

A Service of

ZBW

Leibniz-Informationszentrum Wirtschaft Leibniz Information Centre for Economics

Protsch, Paula; Solga, Heike

Article — Published Version Going across Europe for an apprenticeship? A factorial survey experiment on employers' hiring preferences in Germany

Journal of European Social Policy

Provided in Cooperation with: WZB Berlin Social Science Center

Suggested Citation: Protsch, Paula; Solga, Heike (2017) : Going across Europe for an apprenticeship? A factorial survey experiment on employers' hiring preferences in Germany, Journal of European Social Policy, ISSN 1461-7269, Sage, London, Vol. 27, Iss. 4, pp. 387-399, https://doi.org/10.1177/0958928717719200

This Version is available at: https://hdl.handle.net/10419/182562

Standard-Nutzungsbedingungen:

Die Dokumente auf EconStor dürfen zu eigenen wissenschaftlichen Zwecken und zum Privatgebrauch gespeichert und kopiert werden.

Sie dürfen die Dokumente nicht für öffentliche oder kommerzielle Zwecke vervielfältigen, öffentlich ausstellen, öffentlich zugänglich machen, vertreiben oder anderweitig nutzen.

Sofern die Verfasser die Dokumente unter Open-Content-Lizenzen (insbesondere CC-Lizenzen) zur Verfügung gestellt haben sollten, gelten abweichend von diesen Nutzungsbedingungen die in der dort genannten Lizenz gewährten Nutzungsrechte.

Terms of use:

Documents in EconStor may be saved and copied for your personal and scholarly purposes.

You are not to copy documents for public or commercial purposes, to exhibit the documents publicly, to make them publicly available on the internet, or to distribute or otherwise use the documents in public.

If the documents have been made available under an Open Content Licence (especially Creative Commons Licences), you may exercise further usage rights as specified in the indicated licence.



WWW.ECONSTOR.EU

<Appendix main head>Online Appendix

<Appendix sub head>Details on the Factorial Survey Experiment <Appendix sub sub head>Rating scale and distribution of vignette ratings Besides the wide-ranging scale from 1 (very unlikely) to 10 (very likely), we implemented a random order of vignettes presented to each respondent, including the possibility to go back and forth while rating the vignettes and to correct ratings. This approach helps to avoid ratings disproportionally placed at the bottom or top-end of a rating scale (censored responses), although the respondent actually would have wanted to differentiate their ratings more (Auspurg and Hinz, 2015: 66f.). Figure A1 shows that respondents took the rating task seriously and differentiated their ratings across the entire scale. We are thus confident to treat the employer ratings as our metric dependent variable.

<Figure A1 near here>

<Figure starts>

<Figure head – goes below figure>Figure A1 Distribution of vignette ratings (N: 3289)



Employer ratings from 1 (very unlikely) to 10 (very likely) that applicant would be invited for follow-up selection stage

Source: BIBB Training Panel 2014 (doi:10.7803/371.14.1.2.10), authors' own calculations.

</Figure ends>

<Appendix sub sub head>Sampling of vignettes

A d-efficient sample of vignettes was drawn from the so-called vignette universe to be distributed into sets of five vignettes (for details, see Auspurg and Hinz, 2015: 16ff.). This approach allows for estimating the effects of each dimension and their interactions independently. Vignettes displaying immigrant descendants and fluent German-speaking newcomers are oversampled to reach more precise estimates of the expected smaller difference between these two groups. Since discrimination might be partly responsible for gender inequalities, we decided to vary the vignette persons' sex only between respondents. In total, a sample of 125 vignettes distributed into 25 sets of five was multiplied by two, resulting in a total of 50 different vignette sets (25 sets with male and 25 sets with female applicants only). These vignettes sets were randomly assigned to the employers. Furthermore, the order in which the vignettes were presented was randomized within each respondent to control for potential order effects.

