

Vlaeminck, Sven

**Article — Published Version**

## Dawning of a New Age? Economics Journals' Data Policies on the Test Bench

LIBER Quarterly: The Journal of the Association of European Research Libraries

*Suggested Citation:* Vlaeminck, Sven (2021) : Dawning of a New Age? Economics Journals' Data Policies on the Test Bench, LIBER Quarterly: The Journal of the Association of European Research Libraries, ISSN 2213-056X, LIBER (Association of European Research Libraries), Den Haag, Vol. 31, Iss. 1, pp. 1–29-,  
<https://doi.org/10.53377/lq.10940> ,  
<https://liberquarterly.eu/article/view/10940/11950>

This Version is available at:

<https://hdl.handle.net/10419/238198>

### Standard-Nutzungsbedingungen:

Die Dokumente auf EconStor dürfen zu eigenen wissenschaftlichen Zwecken und zum Privatgebrauch gespeichert und kopiert werden.

Sie dürfen die Dokumente nicht für öffentliche oder kommerzielle Zwecke vervielfältigen, öffentlich ausstellen, öffentlich zugänglich machen, vertreiben oder anderweitig nutzen.

Sofern die Verfasser die Dokumente unter Open-Content-Lizenzen (insbesondere CC-Lizenzen) zur Verfügung gestellt haben sollten, gelten abweichend von diesen Nutzungsbedingungen die in der dort genannten Lizenz gewährten Nutzungsrechte.

### Terms of use:

*Documents in EconStor may be saved and copied for your personal and scholarly purposes.*

*You are not to copy documents for public or commercial purposes, to exhibit the documents publicly, to make them publicly available on the internet, or to distribute or otherwise use the documents in public.*

*If the documents have been made available under an Open Content Licence (especially Creative Commons Licences), you may exercise further usage rights as specified in the indicated licence.*



<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

## Appendix A: Codebook and Coding table

### Data collection

The relevant entities for analysing journals' handling with research data are their editorial policies. Most often, these policies are part of the *guide for authors* or *author information*. Some journals also have a specific section on their website in which their demands regarding reproducibility and data disclosure are listed. Sporadically, these instructions were also available in the 'aims and scope' section of the journal website or in the general description.

As some journals do have more than one website (e.g. one website maintained by the publisher and a second one maintained by the editorial office) both web pages have been included in the analysis (if available). The printed versions have not been checked.

The search terms have been used to find expressions within the search locations. If a search term has been found, the entire paragraph was read and interpreted to come to a conclusion regarding the coding. In order to assign a coding to a variable, at least one of the specifications mentioned had to be met. Each variable was dichotomously classified as "mentioned" or "not mentioned in the data policy"

The data policies (Appendix B) were coded several weeks apart. The first coding was done manually in spring 2019, the second in summer 2019. In a third run, only the results that differed in the first two runs have been reviewed again.

### Variables, Definitions and Coding Instructions

| Variable | Definition   | Search location   | Search terms   | Specification and coding rules  | Coding     |
|----------|--|---|--|---|------------|
| empiric  | The journal generally accepts and publishes empirical /data-driven contributions | Section 'aims and scope, general description of the journal, titles of all articles published in up to four issues of the journal | empiric*<br>data*<br>experiment*<br>simulat*<br>econometric*<br>applied* | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Journal states that empirical/data-driven contributions (e.g. econometric or experimental papers or simulations) are welcome.</li> <li>- Journal has published at least one article in the last four issues that can be considered as an empirical/data-driven contribution</li> </ul> | empiric=1  |
|          |  |   |  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- None of the search terms was found AND no empirical contributions in up to the last four published issues were found.</li> <li>- Journal explicitly discourages submissions of empirical /data-driven contributions.</li> </ul>  | empiric= 2 |

