

Tahir, Muhammad Wajid; Kauser, Rubina

Article — Published Version

Mainstreaming 'gender' and 'integration' needs in human development initiatives: Asian and African migrant women's integration in Europe

International Migration

Provided in Cooperation with:

John Wiley & Sons

Suggested Citation: Tahir, Muhammad Wajid; Kauser, Rubina (2022) : Mainstreaming 'gender' and 'integration' needs in human development initiatives: Asian and African migrant women's integration in Europe, International Migration, ISSN 1468-2435, Wiley, Hoboken, NJ, Vol. 61, Iss. 2, pp. 260-282,
<https://doi.org/10.1111/imig.13006>

This Version is available at:

<https://hdl.handle.net/10419/287877>

Standard-Nutzungsbedingungen:

Die Dokumente auf EconStor dürfen zu eigenen wissenschaftlichen Zwecken und zum Privatgebrauch gespeichert und kopiert werden.

Sie dürfen die Dokumente nicht für öffentliche oder kommerzielle Zwecke vervielfältigen, öffentlich ausstellen, öffentlich zugänglich machen, vertreiben oder anderweitig nutzen.

Sofern die Verfasser die Dokumente unter Open-Content-Lizenzen (insbesondere CC-Lizenzen) zur Verfügung gestellt haben sollten, gelten abweichend von diesen Nutzungsbedingungen die in der dort genannten Lizenz gewährten Nutzungsrechte.

Terms of use:

Documents in EconStor may be saved and copied for your personal and scholarly purposes.

You are not to copy documents for public or commercial purposes, to exhibit the documents publicly, to make them publicly available on the internet, or to distribute or otherwise use the documents in public.

If the documents have been made available under an Open Content Licence (especially Creative Commons Licences), you may exercise further usage rights as specified in the indicated licence.



<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

Mainstreaming 'gender' and 'integration' needs in human development initiatives: Asian and African migrant women's integration in Europe

Muhammad Wajid Tahir¹  | Rubina Kauser²

¹Institute of Political Science, Philipps University Marburg, Marburg, Germany

²Faculty of Psychology, Philipps University Marburg, Marburg, Germany

Correspondence

Muhammad Wajid Tahir, Philipps University Marburg, Institute of Political Science, Wilhelm-Röpke-Str. 6E, 35032, Marburg, Germany.

Email: wajidtahir@daad-alumni.de

Funding information

Fritz Thyssen Stiftung

Abstract

The current study examines the inclusion of 'gender' in the policies/legislation relating to the human development of women migrants (from Asian and African origins) and their impact on six determinants of migrant's gender ideology in two different European gender regimes: Germany and Sweden. The study is conducted in four stages: (1) thematic analysis of different conventions and recommendations of the UN, ILO, and EU, (2) latent analysis of selected policies/legislation, (3) survey of women migrants, and (4) expert interviews. Exposure to relatively egalitarian gender regimes through migration has brought positive changes in all determinants of the gender ideology of migrants, except domestic chores and caregiving responsibilities. Inclusion of a missing 'gender' perspective in relevant measures can expedite smooth integration of migrants, but lack of political commitment, scarcity of financial resources, the absence of gender experts, and lack of coordination between line ministries/agencies are salient barriers to its 'inclusion' in both countries.

This is an open access article under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) License, which permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

© 2022 The Authors. *International Migration* published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd on behalf of International Organization for Migration.

INTRODUCTION

In the recent stream of migration, millions of women have migrated from relatively less gender-egalitarian to gender transitional or more gender-egalitarian regimes (Ponce, 2017; Röder & Mühlau, 2014). Past scholarship asserts that relatively less gender-egalitarian regimes are more likely to possess conservative gender ideology that reinforces women's domestic and caregiving roles, gender-transitional regimes possess moderate gender norms and adopt a few measures to improve the status of women, whereas the relatively more gender-egalitarian regimes possess relatively more liberal gender norms and introduce several measures to empower women in all spheres of life (Guo & Gilbert, 2012; Inglehart & Norris, 2003; Röder & Mühlau, 2014). Now it is hard to predict what changes gender-transitional or relatively more gender-egalitarian regimes will bring in the gender relations of migrants¹. Most feminists of relatively more gender-egalitarian regimes analyse the situation of migrants (women) with their own lenses, thus often perceiving them as ignorant, poor, and dependent in comparison to their own level of modernity and freedom (Dechaufour, 2008; Suleri, 1995). Thus, they predict a lethargic change in their gender relations up to destination standards, though they themselves are not ideal, which is strongly criticized by postcolonial feminists. For instance, Mohanty (1988) believes that patriarchy does not operate identically in origin and destination² countries, thus migrant's gender space and relations cannot be determined or shaped based on perceptions of western feminists or independent of their race, ethnicity, class, and religion. It requires deep analysis to see if they may hold an origin-gender perspective or adopt relatively differing normative standards of destination countries (Llacer et al., 2007; Pessin & Arpino, 2018).

Germany and Sweden are famous places of destination in Europe (DESTATIS, 2015; Eurostat, 2016; Migrationsverket, 2015). Different indicators³ have categorized Germany as a gender-transitional regime (GDI: 0.963 & GGI: 46) and Sweden as a relatively more gender-egalitarian regime (GDI: 0.999 & GGI: 4) in comparison to many origin countries (such as case studies of the current study). In 2015, Germany has received 0.84 million migrant men and 0.65 million women (DESTATIS, 2015) and Sweden has received 0.12 million migrant men and 0.05 million women from different countries (Migrationsverket, 2015). These statistics confirm the 'feminization of migration' (Eurostat, 2016) that requires special state measures to integrate⁴ women migrants into these countries. Although it is presumed that prevailing measures will guarantee equal benefits for natives and migrants, and for women and men, past studies indicate that the ultimate gains of women are contradictory and vary from agencies to societies (King, 2012; Mahler & Pessar, 2006). These findings give way for questioning the effectiveness of emerging strategies to integrate both genders on equal footing.

The present research focuses on the gender mainstreaming of public policies/legislation relating to the human development of migrants, and their possible contribution to their ideological transition towards gender relations in destination countries. The study aims to answer the following questions:

1. Do countries of destination mainstream 'gender' into their policies/legislation and subsequent programs/projects to expedite women migrant's integration with destination societies based on recommendations of various international forums?
2. Does migration from gender inequalitarian to egalitarian regimes bring change in gender ideology of women migrants and their families towards women's roles and responsibilities in destination countries?
3. If yes then, to what extent do destination policies/legislation/programs explain changes in gender ideology of women migrants and their families?

FACTORS THAT SHAPE GENDER IDEOLOGY

Past studies have explained women's migration and integration processes from different aspects and one of them is gender ideology which can be conservative or liberal. *Gender ideology refers to the culturally determined*

pattern of behavior that is considered acceptable for men and women (Bittner, 2011). Literature summarizes three contributors to gender ideology: cultural ideology (Grunow et al., 2018; Neculaesei, 2015; Somech & Drach-Zahavy, 2016), religious ideology (Bittner, 2011; Klingorová & Havlíček, 2015; Scheible & Fleischmann, 2013), and political ideology (Dubrow, 2011; Paxton & Kunovich, 2003). These ideologies, alone or in combination, exert a varying level of influence on the perspective of the agency, family, and society towards gender relations at micro, meso, and macro levels. Postcolonial theorists elaborate that Europeans (destination) perceive their ideologies as superior due to relatively liberal socio-political values, freedom of speech, and democracy that are mostly lacking in Asian or African (origin) ideologies (Mohanty, 1988; Said, 1979). These ideologies can go through a transition while interacting with each other during migratory processes. We presume that a net difference in origin and destination ideologies can reshape the gender beliefs of migrants. What factors influence further?

Social location

Existing scholarship contends that both origin and destination cultures could influence the gender ideology of migrants in destination societies (Röder & Mühlau, 2014). In the lines of postcolonial feminists, though it cannot be generalized, a majority of migrants come from societies with less egalitarian cultures where unequal gender relations prevail at the individual, familial, and societal levels (Chow, 2002; Dechaufour, 2008; Sassen, 2003). Migrant families set informal principles to regulate the integration process under the gender ideology (conservative or liberal) emigrated from origin cultures (Della Puppa, 2019). Although families develop contact with destination cultures, in most cases, they persist in origin-cultural norms and values (Grillo, 2008), which can reinforce previously practiced unequal gender attitudes in destination societies (Diehl & Koenig, 2009; Röder & Mühlau, 2014). The literature refers to this as 'social location' (Pessar & Mahler, 2003) that restrains women migrants from integrating with destination societies (Neuman, 2014; Snel et al., 2006). For example, women migrants of non-western origin are less likely to integrate with European societies (Korteweg & Yurdakul, 2009). Only a few learn selected egalitarian norms and values after having a long conflict between origin and destination ideologies (Bühlmann et al., 2010). Thus, sole exposure to a relatively gender-egalitarian culture is not sufficient for the transition in the gender ideology of migrants. Other facets also matter.

Religious doctrine

Research shows religious ideology to be one of the prominent factors that have a plausible contribution towards the construction of gender ideology (Klingorová & Havlíček, 2015; Scheible & Fleischmann, 2013). Religious ideology and gender ideology are highly correlated; a higher level of religiosity increases the prevalence of conservative gender ideology (Bittner, 2011). This is due to religion being deeply rooted in people's lives (Stump, 2008), especially in that women's in matters such as marriage, fertility, and employment (Blau et al., 2008; Read, 2004). Moreover, the interpretation of the religious text, religious attendance patterns, and religious outlook of societal institutions further shape gender relations in societies (Edgell, 2013). Although every religion brings different history, culture, and institutions that shape acceptable norms and beliefs of its adherents, some religions have appeared to be more unequal towards women's rights such as Islam or Hinduism (Inglehart & Norris, 2003; Klingorová & Havlíček, 2015). However, the literature also asserts that migration alters different aspects of the religiosity of migrants (Korteweg & Yurdakul, 2021; Smit et al., 1998). Hagan and Ebaugh (2003) find that migration increases religious consciousness and participation of migrants, whereas Akresh (2011), Massey and Higgins (2011) and Van Tubergen (2013) observe a decline in their level of religiosity over time. This infers that migration can alter migrants' level of religiosity and perhaps beliefs towards gender relations.