<Appendix sub sub head>Test of randomization and regression techniques Our data set consists of variable and controls at the vignette level and the firm level (see Table A1) and each respondent rated five vignettes. To account for this nested data structure, we estimated linear multi-level regression models. Table A2 shows that the randomization of vignette sets was successful because correlations between vignette-level and firm-level variables are negligible. Accordingly, regression estimates differ only minimally between models with or without firm-level variables or firm fixed-effects (see Table 2 in the main document). All findings discussed are based on random-intercept models including all control variables to account for any remaining correlations with respect to the vignette dimensions but more importantly for the correlations between the firm-level controls and the training-strategy variable.

<Tables A1 to A5 near here>

<Table starts>

<Table head – goes before table>**Table A1** Descriptive statistics of vignettelevel and firm-level predictors

	N:	
Vignette dimensions and their levels	Vignettes	Per cent
1. Immigrant group		
Immigrant descendants	1,033	31.4
Newcomer, German: fluent	977	29.7
Newcomer, German: intermediate	643	19.6
Newcomer, German: basic	636	19.3
2. Education type & level		
Intermediate secondary school degree	537	16.3
Upper secondary school degree	548	16.7
School-based training/technical occupation	553	16.8
School-based training/sales & accounting	549	16.7
occupation		
Bachelor's degree/engineering	547	16.6
Bachelor's degree/business economics	555	16.9
3 Gender		
Male	1.587	48.3
Female	1,702	51.7

4. Relatives live in town		
Yes	1,702	51.8
No information on relatives	1,587	48.2
5. Applicant will apply for additional financial		
support		
Yes	1,663	50.6
No information on additional support	1,626	49.4
	3289	
Firm-level variables	N:	_
	Employers	Percent
6. Type of occupation		
Male-dominated (percentage of male		
apprentices \geq 70)	338	51.1
Non male-dominated (percentage of male		10.0
apprentices < (0)	323	48.9
7 Decien		
1. Region	170	20.0
East Germany Including Berlin	1/8	∠0.9 70
vvesi Germany	483	13
8 Economic soctor		
Agriculture production construction	286	13 3
Sales maintenance business support and other	200	+J.J
services	265	40 1
Public sector education medical and care	110	16.6
		10.0
9. Firm size		
1 to 19 employees	158	23.9
20 to 99 employees	185	28
100 to 199 employees	87	13.2
200 and more employees	231	35
······································		
10. Training strategy		
High post-apprenticeship hiring rate: >= 75% of		
graduates hired	338	51.1
Low post-apprenticeship hiring rate: <75% of		
graduates hired	323	48.9

	661
Source: BIBB Training Panel 2014 (doi:10.7803/37	(1 1 1 1 2 10) authors' own

Source: BIBB Training Panel 2014 (doi:10.7803/371.14.1.2.10), authors' own calculations. </Table ends>

<Table head – goes before table>Table A2 Correlations of vignette dimensions and firm-level variables

	Vignett	e-level v	ariables			Firm-level variables				
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
1 Immigrant group	1									
2 Gender	-0.005	1								
3 Education	-0.006	0.004	1							
4 Relatives in town	-0.013	0.006	0.012	1						
5 Financial support	-0.103	-0.002	0.021	-0.001	1					
6 Firm size	-0.009	-0.040	-0.006	0.009	0.007	1				
7 Economic sector	0.000	-0.007	-0.006	-0.012	-0.005	0.030	1			
8 Region	-0.006	-0.084	-0.020	-0.006	0.007	-0.018	-0.010	1		
9 Type of occupation	0.016	0.032	-0.002	0.014	0.005	-0.029	-0.461	0.125	1	
10 Training strategy	0.010	0.021	-0.003	0.007	-0.007	0.439	-0.073	-0.081	-0.047	1
	· –									

Source: BIBB Training Panel 2014 (doi:10.7803/371.14.1.2.10), authors' own calculations.

</Table ends>

<Table head – goes before table>**Table A3** Interaction of applicants' immigrant group and education: linear random-intercept model

Model A3 coefficientseImmigrant group (ref. immigrant descendant)-0.96***0.25Newcomer, German: intermediate-2.51***0.32Newcomer, German: intermediate sec. school degree)-2.59***0.32Education type & level (ref. intermediate sec. school degree)-0.66**0.26School-based training/technical occupation-0.290.26School-based training/sales & accounting occupation-0.59**0.25Bachelor's degree/engineering-2.25***0.24Interaction: Immigrant group x education-1.23***0.24Newcomer, German: fluent x-1.23***0.24Upper secondary school degree0.75**0.38School-based training/technical occupation0.250.36School-based training/technical occupation0.250.36School-based training/sales & accounting0.540.38occupation0.24Bachelor's degree/engineering1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/business economics0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate xUpper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/sales & accounting0.91**0.45occupation0.380.46Bachelor's degree/engineering2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic xUpper secondary school degree0.1140.45School-based training/	roup and education. Intear random-intercept model		
Immigrant group (ref. immigrant descendant)seImmigrant group (ref. immigrant descendant)-0.96***0.25Newcomer, German: intermediate-2.51***0.32Newcomer, German: basic-2.59***0.32Education type & level (ref. intermediate sec. school degree)-2.59***0.32Upper secondary school degree-0.66**0.26School-based training/technical occupation-0.290.26School-based training/sales & accounting-0.59**0.25occupation-2.25****0.26Bachelor's degree/engineering-2.25****0.26Bachelor's degree/business economics-1.23***0.24Interaction: Immigrant group x education0.250.36Newcomer, German: fluent xUpper secondary school degree0.75**0.38occupation0.250.360.540.38occupation0.540.380.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate xUpper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/sales & accounting0.320.45occupation0.320.440.38occupation0.320.440.45Bachelor's degree/engineering0.320.44School-based training/sales & accounting0.320.44Newcomer, German: intermediate xUpper secondary school degree0.600.44Newcomer, German: intermediate xUpper secondary school degree0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.600.440.4		Model A3	
Immigrant group (ref. immigrant descendant) Newcomer, German: fluent-0.96*** -2.51***0.25 -2.51***Newcomer, German: intermediate-2.51***0.32Newcomer, German: basic-2.59***0.32Education type & level (ref. intermediate sec. school degree)-0.66**0.26Upper secondary school degree-0.66**0.290.26School-based training/sales & accounting occupation-0.59**0.25Bachelor's degree/business economics-1.23***0.24Interaction: Immigrant group x education Newcomer, German: fluent x Upper secondary school degree0.75**0.38Occupation-2.250.360.540.38School-based training/technical occupation Bachelor's degree/business economics0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate x Upper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/technical occupation Bachelor's degree/business economics0.320.45occupation0.320.450.38occupation0.320.450.32bachelor's degree/business economics0.310.45occupation0.320.440.45bachelor's degree/business economics0.380.46Newcomer, German: intermediate x Upper secondary school degree0.140.45occupation0.380.460.380.44Newcomer, German: basic x Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation School-based training/sales & accounting0.		coefficient	se
Newcomer, German: fluent-0.96***0.25Newcomer, German: intermediate-2.51***0.32Newcomer, German: basic-2.59***0.32Education type & level (ref. intermediate sec. school-2.59***0.32Upper secondary school degree-0.66**0.26School-based training/technical occupation-0.59**0.25Bachelor's degree/engineering-2.25***0.26Bachelor's degree/business economics-1.23***0.24Interaction: Immigrant group x education0.75**0.38Newcomer, German: fluent x0.540.38Upper secondary school degree0.75**0.38School-based training/technical occupation0.540.38occupation0.540.38occupation0.220.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.91**0.45Upper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45School-based training/sales & accounting0.91**0.45occupationBachelor's degree/business economics0.380.46Newcomer, German: basic xUpper secondary school degree0.140.45OccupationBachelor's degree/engineering0.380.46School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44Occupation0.230.450.230.45School	Immigrant group (ref. immigrant descendant)		
Newcomer, German: intermediate-2.51***0.32Newcomer, German: basic-2.51***0.32Education type & level (ref. intermediate sec. school-2.59***0.32Upper secondary school degree-0.66**0.26School-based training/stechnical occupation-0.290.26School-based training/sales & accounting-0.59**0.25occupation-0.59**0.26Bachelor's degree/engineering-2.25***0.26Bachelor's degree/business economics-1.23***0.24Interaction: Immigrant group x education-1.23***0.24Newcomer, German: fluent x0.550.36School-based training/sales & accounting0.540.38occupationBachelor's degree/business economics0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.590.44Upper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/sales & accounting0.320.45occupationBachelor's degree/business economics0.320.45bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.230.45Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/sales & accounting0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.2	Newcomer German: fluent	-0.96***	0 25