S. Vlaeminck: Dawning of a new age? Economics journals' data policies on the test bench

|          |   |  |  |   |  |
|----------|---|--|--|---|--|
| data_pol | The journal has a set of rules that aims to include data used to generate the results of a paper into the reviewing and/or publishing process                         | Guide for authors, author information, duties of author, specific section (data policy or similar) | data disclosure*<br>policy*<br>data availability *<br>replication*<br>research data *<br>reproduc* | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The journal has a set of rules for papers that are based on data or are in other ways empirically oriented. This sets of rules aims to integrate the underlying data into the publication or review process. As such, the journal explicitly asks for or mentions data and other research artefacts.</li> <li>- The set of rules is more than a technical information about the possibility to attach data and other artefacts of the research process to the paper.</li> </ul>  | <p>data_pol= 1</p> <p>otherwise<br/>data_pol=2</p> |
| dap      | The journal has a data availability or data disclosure policy. Accountability for providing data and other artefacts of the research process lies with a third party. | Guide for authors, author information, duties of author, specific section on data policy           | Authors [have to]<br>...send [data]<br>...provide [data]<br>...submit [data]<br>...                | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Journal asks or requires authors to submit data and/or other materials of the research process to a third party (data repository, editorial office, etc.), most often after acceptance/ prior to publication of the article, AND</li> <li>- The responsibility to provide the replication data lies with third parties (data repositories, journal data archives, editorial offices) and <u>not</u> with the author (or his personal or institutional webpage).</li> </ul>   | <p>dap = 1</p> <p>otherwise<br/>dap=2</p>          |
| arp      | The journal has a data policy. Accountability for providing data and other artefacts of the research process lies in the hand of the authors.                         | Guide for authors, author information, duties of author, specific section on data policy           | on request   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Journal asks or requires authors to provide data (and /or other artefacts necessary to understand the research process) to other researchers in cases of upcoming requests.</li> <li>- The responsibility to provide the data to would-be replicators lies with the authors.</li> <li>- In case of upcoming requests for data, authors (in fact) have the power to decide whether the data is provided (or not).</li> <li>- In principle, authors can withdraw or retain the data. Therefore, requests of a data policy to publish data on a personal or an institutional webpages are treated as ARPs.</li> </ul> | <p>arp=1</p> <p>otherwise<br/>dap=2</p>            |

S. Vlaeminck: Dawning of a new age? Economics journals' data policies on the test bench

|         |  |  |   |   |                                     |
|---------|--|--|---|---|-------------------------------------|
| mandat  | Degree of obligation of the data policy (voluntary/ mandatory)       | Guide for authors, author information, duties of author, specific section on data policy | <p>Authors [...]<br/>                     ...must include<br/>                     ...must provide<br/>                     ...are expected<br/>                     ...are required<br/>                     - as a condition for publication<br/>                     - mandatory<br/>                     - will publish paper only if</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The wording makes it clear that there is an obligation to submit the data specified in the policy</li> <li>- In case of conflicting wordings (e.g. policy includes both the terms 'required' and 'asked'), the strictest wording is decisive for coding.</li> </ul>  | mandat= 1                           |
|         |  | Guide for authors, author information, duties of author, specific section on data policy | <p>Authors [...]<br/>                     ...are asked<br/>                     ...are encouraged<br/>                     ...may<br/>                     ...should<br/>                     ...can</p>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The wording suggests that submission of the data specified is welcomed but not mandatory</li> <li>- In case of conflicting wordings (e.g. policy includes both the terms 'required' and 'asked'), the strictest wording is decisive for coding.</li> </ul>   | mandat =2                           |
| dataset | The policy explicitly mentions data(sets) which should be provided   | Guide for authors, author information, duties of author, specific section on data policy | Data<br>dataset(s)<br>data set  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The wording clarifies that data or datasets are requested to enable others to validate and reproduce the results.</li> <li>- The request is more than just a technical possibility to submit datasets. It is a recommendation or requirement to submit data to support reproducibility of published research.</li> </ul> | data = 1                            |
| code    | The policy explicitly mentions program code which should be provided | Guide for authors, author information, duties of author, specific section on data policy | code<br>script<br>syntax files<br>software<br>computation<br>program<br>configuration files<br>command files  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The policy mentions a recommendation to provide program code (see list of search terms on the left).</li> </ul>  | code =1<br><br>otherwise<br>code =2 |
| docu    | The policy mentions descriptions of data and/or of the               | Guide for authors, author information, duties of author,                                 | - documentation [of data/research process]  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The policy states a recommendation or requirement to provide documentations or descriptions of the data and/or of the research process.</li> </ul>   | docu =1<br><br>otherwise            |

S. Vlaeminck: Dawning of a new age? Economics journals' data policies on the test bench

|        |  |  |  |  |  |
|--------|--|--|--|--|--|
|        | research process which should be provided  | specific section on data policy  | - descriptions [of data/research process]<br>- information [on the data/research process]<br>-readme * | - Policy asks for a readme file that is part of the documentation of a data submission. It often lists all files of a data submission and their purpose to reproduce the results of a paper  | docu =2                                |
| interm | The data policy asks for intermediate datasets that have been created during the research process. Intermediate datasets provide more information and transparency of the research process than the final dataset. | Guide for authors, author information, duties of author, specific section on data policy | -Intermediate [datasets]<br>-Interim [datasets]  | - The policy recommends providing intermediate steps of the research process (e.g. raw data, dataset before cleaning, program code used to work up the data) and/or invites authors to do so.  | interim =1<br><br>otherwise interim =2 |
| proced | Journal has specific rules for research based on restricted data. These rules should facilitate reproduction of published results, despite data may not be published due to legal reasons.                         | Guide for authors, author information, duties of author, specific section on data policy | Exemption<br>Exception<br>Proprietary [data]<br>Restricted [data]<br>Confidential [data]               | - The text mentions a procedure that should be fulfilled in the event the author has used restricted (proprietary or protected) data. Such a procedure could be to provide the program code and/or descriptions (e.g. codebook), a contact address to access the data, and access conditions for the data.<br>- The policy mentions a procedure, not only the recommendation, to get in touch with the editorial office in such cases. | proced = 1<br><br>otherwise proced =2  |
|        |  |  |  | - The policies does not mention the case of restricted data at all, OR<br>- The policy notes that authors have to contact the editor to get an exception from the data policy (even when they have to submit a formal request/sheet/document to get  | proced = 2                             |

S. Vlaeminck: Dawning of a new age? Economics journals' data policies on the test bench

|         |   |  |  |   |  |
|---------|---|--|--|---|--|
|         |   |  |  | <p>an exception). In the event an exception has been granted, author do not have to provide any additional information on the data and of their calculations.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- After granting an exception, authors of such papers are exempted from the data policy and no additional procedure is mentioned or requested.</li> </ul>  |  |
| statem  | A brief notice on the availability of the data source(s) that has been used to furnish the results of the research article. | Guide for authors, author information, duties of author, specific section on data policy | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- statement *</li> <li>- Data [*] statement</li> <li>- statement of data availability</li> </ul>            | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The policy explicitly lists the requirement or asks to submit a statement regarding the availability of the underlying data. It is not important if the publisher offers a template, or if authors have to write a statement on their own.</li> <li>- The notification of the editors in the event authors have employed restricted data is <u>not</u> a data statement, as it only covers one potential scenario of data availability.</li> </ul> | <p>statem =1</p> <p>otherwise<br/>statem =2</p>        |
| deposit | Journal's recommendation or request on how to provide the data (by which means)   | Guide for authors, author information, duties of author, specific section on data policy | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-Repository</li> <li>-Personal/institutional website</li> <li>-Data archive</li> <li>-On request</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The data policy makes a statement about the way in which the data is published or shared (these recommendations are listed in the order in which they are mentioned on the webpage of the journal)</li> </ul>  | <p>Enter<br/>recommendations<br/>(string variable)</p> |

The variables <journal\_title> and < publisher> are not covered by the codebook, as this information is simply copied from the journal websites.