Political dynamics

Another facet is the political ideology that shapes the gender ideology of individuals, society, and the State (Castle & Taras, 2002; Klingorová & Havlíček, 2015). Political ideology depends on the ruling party's ideology (Castle & Taras, 2002), which determines the direction of State feminism (Borchorst & Siim, 2002; Murphy, 2003; Waylen, 2005). According to Hernes (1987), State feminism is *a variety of public policies and organizational measures, designed partly to solve general social and economic problems, partly to respond to women's demands*. The political ideology of the State works as an overarching ideology, which de- or re-shapes prevailing cultural and religious ideologies towards women's position (Bittner, 2011; Goertz & Mazur, 2008). For example, Bittner (2011) enunciates that political conservatism promotes a higher level of religiosity and conservative gender ideology, whereas Friedan (2010) claims that firm commitment and implementation of gender-sensitive measures can dispose of the negative effects of deeply rooted traditional narratives towards women's emancipation. McBride and Mazur (2006) assert that a democratic government can protect women's rights by introducing gender-sensitive instruments. Recent immigrants in Europe are coming from autocratic or feeble democratic States that are more likely to possess conservative political ideologies (Breunig et al., 2012; Tansey et al., 2017), thus migrant's likelihood to hold traditional gender beliefs is high in destination countries. Nevertheless, most destination countries promote democratic values in politics and equality in gender relations (Inglehart & Norris, 2003; Piper, 2013), and introduce enabling public policies/legislation to promote egalitarian gender beliefs among migrants (Hall, 2009; Sakai, 2004; Yamanaka & Piper, 2005), which can bring positive change in their gender relations.

RESEARCH GAP & THEORETICAL FRAME

The reviewed literature concludes that although the interaction between origin-destination cultural and religious legacies can determine integration patterns of women migrants, the political ideology of host countries plays a decisive role (Bonifacio, 2012). In the current stream of migration, Western Europe has appeared as a main recipient of migrants, which more likely advocates equal rights between women and men through effective policies/legislation in comparison to many origin countries for decades (Inglehart & Norris, 2003). The liberal feminists assert that enabling a legal milieu can produce an identical gendered outcome for women and men, and for natives and migrants, through addressing prevailing inequalities derived from varying historical, cultural, religious, and political contexts across all gender regimes (Friedan, 2010). Such gender-sensitive legal frameworks are more likely designed and effectively implemented in relatively more gender-egalitarian regimes (e.g., destination countries of the present study) in comparison to relatively less gender-egalitarian regimes (e.g., origin countries of the present study; Inglehart & Norris, 2003).

However, it is argued that these measures do not guarantee equal benefits for women migrants (Walsh & Heppner, 2006), which infers that destination countries may not actualize the integration needs of women migrants and translate them into effective public policies/legislation. The postcolonial feminist critics associate it with the prevailing notion of Western superiority that tries to find remedies based on own experiences and perspectives (Mohanty, 1988). Inclusion of women migrant's needs and perspectives are contingent on their representation in destination discourses and institutions: either someone represents them or they represent themselves (Said, 1979). The present situation reflects a higher probability of the former because western discourse proposes a 'civilization' approach (Dechaufour, 2008), which serves as a basis for integration policies/legislation that can also promote ethnocentric biases, racial prejudice, and stabilization of prevailing hierarchies for 'others' (Suleri, 1995). In addition, Mohanty (1988) delineates that white women have to deal with gender issues only, whereas women migrants encounter gender as well as race/ethnicity related issues frequently, which can double their hardships. Varying barriers require a careful analysis of targeted measures designed for a smooth integration of women with

a migratory background. Nonetheless, Suleri (1995) asks what comes first in relevant debates; either gender or race/ethnicity?

In this context, corresponding to liberal feminists, various international and regional forums such as the Beijing Platform for Action (1995), United Nations (UN), and its allied institutions like International Labour Organization (ILO), and European Union (EU) have served different conventions and recommendations to call upon the states to reform laws and implement policies to address gender- and migration-specific (race/ethnicity) challenges faced by women migrants during integration processes in destination countries. These forums explicitly emphasize the states incorporate 'gender' in their legal measures to achieve gender equality and integration-related targets. Any failure will inhibit migrants (women) to revisit their traditional gender beliefs at least up to relatively egalitarian destination normative standards, which can make their social, economic, and gendered integration harder in destination places.

In view of existing gaps in the literature and theoretical construct, by consulting the theory of Inglehart and Norris (2003), a proposition 'liberal political ideology, followed by gender-sensitive policies/legislation and subsequent programs/projects, can alter traditional cultural and religious ideologies of migrants towards women's role and responsibilities in destination societies' is tested with empirical data.

MATERIAL AND METHODS

A mix methods approach is used for data collection and analysis. *In the first stage*, a thematic analysis of twenty-one international documents through a semantic analysis approach (Braun & Clarke, 2006; Maguire & Delahunt, 2017; Nowell et al., 2017) is performed. An 'international legal frame' is constructed through codification and categorization of the gender- and migration-specific clauses of international documents, which segments various gender needs (indicators) into three themes relating to human development initiatives (case studies). These gender needs are expected to be met through effective legal interventions in destination countries. *In the second stage*, gender analysis of different legal documents (four from Germany and eight from Sweden) is performed through a latent analysis approach (Braun & Clarke, 2006) to construct a 'national legal frame'. The given legal provisions are highlighted, interpreted, and compared with the 'international legal frame'. The exercise highlights similarities and differences in the incorporation of 'gender' in the 'national legal frame' as per recommendations of international forums. *In the third stage*, qualitative findings are supplemented with quantitative data collected from women migrants (160) through face-to-face and an online survey.⁵ Analysis of variance (ANOVAs) with repeated measures is computed with two migration stages (pre-migration and post-migration) as the within-subject factor and selected human development programs/projects as a between-subject factor. The independent variable is the political ideology of host countries, which is operationalized as human development programs/projects aimed to facilitate the integration of women migrants such as (1) language learning and skills development opportunities, (2) cultural orientation and civic education programs, and (3) access to information about policies/legislation relating to migration, employment, and gender equality. Various questions are asked to measure women migrant's satisfaction levels with the above measures on a Likert scale. The sum of answers determines the appropriateness of each measure. A lower value denotes a low satisfaction level with the respective measure, whereas a higher value represents the opposite outcome. On the other hand, cultural and religious ideologies are dependent variables. The cultural ideology is determined by four and religious ideology with two contributors. The self-reported contributors of cultural ideology are (1) acceptance of women's employment by surrounding people and head of families, (2) involvement in domestic chores, caregiving responsibilities, and coaching children for studies, (3) empowerment relating to mobility and use of money, and (4) equality in the use of Information & Communication Technologies (ICTs) with reference to male family members. The self-reported contributors of religious ideology are (1) level of religiosity and subsequent religious practices of women migrants and (2) religious beliefs of women migrants and their heads of families towards women's employment. These contributors are operationalized into

different indicators and converted into various questions to learn if changes have appeared in women migrant's own and their family's gender ideology in destination countries. The sum of answers determines the value of each contributor of cultural as well as religious ideology. A lower value denotes a lack of emancipation towards gender relations, whereas a higher value represents the opposite outcome. *In the fourth stage*, different experts from German and Swedish institutions have been invited to take part in in-depth conversations to present their perspectives towards missing clauses relevant legal instruments, as per recommendations of the international legal frame, and to underline prevailing challenges to implementing relevant legislation/programs/ projects. Data are transcribed, coded, categorized, and analyzed using MAXQDA.

FINDINGS

In the light of identified themes, qualitative and quantitative inferences are combined. According to the survey, a majority of women migrants (regular, refugee, and asylum seekers) come from six countries; Pakistan, Syria, Afghanistan, Egypt, Iraq, and Somalia. Fifty-seven percent have arrived between 2015 and 2018, twenty-nine percent between 2010 and 2014, and remaining between 1972 and 2009 in both countries. The mean years of completed education are 14.73 in Germany and 11.42 in Sweden. Eighty-seven percent are married and their fertility level is higher in Sweden at 2.60 than that of Germany at 1.92. Nevertheless, these variables do not reflect significant variations in the computed statistics (ANOVA). Moreover, the study aims to observe the possible impact of migration and relevant policy/legal measures on migrant's (families and women) gender ideologies towards migrant women's emancipation, particularly towards their labour market participation in destination countries. Therefore, the following inferences are presented with respect to each policy/legal measure in three sub-sections.

Migration, language learning and skills development opportunities, and gender ideology

Legal framing of ten⁶ 'work-specific' and thirteen⁷ 'migration-specific' international conventions and recommendations call upon the States through various clauses to provide women migrants with adequate opportunities for learning destination languages and bringing their skills at par with destination labour market needs. The frame puts forth five gender needs: (1) provision of language training at the earliest stage, (2) combination of language courses with job-related skills, (3) provision of vocational guidance and training of own choice, (4) financial subsidy for trainees, and (5) provision of temporary childcare.

In Germany, national legal framing underlines that article 4 of the Integration Act and section 43 (1) (2) (3) of the Residence Act ask for the designing and implementation of German language courses for migrants. Section 45a (1) of the Residence Act suggests that migrants attend job-related language courses after learning the preliminary language. For this purpose, the Federal Office of Migration and Refugees (BAMF) has introduced various programs such as [initial orientation and learning German for asylum-seekers](#),⁸ integration courses for asylum applicants,⁹ and German for special purposes¹⁰ (ESF-BAMF program & vocational language promotion), 'catch-up course'¹¹, and 'intensive course'¹². The BAMF also provides information and guidance on vocational training and integration through two programs titled 'Integration through Skill-building' and 'Stark im Beruf (2015)'. The latter program includes various projects that cover different topics and operates in various steps to improve women's marketability. Second, different articles of the Social Code Book-III (29(1); 30(1-5)) authorize the 'Employment Agency' to address skills development-related issues. The agency offers counselling services on career development, career change, emerging labour market trends, vocational education, job search methods, and benefits of training. Furthermore, participants of language courses or integration courses are also eligible for financial subsidies or fee waivers under special conditions. And finally, the legal frame overlooks childcare-related concerns of trainees. On the other hand, the Swedish Migration & Asylum Policy claims that the government has made a huge investment in

language training and skills development programs to integrate newly arrived migrants (Ministry of Justice, 2017). Section 27 of the Ordinance (2015:503) Respecting Special Employment Support (ORSES) expects that migrants must participate or show a commitment to participate in the Swedish language courses. Moreover, article 8 of the Ordinance (2007:813) On Youth Employment Guarantee (OYEG) informs that migrants will be invited to take part in job-specific language courses under a program titled 'Svenska för invandrare' (Swedish for Immigrants (SFI)) with special focus on certain professional specialities such as childcare, retail workers or drivers. Second, Sections 6, 7 & 8 of the 'Act on Establishment Contributions for Newly Arrived Immigrants (AECNAI)' and Section 2a of the 'Ordinance (2010: 409) Establishment and Introduction Activities for Newly Arrived Immigrants (OEIANAI)' inform that the employment agency will prepare an 'individual plan' for each migrant under the program 'Introduction Dialogue' (Ministry of Integration and Gender Equality, 2009). The plan will be finalized with the consultation of women migrants under a collaborative input of relevant municipalities, companies, organizations, and other authorities. In addition, there are two other legislation named 'Ordinance on Youth Employment Guarantee (OYEG)', and 'Ordinance (2010: 84) on Government Contributions for Vocational Mentoring Activities (OGCVMA)', which offer different types of support to women migrants. The former proposes a scheme titled 'Youth Guarantee Guidance', which helps them to learn market-oriented skills and how to get assistance for setting up their own businesses. The latter supports NGOs financially to assist women migrants through 'Mentoring Scheme' for their careers. Third, the national legal frame also discusses financial subsidy for attending these programs, but does not prescribe an eligibility criterion. Lastly, the national legal frames of both countries do not emphasize providing childcare alternatives or subsidies for trainees. How do women migrants perceive given legal provisions?

My survey statistics manifest that the subjective experiences of women migrants do not correspond with the given legal provisions, because they are more likely unsatisfied with the existing mechanism of learning destination languages and enhancing skills in Germany (64%) as compared to Sweden (35%). In Sweden, migrant women are more likely to have learnt destination languages (75%), combined language learning with job-related training (69%), obtained guidance/professional training (49%), enjoyed fee waivers fully or partially (98%), and accessed childcare facilities while attending these programs (70%) in comparison to Germany (68%, 57%, 39%, 68%, and 44%). Why do women's experiences differ from given legal provisions?

In-depth interviews with various experts yield that both women migrants, as well as the state, are responsible for their unsatisfactory concerns towards language and skills learning programs. From Germany, an expert divulges that women migrants (asylum seekers and refugees) essentially engage in language-learning programs at various institutions after arrival. She also cites a few online portals for self-learning, for example, www.iwdl.de designed by the Volkshochschule. Nevertheless, the state designs neither online interactive language-learning nor skills development packages if they cannot participate in regular classes as Germany is a gradually developing digital state (Employment Agency, Official, Marburg, April, 2019) and these ideas are not part of policy agendas. Second, the employment agency offers skills development programs parallel to language learning options. Nonetheless, many women migrants abandon combining language with skills development initiatives. *These decisions could be associated with their family structures, childcare responsibilities, and unknown factors* (Employment Agency, Official, Marburg, April, 2019). Initially, the agency examines the academic profile, experiences, and soft skills of women migrants. Later, it offers a skills development plan, where women migrant's choice has always been given a priority. The agency schedules two types of training: theoretical and practical (on-job). For the former, the agency pays to trainees, but for the latter, the agency pays to trainees as well as employers under certain conditions. Despite proper guidance and financial support, *often women migrants (especially with children) visit the agency, obtain guidance, submit an application, participate in the preliminary evaluation, and attend a few training sessions, but later they quit* (Employment Agency, Official, Marburg, April, 2019). Lack of coordination between public institutions handling childcare and human development programs also restricts women to participate in these programs. The narrative informs that after the screening of a woman migrant's qualifications and experiences, the agency suggests relevant training, but *when she goes to the childcare office, the office refuses her place and charges us that she is not willing to attend job-specific training,*

but your office coerces her (Employment Agency, Official, Marburg, April, 2019). Hence, often the efforts placed by the agency to mainstream women migrants are ruined when childcare is denied. Moreover, the state does not seem willing to enlarge the spectrum of childcare for language learners or professional trainees. A few institutions make such arrangements on their own such as *Training Campus, Marburg, but this facility is neither common in other cities nor offered by all employers* (Employment Agency, Official, Marburg, April, 2019). Third, the state subsidizes the human development programs for asylum seekers and refugees, but *women migrants with other residence permits have to pay the fee* (Employment Agency, Official, Marburg, April, 2019). With reference to my survey results, those who have paid partially or completely, would have residence permits, which do not fall under the subsidy. On the other hand, the Swedish experts inform that the state encourages women migrants (asylum seekers and refugees) to attend language courses upon arrival, and especially during parental leave, *whereas many women stay on parental leave for several years but do not learn the Swedish language* (Ministry of Justice: Section Gender Equality, Official, Stockholm, February, 2019). Unlike in Germany, there are several self-learning opportunities (online) for those who cannot attend language classes on a regular basis. However, the state does not pay attention to launching interactive online human development programs. The experts admit that although existing institutions are offering job-specific language training, there is a need to improve the existing mechanism to make the learning processes more effective. *This is the first thing we really need to work on it* (Ministry of Justice: Section Gender Equality, Official, Stockholm, February, 2019). Second, like in Germany, the employment agency is responsible to design and implement skills development programs for women migrants. The agency screens out their previous qualifications, experience, and soft skills to identify gaps to be filled through relevant training programs. *Whether are they effective or not, there are different studies that are investigating these things* (Gender Equality Agency, Official, Gothenburg, February, 2019). Another expert asserts that the employment agency has adopted a fast-track policy to connect employers with women migrants on a demand and supply basis, but women migrants do not contact municipalities to avail these opportunities. Initially, they maintain their contact with the municipality and employment agency, but when the agency proposes what kind of education and language proficiency they do need to enter the labour market, *they stop and do not proceed further* (Ministry of Social Affairs: Section Gender Equality, Official, Stockholm, February, 2019). Third, the experts have accepted that there is a scarcity of childcare services. Neither the state nor employers offer financial subsidies to women migrants to arrange alternative childcare while attending human development programs. The expert asserts, *we make clear lines between professional and personal lives, so you have to solve it within your family* (Employment Agency, Official, Gothenburg, February, 2019). Finally, asylum seekers or refugees are only eligible for a financial subsidy to attend these programs. Following statistical analysis underlines a possible association between migration, legal provisions, implementation gaps, and transition in gender ideology of migrants. (Table 1).

The results of the two ANOVA manifest that within the cultural ideology, a significant main effect of migration is found on three determinants in both countries. In comparison to the pre-migration stage, the respondents report a higher level of acceptance of their employment among native people and their head of families with the partial effect of change in Germany ($\eta^2 = 0.15$) and Sweden ($\eta^2 = 0.16$); an improved level of empowerment on mobility and use of money in Germany ($\eta^2 = 0.23$) and Sweden ($\eta^2 = 0.44$); and more equality in the use of ICTs with reference to their male family members in Germany ($\eta^2 = 0.11$) and Sweden ($\eta^2 = 0.19$) in the post-migration stage. Moreover, a significant main effect of language learning and skills development programs is also found on one determinant in Germany. In comparison to the pre-migration stage, the post-hoc test indicates that an increased level of satisfaction with the said programs improves their empowerment for mobility and use of money in Germany ($\eta^2 = 0.09$) in the post-migration stage. Within the religious ideology, a significant main effect of migration is found with one determinant in Sweden and with another determinant in both countries. In comparison to the pre-migration stage, the respondents show a reduced level of religiosity in Sweden ($\eta^2 = 0.07$), and a higher level of emancipation in their own and their head of family's religious beliefs towards women's employment in Germany ($\eta^2 = 0.07$) and Sweden ($\eta^2 = 0.08$) in the post-migration stage.

TABLE 1 Change in gender ideology: effects of migration, and destination language learning & skills development opportunities

Contributors of Gender Ideology	Countries	Pre-migration Stage		Post-migration Stage		F Values (Partial η^2) Effect	
		Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Migration	Language & Skills Learning Opportunities
Cultural ideology							
	Opinion						
	Germany	3.89	0.65	4.59	1.12	13.69*** (0.15)	0.29 (0.00)
	Sweden	3.94	0.67	4.62	1.39	12.91** (0.16)	2.37 (0.06)
Roles	Germany	5.84	1.44	5.69	1.20	0.75 (0.01)	0.43 (0.01)
	Sweden	5.83	1.12	5.88	0.88	0.01 (0.00)	0.83 (0.02)
Empowerment	Germany	6.69	2.15	7.91	2.30	23.67*** (0.23)	1.57 (0.04)
	Sweden	7.04	2.03	9.08	2.06	53.38*** (0.44)	0.86 (0.02)
Equality in the use of ICTs	Germany	10.43	2.65	11.42	1.25	9.98** (0.11)	1.74 (0.04)
	Sweden	9.65	2.71	10.83	1.83	15.97*** (0.19)	1.53 (0.04)
Religious ideology							
	Level of Religiosity						
	Germany	2.96	1.13	3.04	1.24	0.24 (0.00)	0.43 (0.01)
	Sweden	3.27	1.20	3.64	1.34	4.98* (0.07)	1.04 (0.03)
	Religious Belief towards Employment						
	Germany	4.73	1.16	5.14	1.34	5.76* (0.07)	0.39 (0.01)
	Sweden	5.04	1.13	5.45	1.36	5.81* (0.08)	0.06 (0.00)

Notes: SD = standard deviation, F = test score of analysis of variance. Partial η^2 = variance explained by the predictors, * $p \leq 0.05$, ** $p \leq .01$, *** $p \leq 0.00$

Migration, cultural orientation and civic education, and gender ideology

Legal framing of ten¹³ migration-specific international conventions and recommendations call upon the states to provide women migrants with adequate opportunities for learning essential elements of destination society, cultures, history, and politics that could lead to their smooth integration. The frame identifies three gender needs: (1) provision of cultural orientation and civic education programs, (2) provision of both programs through ICTs, and (3) provision of childcare services while attending these programs.

From Germany, national legal framing reveals that the BAMF encourages migrants to expedite their integration through their involvement in volunteer services under several initiatives such as 'Joint Civic Commitments'¹⁴, 'Migration Advice for Adult Immigrants (MBE)', 'the Youth Migration Service (JMD)', and 'Integration Course for Women'.¹⁵ The last one offers 960 lessons on kindergarten and school system, differences and similarities between origin and destination countries, living area, and subjects of their own interest. Besides, women migrants can also directly contact several NGOs offering volunteer civic services. Finally, the courses such as 'Catch-up Course' and 'Intensive Course' include special modules that acquaint women with German society, politics, the legal system, and so on. On the other hand, the employment agency prepares an 'integration plan' for each woman migrant including cultural and civic orientation in Sweden. Moreover, section 4 & 5 of the 'Act on Establishment Contributions for Newly Arrived Immigrants (AECNAI)' and section 1 & 2 of the 'Act on Civic Orientation for Newly Arrived Immigrants (ACONAI)' call for special measures such as 'Community Orientation Program' to acquaint women migrants with different aspects of social and cultural life through collaborative activities between agencies, municipalities, and organizations. Finally, the reviewed legal documents neither instruct competent authorities to introduce cultural and civic education programs through ICTs nor accentuate the provision of childcare facilities while attending these programs in both countries. How do women migrants perceive given legal provisions?

The subjective experiences of women migrants do not correspond with the given legal provisions, because they are more likely unsatisfied with the existing mechanism of cultural orientation and civic education programs in Germany (47%) as compared to Sweden (16%). An overwhelming majority do not attend cultural programs in both countries (G: 85% & S: 70%), but they do participate in civic programs (G: 40% & S: 80%). Women migrants living in Sweden have higher chances to attend these programs through ICTs (56%) and finding childcare facilities (70%) as compared to Germany (27% and 44%). Why do women's experiences differ from given legal provisions?

Once again, experts perceive women migrants as well as the state as responsible for their unsatisfactory concerns relating to cultural orientation or civic education programs. These programs are mainly designed for asylum seekers and refugees, women migrants having other residence permits are not entitled. Now if a huge proportion of women could not attend these courses in Germany, the expert utters *I have no idea, but I know many women also show lack of interest in these activities* (Employment Agency, Official, Marburg, April, 2019). On the other hand, the Swedish experts assert that the state has empowered municipalities to design and implement these programs for migrants. In their opinion, *the municipalities are doing a great job in this context* (Ministry: Section Gender Equality, Official, Stockholm, February, 2019). On the missing gender-specific clauses for combining domestic responsibilities and learning about the host culture, the BAMF provides preliminary information on its web-portal in Germany. Why does the state not introduce interactive programs to educate subjects through ICTs? The expert says *I have already mentioned that we are gradually developing a digital state* (Employment Agency, Official, Marburg, April, 2019). The Swedish statement also does not differ because the state is not taking the use of ICTs in account for this purpose. In addition, if women migrants report the prevalence of such programs with a childcare facility, they could be driven by some NGOs, but *these programs do not prolong more than 1-2 days* (Employment Agency, Official, Gothenburg, February, 2019). In principle, the states have never laid down a proper plan to address the growing needs of childcare facilities while attending these courses across both countries. Following statistical analysis underlines a possible association between migration, legal provisions, implementation gaps, and transition in gender ideology of migrants. (Table 2).

TABLE 2 Change in gender ideology: effects of migration and cultural and civic educational programs

Contributors of Gender Ideology	Countries	Pre-migration Stage		Post-migration Stage		F Values (Partial η^2) Effect		
		Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Migration	Cultural & Civic Education Programs	Migration x Cultural & Civic Education Programs
Cultural Ideology	Germany	3.89	0.65	4.59	1.12	24.89*** (0.24)	0.48 (0.01)	0.30 (0.01)
	Sweden	3.92	0.66	4.66	1.37	16.32*** (0.18)	1.33 (0.03)	0.71 (0.02)
	Germany	5.84	1.44	5.69	1.20	1.79 (0.02)	0.96 (0.02)	0.27 (0.01)
	Sweden	5.65	1.50	5.69	1.34	0.04 (0.00)	10.71*** (0.22)	2.64 (0.07)
Empowerment	Germany	6.69	2.15	7.91	2.30	13.58*** (0.15)	3.69* (0.09)	0.18 (0.00)
	Sweden	6.88	2.33	8.84	2.52	36.38*** (0.33)	0.87 (0.02)	2.28 (0.06)
Equality in the use of ICTs	Germany	10.43	2.65	11.42	1.25	14.89*** (0.16)	0.40 (0.01)	0.21 (0.01)
	Sweden	9.22	3.32	10.32	2.89	9.84** (0.12)	7.63** (0.17)	2.03 (0.05)
Religious Ideology	Germany	2.96	1.13	3.04	1.24	1.03 (0.01)	2.79 (0.07)	0.34 (0.01)
	Sweden	3.08	1.39	3.43	1.54	3.28 (0.04)	8.69*** (0.19)	2.07 (0.05)
	Germany	4.73	1.16	5.14	1.34	6.58** (0.08)	1.41 (0.03)	0.25 (0.01)
	Sweden	4.81	1.59	5.18	1.80	2.09 (0.03)	9.84*** (0.21)	6.75** (0.15)

Notes: SD = standard deviation, F = test score of analysis of variance. Partial η^2 = variance explained by the predictors, * $p \leq 0.05$, ** $p \leq 0.01$, *** $p \leq 0.00$.

The results of the two ANOVA reveal that within the cultural ideology, a significant main effect of migration is found on three determinants in both countries. In comparison to the pre-migration stage, the respondents report a higher level of acceptance of their employment among native people and their head of families with the partial effect of change in Germany ($\eta^2 = 0.24$) and Sweden ($\eta^2 = 0.18$); an improved level of empowerment in mobility and use of money in Germany ($\eta^2 = 0.15$) and Sweden ($\eta^2 = 0.33$); and equality in the use of ICTs with reference to their male family members in Germany ($\eta^2 = 0.16$) and Sweden ($\eta^2 = 0.12$) in the post-migration stage. Moreover, a significant main effect of cultural or civic education programs is also found on two determinants in Sweden, and one in Germany. In comparison to the pre-migration stage, the post-hoc test indicates that an increased level of satisfaction with the said programs reduces their burden of domestic roles and responsibilities ($\eta^2 = 0.22$), and improves equality for the use of ICTs with reference to their male family members ($\eta^2 = 0.17$) in Sweden, and improves their empowerment for mobility and use of money ($\eta^2 = 0.09$) in Germany in the post-migration stage. Within the religious ideology, a significant main effect of migration is found with only one determinant in Germany. In comparison to the pre-migration stage, the respondents show a higher level of emancipation in their own and in their families' religious beliefs towards women's employment in Germany ($\eta^2 = 0.08$) in the post-migration stage. Moreover, a significant main effect of cultural or civic education programs is also found with one determinant in Sweden, and one in Germany. In comparison to the pre-migration stage, the post-hoc test indicates that an increased level of satisfaction with the relevant measures promotes a moderate level of religiosity ($\eta^2 = 0.19$) and emancipation in their own and in their head of family's religious beliefs towards women' employment (alone: $\eta^2 = 0.21$) and (in interaction with migration: $\eta^2 = 0.15$) in Sweden in post-migration stage.

Migration, access to information about policies/legislation, and gender ideology

Legal framing of nine¹⁶ migration-specific various conventions and recommendations call upon the states to provide women migrants with information about their basic rights, employment-related rights, measures to ensure gender equality, and integration processes enshrined in destination policies/legislation. The frame summarizes four gender needs; (1) basic rights under destination laws, (2) key features of work and migration-related policies/legislation, (3) legal provisions about gender equality, and (4) educational programs on gender equality and related institutions.

From Germany, national legal framing yields that primary German laws are only available in the native language. Nevertheless, the BAMF has developed a brochure on Basic German Law¹⁷ in seven different languages that could help women migrants to be acquainted with their basic rights. The BAMF also disseminates 'information' under certain services such as 'Migration Advice Service for Adult Immigrants (MBE)¹⁸', 'Information Service¹⁹', and Youth Migration Services (JMD)²⁰ through the internet. These services provide information in four languages about integration law, integration courses, language courses, employment opportunities, and other aspects of social life. The web portal 'make it in Germany' also offers detailed information on more or less similar topics in fourteen languages. Migrants can also download different apps (Ankommen) from the BAMF web portal containing a lot of information on the subject. Moreover, different NGOs are also offering information on specific subjects to migrants under MBE services. Nonetheless, the legal frame does not provide women migrants with information relating to gender equality measures on arrival. On the other side, articles 12, 13 & 14 of the Freedom of the Press Act authorizes individuals to access and examine an official document of their interest, under certain conditions, after paying a fixed fee from the public archive in Sweden. Moreover, the Swedish Public Employment Service provides information relating to migration and employment through its web portal in different languages²¹. With reference to migrant's basic rights and gender equality, information is only available in Swedish or English languages²². Finally, the reviewed legal documents do not propose training for women migrants on 'gender equality' and related institutions as per law and local practices in both countries. How do women migrants perceive given legal provisions?

My survey statistics correspond less with the given legal provisions and indicate that a small fraction of women migrants is fully satisfied with their access to information on relevant policies/legislation: Germany (14%) and Sweden (34%). On the particular question relating to access the information in their understandable languages, a huge proportion reports no information about their basic rights (53%), about work and migration-related policies/legislation (35%), about legal provisions relating to gender equality and ombudsman (60%) in Germany as compared to Sweden (24%, 24%, and 23%). Moreover, a large fraction has never visited web portals of concerned ministries or departments to retrieve needed information (43%), and a larger proportion reports non-availability of online information in their understandable languages (40%) in Germany as compared to Sweden (26% and 19%). Why do women's experiences differ from given legal provisions?

In-depth interviews with experts underline constraints in accessing requisite information in both countries. For instance, orientation programs offered at arrival, target asylum seekers or refugees, as a result regular women migrants remain deprived of such initiatives. Besides essential information provided by the BAMF, either through web-portal or online APPs, the German expert agrees that mainly information about basic rights, employment rights, gender rights, related institutions, and procedures enshrined in relevant legal documents is only available in German, or partially in the English language. Translation of relevant legal documents is the mandate of relevant ministries. Recently, the state has translated a lot of information into the Arabic language, but translation into other languages requires additional efforts and funds, which are scarce. Nonetheless, *the information relating to employment rights and opportunities is provided in many languages by our agency* (Employment Agency, Official, Marburg, April, 2019). The conversation implies that the educational background of women migrants, access to relevant institutions, lack of financial resources, and slow digitalization are salient barriers to women migrant's access to relevant information in Germany. Importantly, the conversation gives the impression that the expert has no grip on the subject. On the other side, Swedish experts more or less come up with similar opinions on the subject. Mainly, the migration agency has been assigned a duty to inform women migrants about legal provisions relating to subject matters. A Swedish expert informs that migrants obtain an information package on arrival. The information package covers all aspects of information such as basic rights, employment rights and opportunities, gender equality, children rights, and prevention against domestic violence in Sweden. Primary recipients of information packages are mostly men, *but women migrants have a second chance to obtain information during interviews with the officials in textual as well as verbal forms* (Migration Agency, Official, Flen, February, 2019). The information package is also accompanied by an interpreter if required. These strategies could be an explanation of more likely satisfactory experiences of women migrants for accessing relevant information in Sweden. The expert also asserts that although many legislation are to be translated into migrant's understandable languages, women migrants do not show a lot of interest due to illiteracy, number of children, and traditional gender relations within families. Finally, both countries do not plan to introduce educational programs on legal provisions relating to gender equality and concerned institutions for women migrants. Following statistical analysis underlines a possible association between migration, legal provisions, implementation gaps, and transition in gender ideology of migrants. (Table 3).

The results of the two ANOVA yield that within the cultural ideology, a significant main effect of migration is found on three determinants in both countries, and one determinant in Germany. In comparison to the pre-migration stage, the respondents report a higher level of acceptance of their employment among native people and their head of families with the partial effect of change in Germany ($\eta^2 = 0.19$) and Sweden ($\eta^2 = 0.18$); a higher level of empowerment in mobility and use of money in Germany ($\eta^2 = 0.15$) and Sweden ($\eta^2 = 0.38$); more equality in the use of ICTs with reference to their male family members in Germany ($\eta^2 = 0.26$) and Sweden ($\eta^2 = 0.15$); but increase in their burden of domestic roles and responsibilities in Germany ($\eta^2 = 0.05$) in the post-migration stage. Moreover, a significant main effect of the information retrieval mechanisms is also found significant, alone as well as in interaction with migration, on a single determinant in Germany as well as in Sweden. In comparison to the pre-migration stage, the post-hoc test indicates that an increased level of satisfaction with the information retrieval mechanisms improves their equality in the use of ICTs with reference to their male family members in Germany (alone: $\eta^2 = 0.11$ & in interaction with migration: $\eta^2 = 0.10$) as well as in Sweden (alone: $\eta^2 = 0.16$) in the

TABLE 3 Change in gender ideology, effects of migration and access to information relating to selected policies & legislation

Contributors of Gender Ideology	Countries	Pre-migration Stage		Post-migration Stage		F Values (Partial η^2) Effect		Information relating to policies/legislation	Migration x Information relating to policies/legislation
		Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Migration			
Cultural Ideology	Germany	3.89	0.65	4.59	1.12	18.30***	0.07 (0.00)	0.63 (0.02)	
	Sweden	3.92	0.66	4.66	1.37	16.27***	0.33 (0.01)	0.05 (0.00)	
	Germany	5.84	1.44	5.69	1.20	4.54*	0.05 (0.00)	2.35 (0.06)	
	Sweden	5.65	1.50	5.69	1.34	0.25 (0.00)	2.43 (0.06)	0.52 (0.01)	
Empowerment	Germany	6.69	2.15	7.91	2.30	14.23***	0.30 (0.01)	0.57 (0.01)	
	Sweden	6.88	2.33	8.84	2.52	46.22***	1.46 (0.04)	0.43 (0.01)	
Equality in the use of ICTs	Germany	10.43	2.65	11.42	1.25	27.00***	4.71** (0.11)	4.32** (0.10)	
	Sweden	9.22	3.32	10.32	2.89	13.40***	6.94** (0.16)	0.05 (0.00)	
Religious Ideology	Germany	2.96	1.13	3.04	1.24	0.62 (0.01)	1.11 (0.03)	0.38 (0.01)	
	Sweden	3.08	1.39	3.43	1.54	7.31** (0.09)	3.70* (0.09)	3.29* (0.08)	
	Germany	4.73	1.16	5.14	1.34	4.34* (0.05)	0.29 (0.01)	1.38 (0.03)	
	Sweden	4.81	1.59	5.18	1.80	4.94* (0.06)	9.31*** (0.20)	0.83 (0.02)	

Notes: SD = standard deviation, F = test score of analysis of variance. Partial η^2 = variance explained by the predictors, * $p \leq .05$, ** $p \leq .01$, *** $p \leq .00$

post-migration stage. Within the religious ideology, a significant main effect of migration is found with one determinant in Sweden, and with another determinant in both countries. In comparison to the pre-migration stage, the respondents report a reduced level of religiosity in Sweden ($\eta^2 = 0.09$), and show a higher level of emancipation in their own and in their families' religious beliefs towards women's employment in Germany ($\eta^2 = 0.05$) and Sweden ($\eta^2 = 0.06$) in the post-migration stage. Moreover, a significant main effect of information retrieval mechanisms is also found, alone and in interaction with migration, with both determinants in Sweden. In comparison to the pre-migration stage, the post-hoc test indicates that an increased level of satisfaction with information retrieval mechanisms promotes a moderate level of religiosity among women migrants (alone: $\eta^2 = 0.09$ and in interaction with migration: $\eta^2 = 0.09$) and indorses emancipation in their own and in their head of family's religious beliefs towards women's employment (alone: $\eta^2 = 0.20$) in Sweden in the post-migration stage.

DISCUSSION

The above three case studies imply that the existing legal frameworks of both countries, to some extent, comply with the recommendations of international documents to provide women migrants with opportunities for developing their human resources and to be acquainted with their fundamental rights in destination countries. The situation reflects that neither 'gender' nor smooth 'integration'²³ is a priority of policymakers or legislatures while designing/revising state's instruments meant to address integration challenges faced by women migrants in both countries. They have designated key responsibilities for women migrant's integration into the employment and migration-related institutions, whereas the institutions working on gender equality have a very marginal role in the process. These institutions have designed various programs and projects in compliance with national or regional policies/legislation for their social, economic, and gendered integration with destination societies. Although relevant policies/legislation and subsequent programs/projects include general clauses or components to address women migrant's needs, they overlook gender-sensitive metrics essential for reaping equal benefits from relevant measures, especially to improve their linguistic abilities, upgrade their professional skills, and inform them about their social, economic, and gender rights under laws, which is actually not a matter of gender-egalitarian hegemony of the west, but is an inability of the state institutions to analyze their 'gender' and 'integration' needs and translation into effective measures.

The analysis of relevant legal documents, survey statistics, and in-depth interviews have identified four gender gaps that can negatively influence the transition of migrant's gender ideology and the integration of women migrants. *First*, family and childcare responsibilities prohibit many women migrants to participate in human development activities, whereas both states do not move towards 'Interactive E-learning' through ICTs, which can enable them to learn the requisite language, professional, legal, and cultural skills without compromising their gendered roles. The studies of Romiti et al. (2016) and Worbs et al. (2016) also perceive domestic and caregiving responsibilities as key barriers to women's language and skill learning abilities in destination countries. *Second*, many women migrants mention that they do not understand English properly, which makes it harder to learn destination languages under the Host-English medium. Past studies also point out similar vulnerabilities of women migrants to command host languages (Kristen et al., 2016; Van Tubergen & Kalmijn, 2005; Worbs & Baraulina, 2017). A provision for teachers to have a grip on their native languages would expedite the language learning process. Neither reviewed legal documents nor the experts endorse this proposal. *Third*, reviewed legal documents do not instruct the competent authorities to provide alternative childcare facilities or financial subsidies, when women migrants participate in human development programs. Past studies also cite the scarcity of daycare places in both countries (From Germany; Busse & Gathmann, 2018; From Sweden; Broberg & Hwang, 2014). Non-availability of childcare constitutes a major barrier to women's learning and integration processes. Both states seem reluctant to eliminate the scarcity of childcare places, which questions the gender sensitivity of human development programs/projects. *Fourth*, only asylum seekers and refugees are entitled to a financial subsidy for attending human development programs, women migrants with a dependent residence

permit are not eligible for it. They face double segregation as migrants and as women (Llacer et al., 2007). This may reinforce the traditional division of labour in migrant families struggling with financial stability. Men would be preferred for human development, whereas women's likelihood to bring their human profile compatible with integration needs would reduce. In the opinion of experts, these gender gaps are the outcome of inappropriate gender analysis of relevant measures during the design and implementation phases. Furthermore, the absence of collaborative actions between relevant ministries or authorities, and considerable cuts on annual budgets for initiatives relating to integration widen the above-mentioned gaps. For instance, efforts made by of Employment Agency often are in vain when the childcare office refuses to cooperate on the matter of childcare for a trainee in a language or skills development program in German society. Similarly, the government has reduced the annual budget of Swedish Gender Equality and Migration Agencies in the current fiscal year.

These limitations determine women migrants' satisfaction level with prevailing human development arrangements, which can contribute to the transition of gender ideology of individuals as well as their families from traditional to liberal scales. My survey statistics infer that women migrants are more likely satisfied with arrangements relating to language learning, skills development, cultural orientation, civic education, and access to information in Sweden than that in Germany. Nonetheless, these measures exert varying influences on selected determinants of gender ideology (cultural as well as religious) in both countries. Although migration produces enlightened transition in all determinants of gender ideology of migrants, except women's domestic role and responsibilities in both countries. The satisfaction level of women migrants with the selected legal measures also contributes towards transition in two determinants of cultural ideology in both countries and one determinant in Germany, but in all determinants of religious ideology in Sweden. Firstly, the satisfaction level of women migrants with language learning and skills development opportunities contributes to their empowerment on mobility and use of money in Germany. Secondly, their satisfaction level with cultural and civic education programs is associated with positive changes in their domestic responsibilities and equal use of ICTs in Sweden, in their empowerment level for mobility and use of money in Germany, in their reduced level of religiosity, and enlightened religious beliefs towards women's employment in Sweden. Lastly, their satisfaction level with information retrieval mechanisms is associated in with positive changes in the equal use of ICTs in both countries, but a reduction of their level of religiosity, and in the enlightenment of their religious beliefs towards women's employment in Sweden.

CONCLUSION

It is concluded that the national legal frame does not incorporate all aspects of 'gender' in relevant policies/legislation and subsequent programs/projects essential for the integration of women migrants. Hence, the target groups do not reap the expected benefits of human development programs targeting their smooth integration with relatively more gender-egalitarian regimes.

On the one hand, these inferences support the popular assertions of post-colonial feminists that western public discourse and subsequent legal framework try to find remedies based on 'own' lenses (Dechaufour, 2008; Mohanty, 1988), thus they fail to achieve the desired outcome. Both qualitative and quantitative inferences categorize different micro-, meso- and macro-level barriers for availing equal benefits of prevailing programs/projects. Micro-level barriers are women migrant's own limitations to participate in these activities, meso-level barriers are linked to lack of coordination between relevant ministries or departments working on integration, and non-availability of childcare for attendees of relevant programs, and macro-level barriers are classified as missing gender-sensitive clauses in relevant policies/legislation, inadequate budgetary support to integration processes, and ambiguity of political will towards gender and migration narratives. This top-down classification of barriers implies a correlation between legal measures and the attitude of women migrants less likely to participate in human development programs and to retrieve needed information in both countries, especially in Germany.

On the other hand, although both destination countries hold a much better position in the gender equality ranking in comparison to study-specific origin countries (UNDP, 2019; World Economic Forum, 2019), still an androcentric approach could be a fundamental factor behind the exclusion of 'gender' from relevant legal measures. Findings reveal that both states have no adequate mechanism to conduct 'gender' analysis of targeted measures to integrate women migrants within their societies. Thus, the launched programs/projects neglect 'gender' needs of women migrants to dispose of the strong influence of relatively traditional origin-cultural and religious ideologies/practices for constituting egalitarian gender relations within migrant families. The results of the study show that human development programs are less likely disseminated through ICTs, childcare facilities are rarely available to attendees, native-host language learning modules/methods are not available, and only a particular fraction is entitled to a financial subsidy for attending these programs. These barriers are outcomes of 'androcentric' and/or 'Eurocentric' approaches that overlook women's needs in general, and migrant's needs, in particular, while designing and implementing phases.

Thus, although the process of migration does, these measures do not exert a highly positive effect on selected determinants of the gender ideology of migrants towards women's social and economic emancipation. Nonetheless, the situation seems relatively acceptable in Sweden where these measures have contributed a significant effect on more determinants than that in Germany. Finally, the study provides sufficient evidence to claim that by controlling other variables of migration, adequately designed, coordinated, and implemented policies/legislation can help transform the gender ideology of migrants from traditional to enlightened phases. Having an enlightened gender ideology increases the likelihood of migrants promoting equal division of labour within and outside homes.

LIMITATIONS

The quantitative analysis neither extends to origin countries nor includes demographic variables of women migrants. The scope of generalization is limited due to the inclusion of an online sample. The expert's analysis does not include the perspective of BAMF from Germany. Moreover, a few more policies/legislation may have been overlooked while conducting this analysis.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This paper is an outcome of the scholarship awarded to Muhammad Wajid Tahir by the Fritz Thyssen Foundation, Germany to implement a project titled 'Challenges of Integration for Immigrant Women in Europe: Nexus between Gender Mainstreaming of Public Policies/Legislation and Gender Ideology'.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

There is no conflict of interest to declare.

PEER REVIEW

The peer review history for this article is available at <https://publons.com/publon/10.1111/imig.13006>.

DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

The data that support the findings of this study are available on request from the corresponding author. The data are not publicly available due to privacy or ethical restrictions.

ORCID

Muhammad Wajid Tahir  <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3290-7382>

ENDNOTES

1. Both irregular (asylum-seekers and refugees) and regular (employees and dependents)
2. Former: relatively less egalitarian and Latter: relatively more egalitarian
3. Gender Development Index (UNDP, 2019) & Gender Gap Index (World Economic Forum, 2019)
4. Social & Economic Integration: gender equality, autonomy in decision-making & access to employment
5. It was difficult to engage multi-lingual women migrants in qualitative methods due to (1) funding constraints, and (2) possible male-female interaction barriers
6. Source: (BPA, 1995; BPA+15, 2010; CEDAW, 1979; CESCR, 1996; DR, 1958; ESC, 1961; ESC(A), 1988; ESC(R), 1996; HFA, 1975)
7. Source: (ACEOWM, 2011; APITCN, 2016; ESC(R), 1996; HELMPCOD, 2015; HD, 1992; HFA, 1975; MER, 1949; MEC, 1949; MWR, 1975; MWC, 1975; MFLM, 2006; SRRM, 2017; SP, 2010) **Note:** detailed references are placed in bibliography.
8. See details: <http://www.bamf.de/EN/Willkommen/DeutschLernen/ErstorientierungAsyl/erstorientierungasyl-node.html>
9. See details: <http://www.bamf.de/EN/Willkommen/DeutschLernen/IntegrationskurseAsylbewerber/integrationskurseasylbewerber-node.html>
10. See details: <http://www.bamf.de/EN/Willkommen/DeutschLernen/DeutschBeruf/deutschberuf-node.html>
11. See details: http://www.bamf.de/EN/Willkommen/DeutschLernen/Integrationskurse/SpezielleKursarten/Foerderkurse/foerderkurse-node.html;jsessionid=C85BB764FA978143BFAA3AC80081DA73.1_cid286
12. See details: <http://www.bamf.de/EN/Willkommen/DeutschLernen/Integrationskurse/SpezielleKursarten/Intensivkurse/intensivkurse-node.html>
13. Source: (APITCN, 2016; ACEOWM, 2011; ESC(R), 1996; HELMPCOD, 2015; HD, 1992; HFA, 1975; MWR, 1975; MFLM, 2006; SRRM, 2017; SP, 2010) **Note:** detailed references are placed in bibliography
14. See details: <http://www.bamf.de/EN/Willkommen/Integrationsprojekte/Engagement/engagement-node.html>
15. See details: <http://www.bamf.de/EN/Willkommen/DeutschLernen/Integrationskurse/SpezielleKursarten/Frauenkurse/frauenkurse-node.html>
16. Source: (APITCN, 2016; ACEOWM, 2011; CPRMWMF, 1990; HFA, 1975; MWC, 1975; MWR, 1975; MFLM, 2006; MD, 1991; TEU, 2012) **Note:** detailed references are placed in bibliography
17. See detail: http://www.bamf.de/SharedDocs/Anlagen/EN/Publikationen/Broschueren/das-grundgesetz.pdf?__blob=publicationFile
18. See details: <http://www.bamf.de/EN/Willkommen/InformationBeratung/ErwachseneBeratung/erwachseneberatung-node.html>
19. See details: <http://www.bamf.de/EN/Willkommen/InformationBeratung/Buergerservice/buergerservice-node.html>
20. See details: <http://www.bamf.de/EN/Willkommen/InformationBeratung/JugendlicheBeratung/jugendlicheberatung-node.html>
21. See <https://www.arbetsformedlingen.se/Globalmeny/Other-languages.html>
22. See <http://www.do.se/>
23. Effective measures to discourage race/ethnicity based discrimination

REFERENCES

- Akresh, I.R. (2011) Immigrants' religious participation in the United States. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 34(2), 643–661. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2010.526719>
- Bittner, K. (2011) *Religiosity and gender ideology as predictors of relationship quality: Mediating effects of relationship commitment*. Retrieved from <https://lib.dr.iastate.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1415&context=etd> on 04/02/2019 at 18:37 pm
- Blau, F.D., Kahn, L.M., Yung-Hsu, A. & Papps, K.L. (2008) *The transmission of women's fertility, human capital and work orientation across immigrant generations*. Cambridge: National Bureau of Economic Research.
- Bonifacio, G.T. (Ed.) (2012) *Feminism and Migration: Cross-Cultural Engagements* (Vol. 1). Dordrecht: Springer Science & Business Media.

- Borchorst, A. & Siim, B. (2002) The women-friendly welfare states revisited. *NORA - Nordic Journal of Feminist and Gender Research*, 10(2), 90–98. <https://doi.org/10.1080/080387402760262186>
- Braun, V. & Clarke, V. (2006) Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3, 77–101. <https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa>
- Breunig, C., Cao, X. & Luedtke, A. (2012) Global migration and political regime type: A democratic disadvantage. *British Journal of Political Science*, 42(4), 825–854. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0007123412000051>
- Broberg, A.G. & Hwang, C.P. (2014) The historical and social context of child care in Sweden. *Child care in context*. Hove, East Sussex: Psychology Press, pp. 45–72.
- Bühlmann, F., Elcherth, G. & Tettamanti, M. (2010) The division of labour among European couples: the effects of life course and welfare policy on value–practice configurations. *European Sociological Review*, 26(1), 49–66. <https://doi.org/10.1093/esr/jcp004>
- Busse, A. & Gathmann, C. (2018) *Free day-care and its effects on children and their families*. Retrieved from https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3169867 on 06/02/2019 at 01:41 am
- Castle, M. & Taras, R. (2002) *Democracy in Poland*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.
- Chow, E. (2002) Globalization, East Asian development, and gender: A historical view. In: Chow, E.-L. (Ed.) *Transforming gender and development in East Asia*. New York: Routledge, pp. 9–24.
- Dechaufour, L. (2008) Introduction au féminisme postcolonial. *Nouvelles Questions Féministes*, 27(2), 99–110.
- DESTATIS. (2015, December 31) *Foreign population*. Retrieved from <https://www.destatis.de/EN/FactsFigures/SocietyState/Population/MigrationIntegration/ForeignPopulation/Tables/ForeignerLaender.html>
- Della Puppa, F. (2019) Bodies at work, work on bodies: migrant bodies, wage labour, and family reunification in Italy. *Int. Migration & Integration*, 20, 963–981. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12134-018-00644-x>
- Diehl, C. & Koenig, M. (2009) Religiosität türkischer Migranten im generationenverlauf: ein befund und einige erklärungsversuche. *Zeitschrift Für Soziologie*, 38(4), 300–319. <https://doi.org/10.1515/zfsoz-2009-0403>
- Dubrow, J.K. (2011) The importance of party ideology: Explaining parliamentary support for political party gender quotas in Eastern Europe. *Party Politics*, 17(5), 561–579. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1354068810377190>
- Edgell, P. (2013) *Religion and family in a changing society*, vol. 57. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Eurostat. (2016) *Migration and migrant population statistics*. Available from http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statisticsexplained/index.php/Migration_and_migrant_population_
- Friedan, B. (2010) *The feminine mystique*. New York: WW Norton & Company.
- Goertz, G. & Mazur, A. (2008) *Politics, gender and concepts*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.
- Grillo, R.D. (2008) *The family in question: Immigrant and ethnic minorities in multicultural Europe*. Amsterdam, Netherlands: Amsterdam University Press.
- Grunow, D., Begall, K. & Buchler, S. (2018) Gender ideologies in Europe: a multidimensional framework. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 80(1), 42–60. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jomf.12453>
- Guo, J. & Gilbert, N. (2012) Public attitudes and gender policy regimes: Coherence and stability in hard times. *Journal of Sociology & Social Welfare*, 39(1), 163–182. Available from <http://heinonline.org/HOL/LandingPage?handle=hein.journals/jrlsasw39&div=22&id=&page=>
- Hagan, J. & Ebaugh, H.R. (2003) Calling upon the sacred: migrants' use of religion in the migration process. *International Migration Review*, 37(4), 1145–1153. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1747-7379.2003.tb00173.x>
- Hall, G. (2009) *Guide on gender-sensitive labour migration policies*. Available from <http://www.osce.org/secretariat/37228?download=true> on 03/06/2016 at 10:25 am
- Hernes, H. (1987) *Welfare state and woman power: essays in state feminism*. Oslo: Norwegian University Press.
- Inglehart, R. & Norris, P. (2003) *Rising tide: Gender equality and cultural change around the world*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- King, R. (2012) *Theories and typologies of migration: An overview and a primer*. Available from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/260096281_Theories_and_Typologies_of_Migration_An_Overview_and_A_Primer on 19/09/2016 at 11:45 am
- Klingorová, K. & Havlíček, T. (2015) Religion and gender inequality: The status of women in the societies of world religions. *Moravian Geographical Reports*, 23(2), 2–11 <https://content.sciendo.com/view/journals/mgr/23/2/article-p2.xml>
- Korteweg, A.C. & Yurdakul, G. (2021) Liberal feminism and postcolonial difference: debating headscarves in France, the Netherlands, and Germany. *Social Compass*, 68(3), 410–429. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0037768617727486>
- Korteweg, A. & Yurdakul, G. (2009) Islam, gender, and immigrant integration: Boundary drawing in discourses on honour killing in the Netherlands & Germany. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 32(2), 218–238. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870802065218>
- Kristen, C., Mühla, P. & Schacht, D. (2016) Language acquisition of recently arrived immigrants in England, Germany, Ireland, and the Netherlands. *Ethnicities*, 16(2), 180–212. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1468796815616157>

- Llacer, A., Zunzunegui, M.V., Del Amo, J., Mazarrasa, L. & Bolúmar, F. (2007) The contribution of a gender perspective to the understanding of migrants' health. *Journal of Epidemiology & Community Health*, 61(Suppl 2), ii4–ii10. <https://doi.org/10.1136/jech.2007.061770>
- Maguire, M. & Delahunt, B. (2017) Doing a thematic analysis: A practical, step-by-step guide for learning and teaching scholars. *AISHE-J: The All Ireland Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education*, 9(3), 3351–33514.
- Mahler, S.J. & Pessar, P.R. (2006) Gender matters: ethnographers bring gender from the periphery toward the core of migration studies. *The International Migration Review*, 40(1), 27–63. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1747-7379.2006.00002.x>
- Massey, D.S. & Higgins, M.E. (2011) The effect of immigration on religious belief and practice. A theologizing or alienating experience? *Social Science Research*, 40(5), 1371–1389. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssresearch.2010.04.012>
- Mcbride, D. & Mazur, A. (2006, June) *Building a (data) bank while crossing the bridge: RNGS strategies to integrate qualitative and quantitative methods*. In the Conference of the British Journal of Political Science Conference. Londres. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/228896798_Building_A_Data_Bank_While_Crossing_The_Bridge_RNGS_Strategies_To_Integrate_Qualitative_And_Quantitative_Methods on 09/02/2019 at 14:19 pm.
- Migrationsverket. (2015) *Statistics for 2015*. Available from <http://www.migrationsverket.se/English/About-the-Migration-Agency/Facts-and-statistics-/Statistics/2015.html> [Accessed 09 April 2019]
- Ministry of Justice (Migration and Asylum). (2017, February) *Sweden's migration and asylum policy*. Available from <http://www.government.se/491b3d/contentassets/26536c43ab3b41df90c064c2049b1bce/swedens-migration-and-asylum-policy> on 22.11.2017 at 11:30 am.
- Ministry of Integration and Gender Equality. (2009) *Swedish integration policy*. Available from <https://www.government.se/contentassets/b055a941e7a247348f1acf6ade2fd876/swedish-integration-policy-fact-sheet-in-english> on 31.03.2022 at 12:04 pm.
- Mohanty, C. (1988) Under western eyes: Feminist scholarship and colonial discourses. *Feminist Review*, 30(1), 61–88. <https://doi.org/10.1057/fr.1988.42>
- Murphy, E.C. (2003) Women in Tunisia: between state feminism and economic reform. In: Doumato, E.A. & Posunesy, M.P. (Eds.) *Women and globalization in the middle east: gender, economy and society*. London: Lynne Rienner Publisher, pp. 169–193.
- Neculaesei, A. (2015) Culture and gender role differences. *Cross-Cultural Management Journal*, 1(7), 31–35 <http://www.cmj.bxb.ro/Article/CMJ74.pdf>
- Neuman, E. (2014) *Culture, assimilation, and gender gaps in labour market outcomes*. Växjö, Sweden: Linnaeus University. Retrieved from: <https://lnu.se/contentassets/729bb815ca184ffc9d1c33192c8b9a55/lmdswp201410.pdf>
- Nowell, L.S., Norris, J.M., White, D.E. & Moules, N.J. (2017) Thematic analysis: striving to meet the trustworthiness criteria. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 16(1), 1609406917733847.
- Paxton, P. & Kunovich, S. (2003) Women's political representation: The importance of ideology. *Social Forces*, 82(1), 87–113. <https://doi.org/10.1353/sof.2003.0105>
- Pessar, P. & Mahler, S. (2003) Transnational migration: Bringing gender in. *International Migration Review*, 37(3), 812–846. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1747-7379.2003.tb00159.x>
- Pessin, L. & Arpino, B. (2018) Navigating between two cultures: Immigrants' gender attitudes toward working women. *Demographic Research*, 38, 967. <https://doi.org/10.4054/DemRes.2018.38.35>
- Piper, N. (2013) *New perspectives on gender and migration: Livelihood, rights and entitlements*. Routledge.
- Ponce, A. (2017) Gender and Anti-immigrant Attitudes in Europe. *Socius*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/237802311729970>
- Read, J. (2004) Cultural influences on immigrant women's labor force participation: The Arab-American Case. *International Migration Review*, 38(1), 52–77. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1747-7379.2004.tb00188.x>
- Röder, A. & Mühlau, P. (2014) Are they acculturating? Europe's immigrants and gender egalitarianism. *Social Forces*, 92(3), 899–928.
- Romiti, A., Brücker, H., Fendel, T., Kosyakova, Y., Liebau, E., Rother, N. et al. (2016) Bildung und Sprache. In: Brücker, H., Rother, N. & Schupp, J. (Hrsg.) *IAB-BAMFSOEP-Befragung von Geflüchteten: Überblick und erste Ergebnisse*. Forschungsbericht 29. Nürnberg: Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge, pp. 37–47.
- Said, E.W. (1979) *Orientalism*. New York: Vintage Books.
- Sakai, C. (2004) *The Japanese migrant women in Hong Kong and the possibility of the reconfiguration of gender and ethnicity: Can migrant women share their experiences?* Paper presented in 'Migrant Domestic/Care Workers and the Reconfiguration of Gender in Asia' January 24–24, 2004. Tokyo: Ochanomizu University.
- Sassen, S. (2003) The feminization of survival: Alternative global circuits. In: *Crossing Borders and Shifting Boundaries*. VS Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften, pp. 59–77.
- Scheible, J.A. & Fleischmann, F. (2013) Gendering islamic religiosity in the second generation: gender differences in religious practices and the association with gender ideology among moroccan-and Turkish-Belgian Muslims. *Gender & Society*, 27(3), 372–395. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0891243212467495>

- Smith, C., Sikkink, D. & Bailey, J. (1998) Devotion in Dixie and beyond. *Journal of the Scientific Study of Religion*, 37(3), 494–506 <https://www.jstor.org/stable/i260045>
- Snel, E., Engbersen, G. & Leerkes, A. (2006) Transnational involvement and social integration. *Global Networks*, 6(3), 285–308. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-0374.2006.00145.x>
- Somech, A. & Drach-Zahavy, A. (2016) Gender role ideology. *The Wiley Blackwell Encyclopedia of Gender and Sexuality Studies*, 1–3. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118663219.wbegss205>
- Stump, R. (2008) *The geography of religion: faith, place, and space*. Maryland: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers.
- Suleri, S. (1995) Woman skin deep: Feminism and the postcolonial condition. In: Ashcroft, B., Gareth, G. & Helen, T. (Eds.) *The post-colonial studies reader*. London: Routledge, pp. 273–288.
- Tansey, O., Koehler, K. & Schmotz, A. (2017) Ties to the rest: Autocratic linkages and regime survival. *Comparative Political Studies*, 50(9), 1221–1254. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0010414016666859>
- UNDP. (2019) *Human development report 2019*. Available from: <http://hdr.undp.org/sites/default/files/hdr2019.pdf> on 02072020 at 18:05 pm
- Van Tubergen, F. (2013) Religious change of new immigrants in the Netherlands: the event of migration. *Social Science Research*, 42(3), 715–25. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssresearch.2012.12.016>
- Van Tubergen, F. & Kalmijn, M. (2005) Destination-language proficiency in cross-national perspective: a study of immigrant groups in nine western countries. *American Journal of Sociology*, 110(5), 1412–1457. <https://doi.org/10.1086/428931>
- Walsh, W.B. & Heppner, M. (2006) *Handbook of career counseling for women*. New Jersey: Routledge.
- Waylen, G. (2005) Analysing women in the politics of the Third World. *Women and politics in the third world*. Routledge, pp. 20–37.
- Words, S. & Baraulina, T. (2017) *BAMF brief analysis*. Migration, Integration and Asylum Research Centre at the Federal Office for Migration and Refugees, Issue 1/2017. Retrieved from https://www.bamf.de/SharedDocs/Anlagen/EN/Publikationen/Kurzanalysen/kurzanalyse7_gefluchetete-frauen.pdf?__blob=publicationFile
- Words, S., Bund, E. & Böhm, A. (2016) *Asyl – und dann? Die Lebenssituation von Asylberechtigten und anerkannten Flüchtlingen in Deutschland*. BAMF-Flüchtlingsstudie 2014. Forschungsbericht 28, Nürnberg: Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge.
- World Economic Forum. (2019) *Global gender gap report 2020*. Available from http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_GGGR_2020.pdf on 02072020 at 18:00 pm
- Yamanaka, K. & Piper, N. (2005, December) *Feminized migration in East and Southeast Asia: policies, actions and empowerment*. Available from: <http://www.bdigital.unal.edu.co/39693/1/9290850647.2005.pdf>

INTERNATIONAL/REGIONAL CONVENTIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS

- Council of Europe. (1961) *The European social charter (ESC)*. Available from: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/full-list/-/convention/s/rms/090000168006b642> [Accessed 11 September 2017]
- Council of Europe. (1988) *The European Social Charter (additional protocol) (ESC(A))*. Available from: <https://rm.coe.int/CoERMPublicCommOnSearchServices/DisplayDCTMContent?documentId=090000168007a84e> [Accessed 12 September 2017]
- Council of Europe. (1996) *European Social Charter (Revised) (ESC(R))*. <https://rm.coe.int/168007cf93> [Accessed 08 September 2017]
- Council of the European Union. (2010 May, 04) *The stockholm programme-an open and secure europe serving and protecting citizens (SP)*. Available from <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ:C:2010:115:0001:0038:en:PDF> [Accessed 01 September 2017]
- EUR-LEX. (2012, October, 26) *Consolidated Version of the Treaty on European Union (TEU)*. Available from http://eur-lex.europa.eu/resource.html?uri=cellar:2bf140bf-a3f8-4ab2-b506-fd71826e6da6.0023.02/DOC_1&format=PDF [Accessed 02 September 2017]
- European Commission. (2011) *Opinion on The Gender Dimension of Integration of Migrants*. Advisory Committee on Equal Opportunities for Women and Men (ACEOWM). Available from http://ec.europa.eu/justice/gender-equality/files/opinions_advisory_committee/opinion_integration_migrants_en.pdf [Accessed 05 September 2017]
- European Commission. (2016, June 07) *Action Plan on the Integration of Third Country Nationals (APITCN)*. https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/what-we-do/policies/european-agenda-migration/proposal-implementation-package/docs/20160607/communication_action_plan_integration_third-country_nationals_en.pdf [Accessed 06 September 2017]
- International Labour Organization (ILO). (1949, July, 01) C097 - *Migration for Employment Convention (MEC)*. Available from http://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100_INSTRUMENT_ID:312242 [Accessed 05 September 2017].
- International Labour Organization (ILO). (1949, July, 01) R086 - *Migration for Employment Recommendations (MER)*. Available from http://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:12100:0::NO::P12100_INSTRUMENT_ID:312424 [Accessed 14 September 2017].
- International Labour Organization (ILO). (1958, June, 25) R111 - *Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Recommendation (DR)*. Available from http://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100_ILO_CODE:R111 [Accessed 11 September 2017].
- International Labour Organization (ILO). (1975, June, 24) C143 - *Migrant Workers (Supplementary Provisions) Convention (MWC)*. Available from http://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100_ILO_CODE:C143 [Accessed 10 September 2017].
- International Labour Organization (ILO). (1975b, June, 24) R151 - *Migrant Workers Recommendation (MWR)*. Available from http://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100_ILO_CODE:R151 [Accessed 10 September 2017].

- International Labour Organization. (ILO). (2006) *Multilateral framework on labour migration non-binding principles and guidelines for a rights-based approach to labour migration* (MFLM). Available from http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/documents/publication/wcms_146243.pdf [Accessed 15 September 2017].
- Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE), International Organization for Migration (IOM) and International Labour Office (ILO). (2006) *Handbook on Establishing Effective Labour Migration Policies in Countries of Origin and Destination* (HELMPCOD). Available from <http://www.osce.org/eea/19242?download=true> [Accessed 15 September 2017]
- Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe. (OSCE). (1991, October, 04) *Document of the Moscow meeting of the conference on the human dimension of the CSCE* (MD). Available from <http://www.osce.org/de/odihr/elections/14310> [Accessed 16 September 2017].
- Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE). (1992, July, 09-10) *Helsinki document* (HD). Available from <http://www.osce.org/mc/39530?download=true> [Accessed 11 September 2017]
- Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE). (1975, August, 01) *Helsinki final act* (HFA). Available from <http://www.osce.org/helsinki-final-act>, [Accessed 12 September 2017]
- United Nations Human Rights Office of the Higher Commissioner (OHCHR). (1996, December, 16) *International covenant on economic, social and cultural rights* (CESCR). Available from <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/CESCR.aspx> [Accessed 14 September 2017].
- United Nations. (1990, December, 18) *International convention on the protection of the rights of all migrant workers and members of their families* (CPRMWMF). Available from: <https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/ProfessionalInterest/cmw.pdf> [Accessed 18 September 2017].
- United Nations. (2017) *Report of the Special Representative of the Secretary General on Migration* (SRRM). Available from http://www.un.org/en/development/desa/population/migration/events/coordination/15/documents/Report%20of%20SRSG%20on%20Migration%20-%20A.71.728_ADVANCE.pdf [Accessed 09 September 2017]
- UNWOMEN. (1995, September) *Beijing declaration and platform for action* (BPA). Available from: <https://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/beijing/platform/> [Accessed 02 September 2017]

GERMAN LEGISLATION/POLICY DOCUMENTS

- Bundesgesetzblatt. (2016, August, 05) *Integrationsgesetz* (Integration Act). Available from http://www.bmas.de/SharedDocs/Downloads/DE/PDF-Meldungen/2016/entwurf-integrationsgesetz.pdf?__blob=publicationFile&v=4 [Accessed 25 May 2018]
- Federal Ministry of Justice, Germany. (1997, March, 24) *Sozialgesetzbuch* (SGB) Drittes Buch (III) - *Arbeitsförderung* - (Artikel 1 Des Gesetzes Vom 24. März 1997, Bgbl. I S. 594) (English Translation: Social Code Book-III). Available from: https://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/sgb_3/SGB_3.pdf [Accessed 22 May 2018].
- Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection, Germany. (2008, February, 25) *Residence Act: Act on the Residence, Economic Activity and Integration of Foreigners in the Federal Territory* (amended on 2016, March, 11). https://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/englisch_aufenthg/englisch_aufenthg.pdf [Accessed 14 June 2018].

SWEDISH LEGISLATION/POLICY DOCUMENTS

- Ministry of Justice. (2017, February) *Sweden's migration and asylum policy*. Available from <http://www.government.se/491b3d/contentassets/26536c43ab3b41df90c064c2049b1bce/swedens-migration-and-asylum-policy> on 11.04.2018.
- Riksdag. (1949) *The freedom of the press act*. Retrieved from <https://www.riksdagen.se/globalassets/07-dokument-lagar/the-freedom-of-the-press-act-2015.pdf> on 01042019
- Swedish Code of Statutes. (2010, March, 02) *Ordinance on government contributions for vocational mentoring activities* (2010:84). Available from <http://www.ilo.org/dyn/natlex/docs/ELECTRONIC/88267/100865/F231056911/SWE88267Swedish.pdf> on 08. 04. 2018.
- Swedish Riksdag. (2007, November, 08) *Ordinance on youth employment guarantee* (2007:813). Available from <http://www.riksdagen.se/sv/dokument-lagar/dokument/svensk-forfattningssamling/forordning-2007813-om-jobbgaranti-for-sfs-2007-813> on 08. 04. 2018
- Swedish Riksdag. (2014, November, 10) *Act on civic orientation for some newly arrived immigrants* (2013:156). Available from <http://www.ilo.org/dyn/natlex/docs/ELECTRONIC/96587/114163/F2082698855/SWE96587SwedishConsolidated.pdf> on 06. 04. 2018
- Swedish Riksdag. (2015, December, 29) *Ordinance respecting special employment support* (2015:503). Available from <http://www.ilo.org/dyn/natlex/docs/ELECTRONIC/101740/122723/F-288015536/SWE101740SwedishConsolidated.pdf> on 10. 04. 2018.
- Swedish Riksdag. (2015, January, 02) *Ordinance on establishment and introduction activities for newly arrived immigrants* (2010:409). Available from <http://www.ilo.org/dyn/natlex/docs/ELECTRONIC/88572/117787/F-807641750/SWE88572SwedishConsolidated.pdf> on 08. 04. 2018
- Swedish Riksdag. (2016, February, 23) *Act on establishment contributions for newly arrived immigrants* (2010:197). Available from <http://www.ilo.org/dyn/natlex/docs/ELECTRONIC/88289/110570/F-1199467867/SWE88289SwedishConsolidated.pdf> on 03. 04. 2018

EXPERT INTERVIEWS

- German Employment Agency. (2019, April) *An interview with gender and employment expert from Marburg, Germany*.
- Ministry of Justice and Integration. (2019, February) *An interview with migration and gender expert from the gender equality section, Stockholm, Sweden*.
- Ministry of Social Affairs. (2019, February) *An interview with gender expert from Stockholm, Sweden*.

Swedish Employment Agency. (2019, February) *An interview with employment expert from Gothenburg, Sweden.*

Swedish Gender Equality Agency. (2019, February) *An interview with gender expert from Gothenburg, Sweden.*

Swedish Migration Agency. (2019, February) *An interview with migration expert from Flen, Sweden.*

How to cite this article: Tahir, M.W. & Kauser, R. (2023) Mainstreaming 'gender' and 'integration' needs in human development initiatives: Asian and African migrant women's integration in Europe. *International Migration*, 61, 260–282. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1111/imig.13006>