mean	0.008	0.008	0.008	0.008
Observations	4,691	4,047	4,041	4,697
\mathbb{R}^2	0.685	0.668	0.725	0.731
Adjusted R ²	0.614	0.578	0.652	0.673
Residual Std. Error	0.010 (df = 3830)	$0.010 \ (df = 3187)$	$0.010 \ (df = 3188)$	0.009 (df = 3866)
	. , , ,			

Table A9: Robustness replication: sample variation for Vote Rebellion (Share)

Note:

	Dependent variable:				
	Vote Participation (Share)				
	Original	>=2011	<=2015	Bootstrap	
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	
Earnings $\geq \pounds 1,000$	0.022***	0.024^{***}	0.024^{***}	0.017	
	(0.008)	(0.009)	(0.008)	(0.011)	
	p = 0.008	p = 0.009	p = 0.004	p = 0.127	
minister	-0.043^{***}	-0.054^{***}	-0.048^{***}	-0.050^{***}	
	(0.012)	(0.013)	(0.014)	(0.014)	
	p = 0.0003	p = 0.00005	p = 0.0005	p = 0.0004	
minister.state	0.007	-0.003	-0.004	-0.002	
	(0.012)	(0.014)	(0.013)	(0.018)	
	p = 0.563	p = 0.817	p = 0.781	p = 0.890	
undersec	-0.023^{**}	-0.029^{***}	-0.034^{***}	-0.013	
	(0.009)	(0.011)	(0.010)	(0.012)	
	p = 0.011	p = 0.008	p = 0.0005	p = 0.283	
frontbench.team	0.013	0.004	0.018	0.021	
	(0.013)	(0.015)	(0.014)	(0.016)	
	p = 0.306	p = 0.798	p = 0.205	p = 0.189	
shadow.cabinet	0.008	0.025***	-0.0004	0.001	
	(0.007)	(0.009)	(0.007)	(0.009)	
	p = 0.246	p = 0.008	p = 0.955	p = 0.879	
com.chair	0.006	0.003	0.020	0.014	
	(0.013)	(0.014)	(0.013)	(0.018)	
	p = 0.627	p = 0.835	p = 0.105	p = 0.438	
com.member	0.007	0.005	0.008	0.013*	
	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.008)	
	p = 0.160	p = 0.397	p = 0.191	p = 0.097	
enter	0.042***	0.023***	0.048***	0.044***	
	(0.006)	(0.008)	(0.008)	(0.009)	
	p = 0.000	p = 0.005	p = 0.000	p = 0.00001	
leave	-0.071^{***}	-0.063^{***}	-0.070^{***}	-0.045^{**}	
	(0.013)	(0.012)	(0.013)	(0.019)	
	p = 0.00000	p = 0.00000	p = 0.00000	p = 0.018	
Outcome Mean	0.736	0.736	0.736	0.736	
Observations	4,691	4,047	4,041	4,697	
\mathbb{R}^2	0.754	0.763	0.768	0.777	
Adjusted \mathbb{R}^2	0.698	0.700	0.706	0.729	
Residual Std. Error	0.087 (df = 3830)	0.087 (df = 3187)	0.085 (df = 3188)	0.082 (df = 3866)	

Table A10: Robustness replication: sample variation for Vote Participation (Share)

Note:

Original	Or	>=2011	<=2015	Bootstrap
(1)		(2)	(3)	(4)
0.375***	$gs \ge \pounds 1,000$ 0.3	0.427^{***}	0.359^{***}	0.415***
(0.079)	(0	(0.087)	(0.081)	(0.109)
p = 0.00001	p =	p = 0.00001	p = 0.00002	p = 0.0002
-1.183***	er -1	-1.195***	-1.090***	-1.254***
(0.140)	(0	(0.141)	(0.163)	(0.217)
p = 0.000	p =	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000
-1.207***	er.state -1	-1.235^{***}	-1.148***	-1.271***
(0.150)	(0	(0.170)	(0.164)	(0.210)
p = 0.000	D =	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000
-1.291^{***}	ec –1	-1.345^{***}	-1.232^{***}	-1.187^{***}
(0.089)	(((0.105)	(0.095)	(0.118)
p = 0.000	D =	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000
-0.829^{***}	ench.team -0	-0.878***	-0.801^{***}	-0.849^{***}
(0.126)	(((0.138)	(0.136)	(0.158)
p = 0.000	D =	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.00000
0.714***	v.cabinet 0.'	0.469^{***}	0.772***	0.754***
(0.081)	(((0.096)	(0.094)	(0.110)
p = 0.000	D =	p = 0.00001	p = 0.000	p = 0.000
-0.074	air –	-0.091	-0.010	-0.138
(0.135)	(((0.143)	(0.171)	(0.169)
p = 0.582	D =	p = 0.523	p = 0.956	p = 0.415
0.213***	ember 0.	0.248***	0.203***	0.367***
(0.063)	(((0.073)	(0.066)	(0.080)
p = 0.001	D =	p = 0.001	p = 0.003	p = 0.00001
-0.711***	P -0	-0.933***	-0.747***	-0.662***
(0.075)	(((0.113)	(0.098)	(0.111)
p = 0.000	(~ D =	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000
-0.745^{***}	P -0	-0.865***	-0.711***	-0.844^{***}
(0.098)	(((0.098)	(0.101)	(0.137)
p = 0.000	p =	p = 0.000	p = 0.000	p = 0.000
2.823	ne Mean ?	2.823	2.823	2.790
4 714	ations 4	4 069	4 064	4 714
0.782	(0.819	0.798	0.824
0.734	ed \mathbb{R}^2	0.771	0.744	0.786
0.952 (df = 385)	al Std. Error 0.952 ($(3) \qquad 0.899 (df = 3209)$	0.935 (df = 3211)	0.860 (df = 388)
$\begin{array}{c} 0.734\\ 0.952 \ (df = 385) \end{array}$	ed R ² 0 al Std. Error 0.952 ($\begin{array}{c} 0.010\\ 0.771\\ 0.899 \ (df = 3209) \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 0.100\\ 0.744\\ 0.935 \ (\mathrm{df}=32\\ \end{array}$	211)

Table A11: Robustness replication: sample variation for $\log(\text{Number Parliamentary Questions}+1)$

Note: