

Schotte, Simone; Gisselquist, Rachel M.; Leone, Tharcisio

Working Paper

Does affirmative action address ethnic inequality? A systematic review of the literature

WIDER Working Paper, No. 2023/14

Provided in Cooperation with:

United Nations University (UNU), World Institute for Development Economics Research (WIDER)

Suggested Citation: Schotte, Simone; Gisselquist, Rachel M.; Leone, Tharcisio (2023) : Does affirmative action address ethnic inequality? A systematic review of the literature, WIDER Working Paper, No. 2023/14, ISBN 978-92-9267-322-2, The United Nations University World Institute for Development Economics Research (UNU-WIDER), Helsinki, <https://doi.org/10.35188/UNU-WIDER/2023/322-2>

This Version is available at:

<https://hdl.handle.net/10419/283710>

Standard-Nutzungsbedingungen:

Die Dokumente auf EconStor dürfen zu eigenen wissenschaftlichen Zwecken und zum Privatgebrauch gespeichert und kopiert werden.

Sie dürfen die Dokumente nicht für öffentliche oder kommerzielle Zwecke vervielfältigen, öffentlich ausstellen, öffentlich zugänglich machen, vertreiben oder anderweitig nutzen.

Sofern die Verfasser die Dokumente unter Open-Content-Lizenzen (insbesondere CC-Lizenzen) zur Verfügung gestellt haben sollten, gelten abweichend von diesen Nutzungsbedingungen die in der dort genannten Lizenz gewährten Nutzungsrechte.

Terms of use:

Documents in EconStor may be saved and copied for your personal and scholarly purposes.

You are not to copy documents for public or commercial purposes, to exhibit the documents publicly, to make them publicly available on the internet, or to distribute or otherwise use the documents in public.

If the documents have been made available under an Open Content Licence (especially Creative Commons Licences), you may exercise further usage rights as specified in the indicated licence.

ONLINE APPENDIX

Does affirmative action address ethnic inequality?

A systematic review of the literature

WIDER Working Paper 2023/14

Simone Schotte, Rachel Gisselquist, and Tharcisio Leone¹

January 2023

¹ Corresponding author: simone.schotte@finnoc.fi

Supplementary material

Table S1: List of studies

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Acemoglu et al. (2007) (Mimeo)	South Africa	Employment / Business: Black Economic Empowerment (BEE)	Race/colour: Black people (African, Coloured and Indian people who are South African citizens)	Work / Business Performance: Firm investment, labour productivity and profitability	Estimation: OLS and FE models	Insignificant No significant effects. If anything, some weak evidence that BEE has a negative effect on investment and labour productivity.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Adeyemi (2001) (Journal: <i>Higher Education</i>)	Nigeria	Education: Catchment area policy in the admission process (Quota)	Region: Students from catchment areas (geographical areas served by an institution)	Educational attainment: Student performance	Descriptive: ANOVA	Mixed (+/-) Admission based on catchment area criterion ranged between 29.0% and 31.0%, which implies that the universities have to a large extent been implementing the policy as stipulated. However, the major ethnic groups in each catchment area have been dominating admissions.	Negative (-) Student performance may be affected adversely. Students admitted through the merit factor performed better than the ones admitted through the catchment area factor.	Insignificant Continuously low female enrolment at all levels of education.	n.a.
Alionescu (2004) (Journal: <i>Southeast European Politics</i>)	Romania	Electoral representation: Ethnic parties who do not win any seats in Parliament have the right to one seat in the lower chamber if they receive at least 5 % of the votes.	Other: Hungarians, Roma, and other minorities	Political participation: Seats in Parliament	Descriptive: Number of seats	Positive (+) Continuous increase of the number of members of parliament (MPs) representing minorities.	Negative (-) The majority of voters for ethnic parties do not belong to the minority for which they voted. There is growing criticism concerning the ways in which new voters were attracted.	n.a.	n.a.
Allen (2018b) (Dissertation Chapter 5)	Croatia	Electoral representation: Communally reserved legislative seats (Quota)	Other: Serbian, Hungarian, Italian, Czech and Slovak, and other minority communities	Political participation: Turnout in communally reserved districts	Descriptive: Average turnout (combined with qualitative analysis)	Negative (-) Low turnout in reserved districts that is related to weaknesses of the reservation system (e.g., lack of competitiveness in the reserved seat)	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						elections; mainstream parties do not compete for minority voters.			
Allen (2018a) (Dissertation Chapter 6, 1 st part of the analysis)	Comparative: Taiwan, New Zealand, Slovenia	Electoral representation: Communally reserved legislative seats (Quota)	Indigeneity / other: Lowland and Highland Aborigines in Taiwan; Māori in New Zealand; Italians and Hungarians in Slovenia	Political participation: Turnout in communally reserved districts	Descriptive: Average turnout	Negative (-) Turnout in the reserved districts has been systematically much lower than the nationwide average.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Allen (2018a) (Dissertation Chapter 6, 2 nd part of the analysis)	Comparative: 29 European countries (Belgium and Switzerland excluded due to heavily ethnicized nature of party politics)	Electoral representation: Communally reserved legislative seats (Quota)	Other: Hungarians, Roma, and other minorities	Political participation: Participation of ethnic parties in a governing coalition	Estimation: Logistic and OLS regression	Negative (-) Ethnic parties are less likely to participate in coalitions, and those ethnic parties elected through reserved constituencies are even less likely to participate.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Alon and Tienda (2005) (Journal: <i>Sociology of Education</i>)	United States	Education: Racial quotas for college admissions (Quota)	Race/colour: Black and Hispanic students	Educational attainment: Graduation rate within six years of enrolment	Estimation: DID with Propensity scores	n.a.	Positive (+) The study rejects the mismatch hypothesis for students who enrolled at the most selective institutions during the late 1980s and early 1990s. Conditional on admission, all groups of students who attended selective institutions were more likely to graduate within six years of enrolment than their counterparts who attended less-selective colleges.	n.a.	n.a.
Alon (2015a) (Book / book chapter)	Comparative: United States and Israel	Education: Comparison of race- vs- class-based AA	Race/colour: Black and Hispanic students in the United States vs. socio-economic	Educational attainment: College admission	Descriptive: Comparison in means	Positive (+) Class-based and race-based admission policies each boost one type of diversity.	n.a.	Negative (-) The focus on one aspect of disadvantage limits the potential	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
			status-based policy in Israel					of tapping into other aspects because of the relatively low degree of overlap between class, racial, and spatial inequality.	
Alon (2015b) (Book / book chapter)	United States	Education: Hypothetical comparison of race- vs- class-based AA (simulation)	Race/colour: Black and Hispanic students	Educational attainment: College admission and graduation	Descriptive: Comparison in means	Positive (+) The level of racial diversity at elite colleges would substantially decline if class-based policies replaced race-based ones.	Positive (+) Black and Hispanic freshman beneficiaries of race-conscious admissions at elite schools were more likely than their peers at less-selective schools to continue into their second year and to graduate.	n.a.	n.a.
Arcidiacono and Lovenheim (2016) (Journal: <i>Journal of Economic Literature</i>)	United States	Education: Consideration of race as one of many factors in university admissions	Race/colour: Black and Hispanic students	Educational attainment: Admission to undergraduate education and law schools and graduation rates	Descriptive: Comparison in means	Positive (+) Black applicants were admitted to Michigan's law school in 2002 at a slightly higher rate than white students, despite the average academic index of black applicants being ca. 1.5 standard deviations lower than the mean white applicant.	Mixed (+/-) Reshuffling some African American students to less selective schools would improve some outcomes due to match effects dominating quality effects. However, shifting minority undergraduates to low-resource, nonselective schools ultimately may undo any gains from higher match quality.	n.a.	Negative (-) The white students who were rejected generally look academically stronger than the black students who were admitted.
Arcidiacono (2005) (Journal: <i>Econometrica</i>)	United States	Education: (Removing) preferential treatment in university admissions and in financial aid. (Quota)	Race/colour: Black students	Educational attainment / Earnings: Educational choices and future earnings	Estimation: Structural model	Positive (+) ^κ Removing race-based advantages in admissions substantially decreases the number of black students at top-tier schools. Removing advantages in financial aid causes a decrease in	Insignificant Removing preferential treatment for blacks in admissions and in financial aid shows little effect on earnings.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						the number of blacks who attend college.			
Arcidiacono et al. (2014) (Journal: <i>IZA Journal of Labor Economics</i>)	United States	Education: Proposition 209 that removed preferential university admissions (Quota)	Race/colour: Minority students (Black, Hispanic, Native)	Educational attainment: Graduation rates and academic preparation	Estimation: Linear Probability Model	n.a.	Negative (-) The graduation rates of minorities increased after Prop 209, especially for those students in the bottom part of the distribution of academic preparation (matching, behavioural response, and selection).	n.a.	n.a.
Artes and Mena-Chalco (2019) (Journal: <i>Educação & Realidade</i>)	Brazil	Education: International Scholarship Program of the Ford Foundation (IFP) for postgraduate students	Race/colour: Black, brown and indigenous populations, preferably from Brazil's North, Northeast and Central-West regions	Other: Scientific Articles and Co-authoring between IFP Fellows	Descriptive: Comparison in means	Positive (+) The trajectories of the IFP fellows indicate that differentiating policies are successful and can produce researchers included in academy and in spaces of knowledge production.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Assunção and Ferman (2015) (Mimeo)	Brazil	Education: Admissions quotas in higher education (Quota)	Race/colour: Black and public school students	Educational attainment: Proficiency in public schools (evaluated either through a Math or a Portuguese exam)	Estimation: DID	Positive (+) The 40% quota represents a drastic change in the composition of admitted students, particularly for the most competitive courses.	Negative (-) In Rio de Janeiro, the proficiency of black students in public schools was 0.267 standard deviation lower due to the introduction of quotas. This implies an approximately 18% widening of this gap.	Insignificant Other groups of favoured students were not affected, which reflects the system of quotas being much more generous for black students than any other group of favoured students.	n.a.
Ayres and Brooks (2004) (Journal: <i>Stanford Law Review</i>)	United States	Education: Admissions quotas in higher education (Quota)	Race/colour: Black students	Educational attainment: Expected number of black lawyers and probability that black students will become lawyers	Estimation: Linear Probability Model	n.a.	Mixed (+/-) The analyses provide mixed support for the academic mismatch hypothesis in law schools, with results showing no mismatch effect, some supporting a mismatch effect,	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
							others pointing to a reverse mismatch effect. The study found no compelling evidence that the system of AA in place in 1991 reduced the number of black lawyers.		
Bagde et al. (2016) (Journal: <i>American Economic Review</i>)	India	Education: Admissions quotas in higher education (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST, OBC	Educational attainment: College matriculation and academic success	Estimation: Linear Probability Model	Positive (+) Affirmative action increases college attendance among targeted students, with proportionally largest effects for the most disadvantaged castes.	Positive (+) Improved priority in college selection allows targeted students to attend higher-quality colleges, which in turn increases first-year achievement. The study finds no evidence of “mismatch” that harms intended beneficiaries.	n.a.	n.a.
Bamrah and Girdhar (2015) (Working Paper)	India	Education: Reservation policy (RP) (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST, OBC	Educational attainment: Enrolment in higher education	Estimation: Linear regression	Positive (+) Hypothesis testing performed through z-test supported that the reservation policy favours the enrolment of reserved category students.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Banducci et al. (2004) (Journal: <i>The Journal of Politics</i>)	Comparative: United States and New Zealand	Electoral representation: Incorporation of structures into electoral systems that make it possible for minority groups to elect representatives of their choice in single-member districts	Other (Race/colour + Indigeneity): African-Americans in the United States; Māori in New Zealand	Other: Attitudes and behaviour of minority voters	Estimation: Multivariate analysis	Positive (+) In both countries, there were dramatic increases in minority representation in national legislatures in the 1990s.	Positive (+) In the United States, the race of the representative influences recall, contact, and approval. In New Zealand, Māori who are represented by Māori electorate MPs are more likely to believe they have a say in government but are also more critical of their MPs.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Bardhan et al. (2010) (Journal: <i>Journal of Globalization and Development</i>)	India	Electoral representation: Political reservations in local governments (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST; women	Other: Provision of government services and local public goods	Estimation: FE regression	Positive (+) Significant positive effect of SC/ST reservation on per capita benefits in the village as a whole.	n.a.	Positive (+) Significant positive effect of SC/ST reservation on intra-village targeting to female headed households.	n.a.
Barlow and Villarejo (2004) (Journal: <i>Journal of research in science teaching</i>)	United States	Education: Biology Undergraduate Scholars Program (BUSP)	Race/colour: Underrepresented minority students (Hispanics, African, Native Americans)	Educational attainment: Persistence and performance in basic math and science courses and graduation outcomes	Estimation: Multivariate linear and logistic regression models	Positive (+) Greatly improved persistence and performance of minority students in basic math and science courses (due to supplemental instruction and possibly other, unmeasured, facets of the program).	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Basant and Sen (2020) (Journal: <i>The Journal of Development Studies</i>)	India	Education: Central Educational Institutions (Reservations in Admissions) Amendment Bill (Quota)	Caste: OBC	Educational attainment: Enrolment of OBCs	Estimation: DID	Positive (+) The intent-to-treatment effect is positive and statistically significant in the newly exposed states (eastern region).	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Berry (2004) (Journal: <i>Journal of Public Budgeting, Accounting & Financial Management</i>)	United States	Education: AA programs in higher education	Race/colour: Minorities (Hispanics, African, Native Americans)	Other: Perception of institutional barriers that impede the implementation of AA programs	Estimation: Regression using the effectiveness to barriers model	Positive (+) Compared to whites, minority AA officers are more likely to perceive that institutional barriers interfere with their role. A larger AA budget does not necessarily reduce the effect of institutional barriers. However, as the size of the AA staff increases, the effect of institutional barriers decreases. The benefits of an AA program that	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						has been fully integrated into mission of the institution continue to outweigh the costs.			
Bertrand et al. (2010) (Journal: <i>Journal of Public Economics</i>)	India	Education: Admission quotas in engineering colleges (Quota)	Caste: SC, OBC	Educational attainment: Enrolment in higher education and (future) labour market outcomes	Estimation: OLS and IV	Positive (+) Even though applicants are positively selected from the population, caste-based targeting does result in the redistribution of education resources to those who are more economically disadvantaged.	Positive (+) Despite much lower entry exam scores, those who are admitted by AA economically benefit from attending engineering college.	Negative (-) Targeting by caste may lead to the exclusion of other disadvantaged groups (e.g., reduction in the overall number of females entering engineering colleges).	Negative (-) The income losses experienced by displaced upper-caste applicants are larger than the income gains experienced by displacing lower-caste students.
Bhattacharjee (2019) (Mimeo)	India	Education: Admission quotas in central government funded colleges (Quota)	Caste: OBC	Educational attainment: College enrolment and high school completion rates	Estimation: DID	Positive (+) College enrolments among OBC students increased relative to students from both other beneficiary (SC/ST) and non-beneficiary groups	Positive (+) The AA policy had significant positive spillover effects on high school completion rates and school enrolments in higher grades for OBC students.	Insignificant The analyses in this paper do not reveal any worsening of outcomes for non-beneficiary groups.	Insignificant The analyses in this paper do not reveal any worsening of outcomes for non-beneficiary groups.
Bhavnani and Lee (2021) (Journal: <i>American Journal of Political Science</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Admission quotas in bureaucracy (public service) (Quota)	Caste: ST, SC, OBC	Work / Business Performance: Bureaucratic Performance	Estimation: OLS and 2SLS	n.a.	Insignificant The data suggest that disadvantaged group members recruited via AA perform no worse than others.	n.a.	n.a.
Bird (2016) (Journal: <i>Politics, Groups, and Identities</i>)	Comparative: 17 countries (Afghanistan, Bolivia, Burundi, Colombia, Djibouti, Iraq, Jordan, Kosovo)	Electoral representation: Electoral reservations for both ethnic minorities and women (Quota)	Other: Ethnic minorities and women	Political participation: Representation in national parliament	Descriptive: Composition of seats	Insignificant There are rarely representational gains for those located at the intersection of the two quota mechanisms (i.e., even where combined gender and ethnic	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
	Montenegro, Niger, Pakistan Palestinian Territories, Panama, Poland Serbia, Slovenia Taiwan)					quotas exist, we do not necessarily see greater inclusiveness of minority women).			
Bleemer (2022) (Journal: <i>The Quarterly Journal of Economics</i>)	United States	Education: (Removing) Lower admission threshold for minority applicants	Race/colour: African American, Chicano, and Latino	Educational attainment: College quality, course performance, choice of major, degree attainment; wages	Estimation: DID (complemented by RDD and institutional value-added analyses)	Positive (+) ^R Ending AA caused underrepresented minority (URM) applicants to enrol at lower-quality colleges.	Positive (+) ^R Contrary to the mismatch hypothesis, URM applicants' degree attainment declined overall and in STEM fields. URM applicants' average wages in their twenties and thirties declined (driven by declines among Hispanic group).	n.a.	Insignificant White and Asian students just below Berkeley's admissions threshold attained similar educational and labour market outcomes after enrolling at other universities.
Borooah (2019) (Book / book chapter)	India	Employment / Business: Reservation for jobs in government and the public sector (Quota)	Caste: ST, SC, OBC (study focus on men only)	Employment: Regular salaried and wage employment (RSWE)	Estimation: Multinomial logit	Positive (+) Positive discrimination in the public sector in favour of men from the SC was much stronger than negative discrimination against their counterparts in the private sector.	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) It is those from the SC who are the net gainers, and those from the FC who are the net losers of job reservation policies.
Burger and Jafta (2010) (Working Paper)	South Africa	Employment / Business: Employment Equity Act (Act 55 of 1998)	Race/colour: Blacks, women (people with disabilities are also targeted but not covered by study)	Employment / Earnings: Employment and wage gaps	Estimation: Oaxaca-Blinder decomposition	Insignificant Affirmative action may have helped individuals from the designated groups who already found themselves higher up on the skills ladder, but that these effects were too small and concentrated on too few individuals to have had an impact on the	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						average previously disadvantaged in individual.			
Burstein and Edwards (1994) (Journal: <i>Law and Society Review</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Civil Rights Act of 1964	Race/colour: Black population	Earnings: Relative earnings of blacks and whites	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) Blacks' relative earnings rose along with victories in court through the mid-1970s.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Button and Rienzo (2003) (Journal: <i>Social Science Quarterly</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Employer support of AA	Race/colour: Black population	Employment: Black employment	Estimation: OLS	Positive (+) Employer support for AA has a significant and positive effect on black employment, particularly at higher job levels.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Caldwell (2009) (Journal: <i>University of Kansas Law Review</i>)	United States	Education: California's Proposition 209 and the Hopwood v. Texas decision	Race/colour: Hispanic and black students	Educational attainment: Admission in Higher Education	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+)^R The year AA ended, the black-white admissions rate gap more than doubled and has since remained around 15-20%. The percentage of total admits who were black also fell dramatically around the time of the end of AA and has continued to remain low.	n.a.	Negative (-)^R With the end of AA, the admission rates for Asians increased slightly from 84.2% in 1997 to 85% in the fall of 1998.	Negative (-)^R With the end of AA, the admission rates for whites increased slightly from 81.8% in 1997 to 83.8% in the fall of 1998.
Campos et al. (2016) (Journal: <i>Revista Contabilidade & Finanças</i>)	Brazil	Education: Social quotas (Law 12, 711/ 2012) (Quota)	Race/colour: Students who attended High School fully in public institutions, with special modalities for students who declare themselves as black, brown, or Indian	Educational attainment: Dropout rates	Estimation: Binomial analysis	Insignificant When comparing the dropout rates of entrants through broad competition and quotas the results indicate that, for courses in the Business field and the total amount of courses in the Higher Education Institutions under study,	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						the dropout rates of both modes of entry are statistically equal, with no difference between them.			
Cassan (2019) (Journal: <i>Journal of Development Economics</i>)	India	Education: SC and ST Orders (Amendment) Act of 1976	Caste: SC	Educational attainment: Education level, school completion, literacy	Estimation: DID	n.a.	Positive (+) The paper finds an overall important but imprecisely estimated effect of AA, which may have led to an increase in literacy of 10 pts and in secondary attainment of 7 pts. It finds no statistically significant increase in higher education.	n.a.	n.a.
Chambers et al. (2005) (Journal: <i>Stanford Law Review</i>)	United States	Education: Elimination of AA in admission to law schools (simulation)	Race/colour: African Americans	Educational attainment: Enrolment in law schools and production of lawyers (graduation and entering the bar exam)	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) ^R Ending AA would have cut by about 32.5% the numbers of African Americans who would have been admitted to any accredited law school.	Positive (+) ^R Without AA the number of African American students passing the bar and becoming lawyers would reduce in the range of 30-40% each year. Particularly the elimination of AA in admissions at elite law schools would be likely to substantially diminish African American representation in leadership positions such as partners in corporate law firms, professors teaching at law schools, and federal judges.	n.a.	n.a.
Charles (2003) (Journal:)	United States	Employment / Business: Managing diversity	Race/colour: African Americans, Hispanics	Employment: Representative bureaucracy	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) Since 1975, the number of minority employees in the state of New Jersey government workforce	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
<i>Public Personnel Management)</i>						has increased from 20% to 35%.			
Chatterji et al. (2014) (Journal: <i>Journal of Labor Economics</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Reservation of a proportion of government contracts for minority-owned businesses (City Set-Aside Programs) (Quota)	Race/colour: African American men	Employment: Self-employment and employment rates	Estimation: DID and event study	Positive (+) Black business ownership rates increased significantly after program initiation, with the black-white self-employment gap falling by 3 ppts (35–40%). The racial gap in employment fell by roughly 4 ppts after program initiation.	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) It appears that city programs led to a reallocation of self-employment from white to black men, as there is little change in the aggregate rates.
Chaudhary (2015) (Journal: <i>Journal of Social and Economic Development</i>)	India	Electoral representation: Decentralisation and political reservation for disadvantaged groups (73rd constitutional amendment) (Quota)	Caste: ST, SC; women	Other: Multidimensional Poverty Index (MPI)	Estimation: OLS	n.a.	Positive (+) Increased political representation of the disadvantaged castes and tribes at the local level has contributed towards lowering multidimensional deprivation amongst these groups overtime.	Insignificant The bias of elected members from disadvantaged groups in favour of their own communities was confirmed when no statistically significant impact of panchayat elections was seen on other categories of the population.	
Childs and Stromquist (2015) (Journal: <i>Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education</i>)	Brazil	Education: Law of Social Quotas (Quota)	Race/colour: Black, mixed and indigenous public-school students	Educational attainment: Campus diversity, academic performance and predictive validity	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) All three of the universities studied showed significant gains in diversity after the implementation of the affirmative-action policies.	Insignificant Academic performance varies by programme of study but, in general, variation is surprisingly slight.	n.a.	Negative (-) A larger number of displacing students were Black and Brown, while the majority of displaced students were White.
Chin and Prakash (2011) (Journal:)	India	Electoral representation: 73rd and 74th Constitutional Amendments (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST	Other: Poverty	Estimation. (State) Fixed effects	Positive (+) Increasing the share of seats reserved for minorities reduces overall poverty (effect driven by seats reserved for STs)	Positive (+) Political reservation for STs has a greater effect on rural poverty than urban poverty, and appears to benefit	n.a. The study states that individuals in non-target groups may have gained (e.g., because ST legislators strongly promote antipoverty programs), but this is not directly tested.	

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
<i>Journal of Development Economics</i>)						alone, while reservations for SCs have no significant impact).	people near the poverty line as well as those far below it.	Though the authors cannot rule out that there is redistribution from non-minorities to minorities (non-target groups to target groups), they conclude that it does not appear to be those near the poverty line who are bearing the expense for the gains (otherwise overall poverty would not have declined).	
Cicalò (2008) (Working Paper)	Brazil	Education: UFRJ Quota system (Quota)	Race/colour: Black, native Indians, disabled and students from public schools	Educational attainment: Examination pass rates and student performance on tests related to their problem-solving ability	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Mixed (+/-) While “black” and “public school” quotas have been filled more or less constantly between 2004 and 2007, in disciplines such as Medicine, Law, Social Sciences and History, the trend in other courses seems to be negative. In Statistics, Physics, Engineering, Mathematics and Economics, the black and public school quotas are filled well below the 20% established by the legislation, with figures often close to 0%. Figures might suggest that the availability of quotas does not automatically generate high “demand”.	Insignificant The academic performance of quota and non-quota students is very similar. Also, average dropping out rates seems to suggest that quota students quit Programs somewhat less than other students.	n.a.	n.a.
Conrad and Sharpe (1996) (Journal: <i>The Review of Black Political Economy</i>)	United States	Education: Ending AA in admissions to the California State University system (Quota)	Race/colour: African Americans, Mexican Americans, Native Americans	Educational attainment: Admission in higher education; returns to schooling and service delivery	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+)^R Ending AA will, in the short run, reduce the number of minority students admitted. It will also redistribute minority students from the most competitive towards less competitive campuses.	Positive (+)^R This redistribution will lower the returns to schooling for affected groups. A lower number of minority graduates in law and medicine may negatively affect the	Negative (-)^R The number of Asian American students will increase with the removal.	Negative (-)^R The number of white students enrolled will also increase, but only slightly.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
							delivery of legal and health care services to minority communities.		
Contreras (2005) (Journal: <i>Educational Policy</i>)	United States	Education: Ending AA in admissions to University of California (Proposition 209) (Quota)	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	Educational attainment: Admission in higher education; class bias	Estimation: Logistic regression	Positive (+)^R With Prop 209, educational equity and access continues to shift further away from a level that is adequately representative of all groups.	Positive (+)^R Class biases may have emerged (minority students with higher incomes and higher parent education had a greater likelihood to be part of the admit pool.	n.a.	n.a.
Crampton et al. (2012) (Journal: <i>New Zealand Medical Journal</i>)	New Zealand	Education: Priority in university admission at the University of Otago	Indigeneity: Māori and Pacific students (who meet the admissions criteria)	Educational attainment: Enrolment in higher education	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) While there are still too few Māori and Pacific applicants above the academic threshold to match the demographic make-up of society, progress is nevertheless being made.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Curtis et al. (2017) (Journal: <i>BMJ open</i>)	New Zealand	Education: Māori and Pacific Admission Scheme (MAPAS) at the University of Auckland (Quota)	Indigeneity: Indigenous Māori or Pacific students and rural background students	Educational attainment: Short- and long-term academic outcomes	Estimation: Multiple regression analyses	Negative (-) The graduation rate for MAPAS students was significantly below the general average. The findings raise concerns about the ability of the secondary education sector to prepare Māori and Pacific students adequately for tertiary health professional study.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Daly et al. (2013) (Journal: <i>Australian Journal of Labour Economics</i>)	Australia	Employment / Business: Indigenous Employment Program (IEP) developed by the National Australia Bank (NAB)	Indigeneity: Indigenous Australians	Other: Experience at work, living with parents vs. independently, future goals	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) All the trainees interviewed said they would recommend the scheme to friends and family. The opportunity had been life changing for some who stayed at school when they may have otherwise left.	Positive (+) By and large, the trainees agreed that their experience at NAB had helped them think about their future and what they needed to do to get to where they wanted to go.	n.a.	Positive (+) Having an Indigenous person in the workplace made employees and customers think more carefully about Indigenous stereotypes, and

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
									helped break down negative views.
Das et al. (2017) (Working paper)	India	Electoral representation: 73rd Constitutional amendment (Quota)	Caste: ST, SC, OBC (study focuses on OBC)	Other: Delivery of public goods	Estimation: OLS	n.a.	Positive (+) When group sizes are asymmetric, AA may increase electoral competition and consequently, improve provision of public goods. Specifically, electoral quotas for OBCs increased provision of public goods in villages with high OBC shares.	n.a.	Insignificant The increased provision of public goods did not disproportionately benefit OBCs.
De Vries and Pettigrew (1994) (Journal: <i>Basic and Applied Social Psychology</i>)	Netherlands	Employment / Business: Program for minority employment among urban police	Race/colour: Minority groups (migrants)	Other: Performance and well-being	Descriptive: Quantitative and qualitative analysis of structured individual interviews	Insignificant With experience controlled, there were few perceived performance differences between the majority and minority officers save for writing skills.	Insignificant With experience controlled, there no significant differences in job satisfaction and well-being, with the exception that minority officers ranked the work atmosphere of the police force lower than did majority officers.	n.a.	Positive (+) Many majority respondents understood with appreciation the enhanced effectiveness of a multi-ethnic workforce in administering the law in an increasingly multi-ethnic society.
DeHart and Mamet (2020) (Working paper)	United States	Electoral representation: Reserved seats legislators (RS) in Maine (Quota)	Indigeneity: Native American	Political participation: Tribes' substantive representation	Estimation: OLS and DID	Positive (+) Per session, RS legislators introduced five more bills to advance their own constituents' interests than non-RS legislators.	Mixed (+/-) Non-RS legislators in districts with tribal constituents reduced their contribution to indigenous representation. However, non-RS legislators in districts without tribes increased their contributions to Native American	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
							representation after the 1995 rule change, especially Democrats.		
Demarest et al. (2020) (Journal: <i>Oxford Development Studies</i>)	Nigeria	Electoral representation: Federal Character Principle and Commission (FCC) (Quota)	Region: Geographical areas (to ensure equitable representation of different groups in all tiers of government)	Political participation: Public service employment and political appointment	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Insignificant: Imbalances in public service employment have largely remained the same since the inception of the FCC, and hence have not been mitigated.	Positive (+) There is an equitable distribution of ministerial positions across the zones. The FCC has avoided the capture of government institutions by a single group and may have important symbolic value in strengthening power-sharing norms.	n.a.	n.a.
Deshpande and Ramachandran (2019) (Journal: <i>World Development</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Extension of quotas in government employment to OBCs in 1993 (Quota)	Caste: OBC	Employment: Occupation shares and secondary school completion rates	Estimation: DID	Positive (+) AA had the directed intended effect of increasing the share of OBCs with public sector jobs.	Positive (+) AA also had an indirect incentive effect of increasing the probability of completing secondary schooling, a minimum qualification necessary to be able to access government positions.	n.a.	n.a.
Deshpande and Weisskopf (2014) (Journal: <i>World Development</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Reservation policies in the public sector (Indian Railways) (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST	Work / Business Performance: Productivity	Estimation: Fixed effects (FE) and Lev-Pet regression	n.a.	Insignificant Higher proportions of SC/ST employment have not hurt—and may even have helped—total factor productivity.	n.a.	n.a.
de Souza Miranda et al. (2020) (Journal: <i>Revista Pensamento Contemporânea</i>)	Brazil	Education: USP's Social Inclusion Program (INCLUSP)	Race/colour: Black, indigenous and low-income candidates from public schools	Educational attainment: Academic performance	Descriptive: Comparison of means	n.a.	Insignificant The analysis of the grades of students and due approvals of the first year of the course, point out that in most courses there is no differentiation between	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
<i>neo em Administra- ção</i>)							students with and without bonus.		
Detterman (2000) (Journal: <i>Psychology, Public Policy, and Law</i>)	United States	Education: AA policies in education	Race/colour: African American	Educational attainment: College completion and income	Descriptive: Comparison of means	n.a.	Negative (-) Median salaries of white college graduates between 25 and 34 years declined by 14%, while those of Black college graduates in the same age range declined by 24%. If AA is working, it is working in the wrong direction.	n.a.	n.a.
Ding et al. 2017 (Journal: <i>International journal of Anthropology and Ethnology</i>)	China	Education: Additional points in College Entrance Examination	Other: Ethnic minority groups	Earnings: Labor market returns	Estimation: OLS and Heckit IV	n.a.	Positive (+) For ethnic minorities, the annual return of having a baccalaureate degree increases for graduating from a college/university ranked very good and good respectively.	n.a.	n.a.
Dobbin and Kalev (2015) (Book / book chapter)	United States	Employment / Business: Diversity managers, diversity taskforces and AA plans	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	Other: Managerial diversity	Estimation: Fixed effects	Positive (+) Diversity managers and task forces have strong positive effects on managerial diversity in firms. AA plans have weaker effects.	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) Diversity taskforces show a significant negative effect on white men in management.
Dometrius and Sigelman (1984) (Journal: <i>Public Administration Review</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Equal Employment Opportunity Act	Race/colour: Minorities (black, Hispanics, etc.); women	Employment / Earnings: Representation and salary inequalities	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) State and local governments are doing a better job than the private sector both in increasing the share of positions blacks hold and in providing them with salaries closer to those of white males.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Dong (2016) (Journal: <i>The South Asianist</i>)	Nepal	Employment / Business: Civil Service Act (Quota)	Caste: Janajatis, Madhesis, Dalits; women	Employment: Employment participation in civil service	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) The reservation policy contributed to recruit various disadvantaged groups through which Nepal is creating more inclusive in the state's apparatus and the state's policy is distributing benefit sharing among the Nepali citizens.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
DuBois (2015) (Journal: <i>American Law and Economics Review</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: National Football League's (NFL) "Rooney Rule"	Race/colour: Racial minority groups	Employment: Hiring as Head Coach	Estimation: DID with OLS	Positive: A minority candidate is a statistically significant 19–21% more likely, depending on the comparison group, to fill an NFL head coaching vacancy in the post-Rooney era than the pre-Rooney era.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Dulleck et al. (2017) (Journal: <i>Economics Letters</i>)	Comparative: Australia and China	Education: Experimental study design exploring the effect of AA in presence/ absence of stereotypes	Other: Australian students (relatively weak in mathematical skills) vis a vis Chinese)	Educational attainment: Alternative measures of effort	Estimation: OLS	Insignificant The results suggest that AA which favours a group suffering from a real negative stereotype does not influence effort. However, AA discourages effort in the absence of a negative stereotype.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Dunning and Nilekani (2013) (Journal: <i>The American Political Science Review</i>)	India	Electoral representation: 73rd amendment (Quota)	Caste: ST, SC, OBC	Other: Economic Benefits (Participation in welfare programs; receipt of benefits or jobs from the village council)	Estimation: RDD	n.a.	Insignificant: The paper finds at most weak effects of quotas on the targeting of material benefits. The authors suggest that party ties across levels of government induce partisan targeting by politicians and thereby mitigate the distributive effects of ethnic quotas.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Ehrhardt (2017) (Journal: <i>African Affairs</i>)	Nigeria	Employment / Business: Federal Character (Quota)	Indigeneity: Nigerians defined as 'indigenes'	Other: Self-identification as indigenous	Descriptive: Comparison of means	n.a.	Negative (-) Bureaucrats in Kano prioritize Kano's 'natives' over other Nigerian citizens in allocating indigeneship certificates. Full bureaucratic discretion allowed not only for implicit bias, but also for the explicit formalization of informal norms and ethnicization of belonging.	n.a.	n.a.
Epple et al. (2008) (Journal: <i>Journal of Public Economic Theory</i>)	United States	Education: Ban on race-based AA and the resulting adoption of race-blind admission policies in higher education	Race/colour: African American and Hispanic students	Educational attainment: College attendance; SAT scores	Estimation: Computational Model	Positive (+) ^R Minorities are significantly hurt by the ban on AA. Minority presence in the top-tier of colleges declines by 35%.	Mixed (+/-) The ban on AA results in an increase in average SAT scores of non-whites in lower ranked colleges and a decline in higher-ranked colleges. This is a consequence of the reduced access of non-white students to higher-ranked colleges.	n.a.	Negative (-) ^R Non-minorities gain from the ban on AA, but those gains are modest. For whites, a ban on AA improves college access particularly for those with relatively lower incomes and scores.
Epps (1998) (Journal: <i>Ohio State Law Journal</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Colleges and universities (because they accept federal contracts and grants) are required to demonstrate AA efforts	Race/colour: African Americans, Hispanics, and Native Americans	Employment: Minority representation in faculty positions	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Insignificant: After three decades of AA, a substantial gap remains between the proportion of minority students participating in higher education and the proportion of full-time minority faculty.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Estevan et al. (2019)	Brazil	Education: UNICAMP's AA	Race/colour:	Educational attainment:	Estimation: DiD	Positive (+)	Insignificant	Negative (-)	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
(Journal: <i>The Economic Journal</i>)		policy (bonus points on admission examination score)	Applicants from public schools, where extra points are granted to black, mulatto or native applicants	University admission		The policy significantly increased the admission probability of public high school applicants and redistributed university admission towards applicants from families with lower socio-economic status.	Little evidence of behavioural reactions regarding examination preparation effort.	The main losers from the policy were visible minority applicants from private schools, as they experienced a decrease in admission probabilities.	
Fernandez et al. (2017) (Journal: Governance)	South Africa	Employment / Business: White Papers on the Transformation of the Public Service and on AA in the Public Service	Race/colour: African, Coloured, Indian; women; disabled people	Work / Business performance: Performance	Estimation: Random effects model	n.a.	Positive (+) By increasing African, Coloured, and Indian representation and fostering representative bureaucracy, the performance of national departments and Chapter 9 institutions has been improved.	n.a.	n.a.
Francis and Tannuri-Pianto (2012) (Journal: Economics of Education Review)	Brazil	Education: Race-targeted admission policy at University of Brasilia (UnB) (Quota)	Race/colour: Applicants who self-identify as Black	Educational attainment: Equity in Admission	Estimation: First-difference estimator	Positive (+) Race-based quotas help promote equity to some extent, but the scale and scope of redistribution are highly limited (persistence of tremendous disparities despite racial quota).	n.a.	n.a. (If more importance is placed on raising socio-economic diversity than raising racial diversity, then quotas for low income students may be preferred.)	n.a.
Francis and Tannuri-Pianto (2015) (Journal: The Journal of Human Resources)	Brazil	Education: Race-targeted admission policy at University of Brasilia (UnB) (Quota)	Race/colour: Black	Educational attainment: College academic performance, preuniversity effort and black identity	Estimation: DiD	Positive (+) Racial quotas raised the proportion of black and dark-skinned students at UnB, and those displacing applicants were, by many measures, from families with significantly lower socioeconomic status than displaced applicants.	Insignificant Racial quotas did not reduce the pre-university effort of applicants or students and had no effect on racial gaps in GPA.	n.a. (Racial quotas induced some individuals to misrepresent their racial identity.)	n.a. (Displacement effect on students with higher socio-economic status)

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Francis-Tan and Tannuri-Pianto (2015) (Journal: <i>Ethnic and Racial Studies</i>)	Brazil	Education: Race-targeted admission policy at University of Brasilia (UnB) (Quota)	Race/colour: Black and brown students	Other: Racial identification	Estimation: DiD	Positive (+) The evidence demonstrates that the implementation of racial quotas at UnB had inspired a shift in racial identification from non-black to black and from lighter to darker racial categories.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Francis-Tan and Tannuri-Pianto (2018) (Journal: <i>Journal of Development Economics</i>)	Brazil	Education: Race-targeted admission policy at University of Brasilia (UnB)	Race/colour: Black	Earnings: Years of education and college degree; formal employment and earnings.	Estimation: RDD	Positive (+) Relative to quota applicants not attending, quota applicants attending UnB have significantly more years of education and are more likely to complete college.	Mixed (+/ Insignificant) Attendance significantly raises the earnings of both male quota applicants and male non-quota applicants. Attendance does not raise the earnings of female applicants.	n.a.	n.a.
Frisancho and Krishna (2016) (Journal: <i>Higher Education</i>)	India	Education: Reservation policies in higher education (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST	Educational attainment: Targeting, catch-up, and mismatch	Estimation: PSM	Positive (+) Admission preferences effectively target minority students who are poorer than average displaced non-minority students.	Negative (-) Minority students, especially those in more selective majors, fall behind their same-major peers in terms of grades as they progress through college.	n.a.	n.a.
Gandara (2012) (Report)	United States	Education: SP1 (eliminated AA within the University of California) and Prop 209 (state-wide elimination)	Race/colour: African American and Latino	Education: Admission in Higher Education	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+)^R Between 1995 and 1998, there was a 22% decline in enrolments of African American students and of 15% for Chicano/Latinos.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Garaz (2014) (Journal: <i>European Educational Research Journal</i>)	Comparative: 15 countries of Central, Eastern, and South-Eastern Europe, as well as from Turkey.	Education: REF's scholarship programme	Other: Ethnic Roma	Educational attainment: Socio-economic characteristics of enrolled students	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) Although Roma students come from better-off environments than the mainstream Roma communities, at the same time they come from more disadvantaged socio-	Positive (+) Even when not targeting the most marginalised members of Roma communities, AA has a great potential in forming a critical mass of Romani intellectuals	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						economic backgrounds compared to the mainstream students, and even to the mainstream population.	to become outspoken public advocates for their group's cause, to contradict negative stereotypes, and to constitute a valuable social capital for their less fortunate peers.		
Garces (2012a) (Journal: <i>The Journal of Higher Education</i>)	United States	Education: Grutter v. Bollinger (landmark Supreme Court case concerning AA in student admissions)	Race/colour: African Americans, Latinos, and Native Americans	Educational attainment: Enrolment in higher education	Estimation: DID	Positive (+) Allowing the consideration of race in higher education admissions in Texas after Grutter helped increase the enrolment rates of students of colour in public graduate and professional schools in the state in 2006, on average, by about 3.4%.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Garces (2012b) (Journal: <i>The Review of Higher Education</i>)	United States	Education: Bans of AA	Race/colour: African Americans, Latinos, and Native Americans	Educational attainment: Enrolment in higher education	Estimation: DID	Positive (+)^R AA bans have reduced the enrolment of students of colour by about 12.2% across graduate programs.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Garces (2013) (Journal: <i>American Educational Research Journal</i>)	United States	Education: Bans of AA	Race/colour: African Americans, Latinos, and Native Americans	Educational attainment: Enrolment in higher education	Estimation: DID	Positive (+)^R After the implementation of AA bans, the greatest declines in the proportion of enrolled graduate students who are students of colour took place in the fields of engineering (26%), natural sciences (19%), and the social sciences (15.2%)—fields where students of colour are already the most underrepresented—with a slightly lower decline in the humanities (11.8%).	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non- target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non- marginalised group(s)
Gill (2002) (Journal: <i>Social Change</i>)	India	Education / Employment / Business: Article 16(4) and 335 (Quota)	Race/colour: SC, OBC	Other: Social and economic mobility	Descriptive: Comparison of means	n.a.	Positive (+) The reservation policy has provided avenues of social and economic mobility through educational and occupational opportunities to the lower under-privileged castes.	n.a.	n.a.
Gille (2013) (Mimeo)	India	Education: Reservation Policies (Quota)	Caste: OBC	Other: Application for reserved places	Estimation: OLS	n.a.	Negative (-) Stigma plays a significant role in preventing households from locally high ranked groups to apply for reservation.	n.a.	n.a.
Gille (2018) (Journal: <i>Journal of Comparative Economics</i>)	India	Electoral representation: Reservation Policies (the position of village council president, called pradhan, has to be reserved for low castes by rotation across villages) (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST, OBC	Employment: Impact of having someone from the same caste group as Pradhan on application for reserved jobs	Estimation: OLS	Positive (+) Sharing the caste group of the local elected leader (pradhan) increases households' application for reserved jobs in the public sector. The impact is driven by the pradhan helping the application of members from his caste group to be processed.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Girard (2018) (Journal: <i>World Development</i>)	India	Electoral representation: Seat reservations in local political assemblies (the gram panchayats) (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST, OBC, and Other Castes (OC).	Other: Access to public infrastructure	Estimation: OLS	Positive (+) Large and significant effect of electoral quotas on low-caste members' access to streets.	Insignificant Unfortunately, the effect is not permanent it vanishes once the quota comes to an end.	n.a.	n.a.
Gilmer (2007) (Journal:	United States	Education: Academic Investment in Math and	Race/colour: Female and under- represented minority (Blacks and Hispanics)	Educational attainment: Success in math, GPA, semester credit hours	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) The BGSU AIMS program has demonstrated success in the intended areas of improved GPA's	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
<i>Journal of STEM Education</i>		Science (BGSU AIMS)		(SCH), retention and graduation rate		versus control groups, good retention, improved progress toward graduation (measured by SCH's) and graduation rates.			
Gomez and Premdas (2012) (Book / book chapter)	Malaysia	Education / Employment / Business: New Economic Policy (NEP) (Quota)	Indigeneity: Bumiputera	Other: Tertiary education, Employment, Equity ownership, Poverty	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) AA facilitated Bumiputera access to education, specially at the tertiary level, which robustly increased their representation in managerial, professional, and technical occupations during the 1970 and 1980s.	Positive (+) Among the beneficiaries of the NEP there has been a substantial reduction in poverty (absolute poverty among the Bumiputera reduced from 65% in 1970 to 3.6% in 2007). Income disparities between the Bumiputera and non-Bumiputera narrowed significantly during the two NEP decades.	Negative (-) While Bumiputera gains in access to tertiary education are evident in the workforce, India and specially non-Malay Bumiputera attainment levels are substantially lower.	n.a.
Griffin (1990) (Journal: <i>The Review of Economics and Statistics</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Executive Order 11246	Race/colour: No discrimination on the basis of race, colour, religion, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity or national origin	Work / Business performance: Firms' behavior and costs	Estimation: Translog cost function	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) The cost of complying with AA averaged 6.5% of costs for constrained firms in 1980.
Grove and Hussey (2011) (Mimeo)	United States	Education: Racial preferences in college and university admission	Race/colour: African American and Hispanic	Earnings: Grade point average, areas of concentration, degree completion, wages, promotion prospects, general work quality	Estimation: Fixed effect regression	Positive (+) Being black positively but weakly (10%-level) increases the likelihood of admission, such that blacks enjoy a 5% advantage over whites.	Insignificant Little evidence of negative mismatch effects due to admission preferences (blacks and Hispanics enjoy similar or even higher returns to selectivity than whites).	Negative (-) Asians are disadvantaged in admission relative to whites (being Asian decreases one's likelihood of acceptance by 6.3%).	n.a.
Guan (2005) (Journal: <i>Southeast Asian Affairs</i>)	Malaysia	Education / Employment / Business: Article 153 of Constitution (Quota)	Indigeneity: Malays	Earnings: Monthly incomes and Enrolment in tertiary education	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) Ethnic preferential policies have greatly enhanced Malay participation in higher education.	Positive (+) Malay horizontal and vertical participation in the economy has expanded substantially, especially in the modern sector. The economic	Negative (-) The public sector has become essentially a Malay enclave where very few non-Malays are employed.	

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
							disparities between the Malay and non-Malay communities have narrowed significantly.		
Gulzar et al. (2020) (Journal: <i>American Political Science Review</i>)	India	Employment / Business: National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme (NREGS)	Caste: ST	Employment: Workdays	Estimation: RDD	Positive (+) NREGS delivery improves substantially for the targeted minorities (ST), who receive 24.2% more workdays in Scheduled Areas.	n.a.	Insignificant No evidence that the quota causes a change in employment for the non-targeted, historically disadvantaged minorities (SC).	Negative (-) Improvement appears to come primarily at the cost of work for non-minorities (non-SC/ST), who receive 11.5% fewer workdays.
Harper and Griffin (2010) (Journal: <i>Harvard Journal of African American Public Policy</i>)	United States	Education: Preferential treatment or awarded points in college admissions	Race/colour: African Americans (study focuses on black male achievers from lower-income or working-class backgrounds who attended expensive predominantly White private post-secondary institutions.)	Other: College access	Descriptive: Qualitative inquiry (data collected from 219 students)	Insignificant Participants attributed their college access not to AA but to Initiatives targeted specifically to lower-income students, including Whites. (These initiatives influenced access at all levels, from readiness to college choice to financing high tuition costs to persistence from freshman through senior year.)	Negative (-) While no participant was knowingly given preferential treatment or awarded points for his race in the college admissions process, the vast majority reported having been accused by White peers of being unfairly admitted via AA policies and practices.	n.a.	n.a.
Heckman (1989) (Working paper)	United States	Employment / Business: 1964 Civil Rights Bill	Race/colour: African American and other minorities	Earnings: Earnings gap (between blacks and whites)	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	Mixed (+/-) The evidence on AA programs is mixed. While relative status of blacks increased over the period 1965-1981, absolute differentials in real earnings between blacks and whites widened over this period.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Heilig et al. (2019)	United States	Employment / Business:	Race/colour: African American and other minorities	Employment: Ethnoracial and gender diversity	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	Insignificant While some progress has been made toward gender	n.a.	Positive (+) The study shown that U.S. colleges	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
(Journal: Hispanic Journal of Law and Policy)		Civil Rights Act of 1964	(Women, American Indian/Alaskan Native, Asian, Hispanic/Latino, Native Hawaiian/Other Pacific Islander)			equity, one of the biggest challenges is that ethno-racial diversity among tenured faculty continues to lag across institutional types.		and universities have not realized much progress toward ethnoracial and gender faculty diversity in recent years-the exception being a modest increase (between 1-2%) in tenured Asians across institutional types.	
Heller (2002) (Mimeo)	United States	Education: Proposition 209 and Initiative 200 (I-200)	Race/colour: African American, Hispanic, Native American, Hawaiian Pacific Islanders	Educational attainment: Enrolment in higher education	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	Positive (+)^R Both African American and Hispanic enrollment representation decreased by nearly 60% in the first year I-200 was in place. Native American enrolment also dropped 26%. The enrollment numbers for Hawaiian Pacific Islanders dropped from a low number of 38 students to an even lower 11 students in the entire freshman class, a percent decrease of nearly 270%.	Positive (+)^R Administrators working with minority students reported an increase in feelings of alienation and isolation among these students following the passage of I-200.	n.a.	n.a.
Herskovic and Ramos (2014) (Mimeo)	Brazil	Education: Quotas and extra points policies in Federal University admissions (Quota)	Race/colour: Black and brown students from public schools	Other: Welfare, inequality, GDP, investment, intergenerational income correlation	Descriptive: Structural model	Positive (+) Both quotas and extra points policies can reduce the intergenerational correlation of earnings, but the final effect on inequality, welfare and GDP depends on the magnitude of the policy. (A small quota for students in the bottom quintile of the income	Positive (+) AA policies can have meaningful welfare implications and can be used as a welfare improving mechanism.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						distribution can increase GDP up to 1.13%).			
Hicklin (2007) (Journal: Public Administration Review)	United States	Education: Hopwood judicial decision and California's Proposition 209	Race/colour: African Americans, Latinos, and Native Americans	Educational attainment: Enrolment in higher education	Estimation: Value-Added Analysis	Mixed (+/-) ^R For the most selective, highly selective, more selective universities, minority enrolments decreased significantly. For the universities considered non-selective, less selective, or simply selective, Hopwood and Prop 209 led to an increase in minority enrolments.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Higham and Shah (2013a) (Journal: <i>Focaal—Journal of Global and Historical Anthropology</i>)	India	Education: Quota system (Quota)	Caste: ST	Educational attainment: Secondary school outcomes	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	n.a.	Positive (+) Adivasi access to and attainment in secondary school increased over time, as the secondary sector expanded in Ranchi district and Jharkhand more generally.	n.a.	n.a.
Higham and Shah (2013b) (Journal: <i>Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Caste-based reservations (Quota)	Caste: ST	Employment: Public employment and educational outcomes	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	Positive (+) By 2009, while older adivasis continued to pursue only farming and manual wage labour, a small but significant minority of the 21–30-year-old age cohort had, for the first time, secured state-sector jobs (that historically local elites would have dominated).	Positive (+) In 2009 the vast majority of adivasis over the age of 30 remained illiterate. A small proportion had completed primary or middle school but no-one had achieved a Matriculation (Matric) pass. By contrast, among 21–30-year-olds, 16 out of 65, or 25%, had passed Matric.	n.a.	n.a.
Hinks (2009)	South Africa	Employment / Business:	Race/colour:	Other: Job satisfaction	Estimation:	Mixed (+/-)	n.a.	n.a.	Insignificant

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
		Employment equity plan (EEP)	Black, Asian and Coloured workers; women; disabled people		Ordered probit regression and OLS	AA in the workplace enhances black worker job satisfaction but significantly diminishes job satisfaction of coloured workers.			White workers employed by an EEP employer are also less satisfied but not significantly so.
Hinrichs (2012) (Journal: <i>The Review of Economics and Statistics</i>)	United States	Education: AA bans	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Native Americans	Educational attainment: College enrolment, educational attainment, and the demographic composition of various types of colleges	Estimation: DID	Positive (+) ^R Affirmative action bans decrease underrepresented minority enrolment at selective colleges.	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) ^R Bans increase white enrolment at selective colleges.
Hinrichs (2014) (Journal: <i>Economics of Education Review</i>)	United States	Education: AA bans	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Native Americans	Educational attainment: Graduation rates and degree attainment	Estimation: Regression analysis	Positive (+) ^R AA bans lead to fewer underrepresented minorities becoming graduates of selective colleges.	Negative (-) ^R Although the graduation rates for underrepresented minority groups at selective institutions rise when AA is banned, this may be due to the changing composition of students at these universities. Moreover, this effect is small relative to the number displaced from selective universities due to AA bans.	n.a.	n.a.
Holzer and Neumark (1999) (Journal: <i>Journal of Labor Economics</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: AA plans	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Native Americans; women	Work / Business performance: Qualification and job performance	Estimation: DID	Insignificant The probability that a minority or female was hired is estimated to be significantly higher when AA is used in hiring.	Insignificant The results show that ratings of white female or black employees in establishments using AA are generally at least as high as those of other comparable workers. (These results are reversed only for Hispanic men, who receive significantly	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
							lower performance ratings.)		
Holzer (1996) (Working Paper)	United States	Employment / Business: Civil Rights Act of 1964 and Executive Orders	Race/colour: Minorities (Blacks, Hispanics, Native Americans); women	Employment: Employment	Estimation: Logit	Positive (+) AA raises the employment of most minority groups and females relative to white males.	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) The presence of AA reduces the employment shares of white males by roughly 3.5 ppts, or 10%.
Horwitz and Jain (2011) (Journal: <i>Equality, Diversity and Inclusion: An International Journal</i>)	South Africa	Employment / Business: Broad Based Black Economic Empowerment Act (BBBEE)	Race/colour: Africans, Coloureds, Indians, Chinese; women; people with disabilities	Work / Business performance: Business ownership	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) There has been a notable increase in black equity ownership and control of South African companies.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
House-Soremekun (2007) (Journal: <i>Western New England Law Review</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Ohio House Bill 584	Race/colour: African Americans	Work / Business performance: Black business success (number of years the businesses had been in operation and total profits per year)	Estimation: OLS and Logistical Regressions	Positive (+) AA programs, and by extension minority set-aside programs, appear to have a positive and empirical impact on the success of Black business owners.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Howard and Prakash (2012) (Journal: <i>International Review of Applied Economics</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Employment quotas in public sector jobs (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST	Employment: Occupational structure	Estimation: Multinomial logit models	n.a.	Mixed (+/-) Unequal effects on the overall occupational structure of each minority population: The SCs are more likely to choose high-skill occupations and less likely to choose low- and middle-skill occupations, while STs display the opposite	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
							pattern. This suggests that there is competition between the two populations for high-skill employment, and that STs are possibly subject to greater labor market discrimination for these occupations.		
Htun (2016) (Book / book chapter)	Comparative: 16 countries in Latin America	Electoral representation: Reserved seats (Quota)	Other (Race/colour + Indigeneity): Afro descendants, indigenous peoples; women	Political participation: Seats in Parliament	Descriptive: Number of Seats	Mixed (+/-) Though gender quota laws have increased the political inclusion of women, reserved seats for Afro descendants and indigenous peoples have had a more mixed effect.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Hughes (2011) (Journal: <i>The American Political Science Review</i>)	Comparative: Global (81 countries)	Electoral representation: Minority and gender quotas (Quota)	Other: Minority women	Political participation: Legislative Diversity	Estimation: Hierarchical linear modeling (HLM)	Mixed (+/-) Some quota systems are associated with enhanced minority women's legislative representation, whereas other quota systems leave minority women behind.	n.a.	Positive (+) Minority quotas do benefit minority men.	n.a.
Hughes (2014) (Working Paper)	Jordan	Electoral representation: Nested quota for Bedouin women (Quota)	Indigeneity: Bedouin Women	Political participation: Seats in national legislature	Descriptive: Number of Seats	Positive (+) The nested quota had specific effects on the political behaviour of Bedouin women. Indeed, in the 2013 elections, the Bedouin areas had the highest number of women as a percentage of all candidates.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Hutchins and Sigelman (1981)	United States	Employment / Business:	Race/colour: Blacks	Employment: Public employment	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) In most states, black government employment is at least proportional to	Insignificant But in every state except one, black	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non- target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non- marginalised group(s)
(Journal: <i>Social Science Quarterly</i>)		Equal Employment Opportunity Act				the black share of the population, but in every state except one, black salaries lag behind those of whites.	salaries lag behind those of whites.		
Iyer et al. (2021) (Journal: <i>Comparative education review</i>)	Vietnam	Education: Ethnic minority boarding school policy	Other: Ethnic minority students	Educational attainment: Academic performance	Estimation: Value-Added Analysis	Positive (+) Students in less effective schools make less progress, and these students are typically from ethnic minority backgrounds, indicating a “double disadvantage.” However, students in schools with AA for ethnic minorities achieved a higher performance.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Jain and Lawler (2004) (Journal: <i>Relations industrielles/ Industrial relations</i>)	Canada	Employment / Business: Employment Equity Act (EEA)	Other (Race/colour + Indigeneity): Aboriginal peoples, visible minorities (VM); women; disabled people	Employment: Minority employment equity	Estimation: OLS	Mixed (+/-) While the data indicate a general improvement in EE attainment over time, there is substantial variation by firm size, industry, occupation, and province.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Jain et al. (2000) (Journal: <i>Canadian Public Adminis- tration</i>)	Canada	Employment / Business: Employment Equity Act (EEA) and Federal Contract Compliance Program	Other (Race/colour + Indigeneity): Aboriginal peoples, visible minorities (VM); women; disabled people	Employment: Representation of VM and aboriginal officers	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) There has been some progress in the representation of VM and aboriginal people. (However, there is still room for considerable improvement in the policies, practices and culture of police services if they are to become more representative of the diversity of the communities they serve.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Jencks (1985)	United States	Employment / Business:	Race/colour: Blacks	Earnings: Earnings	Descriptive:	n.a.	Positive (+)	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
(Journal: <i>American Behavioral Scientist</i>)		Executive Order 11246			Comparison of means		Looking first at 25- to 34-year-olds, who are most likely to be affected by changing employment opportunities, we see that black male high school and college graduates both gained relative to their white counterparts during the 1960s. Black male college graduates gained even more during the 1970s, but black male high school graduates did not gain at all.		
Jesenius 2015 (Journal: <i>American Economic Journal: Applied Economics</i>)	India	Electoral representation: Reserved seats in Parliament (Quota)	Caste: SC	Other: Literacy rate, Employment Rate, Agricultural Laborers, Electricity in village, School in village, Medical Facility, Communication Channel in village	Estimation: Matching Estimates	Insignificant The study finds that 30 years of quotas had no detectable constituency-level effect on overall development or redistribution to SCs, neither on the literacy rates or employment patterns of SCs or non-SCs, nor on village amenities in reserved constituencies.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Joshua et al. (2014) (Journal: <i>International journal of interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary studies</i>)	Nigeria	Education: Quota system in education (Quota)	Region: State of residence and catchment zone	Educational attainment: Cut-off marks by entrance examinations	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) The quota increases the representation at the national level (but, according to the authors, the side-effects are more important).	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) Candidates from south-west need to score substantially higher to be admitted.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Kaletski and Prakash (2016) (Journal: <i>World Development</i>)	India	Electoral representation: Political reservation for minorities (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST	Other: Child labour	Estimation: OLS	Mixed (+/-) At the household level, ST reservation decreases the incidence of child labour, while SC reservation increases the total number of children working.	n.a.	Positive (+) Spillover effects do exist, but in this case, only impact OBC households.	Insignificant There is no effect of SC/ST reservation on child labour in non-disadvantaged households.
Kalev et al. (2006) (Journal: <i>American Sociological Review</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Range of AA and diversity measures	Race/colour: African Americans; women	Employment: Representation	Estimation: Cross-sectional time-series models	Mixed (+/-) AA structures establishing responsibility (AA plans, diversity committees, and diversity staff positions) are followed by significant increases in managerial diversity. Programs that target managerial stereotyping through education and feedback (diversity training and diversity evaluations) are not followed by increases in diversity. Programs that address social isolation among women and minorities (networking and mentoring programs) are followed by modest changes.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Kataka (2014) (Journal: <i>Education Journal</i>)	Kenya	Education: Quota system in education (Quota)	Region: Home district (County)	Other: National cohesion	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Negative (-) Learners are deprived of a chance to socialize broadly and to develop a spirit of national consciousness by not schooling outside home District.	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) Qualified students in highly populated areas may end up missing out on chances of furthering education due to quotas.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Khanna (2020) (Journal: <i>Review of Economics and Statistics</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Caste-based reservations at the central level	Caste: OBC	Educational attainment: Years of Education	Estimation: RDD and DID	n.a.	Positive (+) The estimators consistently show that affirmative action incentivizes about 0.8 additional years of education for the average minority group student and 1.2 more years of education for a student from a marginal minority subgroup.	Insignificant These effects are absent among ineligible minorities, ineligible candidates within the eligible minority groups, and low-income students from ineligible upper castes.	n.a.
Kroeber (2017) (Journal: <i>Ethnopolitics</i>)	Comparative: Venezuela, Taiwan, New Zealand	Electoral representation: Reserved seat for minorities (Quota)	Indigeneity: Indigenous People	Other: Substantive representation and acceptance	Estimation: Regression analysis	n.a.	Positive (+) Evidence from the three case studies supports the fruitfulness of electoral rules for reserved seats as a factor explaining the quality of minority representation.	n.a.	n.a.
Kumar et al. (2019) (Journal: <i>Journal of Asian and African Studies</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Reservation in government jobs (Quota)	Caste: ST, SC, OBC	Employment: Representation	Estimation: Logit model	Positive (+) The policy has helped in increasing the chances of representation of people from target groups.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Leal and Choi Mendizábal (2021) (Working paper)	Brazil	Education: Law of Quotas (Quota)	Race/colour: Non-white students (black, brown, and indigenous) from public high schools	Educational attainment: Students' pre-college academic performance	Estimation: DiD	n.a.	Positive (+) The law fostered incentives to pre-college human capital accumulation as it induced eligible students to attain higher scores on the ENEM exam. This closed the performance gap by the end of secondary education.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Lee (2012) (Journal: <i>Journal of Contemporary Asia</i>)	Malaysia	Employment / Business: New Economic Policy (NEP) (Quota)	Indigeneity: Bumiputera	Employment: Representation in tertiary institutions and upper-level occupations (managerial and professional positions).	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Mixed (+/-) The successes of AA have dwindled in recent decades. Benefits have been inequitably distributed within the beneficiary group, and some groups remain systemically excluded.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Lee (2015) (Journal: <i>Journal of Asian and African studies</i>)	Comparative: Malaysia and South Africa	Other (Education / Employment / Business): AA policies in education and employment	Other (Indigeneity + Race/colour): Bumiputeras (Malaysia) and blacks (South Africa)	Employment: Representation in tertiary institutions and upper-level occupations	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) Both countries have made quantitative gains in increasing representation of target groups in tertiary education and high-level occupations.	Negative (-) Continuing, primarily qualitative, shortfalls in terms of graduate capability, dependence on public sector employment, and persistent difficulty in cultivating private enterprises.	n.a.	n.a.
Lee (2020a) (Book / book chapter)	Malaysia	Education: New Economic Policy (NEP) (Quota)	Indigeneity: Bumiputera	Educational attainment: Enrolment in higher education, graduate quality and employability	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) Matriculation and foundation programmes have in recent decades crucially facilitated Bumiputera entry to higher education, but the quality and rigor of these pre-university fast tracks are questionable.	Positive (+) Bumiputeras steadily increased their presence in professional and technical positions in the 1970s and 1980s, but progress slowed down from the 1990s through the 2000s, captured in the flatter slope.	n.a.	n.a.
Lee (2020b) (Book / book chapter)	South Africa	Employment / Business: Labour Relations Act 1995	Race/colour: Black population	Employment: Education and employment	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) The student composition of higher education institutions changed, with blacks growing both in terms of gross numbers and as a proportion of total enrolment.	Positive (+) The share of Africans steadily increased as a proportion of managers and professionals, especially over the period 2010–2018, while Coloureds and Indians maintain their level of representation throughout almost two decades.	n.a.	Negative (-) In the 1995–2016 interval, the number of whites annually enrolled in university dropped by 29%.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
A. Lee (2021) (Journal: <i>Comparative Political Studies</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Reservations for OBCs	Caste: OBC	Educational attainment: Years of Education and Government Employment	Estimation: DiD and DDD	Positive (+) The implementation of OBC reservation is associated with an increase in government employment of between 5 and 7 ppts relative to the declining trend among non-OBCs (though this may be a result of other social and political trends).	Positive (+) Reservations increased the education level of OBCs, though these effects appear to have been modest in substantive size—an increase of approximately three quarters of a year of education in the immediate aftermath of the policy, growing slightly in subsequent years.	Insignificant Reservations did not decrease the achievement levels of other groups.	n.a.
L. M. Lee (2021) (Journal: <i>Michigan Law Review</i>)	United States	Education: Supreme Court's ruling in Grutter v. Bollinger	Race/colour: Minorities (Black and Latinx)	Educational attainment: Matriculation and degrees	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Insignificant: For Black students, matriculation and degrees awarded have remained stable on average but are considerably lower than the Black population nationally. For Latinx students, matriculation and degrees awarded have dramatically increased; the same is true, however, of the national Latinx population. As a result, the ratio of enrolment and degrees awarded to the respective populations has remained stagnant for both minority groups.		n.a.	n.a.
J. H. Lee (2021) (Journal: <i>Race Ethnicity and Education</i>)	Brazil	Education: Quota Law (Quota)	Race/colour: Black, Brown, and indigenous public secondary school students	Educational attainment: Enrolment and completion rate	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) Students identifying as <i>parda/o</i> have increased in enrolment rates steadily. However, the rates of enrolment for <i>parda/o</i> students are consistently less than half of that of <i>branca/o</i> students.	Positive (+) The completion rates of <i>parda/o</i> students have steadily risen at more than double the rate of their <i>branca/o</i> counterparts.	n.a.	n.a.
Leonard (1984) (Journal: <i>Journal of Labor Economics</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Executive Order no. 11246	Race/colour: Non-whites; females	Employment: Representation	Estimation: Multiple Regression Estimates	Positive (+) AA has led to improved employment opportunities for females and minorities.	Positive (+) The increase in the demand for black male labor relative to white induced by AA can help account for a significant part of the increase in the relative earnings of black males.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Lerner and Nagai (2000) (Journal: <i>Academic Questions</i>)	United States	Education: Racial preference in college admission	Race/colour: Hispanic, Black	Educational attainment: Enrolment in higher education	Estimation: DiD	Positive (+) The relative odds-ratio of black-to-white applicants, controlling for test scores, high school rank, legacy status, and residency is 111 to 1. That is, a black applicant has over a hundred-to-one chance of admission compared to an equally qualified white candidate. The Hispanic candidate, controlling for all other variables, has a 4.85 to 1 odds-ratio, which is statistically significant, but the odds ratio is not as favourable as being black.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Lin (2013) (Mimeo)	United States	Education: Elimination of AA in higher education admission	Race/colour: Hispanic, Black; women	Educational attainment: Enrolment in higher education and earnings	Descriptive: DiD	Insignificant: In contrast with the expectation, eliminating affirmative action does not reduce the enrolment of minority students.	Insignificant: Observing the wage level of minority students 12 years after California ended AA, the study finds a negative but insignificant effect on the wage of California minority students who were influenced by the policy change in 1995.	n.a.	n.a.
Loncar (2013) (Dissertation)	Serbia	Electoral representation: Law on the Election of Deputies	Other: National minorities	Other: Representation of interests	Descriptive: Comparative analysis	Mixed (+/-) Minority political parties are not a priori substantive representatives of national minorities. Descriptive representatives elected on minority electoral lists perform better as substantive representa-	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						tives than descriptive representatives elected on the electoral list of mainstream parties.			
Lublin and Wright (2013) (Journal: <i>Electoral Studies</i>)	Comparative: Global (80 countries)	Electoral representation: Reserved seats and lower thresholds	Other: Ethnic minorities	Political participation: Legislative seats	Estimation: Multivariate analysis and in-depth case studies	Positive (+) Both reserved seats and lower thresholds increase minority representation, though reserved seats accomplish that goal more consistently.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Mazibuko and Govender (2017) (Journal: <i>SA Journal of Human Resource Management</i>)	South Africa	Employment / Business: AA legislations in employment	Race/colour: Formerly disadvantaged groups	Work / Business performance: Organisational performance and effectiveness	Estimation: ANOVA tests	n.a.	Positive (+) Leadership diversity strongly influences organisational performance and/or effectiveness. Promoting diversity is significantly related with performance improvement in terms of knowledge to drive transformation.	n.a.	n.a.
McCrary (2007) (Journal: <i>American Economic Review</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Court-ordered AA in municipal police departments (Quota)	Race/colour: Black	Employment: Employment share and police performance	Estimation: Parametric Estimates	Positive (+) Substantial impact on work-force composition: 14-ppts gain in the fraction African American among newly hired officers.	Insignificant There is mixed evidence of differences in police performance between litigated and unlitigated departments, but the bulk of the evidence suggests little to no effect.		
McCrudden et al. (2004) (Journal: <i>Oxford Journal of Legal Studies</i>)	Ireland	Employment / Business: Fair Employment Commission (FEC)	Religion: Catholics and Protestants	Employment: Religio-political composition of workforces	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) Significant changes occurred in the employment growth and community balance of firms with agreements, with trends towards more balanced and integrated employment.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
McCrudden et al. (2009)	Ireland	Employment / Business:	Religion:	Employment:	Descriptive:	Positive (+)	Positive (+)	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
(Journal: <i>The Equal Rights Review</i>)		Equality Commission	Catholics and Protestants	Workforce composition	Comparison of means	Agreements were effective both in boosting employment and increasing shares in managerial/professional occupations; i.e., the gains were not restricted to workers in lowskill occupations.	There appeared to be "spill-over" effects on non-agreement firms such that there was a general move towards fair employment, with a clear decline in "extreme" firms at both ends of the spectrum.		
Mehmet and Hoong (1985) (Journal: <i>Higher Education</i>)	Malaysia	Education: Government scholarships	Race/color: Malays	Employment: Employment ratio of scholarship holders	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Negative (-) The Malaysian scholarship policy "fails badly" because it discriminates in favour of richer and more powerful households.	Negative (-) The bonded scholarship policy, which promotes credentialism, places universities into a subservient position of meeting the general staff requirements of the public sector while virtually ignoring the private sector's needs.	n.a.	n.a.
Merritt and Reskin (1997) (Journal: <i>Columbia Law Review</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: AAs in law faculty hiring	Race/colour: Minorities (African American, Latino or Latina, Native American; women)	Employment: Hire as professor	Estimation: OLS	Positive (+) White women and men of colour, but surprisingly not women of colour, began teaching at somewhat more prestigious schools than white men with comparable credentials. The advantage, however, was relatively modest.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Mickey-Pabello and Garces (2018) (Journal: <i>American Journal of Education</i>)	United States	Education: AA bans	Race/colour: African American, Native American, and Latino or Hispanic	Educational attainment: Applications and admissions in higher education	Estimation: DID	Positive (+) ^R The share of applications from underrepresented students of colour received by public medical schools dropped by a moderate 0.7 ppt after the bans, whereas the share of admitted students of colour dropped by 3.4 percentage points.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Mitchell-Walthour (2015) (Book / book chapter)	Brazil	Education: Quota Legislation (Quota)	Race/color: Afro-Brazilian and indigenous students from public high schools	Other: Support for AA in education	Descriptive: Comparison of means	n.a.	Positive (+) In the 2006 sample among Afro-Brazilians in Salvador and São Paulo, 70% of respondents supported AA for blacks and browns. In the 2008 survey, an overwhelming 95% of the sample agrees with AA policy.	n.a.	n.a.
Molnár (2017) (Journal: <i>Journal of Social Entrepreneurship</i>)	Hungary	Employment / Business: Kiut program (non-profit corporation providing microcredit mentoring and other social services)	Other: Undereducated, unemployed, and socially excluded Roma people	Work / Business performance: Business performance, family's financial situation, and life and financial satisfaction	Estimation: Comparison of means and t-test for equality of means	Mixed (+/ Insignificant) In the case of socially excluded groups, a loan in itself is not sufficient to support the establishment of viable formal businesses and in this way to promote the (re-) entry of the clients to the labour market. However, the provision of financial and social capital—through business advice, financial training, skills development, help in registering the business, and bookkeeping, etc.—together can contribute to capability building and halting the processes causing social exclusion.	Positive (+) The unsecured loan has a symbolic role. It expresses that the loan providers have confidence in the client. Servicing the unsecured loan significantly increased the personal prestige of those who have repaid their loan in the given locality. To a lesser extent, the programme also had a strong empowerment effect for those whose venture eventually ended in failure.	n.a.	n.a.
Mustapha (2009) (Journal: <i>Journal of International Development</i>)	Nigeria	Employment / Business: Federal Character Commission (FCC) (Quota)	Region: Geographical areas (to ensure equitable representation of different groups in all tiers of government)	Employment: Representativeness of federal bureaucracies	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Insignificant: The FCC is not creating a representative bureaucracy (the three northern zones—which were to be the main beneficiaries of the FCC—have a smaller percentage of the bureaucracy in 2004, compared to 1996 when the FCC was created).	Positive (+): The FCC is increasingly generating the data through which the nagging national problem of representation can be objectively assessed, monitored and pronounced upon, away from the “screaming headlines” of ethnic entrepreneurs.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Muttarak et al. (2012) (Journal: <i>Sociology</i>)	Ireland	Employment / Business: Fair Employment Act 1989	Religion: Catholics and Protestants	Employment: Employment participation	Estimation: DiD with FE	Positive (+) There has been a general shift towards workforce integration. The success of agreements, however, is limited to certain industrial sectors and medium-sized enterprises.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Naff and Kellough (2003) (Journal: <i>International Journal of Public Administration</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Diversity management programs.	Race/colour: Minorities (Black, Hispanic, Native Americans; women)	Employment: Employment equity	Estimation: Multiple regression	Insignificant For the most part, that there is little evidence that broad-based diversity programs, nor any of their programmatic components, have created a more equitable work environment for women or people of colour.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Niemann and Dovidio (2005) (Journal: <i>Journal of Social Issues</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: AA in higher education	Race/colour: African American, Latina/o	Other: Job satisfaction	Estimation: Multiple regression	n.a.	Mixed (+/-) AA that was seen as willingly pursued by the department was positively related to job satisfaction, whereas perceptions that it was imposed tended to be negatively related to satisfaction. This effect is mediated by how supportive colleagues are seen and how much self-doubt faculty experience.	n.a.	n.a.
Omeje et al. (2016) (Journal: <i>SAGE Open</i>)	Nigeria	Education: Quota system (Quota)	Region: State and catchment area	Educational attainment: Students' admissions in universities	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Negative (-) The study revealed that the quota and catchment area system have an inequitable effect on students' admission processes and avail	Negative (-) The quota and catchment area system also contribute to the production of low-quality graduates in the universities in North Central States of	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						accessibility to the university education.	Nigeria, encourage unethical practices during admission processes, and make for overpopulation of university campuses in North Central States.		
Orfield and Whitley (2001) (Book / book chapter)	United States	Education: U.S. Supreme Court's 1978 Bakke decision	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	Other: Student learning experiences	Descriptive: Comparison of means	n.a.	Positive (+) When asked to make an overall assessment of whether diversity was a positive or negative element in their total educational experience, 89% of Harvard students and 91% of Michigan students reported a positive impact (the large majority reporting a strongly positive impact).	n.a.	Positive (+) White students appear to have a particularly enriching experience, since they are by far the most likely to have grown up with little interracial contact.
Osorio (2012) (Book / book chapter)	Brazil	Employment / Business: Creation of the Special Secretariat of Policies to Promote Racial Equality (SEPPIR)	Race/colour: Black population	Earnings: Black-white income inequality	Descriptive: Income ratio, between-group inequality, and coefficient of concentration in the income distribution	Insignificant The SEPPIR can be evaluated as ineffective, considering the lack of impact on racial inequality in the short run.	Positive (+) However, the SEPPIR's presence contributed to further strengthen and disseminate pro-AA discourse in the federal government.	n.a.	n.a.
Pande (2003) (Journal: <i>The American Economic Review</i>)	India	Electoral representation: Political Reservation in Indian States (Quota)	Caste: SC/ST	Other: Total spending, education spending, job quotas, welfare spending	Estimation: OLS	n.a.	Positive (+) Political reservation in Indian states has increased redistribution of resources in favour of the beneficiary groups. Such increases have been accompanied by increases in overall spending and	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
							decreases in spending on education programs.		
Pandey and Risal (2021) (Journal: <i>Wutan Huatan Jisuan Jishu</i>)	Nepal	Employment / Business: Reservation policy (Quota)	Caste: Dalit (caste), Madhesis, Adivasi Janajatis, Tharus, Khas Arya, and other marginalized communities; women	Work / business performance: Service Deliveries (Communication, flexibility and participation, learning and development)	Descriptive: Mean scores	Negative (-) The AA policy violates the meritocracy principle and risks selecting low quality candidates. Results show that candidates selected from the reservation category have lower communication capacity, less flexibility, cannot put forward concrete ideas during meetings, and their learning attitude and personal development activities are lower.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Pandeya and Oyama (2019) (Journal: <i>Asian Journal of Political Science</i>)	Nepal	Electoral representation: 2007 Interim Constitutionc	Caste: Madhesis, Dalits, Janajatis, backward regions, and others	Political participation: Legislative representation	Descriptive: Descriptive and inferential statistical analysis	Insignificant Data from 1959 to 2013 show the existence of a prolonged unequal representation of caste/ethnic groups in the legislature of Nepal. Although women and some excluded identities have gained substantial seats in the later period, progress for many groups, particularly historically marginalized ones, has been far too slow.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Patel and Graham (2012) (Journal: <i>Development Southern Africa</i>)	South Africa	Employment / Business: Broad-based black economic empowerment (BBBEE)	Race/colour: Black people	Business performance: Business deals	Descriptive: Number of deals	Positive (+) The BBBEE legislation enacted in 2003 significantly increased the number of BEE deals.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Rasiah and Shari (2001)	Malaysia	Employment / Business:	Indigeneity: Bumiputera	Employment:	Descriptive:	Positive (+)	Positive (+)	n.a.	Negative (-)

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
(Journal: <i>Cambridge Journal of Economics</i>)		New Economic Policy (NEP)		Employment rate and entrepreneurs	Comparison of means	Through preferential policies, the state expanded Bumiputera employment in public services, and stimulated their greater participation in manufacturing, thereby succeeding in its efforts to restructure the occupational identification of ethnicity, which was complemented by land schemes and the distribution of shares among poor Bumiputera households.	The NEP also emphasized the creation of a pool of Bumiputera entrepreneurs, so that their participation in corporate equity could be backed by managerial control.		In corporate equity terms, Bumiputera, non-Bumiputera and foreign participation was set at 30%, 40% and 30% respectively for 1990. It was 2.4%, 32.3% and 63.3% respectively in 1970.
Ratuva (2013a) (Book / book chapter)	Fiji	Employment / Business: Constitution's AA thrust (Quota)	Indigeneity: Indigenous Fijian	Employment: Employment in civil service	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) By 1991, 55.8% of the civil services staff were indigenous Fijians (compared to 43% before the coup).	n.a.	Negative (-) 79.5% of those who left the service were Indo-Fijians and other minorities, compared to 20.5% indigenous Fijians; in 1988 it was 68.2 per cent and 31.8 per cent respectively.	
Ratuva (2013b) (Book / book chapter)	Fiji	Employment / Business: Alliance Party AA policies	Indigeneity: Indigenous Fijian	Earnings: Income and wealth	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Mixed (+/-) As far as indigenous Fijian farmers were concerned, the Seaqaqa scheme was a mixed success. While there were failures, there were also success stories; but in the national scheme of things, indigenous Fijians were still in the minority as far as sugar production was concerned.	Negative (-) Perhaps one of the most ambitious Alliance initiatives, this time involving the Fijian Administration, was the setting up of the Native Land Development Corporation (NLDC) in 1974 as a commercial subsidiary of the Native Land Trust Board. All the NLDC projects failed and the NLDC debts had to be paid by the government.	n.a.	n.a.
Ravallion (2020a)	Malaysia	Employment / Business:	Indigeneity: Bumiputera	Other: Income distribution	Estimation: Earnings regressions	Positive (+) The share of total inequality accountable to	Positive (+) The paper finds that measures of	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
(Journal: <i>World Development</i>)		New Economic Policy (NEP) (Quota)				ethnicity has more than halved. Despite this (considerable) success in attenuating relative inequality, the gains to the poorer Bumiputera have not been enough to attenuate the large absolute gaps by ethnicity.	fractionalization and relative income polarization between ethnic groups have also fallen over time, though (similarly to inequality) absolute polarization has tended to rise.		
Ravallion (2020b) (Journal: <i>World Development</i>)	Malaysia	Employment / Business: New Economic Policy (NEP) (Quota)	Indigeneity: Bumiputera	Other: Poverty	Estimation: Regression-based elasticity	Positive (+) The impact on the national poverty rate of redistribution from the Chinese to the Bumiputera was high around the time that the NEP was introduced. Over time, the effect declined considerably.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Ready (2001) (Book / book chapter)	United States	Education: Project 3000 by 2000 (campaign of U.S. medical schools to increase minority enrolment. Its goal is that 3,000 underrepresented minority students will matriculate annually at U.S. medical schools.	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	Educational attainment: Enrolment and performance	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) After Project 3000 by 2000 was launched, the number of under-represented minority students entering medical school increased 36%, from 1,485 in 1990 to 2,024 in 1994, and remained virtually unchanged in 1995. The enrolment gains were made possible by a 65% increase in minority applications.	Positive (+) The minority students who entered medical school through these programs performed academically at levels comparable to those of other students admitted in traditional ways. Those admitted to the medical profession through AA have proved to be more likely to address the healthcare needs of minority and disadvantaged patients than other doctors.	n.a.	n.a.
Rodgers and Spriggs (1996) (Journal:)	United States	Employment / Business: Executive Order 11246	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	Employment: Proportion of Minorities in establishment's work force	Estimation: Logit	Mixed (+/-) Federal-contract status remains significant in explaining the share of an establishment's work force that is African	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) In 1982, federal-contract status increased the Asian share of

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
<i>The American Economic Review</i>)						American or Hispanic. For African Americans, the effect is positive, while for Hispanic workers it is negative.			an establishment's work force by 0.20 ppts and by 0.25 ppts in 1992.
Rothstein and Yoon (2008a) (Working paper)	United States	Education: Race-based preferences in public university admissions (vs. simulation of admissions under race-blind policies)	Race/colour: African Americans	Educational attainment: Admission in higher education; number of lawyers	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	Positive (+) Race-based preferences have large effects on the number of black law students, and thereby on diversity in law schools. In absence of AA, black representation at the most selective schools would fall by 90%, but extent well beyond; all but the least selective schools would enrol 1/3 to 1/2 fewer black students than they do today.	Positive (+) Eliminating AA would dramatically reduce the number of blacks who become lawyers.	n.a.	n.a.
Rothstein and Yoon (2008b) (Working paper)	United States	Education: Race-based higher education admission preferences	Race/colour: Blacks	Educational attainment: Grades, graduation, bar exam success and labour market experiences	Estimation: OLS and Probit	n.a.	Mixed (+/-) There is no evidence of mismatch effects on any students' employment outcomes or on the graduation or bar passage rates of black students with moderate or strong entering credentials. What evidence there is for mismatch comes from less-qualified black students who typically attend second- or third-tier schools. Many of these students would not have been admitted to any law school without preferences, however, and the	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
							resulting sample selection prevents strong conclusions.		
Sabharwal et al. (2020) (Journal: <i>Gender and Education</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Recruitment for academic positions (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST, OBC; women	Other: Participation in conferences (hidden social exclusion)	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	n.a.	Negative (-): The analysis of administrative records found that access to conferences was proportionally lower for women and marginalised caste groups than their representation at faculty level.	n.a.	n.a.
Samii (2013) (Journal: <i>American Political Science Review</i>)	Burundi	Employment / Business: Forces Technical Agreement (Quota)	Other: Hutus and Tutsis	Other: Prejudicial behaviour and ethnic salience	Estimation: RDD	Positive (+) At the macro level, the new Burundian military operates as a deeply integrated and cohesive institution. This is indicative of the possibility of quota-based integration in difficult settings such as post-war Burundi.	Positive (+) A micro-level natural experiment, which produces quasi-random exposure to ethnic integration through the military retirement age, shows that exposure to ethnic integration decreases prejudicial behaviour and is benign with respect to ethnic salience.	n.a.	n.a.
Sander (2004) (Journal: <i>Stanford Law Review</i>)	United States	Education: Supreme Court's Bakke decision (Quota)	Race/colour: Blacks	Educational attainment: Admission in higher education, performance of beneficiaries and success on postgraduate bar examinations	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) For blacks, there are two primary benefits of AA. First, black students widely have the opportunity to attend significantly more elite schools than do white peers with similar credentials. Second, the system as a whole leads to the admission of an additional five or six hundred black students- about one seventh of the	Negative (-) Most black law applicants end up at schools where they will struggle academically and fail at higher rates than they would in the absence of preferences. The net trade-off of higher prestige but weaker academic performance substantially harms black performance on bar exams and harms	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						annual total-who would not otherwise be admitted to any accredited school.	most new black lawyers on the job market		
Sautman (1998) (Journal: <i>Pacific Rim Law & Policy Journal</i>)	China	Education: Preferential policies in higher education	Other: Minority people	Educational attainment: Students' admissions in universities	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) When the Chinese Communist Party achieved national power in 1949, minorities accounted for less than 1% of all university students. The proportion increased rapidly in the 1950s, peaking at 3.7% in 1956-1957 and declining somewhat thereafter as the national entrance examination introduced in 1954 began to affect student selection.	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) As a result of lowered minimums and added points, minority students are often admitted with much lower scores on average than Han admittees.
Segawa (2013) (Journal: <i>African and Asian Studies</i>)	Malaysia	Employment / Business: New Economic Policy (NEP) (Quota)	Indigeneity: Malays	Other: Assimilation and multiculturalism	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) AA policies in Malaysia have been biased towards Malays in restructuring employment patterns and share capital ownership.	Negative (-) The sharpening of ethnic identity among non-Malays has strengthened the 'us versus them' mentality and has increased ethnic tensions.	n.a.	Negative (-) Malay preferential policies have caused non-Malays to feel alienated from the state because of their "perceived treatment as second-class citizens."
Sheth (2004) (Working paper)	India	Employment / Business: Reservations (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST, OBC	Educational attainment: Enrolment (ratios), Literacy, Drop-out, Admission in higher education, Representation in public employment	Descriptive: Comparison of means	n.a.	Positive (+) Reservations have helped the SCs, STs and the OBCs. By providing a concrete basis to their mobility aspirations, it has induced them to achieve higher levels of	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
							literacy and living standards.		
Sifani (2009) (Dissertation)	Namibia	Employment / Business: Affirmative Action (Employment) Act and Employment Equity Commission (EEC)	Race/colour: Blacks; women and people with disabilities	Employment: Representation in management positions	Estimation: FE and RE models	Positive (+) The dummy variable for compliance with the submission of annual reports to the EEC shows a significant positive impact on the employment ratio. This is an indication that if institutions comply with the provisions of the AA (Employment) Act, by submitting their annual AA reports, they are likely to increase the ratio of the designated groups on total employment.	Positive (+) The study also found that training at management level has an insignificant positive impact on the employment ratio.	n.a.	n.a.
Sowell (1975) (Book / book chapter)	United States	Employment / Business: Civil Rights Act of 1964	Race/colour: Blacks	Employment: Academic employment, pay, and promotion	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	Insignificant The pay differentials between minorities and other academics were less than \$100 per year before affirmative action and less than \$1,000 afterwards indicating that both the necessity for such programs and the effectiveness of them are open to serious question.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Sunam and Shrestha (2019) (Journal: <i>Contributions to Nepalese Studies</i> (CNAS))	Nepal	Employment / Business: 1993 Civil Service Act (reservation policy in the civil service) (Quota)	Caste: Adivasi-Janajatis, Madhesis, Dalits, and "backward" regions; women, people with disabilities.	Employment: Composition of bureaucracy	Descriptive: Composition of bureaucracy	Positive (+) The reservation policy has played a vital role in building an inclusive bureaucracy for the first time in the history of Nepal. Though minority groups are still under-represented, one in six civil-service employees represent those recruited	Negative (-) The creation of new categories of reservation for Khas-Aryas, and the continuation of reservations for the already proportionally represented, as well as socially and economically better-off	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						under the reservation streams.	groups, means that the most disadvantaged and excluded groups have been denied a larger share of reservations.		
Sunam et al. (2021) (Journal: <i>Development Policy Review</i>)	Nepal	Employment / Business: 1993 Civil Service Act (reservation policy in the civil service) (Quota)	Caste: Adivasi-Janajatis, Madhesi, Dalits, and “backward” regions; women, people with disabilities.	Work / Business Performance: Work Performance	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) Surveys reporting the self-rated performance and as rated by their supervisors or colleagues have found that the performance of the beneficiaries of AA is more than satisfactory.	Positive (+) A more diverse workforce created with AA led to more civil servants with specific language skills and better understanding of different cultural contexts of the marginalized and indigenous communities, which has played an important role in providing effective services to ordinary citizens, particularly to those living on the margins of society.		n.a.
Surdu and Szira (2009) (Working paper)	Romania	Education: Government Decision 430/2001 (Quota)	Other: Ethnic Roma	Educational attainment: Graduation in secondary and higher education	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) On the one hand, there has been a significant increase in the number of Roma pupils accessing secondary and tertiary education.	Negative (-) On the other hand, the policy has been screwed toward those with higher socio-economic status and failed to reach those most in need. More than half of the beneficiaries would qualify to enter vocational schools, high schools and universities on their own forces even if these measures would not be in place.	n.a.	n.a.
Sweet (2006) (Journal: <i>Journal of Law and Society</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Government contracting AA programmes	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	Employment: Minority employment	Estimation: OLS	Insignificant AA in government contracting does not significantly increase minority employment and is statistically insignificant in eradicating discrimination in contracting.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Tabatadze and	Georgia	Education: Amendment of November 19 of	Other: Armenian, Azerbaijani, Ossetian	Educational attainment:	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Mixed (+/ Insignificant) During 2010-2013 the number of Azeri speaking	Negative (-)	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Gorgadze (2013) (Report)		2009 (allowed entrants to take the entry tests in Russian and introduced training courses)	and Abkhazian students	Equal access to higher education		registered entrants as well as enrolled students has significantly increased (the indicator has at least tripled). For the Armenian speaking entrants, there's no obvious progress.	Students who do not speak a state language in the beginning of the program, can't overcome the language issues within the one-year program; moreover, they face language issues on an undergraduate level as they do not have enough communication skills at the end of the program as well as have huge issues in terms of academic language competences.		
Tan and Preece (2021) (Journal: <i>Representation</i>)	Comparative: 11 countries (Bhutan, China, Fiji, India, Nepal, Pakistan, Philippines, Samoa, Singapore, Taiwan and Vietnam).	Electoral representation: Reserved seats (Quota)	Other: Ethnic minorities and Indigenous groups	Political participation: Legislative diversity	Descriptive: Number of seats in Parliament	Positive (+) Overall, the varied ethnic quota mechanisms have met or raised the level of ethnic-Indigenous legislative representation in almost all quota countries in their latest legislative/ general election.	Positive (+) Taiwan, Singapore and Pakistan have all experienced a decrease in social exclusion or rise in ethnic equality since 1960–2020. This means the barriers and discriminatory policies towards ethnic minority groups have been addressed or removed to varying degrees since 1960 in all three cases.	n.a.	n.a.
Tan (2014) (Journal: <i>International Political Science Review</i>)	Singapore	Electoral representation: 1988 electoral reform (Quota)	Other: Malay, Indian or other minorities; women	Political participation: Number of minority ethnic and women candidates	Descriptive: Average shares	Positive (+) Ethnic quotas imposed on public housing and candidate selection in the group constituencies both repressed ethnic-based politics and improved the legislative presence of minority.	n.a.	Positive (+) Ethnic quotas have had the unintended effect of improving women's political participation.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Taylor (1994) (Journal: <i>Basic and Applied Social Psychology</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: AA practiced by employers	Race/colour: African Americans; women	Other: Job Satisfaction, Work by Choice, Intrinsic Work Orientation, Ambition, Life Satisfaction, Health, Zest for Life, Happiness	Estimation: Analyses of covariance (ANCOVAs)	n.a.	Positive (+) No evidence that benefiting from AA has detrimental social psychological consequences. On the contrary, those employed at AA workplaces show greater occupational ambition. There was also a nearly significant tendency for Blacks at AA firms to believe that other people are helpful.	n.a.	n.a.
Turner et al. (1999) (Journal: <i>The Journal of Higher Education</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Civil rights legislation and programs by higher education institutions	Race/colour: African Americans, Latinos, and Native Americans	Employment: Representation in the academic workplace	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Insignificant Statistical and narrative data show the continued underrepresentation and exclusion of faculty of colour in the Midwestern colleges and universities despite civil rights legislation and programs by higher education institutions.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Tzannatos (1991) (Journal: <i>International Journal of Educational Development</i>)	Malaysia	Education: New Economic Policy (NEP) (Quota)	Indigeneity: Bumiputras	Educational attainment: Enrolment in higher education	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) Only one in five students in tertiary institutions is a non-Bumiputra and enrolment at diploma level is almost 100% Bumiputra.	Positive (+) Average Bumiputras income rose by 40% more than the average income of other groups during the 1970-1984 period.	Negative (-) Many (non-Bumiputra) students are forced to study abroad and brain drain is a serious possibility.	
Ukiwo (2007) (Journal: <i>International Journal of Educational</i>)	Nigeria	Education: Concurrent List (Quota)	Region: State and catchment area	Educational attainment: Enrolment in tertiary institutions	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	Positive (+) The establishment of more universities and introduction of remedial programmes for admissions in areas designated 'educationally less advantaged' had a	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) More and more Southerners are competing for fewer positions. Southerners continue to complain

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
<i>Development)</i>						positive impact on enrolment. However, the educational imbalance between the North and the South persists.			about the constraints quotas pose to their aspirations for higher educational attainments.
Valente and Berry (2017) (Journal: Latin American Research Review)	Brazil	Education: Lei das Cotas (Affirmative Action Law) (Quota)	Race/colour: Black, brown, and indigenous students from public high schools	Educational attainment: Academic performance	Estimation: OLS	n.a.	Mixed (+/- Insignificant) Students admitted to public universities under AA perform at similar levels to students who were not, whereas quota students in private universities perform slightly better than students admitted through traditional methods.	n.a.	n.a.
Verbeek and Groeneveld (2012) (Journal: Personnel Review)	Netherlands	Employment / Business: “Hard” diversity policies under Wet SAMEN (1. assigning responsibility for diversity policy in organizations, 2. tiebreak preferential treatment, and 3. formulation of target figures)	Other: Ethnic minorities	Employment: Ethnic minority representation	Estimation: Lagged Dependent Variable (LDV) model	Insignificant The findings suggest that the three diversity policies do not impact ethnic minority representation in the short run (in the course of a year).	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Vieira and Arends-Kuenning (2019) (Journal: <i>Economics of Education Review</i>)	Brazil	Education: National Law of Quotas (Quota)	Race/colour: Blacks, Indígenas and low-income public high school students (PHSS)	Educational attainment: College admission	Estimation: DID	Positive (+) The programs where AA policy was adopted, there was a significant increase in the enrolment of students from targeted disadvantaged groups.	n.a.	Positive (+) Significant increase in the enrolment of students with disadvantaged characteristics not explicitly targeted by the policies (e.g., students with low	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
								levels of educational attainment by their parents).	
Vollan (2011) (Journal: <i>International Journal on Minority and Group Rights</i>)	Nepal	Electoral representation: List Proportional system (Quota)	Caste: Madhesis, Dalits, Janajatis, backward regions and other minorities; women	Political participation: Reservation seats	Descriptive: Number of Seats	Positive (+) The system did produce an inclusive Constituent Assembly (CA) far beyond what a system without quotas would have achieved. Women and Dalits were the groups which were still furthest away from a proportional representation, even though they made a good leap forward in representation due to the quota system.	n.a.	Negative (-) The marginalised groups within the Madhesis and the Janajatis did not get proper representation, because these groups included both privileged and underprivileged groups.	Negative (-) The complexity of the system represented difficulties for the parties beyond what was needed for including otherwise excluded groups.
Walker (2000) (Report)	Australia	Education: Aboriginal Student Allowance (ABSTUDY)	Indigeneity: Aboriginal students	Educational attainment: Student retention, participation and achievement	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) Many students stressed the crucial importance of maintaining essential ABSTUDY living allowances and supplementary benefits allowances to achieve Indigenous aspirations and outcomes in higher education. They emphasised how these benefits assisted them to achieve their study and career goals and to change their situation.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Waseem (1997) (Journal: <i>Ethnic Studies Report</i>)	Pakistan	Employment / Business: Quota system (Quota)	Region: Punjab, Sindh, NWFP, Baluchistan, Northern Areas and FATA, Azad Kashmir	Employment: Ethnic Representation in Federal Bureaucracy	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) In 1993, Punjab enjoyed a share in services which was more than its designated share in the quota. The mohajirs' margin of overrepresentation came down from	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) AA policies generally frustrated the Urdu-speaking migrants from India (mohajirs) who had

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						three times their designated share to only a fraction above that. Sindhis represented the other side of the same coin as they moved up from a mere trickle down to a figure approximating their quota.			traditionally enjoyed a privileged status in the bureaucracy.
Welch and Gruhl (1998) (Book / book chapter)	United States	Education: Bakke decision (abolition of race as a definite and exclusive basis for university admission decisions) (Quota)	Race/colour: Black, Hispanic, and Native American	Educational attainment: Admissions, applications, and enrolment in tertiary education	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Insignificant Most of these officials appeared to perceive that Bakke has had minimal impact on admissions policies. The overall growth in minority enrolments in the typical medical or law school between 1978, the time of Bakke, and 1987 was extremely small.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Xaxa (2001) (Journal: <i>Economic and Political Weekly</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Reservation policy	Caste: SC, ST	Employment: Seats in parliament/state legislatures, employment in government services and admission in higher education	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) The SCs have, in general, fared better than the STs in achieving the reserved places.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Yaffe (1995) Journal: <i>The American Review of Public Administration</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Equal employment responsibilities	Race/colour: Hispanics	Employment: Employment patterns for Latinas in management positions in local government	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Insignificant 25 years after Los Angeles County enacted comprehensive AA and equal employment policies, across both gender and ethnic or racial lines, Latinas remain the most underrepresented of any protected group in management. This may	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						be attributed more to the failure of elected officials to rationally and equitably apply the policies than to demographic availability or educational factors.			
Yasuda (1991) (Journal: <i>The Developing Economies</i>)	Malaysia	Employment / Business: Industrial Co-ordination Act (ICA) (Quota)	Indigeneity: Bumiputera	Other: Corporatetock ownership	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) Government licensing of enterprises under the ICA without a doubt contributed to the nurturing of Bumiputera-owned corporations in the manufacturing sector.	n.a.	n.a.	Mixed (+/-) The non-Bumiputera Malaysian groups, led by the Chinese business community, also saw increases. The losers were the foreign investors in Malaysia.
Yusof (2012) (Book / book chapter)	Malaysia	Employment / Business: New Economic Policy (NEP) (Quota)	Indigeneity: Bumiputera (Malays and other indigenous groups)	Other: Human capital and education, employment restructuring; poverty; income inequality	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) Advancements in educational attainment of the lower-income groups, especially among the Bumiputera; more Bumiputera found employment in the more modern and high-productivity and paying industries/occupations; inequality in ownership and control was reduced; mixed progress in developing the Bumiputera Commercial and Industrial Community.	Positive (+) All ethnic groups recorded progress in poverty reduction (Bumiputera poverty had fallen to 8.3%, Chinese and Indian poverty had fallen faster, reaching 0.6% and 2.9%, respectively, by 2004). The income disparity ratio between the Bumiputera and non-Bumiputera, over the past thirty-plus years, has narrowed.	n.a.	n.a.
Zang (2008) (Journal: <i>World Development</i>)	China	Employment / Business: AA in public employment (officially minority)	Other: Minority nationalities (the study contrasts the Han majority with Hui Muslim groups)	Employment: Probability of employment	Estimation: Multinomial regression analyses	Negative (-) Significant Hui–Han differences in job attainment in both state firms and redistributive	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
		workers are hired first if they hold similar or slightly lower qualifications than Han workers).				agencies despite government AA policy.			
Zhao and Lovrich (1998) (Journal: <i>Journal of Criminal Justice</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: AA as defined by federal courts and the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) following the Equal Employment Opportunity Act 1972	Race/colour: African Americans	Employment: Employment Participation	Estimation: OLS	Insignificant The influence of the presence of AA programs is weaker compared to previous studies. The significant effects of the presence of an African American mayor and the presence of a formal affirmative action program disappear after controlling for the influence of other explanatory variables.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Zoabi and Awad (2015) (Book / book chapter)	Israel	Education: Pre-Academic Preparatory Program (PAPP) in Sakhnin College	Religion: Arab Palestinian minority	Other: Perceptions of empowerment	Descriptive: Participative-responsive evaluation model	Positive (+) The findings reveal a high impact of the PAPP studies on the sense of empowerment.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Zoabi and Awad (2015) (Book / book chapter)	Israel	Education: Equal Opportunities for Arab minority students at the Technion-Israel Institute of Technology	Religion: Arab Palestinian minority	Educational attainment: Dropout rates, perceptions of academic life, and feeling of belonging	Descriptive: Participative-responsive evaluation model	Positive (+) In sum, the evaluation showed that the intervention program of the Technion among Arab minority students contributed to their academic life, mainly decreasing their drop-out rate and enhancing their academic life at the institution.	Insignificant Yet, the program contributed little to Arab minority students' sense of community and feelings of belonging to the Technion as a home.	n.a.	n.a.

Notes: ^R indices reverse coding, as the study investigates the effects of removing an ethnic AA policy (United States only).

Source: authors' elaboration.

Bibliography

- Acemoglu, D., Gelb, S., & Robinson, J. A. (2007). Black economic empowerment and economic performance in South Africa. *Cambridge, MA: Center for Economic Development, Working Paper*, 2003.
- Adeyemi, K. (2001). Equality of access and catchment area factor in university admissions in Nigeria. *Higher Education*, 42(3), 307-332. <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1017965905830>
- Alionescu, C.-C. (2004). Parliamentary representation of minorities in Romania. *Southeast european politics*, 5(1), 60-75.
- Allen, G. (2018a). Comparative Evidence of the Negative Impacts of Reservations. In G. Allen (Ed.), *Presence and Impotence: The perils of guaranteed descriptive representation* (pp. 116-136). Dissertation for the degree Doctor of Philosophy in Political Science. .
- Allen, G. (2018b). The Impact of Communal Reservations in Croatia. In G. Allen (Ed.), *Presence and Impotence: The perils of guaranteed descriptive representation* (pp. 76-115). Dissertation for the degree Doctor of Philosophy in Political Science. University of California, Santa Barbara.
- Alon, S. (2015a). *Race, class, and affirmative action (Chapter 11)*. Russell Sage Foundation.
- Alon, S. (2015b). *Race, class, and affirmative action (Chapters 8 and 10)*. Russell Sage Foundation.
- Alon, S., & Tienda, M. (2005). Assessing the “mismatch” hypothesis: Differences in college graduation rates by institutional selectivity. *Sociology of education*, 78(4), 294-315.
- Arcidiacono, P. (2005). Affirmative action in higher education: How do admission and financial aid rules affect future earnings? *Econometrica*, 73(5), 1477-1524.
- Arcidiacono, P., Aucejo, E., Coate, P., & Hotz, V. J. (2014). Affirmative action and university fit: Evidence from Proposition 209. *IZA Journal of Labor Economics*, 3(1), 1-29.
- Arcidiacono, P., & Lovenheim, M. (2016). Affirmative action and the quality-fit trade-off. *Journal of Economic Literature*, 54(1), 3-51.
- Artes, A., & Mena-Chalco, J. P. (2019). The Ford Foundation Fellowships Program: 12 years of operation in Brazil. *Educação & Realidade*, 44.
- Assunção, J., & Ferman, B. (2015). Affirmative action in university admissions and high school students' proficiency. *Mimeo*.
- Ayres, I., & Brooks, R. (2004). Does affirmative action reduce the number of black lawyers. *Stan. L. Rev.*, 57, 1807.
- Bagde, S., Eppele, D., & Taylor, L. (2016). Does affirmative action work? Caste, gender, college quality, and academic success in India. *American Economic Review*, 106(6), 1495-1521.
- Bamrah, I. S., & Girdhar, A. (2015). Investigation on impact of reservation policy on student enrollment using data mining. 2015 IEEE International Conference on Computational Intelligence and Computing Research (ICICR),
- Banducci, S. A., Donovan, T., & Karp, J. A. (2004). Minority representation, empowerment, and participation. *The Journal of Politics*, 66(2), 534-556.
- Bardhan, P. K., Mookherjee, D., & Parra Torrado, M. (2010). Impact of Political Reservations in West Bengal Local Governments on Anti-Poverty Targeting. *Journal of Globalization and Development*, 1(1). <https://doi.org/10.2202/1948-1837.1025>
- Barlow, A. E., & Villarejo, M. (2004). Making a difference for minorities: Evaluation of an educational enrichment program. *Journal of research in science teaching*, 41(9), 861-881.
- Basant, R., & Sen, G. (2020). Quota-based Affirmative Action in higher education: impact on other backward classes in India. *The Journal of Development Studies*, 56(2), 336-360.
- Berry, R. M. (2004). Affirmative action in higher education: costs, benefits, and implementation. *Journal of Public Budgeting, Accounting & Financial Management*.
- Bertrand, M., Hanna, R., & Mullainathan, S. (2010). Affirmative action in education: Evidence from engineering college admissions in India. *Journal of Public Economics*, 94(1-2), 16-29.

- Bhattacharjee, A. (2019). Spillovers in Affirmative Action: Evidence from OBC Quotas in India. *Leeds University Business School Working Paper*(19-03).
- Bhavnani, R. R., & Lee, A. (2021). Does affirmative action worsen bureaucratic performance? evidence from the indian administrative service. *American Journal of Political Science*, 65(1), 5-20.
- Bird, K. (2016). Intersections of exclusion: the institutional dynamics of combined gender and ethnic quota systems. *Politics, Groups, and Identities*, 4(2), 284-306.
- Bleemer, Z. (2022). Affirmative Action, Mismatch, and Economic Mobility after California's Proposition 209. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 137(1), 115-160. <https://doi.org/10.1093/qje/qjab027>
- Borooah, V. K. (2019). *Disparity and Discrimination in Labour Market Outcomes In India*. Springer.
- Burger, R., & Jafta, R. (2010). Affirmative action in South Africa: an empirical assessment of the impact on labour market outcomes. *CRISE WORKING PAPER No. 76*. <https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/media/57a08b2ced915d622c000b5d/workingpaper76.pdf>
- Burstein, P., & Edwards, M. E. (1994). The impact of employment discrimination litigation on racial disparity in earnings: evidence and unresolved issues. *Law and Society Review*, 79-111.
- Button, J. W., & Rienzo, B. A. (2003). The impact of affirmative action: Black employment in six southern cities. *Social Science Quarterly*, 84(1), 1-14.
- Caldwell, R. (2009). The Erosion of Affirmative Action and its Consequences for the Black-White Educational Attainment Gap. *University of Kansas Law Review*, 57, 813.
- Campos, L. C., Machado, T. R. B., Miranda, G. J., & Costa, P. d. S. (2016). Social quotas, affirmative actions, and dropout in the Business field: empirical analysis in a Brazilian federal university. *Revista Contabilidade & Finanças*, 28, 27-42.
- Cassan, G. (2019). Affirmative action, education and gender: Evidence from India. *Journal of Development Economics*, 136, 51-70.
- Chambers, D. L., Clydesdale, T. T., Kidder, W. C., & Lempert, R. O. (2005). The real impact of eliminating affirmative action in American law schools: An empirical critique of Richard Sander's study. *Stanford Law Review*, 1855-1898.
- Charles, J. (2003). Diversity management: An exploratory assessment of minority group representation in state government. *Public Personnel Management*, 32(4), 561-577.
- Chatterji, A. K., Chay, K. Y., & Fairlie, R. W. (2014). The impact of city contracting set-asides on black self-employment and employment. *Journal of Labor Economics*, 32(3), 507-561.
- Chaudhary, K. (2015). The effect of political decentralisation and affirmative action on Multidimensional Poverty Index: evidence from Indian States. *Journal of Social and Economic Development*, 17(1), 27-49. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40847-015-0004-5>
- Childs, P., & Stromquist, N. P. (2015). Academic and diversity consequences of affirmative action in Brazil. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 45(5), 792-813.
- Chin, A., & Prakash, N. (2011). The redistributive effects of political reservation for minorities: Evidence from India. *Journal of Development Economics*, 96(2), 265-277. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdeveco.2010.10.004>
- Cicalò, G. A. (2008). What do we know about quotas? Data and considerations about the implementation of the quota system in the State University of Rio de Janeiro (UERJ). *universitas humanística*(65), 262-280.
- Conrad, C. A., & Sharpe, R. V. (1996). The impact of the California Civil Rights Initiative (CCRI) on university and professional school admissions and the implications for the California economy. *The Review of Black Political Economy*, 25(1), 13-59.
- Contreras, F. E. (2005). The reconstruction of merit post-Proposition 209. *Educational Policy*, 19(2), 371-395.
- Crampton, P., Weaver, N., & Howard, A. (2012). Holding a mirror to society? The sociodemographic characteristics of the University of Otago's health professional students. *New Zealand Medical Journal*, 125(1361), 12-28. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/22960712>
- Curtis, E., Wikaire, E., Jiang, Y., McMillan, L., Loto, R., Poole, P., Barrow, M., Bagg, W., & Reid, P. (2017). Examining the predictors of academic outcomes for indigenous Māori, Pacific and rural students

- admitted into medicine via two equity pathways: a retrospective observational study at the University of Auckland, Aotearoa New Zealand. *BMJ open*, 7(8), e017276.
- Daly, A., Gebremedhin, T., & Sayem, M. (2013). A case study of affirmative action Australian-style for Indigenous people. *Australian Journal of Labour Economics*, 16(2), 277-294.
- Das, S., Mukhopadhyay, A., & Saroy, R. (2017). Efficiency consequences of affirmative action in politics: Evidence from India. *IZA Discussion Paper No. 11093*. <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3056631>
- de Souza Miranda, C., de Lima, J. P. R., & de Andrade, F. P. (2020). Do students from affirmative actions have lower academic performance? *Revista Pensamento Contemporâneo em Administração*, 14(1), 1-15.
- De Vries, S., & Pettigrew, T. F. (1994). A comparative perspective on affirmative action: Positieve Aktie in the Netherlands. *Basic and Applied Social Psychology*, 15(1-2), 179-199.
- DeHart, C., & Mamet, E. (2020). Do Reserved Seats Work? Evidence from Tribal Representatives in Maine.
- Demarest, L., Langer, A., & Ukiwo, U. (2020). Nigeria's Federal Character Commission (FCC): a critical appraisal. *Oxford Development Studies*, 48(4), 315-328. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13600818.2020.1727427>
- Deshpande, A., & Ramachandran, R. (2019). Traditional hierarchies and affirmative action in a globalizing economy: Evidence from India. *World Development*, 118, 63-78. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2019.02.006>
- Deshpande, A., & Weisskopf, T. E. (2014). Does affirmative action reduce productivity? A case study of the Indian railways. *World Development*, 64, 169-180.
- Detterman, D. K. (2000). Tests, affirmative action in university admissions, and the American way. *Psychology, Public Policy, and Law*, 6(1), 44.
- Dobbin, F., & Kalev, A. (2015). Why firms need diversity managers and task forces. In A. Forsyth, H. Sheikh, & F. Sperotti (Eds.), *How global migration changes the workforce diversity equation* (pp. 170-198). Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Dometrius, N. C., & Sigelman, L. (1984). Assessing progress toward affirmative action goals in state and local government: A new benchmark. *Public Administration Review*, 241-246.
- Dong, T. B. (2016). Social inequality in the civil service and a review of affirmative action in Nepal. *The South Asianist Journal*, 4(2).
- DuBois, C. (2015). The impact of "soft" affirmative action policies on minority hiring in executive leadership: The case of the NFL's Rooney Rule. *American Law and Economics Review*, 18(1), 208-233.
- Dulleck, U., He, Y., Kidd, M. P., & Silva-Goncalves, J. (2017). The impact of affirmative action: Evidence from a cross-country laboratory experiment. *Economics Letters*, 155, 67-71. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.econlet.2017.03.010>
- Dunning, T., & Nilekani, J. (2013). Ethnic quotas and political mobilization: caste, parties, and distribution in Indian village councils. *American Political Science Review*, 107(1), 35-56.
- Ehrhardt, D. (2017). Indigeneship, bureaucratic discretion, and institutional change in Northern Nigeria. *African Affairs*, 116(464), 462-483. <https://doi.org/10.1093/afraf/adx016>
- Epple, D., Romano, R., & Sieg, H. (2008). Diversity and affirmative action in higher education. *Journal of Public Economic Theory*, 10(4), 475-501.
- Epps, E. G. (1998). Affirmative action and minority access to faculty positions. *Ohio St. LJ*, 59, 755.
- Estevan, F., Gall, T., & Morin, L.-P. (2019). Redistribution without distortion: Evidence from an affirmative action programme at a large Brazilian university. *The Economic Journal*, 129(619), 1182-1220.
- Fernandez, S., Koma, S., & Lee, H. (2017). Establishing the link between representative bureaucracy and performance: The South African case. *Governance*, 31(3), 535-553.
- Francis-Tan, A., & Tannuri-Pianto, M. (2015). Inside the black box: affirmative action and the social construction of race in Brazil. *Ethnic and racial studies*, 38(15), 2771-2790.
- Francis-Tan, A., & Tannuri-Pianto, M. (2018). Black Movement: Using discontinuities in admissions to study the effects of college quality and affirmative action. *Journal of Development Economics*, 135, 97-116.

- Francis, A. M., & Tannuri-Pianto, M. (2012). The redistributive equity of affirmative action: Exploring the role of race, socioeconomic status, and gender in college admissions. *Economics of Education Review*, 31(1), 45-55.
- Francis, A. M., & Tannuri-Pianto, M. (2015). Using Brazil's racial continuum to examine the short-term effects of affirmative action in higher education. *Journal of Human Resources*, 47(3), 754-784.
- Frisancho, V., & Krishna, K. (2016). Affirmative action in higher education in India: targeting, catch up, and mismatch. *Higher Education*, 71(5), 611-649.
- Gandara, P. (2012). California: A case study in the loss of affirmative action.
- Garaz, S. (2014). Helping the marginalised or supporting the elite? Affirmative action as a tool for increasing access to higher education for ethnic Roma. *European Educational Research Journal*, 13(3), 295-311.
- Garces, L. M. (2012a). Necessary but not sufficient: The impact of Grutter v. Bollinger on student of color enrollment in graduate and professional schools in Texas. *The Journal of Higher Education*, 83(4), 497-534.
- Garces, L. M. (2012b). Racial diversity, legitimacy, and the citizenry: The impact of affirmative action bans on graduate school enrollment. *The Review of Higher Education*, 36(1), 93-132.
- Garces, L. M. (2013). Understanding the impact of affirmative action bans in different graduate fields of study. *American Educational Research Journal*, 50(2), 251-284.
- Gill, M. S. (2002). Reservation-An affirmative action of social justice? *Social Change*, 32(1-2), 27-38. <https://doi.org/10.1177/004908570203200202>
- Gille, V. (2013). Stigma in positive discrimination application? Evidence from quotas in education in India. Conference Paper, Centre d'Economie de la Sorbonne,
- Gille, V. (2018). Applying for social programs in India: Roles of local politics and caste networks in affirmative action. *Journal of Comparative Economics*, 46(2), 436-456.
- Gilmer, T. (2007). An understanding of the improved grades, retention and graduation rates of STEM majors at the Academic Investment in Math and Science (AIMS) Program of Bowling Green State University (BGSU). *Journal of STEM Education*, 8(1).
- Girard, V. (2018). Don't Touch My Road. Evidence from India on Affirmative Action And Everyday Discrimination. *World Development*, 103, 1-13. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2017.10.008>
- Gomez, E. T., & Premdas, R. (2012). *Affirmative Action, Ethnicity, and Conflict*. Routledge.
- Griffin, P. B. (1990). *The impact of affirmative action on labor demand: A test of some implications of the Le Chatelier principle*. University of California, Santa Barbara.
- Grove, W., & Hussey, A. (2011). *Affirmative Action in MBA Programs: Investigating the Mismatch Hypothesis for Race and Gender*.
- Guan, L. H. (2005). Affirmative Action in Malaysia. *Southeast Asian Affairs, ISEAS - Yusuf Ishak Institute*, 211-228. <https://doi.org/10.2307/27913284>
- Gulzar, S., Haas, N., & Pasquale, B. (2020). Does Political Affirmative Action Work, and for Whom? Theory and Evidence on India's Scheduled Areas. *American Political Science Review*, 114(4), 1230-1246. <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0003055420000532>
- Harper, S. R., & Griffin, K. A. (2010). Opportunity beyond affirmative action: How low-income and working-class Black male achievers access highly selective, high-cost colleges and universities. *Harvard Journal of African American Public Policy*, 17, 43.
- Heckman, J. J. (1989). The impact of government on the economic status of black Americans.
- Heilig, J. V., Flores, I. W., Barros Souza, A. E., Barry, J. C., & Monroy, S. B. (2019). Considering the ethnoracial and gender diversity of faculty in United States college and university intellectual communities. *Hisp. JL & Pol'y*, 1.
- Heller, D. E. (2002). The role of institutional financial aid in increasing minority student enrollment in a post-Hopwood environment. *Ann Arbor*, 1001, 48109-41259.
- Herskovic, B., & Ramos, J. (2014). Affirmative Action in College Admission: long-run implications for efficiency and inequality. *Mimeo*.

- Hicklin, A. (2007). The effect of race-based admissions in public universities: Debunking the myths about hopwood and proposition 209. *Public Administration Review*, 67(2), 331-340.
- Higham, R., & Shah, A. (2013a). Affirmative action and political economic transformations: Secondary education, indigenous people, and the state in Jharkhand, India. *Focaal*, 2013(65), 80-93.
- Higham, R., & Shah, A. (2013b). Conservative force or contradictory resource? Education and affirmative action in Jharkhand, India. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 43(6), 718-739.
- Hinks, T. (2009). Job Satisfaction and Employment Equity in South Africa. *Journal of African Economies*, 19(2), 237-255. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jae/ejp019>
- Hinrichs, P. (2012). The effects of affirmative action bans on college enrollment, educational attainment, and the demographic composition of universities. *Review of Economics and Statistics*, 94(3), 712-722.
- Hinrichs, P. (2014). Affirmative action bans and college graduation rates. *Economics of Education Review*, 42, 43-52.
- Holzer, H. (1996). *Employer hiring decisions and antidiscrimination policy*. Institute for Research on Poverty, University of Wisconsin-Madison.
- Holzer, H., & Neumark, D. (1999). Are affirmative action hires less qualified? Evidence from employer-employee data on new hires. *Journal of Labor Economics*, 17(3), 534-569.
- Horwitz, F. M., & Jain, H. (2011). An assessment of employment equity and Broad Based Black Economic Empowerment developments in South Africa. *Equality, Diversity and Inclusion: An International Journal*, 30(4), 297-317. <https://doi.org/10.1108/02610151111135750>
- House-Soremekun, B. (2007). The impact of minority set-aside programs on black business success in Cleveland, Ohio: Implications for public policy. *W. New Eng. L. Rev.*, 30, 19.
- Howard, L. L., & Prakash, N. (2012). Do employment quotas explain the occupational choices of disadvantaged minorities in India? *International Review of Applied Economics*, 26(4), 489-513.
- Htun, M. (2016). *Inclusion without representation in Latin America: Gender quotas and ethnic reservations*. Cambridge University Press.
- Hughes, M. (2014). Quota design and the political representation of women from indigenous and tribal groups. *Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies Research Paper No. RSCAS*, 105.
- Hughes, M. M. (2011). Intersectionality, quotas, and minority women's political representation worldwide. *American Political Science Review*, 105(3), 604-620.
- Hutchins, M., & Sigelman, L. (1981). Black employment in state and local governments. *Social Science Quarterly*, 62(1), 79.
- Iyer, P., Rolleston, C., & Huong, V. T. T. (2021). Equitable, quality education for ethnic minority students? A case of "positive deviance" in vietnam. *Comparative Education Review*, 65(3), 467-492.
- Jain, H., & Lawler, J. (2004). Visible minorities under the Canadian employment equity act, 1987-1999. *Relations industrielles/Industrial relations*, 59(3), 585-611.
- Jain, H. C., Singh, P., & Agocs, C. (2000). Recruitment, selection and promotion of visible-minority and aboriginal police officers in selected Canadian police services. *Canadian Public Administration*, 43(1), 46-74.
- Jencks, C. (1985). Affirmative action for blacks: Past, present, and future. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 28(6), 731-760.
- Joshua, S., Loromeke, R. E., & Olanrewaju, I. P. (2014). Quota System, Federal Character Principle and Admission to Federal Unity. *International journal of interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary studies (IJIMS)* 2(2).
- Kaletski, E., & Prakash, N. (2016). Does political reservation for minorities affect child labor? Evidence from India. *World Development*, 87, 50-69.
- Kalev, A., Dobbin, F., & Kelly, E. (2006). Best Practices or Best Guesses? Assessing the Efficacy of Corporate Affirmative Action and Diversity Policies. *American Sociological Review*, 71(4), 589-617. <https://doi.org/10.1177/000312240607100404>

- Kataka, J. K. (2014). The quota system of education and its influence on national unity: A study of the Catholic University of Eastern Africa. *Education Journal*, 3(5), 278-292.
- Khanna, G. (2020). Does Affirmative Action Incentivize Schooling? Evidence from India. *The Review of Economics and Statistics*, 102(2), 219-233. https://doi.org/10.1162/rest_a_00848
- Kroeber, C. (2017). Exploring the impact of reserved seat design on the quality of minority representation. *Ethnopolitics*, 16(2), 196-216.
- Kumar, D., Pratap, B., & Aggarwal, A. (2019). Affirmative Action in Government Jobs in India: Did the Job Reservation Policy Benefit Disadvantaged Groups? *Journal of Asian and African Studies*, 55(1), 145-160. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0021909619871588>
- Leal, G. S., & Choi Mendizábal, Á. B. (2021). Racial quotas in higher education and pre-college academic performance: Evidence from Brazil. *UB Economics—Working Papers*, 2021, E21/411.
- Lee, A. (2021). Does Affirmative Action Work? Evaluating India's Quota System. *Comparative Political Studies*, 54(9), 1534-1564. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0010414021989755>
- Lee, H.-A. (2012). Affirmative action in Malaysia: Education and employment outcomes since the 1990s. *Journal of Contemporary Asia*, 42(2), 230-254.
- Lee, H.-A. (2015). Affirmative action in Malaysia and South Africa: contrasting structures, continuing pursuits. *Journal of Asian and African Studies*, 50(5), 615-634.
- Lee, H.-A. (2020a). *Affirmative action in Malaysia and South Africa: Preference for parity (Ch. 7)*. Routledge.
- Lee, H.-A. (2020b). *Affirmative action in Malaysia and South Africa: Preference for parity (Ch. 8)*. Routledge.
- Lee, J. H. (2021). Policy and ideology collide: an examination of affirmative action for students of Brazilian public higher education. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 24(1), 39-55.
- Lee, L. M. (2021). Affirmative Inaction: A Quantitative Analysis of Progress Toward "Critical Mass" in US Legal Education. *Michigan Law Review*, 119(5).
- Leonard, J. S. (1984). The Impact of Affirmative Action on Employment. *Journal of Labor Economics*, 2(4), 439-463. <https://doi.org/10.1086/298041>
- Lerner, R., & Nagai, A. K. (2000). Reverse discrimination by the numbers. *Academic Questions*, 13(3), 71.
- Lin, Y. (2013). *Does Elimination of Affirmative Action Affect Postsecondary Admission and Earnings? Evidence from California*. https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Yuxin-Lin-5/publication/320022096_Does_Elimination_of_Affirmative_Action_Affect_Postsecondary_Admission_and_Earnings_Evidence_from_California/links/59c93454a6fdcc451d545712/Does-Elimination-of-Affirmative-Action-Affect-Postsecondary-Admission-and-Earnings-Evidence-from-California.pdf
- Loncar, J. (2013). *Political representation of national minorities: a case study of minority parties in Serbia* [University of York].
- Lublin, D., & Wright, M. (2013). Engineering inclusion: Assessing the effects of pro-minority representation policies. *Electoral Studies*, 32(4), 746-755. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.electstud.2013.06.001>
- Mazibuko, J. V., & Govender, K. K. (2017). Exploring workplace diversity and organisational effectiveness: A South African exploratory case study. *SA Journal of Human Resource Management*, 15, 10.
- McCrary, J. (2007). The effect of court-ordered hiring quotas on the composition and quality of police. *American Economic Review*, 97(1), 318-353.
- McCrudden, C., Ford, R., & Heath, A. (2004). Legal regulation of affirmative action in Northern Ireland: an empirical assessment. *Oxford Journal of Legal Studies*, 24(3), 363-415.
- McCrudden, C., Muttarak, R., Hamill, H., & Heath, A. (2009). Affirmative action without quotas in Northern Ireland. *The Equal Rights Review*, 4, 7-14.
- Mehmet, O., & Hoong, Y. Y. (1985). An empirical evaluation of government scholarship policy in Malaysia. *Higher Education*, 14(2), 197-210. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00137484>
- Merritt, D. J., & Reskin, B. F. (1997). Sex, race, and credentials: The truth about affirmative action in law faculty hiring. *Colum. L. Rev.*, 97, 199.
- Mickey-Pabello, D., & Garces, L. M. (2018). Addressing racial health inequities: Understanding the impact of affirmative action bans on applications and admissions in medical schools. *American Journal of Education*, 125(1), 79-108.

- Mitchell-Walthour, G. (2015). Afro-Brazilian support for affirmative action. In *Race, politics, and education in Brazil* (pp. 133-153). Springer.
- Molnár, G. (2017). Capability building combined with microcredit: the loan alone is insufficient. *Journal of Social Entrepreneurship*, 8(3), 354-374. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19420676.2017.1371632>
- Mustapha, A. R. (2009). Institutionalising ethnic representation: How effective is affirmative action in Nigeria? *Journal of International Development*, 21(4), 561-576. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jid.1573>
- Muttarak, R., Hamill, H., Heath, A., & McCrudden, C. (2012). Does Affirmative Action Work? Evidence from the Operation of Fair Employment Legislation in Northern Ireland. *Sociology*, 47(3), 560-579. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0038038512453799>
- Naff, K. C., & Kellough, J. E. (2003). Ensuring employment equity: Are federal diversity programs making a difference? *International Journal of Public Administration*, 26(12), 1307-1336.
- Niemann, Y. F., & Dovidio, J. F. (2005). Affirmative action and job satisfaction: Understanding underlying processes. *Journal of Social Issues*, 61(3), 507-523.
- Omeje, J. C., Egwa, E. I., & Adikwu, V. O. (2016). Impact of Quota System and Catchment Area Policy on the University Admissions in North Central Nigeria. *SAGE Open*, 6(2). <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244016654951>
- Orfield, G., & Whitley, D. (2001). Diversity and Legal Education: Student Experiences in Leading Law Schools. In G. Orfield (Ed.), *Diversity challenged: Evidence on the impact of affirmative action* (pp. 143-174). Harvard Education Publishing Group, Harvard Graduate School of Education.
- Osorio, R. G. (2012). The Persistence of Black-White Income Differentials in Brazil. In G. K. Brown, A. Langer, & F. Stewart (Eds.), *Affirmative action in plural societies: International experiences* (pp. 100-127). Palgrave Macmillan Limited.
- Pande, R. (2003). Can mandated political representation increase policy influence for disadvantaged minorities? Theory and evidence from India. *American Economic Review*, 93(4), 1132-1151.
- Pandey, D. L., & Risal, N. (2021). Effectiveness of Reservation in the Nepalese Civil Service. *Wutan Huatan Jisuan Jishu*, XVII(1), 16-24.
- Pandeya, G. P., & Oyama, T. (2019). The question of equal representation of citizens in the legislature of Nepal: rhetoric and reality. *Asian Journal of Political Science*, 27(1), 45-69.
- Patel, L., & Graham, L. (2012). How broad-based is broad-based black economic empowerment? *Development Southern Africa*, 29(2), 193-207. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0376835x.2012.675692>
- Rasiah, R., & Shari, I. (2001). Market, government and Malaysia's new economic policy. *Cambridge Journal of Economics*, 25(1), 57-78. <https://doi.org/10.1093/cje/25.1.57>
- Ratuva, S. (2013a). Coerced preferences: affirmative action and horizontal inequality in Fiji. In E. T. P. Gomez, Ralph (Ed.), *Affirmative Action, Ethnicity, and Conflict*. Routledge.
- Ratuva, S. (2013b). *Politics of Preferential Development: Trans-global study of affirmative action and ethnic conflict in Fiji, Malaysia and South Africa*. ANU Press. https://doi.org/10.26530/open_459990
- Ravallion, M. (2020a). Ethnic inequality and poverty in Malaysia since May 1969. Part 1: Inequality. *World Development*, 134. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2020.105040>
- Ravallion, M. (2020b). Ethnic inequality and poverty in Malaysia since May 1969. Part 2: Poverty. *World Development*, 134. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2020.105039>
- Ready, T. (2001). The Impact of Affirmative Action on Medical Education and the Nation's Health. In G. Orfield (Ed.), *Diversity challenged: Evidence on the impact of affirmative action* (pp. 205-220). Harvard Education Publishing Group, Harvard Graduate School of Education.
- Rodgers, W. M., & Spriggs, W. E. (1996). The effect of federal contractor status on racial differences in establishment-level employment shares: 1979-1992. *The American Economic Review*, 86(2), 290-293.
- Rothstein, J., & Yoon, A. (2008a). *Affirmative action in law school admissions: What do racial preferences do?*
- Rothstein, J., & Yoon, A. (2008b). *Mismatch in law school*.
- Sabharwal, N. S., Henderson, E. F., & Joseph, R. S. (2020). Hidden social exclusion in Indian academia: gender, caste and conference participation. *Gender and education*, 32(1), 27-42.

- Samii, C. (2013). Perils or Promise of Ethnic Integration? Evidence from a Hard Case in Burundi. *American Political Science Review*, 107(3), 558-573. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0003055413000282>
- Sander, R. H. (2004). A systemic analysis of affirmative action in American law schools. *Stan. L. Rev.*, 57, 367.
- Sautman, B. (1998). Affirmative action, ethnic minorities and China's universities. *Pac. Rim. L. & Pol'y J.*, 7, 77.
- Segawa, N. (2013). Affirmative Action and Nation Building in Malaysia: The Future of Malay Preferential Policies. *African and Asian Studies*, 12(3), 189-214. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1163/15692108-12341262>
- Sheth, D. (2004). *Caste, ethnicity and exclusion in South Asia: the role of affirmative action policies in building inclusive societies*.
- Sifani, J. N. (2009). *The impact of Namibia's affirmative action policy on employment of the designated groups* [The University of Namibia].
- Sowell, T. (1975). Affirmative Action Reconsidered: Was It Necessary. *Washington, D, C: American Enterprise Institute for Public Policy Research*.
- Sunam, R., Pariyar, B., & Shrestha, K. K. (2021). Does affirmative action undermine meritocracy? "Meritocratic inclusion" of the marginalized in Nepal's bureaucracy. *Development Policy Review*, 40(1). <https://doi.org/10.1111/dpr.12554>
- Sunam, R., & Shrestha, K. (2019). Failing the most excluded: a critical analysis of Nepal's affirmative action policy. *Contributions to Nepalese Studies*, 46(2), 283-305.
- Surdu, M., & Szira, J. (2009). Analysis of the impact of affirmative action for Roma in high schools, vocational schools and universities. *Budapest: Roma Education Fund*. Recuperado de http://www.romaeducationfund.hu/sites/default/files/publications/gallup_romania_eng_lish.pdf.
- Sweet, M. J. (2006). Minority business enterprise programmes in the United States of America: An empirical investigation. *Journal of Law and Society*, 33(1), 160-180.
- Tabatadze, S., & Gorgadze, N. (2013). Evaluation of the Effectiveness of the Quota System in Georgia. *Centre for Civil Integration and Inter-Ethnic Relations (CCIIR)*.
- Tan, N. (2014). Ethnic quotas and unintended effects on women's political representation in Singapore. *International Political Science Review*, 35(1), 27-40.
- Tan, N., & Preece, C. (2021). Ethnic Quotas, Political Representation and Equity in Asia Pacific. *Representation*, 1-25.
- Taylor, M. C. (1994). Impact of Affirmative Action on Beneficiary Groups: Evidence From the 1990 General Social Survey. *Basic and Applied Social Psychology*, 15(1-2), 143-178. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01973533.1994.9646076>
- Turner, C. S. V., Myers Jr, S. L., & Creswell, J. W. (1999). Exploring underrepresentation: The case of faculty of color in the Midwest. *The Journal of Higher Education*, 70(1), 27-59.
- Tzannatos, Z. (1991). Reverse racial discrimination in higher education in Malaysia: Has it reduced inequality and at what cost to the poor? *International Journal of Educational Development*, 11(3), 177-192. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0738-0593\(91\)90018-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/0738-0593(91)90018-4)
- Ukiwo, U. (2007). Education, horizontal inequalities and ethnic relations in Nigeria. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 27(3), 266-281. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2006.10.016>
- Valente, R. R., & Berry, B. J. (2017). Performance of students admitted through affirmative action in Brazil. *Latin American Research Review*, 52(1), 18-34.
- Verbeek, S., & Groeneveld, S. (2012). Do "hard" diversity policies increase ethnic minority representation? *Personnel Review*, 41(5), 647-664. <https://doi.org/10.1108/00483481211249157>
- Vieira, R. S., & Arends-Kuenning, M. (2019). Affirmative action in Brazilian universities: Effects on the enrollment of targeted groups. *Economics of Education Review*, 73. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.econedurev.2019.101931>
- Vollan, K. (2011). Group Representation and the System of Representation in the Constituent Assembly and Future Parliaments of Nepal. *International Journal on Minority and Group Rights*, 18(3), 343-368. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1163/157181111X583323>

- Walker, R. (2000). Indigenous performance in western Australian universities. *EIP, Department of Education, Training and Youth Affairs, Canberra*.
- Waseem, M. (1997). Affirmative action policies in Pakistan. *Ethnic Studies Report*, 15(2), 223-245.
- Welch, S., & Gruhl, J. (1998). *Affirmative action and minority enrollments in medical and law schools*. University of Michigan Press.
- Xaxa, V. (2001). Protective discrimination: Why scheduled tribes lag behind scheduled castes. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 2765-2772.
- Yaffe, J. (1995). Government's Role in the under Representation of Latinas in Public Employment. *The American Review of Public Administration*, 25(4), 303-326.
- Yasuda, N. (1991). Malaysia's New Economic Policy and the Industrial Co-ordination Act. *The Developing Economies*, 29(4), 330-349.
- Yusof, Z. A. (2012). Affirmative action in Malaysia: An overview of progress and limitations. In G. Brown, Langer, A., & Stewart, F. (Eds.). (Ed.), *Affirmative action in plural societies: International experiences* (pp. 128-150).
- Zang, X. (2008). Market Reforms and Han–Muslim Variation in Employment in the Chinese State Sector in a Chinese City. *World Development*, 36(11), 2341-2352.
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2007.11.009>
- Zhao, J., & Lovrich, N. (1998). Determinants of minority employment in American municipal police agencies: The representation of African American officers. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 26(4), 267-277.
- Zoabi, K., & Awad, Y. (2015). The Role of Evaluation in Affirmative Action–Type Programs. In B. Rosenstein & H. Desivilya Syna (Eds.), *Evaluation and Social Justice in Complex Sociopolitical Contexts: New Directions for Evaluation* (pp. 83-93). John Wiley & Sons.
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1002/ev.20122>