Newcomer, German: basic Education type & level (ref. intermediate sec. school degree)-2.59***0.32Upper secondary school degree School-based training/technical occupation Bachelor's degree/business economics Interaction: Immigrant group x education Newcomer, German: fluent x Upper secondary school degree School-based training/technical occupation School-based training/technical occupation Newcomer, German: fluent x Upper secondary school degree School-based training/technical occupation School-based training/technical occupation Bachelor's degree/business economics Newcomer, German: intermediate x Upper secondary school degree School-based training/technical occupation School-based training/technical occupation School-based training/technical occupation School-based training/technical occupation School-based training/technical occupation School-based training/sales & accounting O.120.120.32Occupation Bachelor's degree/business economics School-based training/technical occupation School-based training/technical occupation School-based training/technical occupation School-based training/technical occupation School-based training/technical occupation School-based training/sales & accounting O.230.44Occupation Bachelor's degree/business economics School-based training/sales & accounting O.120.140.45Occupation Bachelor's degree/business economics School-based training/sales & accounting O.230	Newcomer, German: intermediate	-2 51***	0.32
LosLosEducation type & level (ref. intermediate sec. school degree)-0.66**0.26Upper secondary school degree-0.66**0.290.26School-based training/technical occupation-0.59**0.25Bachelor's degree/engineering-2.25***0.24Interaction: Immigrant group x education-1.23***0.24Newcomer, German: fluent x-1.23***0.24Upper secondary school degree0.75**0.38School-based training/technical occupation0.250.36School-based training/technical occupation0.250.36School-based training/technical occupation0.540.38occupation0.540.38occupation0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.120.37Upper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45occupation0.320.450.60Bachelor's degree/pusiness economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.600.44Mexcomer, German: basic x0.380.46Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/technical occupation0.380.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.120.44Machelor's degree/business economics0.120.44School-based trainin	Newcomer, German: hasic	-2 59***	0.32
Labelation (p) of a forely (c) meanine labelation (c) (c)degree)Upper secondary school degree-0.66**0.26School-based training/sales & accounting-0.59**0.25occupation-2.25***0.26Bachelor's degree/engineering-2.25***0.26Bachelor's degree/business economics-1.23***0.24Interaction: Immigrant group x educationNewcomer, German: fluent x-1.23***0.24Wpper secondary school degree0.75**0.380.540.38occupation0.540.380.540.38occupation1.28***0.380.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate xUpper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/sales & accounting0.320.45occupationSchool-based training/technical occupation0.320.45Bachelor's degree/pusiness economics0.320.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45occupation2.30***0.440.60Bachelor's degree/pusiness economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic xUpper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44Newcomer, German: basic xUpper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/sales & accounting0.320.44<	Education type & level (ref_intermediate sec_school	2.00	0.02
Upper secondary school degree-0.66**0.26School-based training/technical occupation-0.59**0.25School-based training/sales & accounting-0.59**0.25occupation-2.25***0.26Bachelor's degree/engineering-2.25***0.26Bachelor's degree/business economics-1.23***0.24Interaction: Immigrant group x education0.250.38Newcomer, German: fluent x0.250.36School-based training/technical occupation0.250.36School-based training/sales & accounting0.540.38occupation1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/engineering1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/business economics0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.590.44Upper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/sales & accounting0.320.45occupation0.320.45Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44Occupation0.120.440.23Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Cocupation0.120.440.	degree)		
School-based training/technical occupation-0.290.26School-based training/sales & accounting occupation-0.59**0.25Bachelor's degree/engineering-2.25***0.26Bachelor's degree/business economics-1.23***0.24Interaction: Immigrant group x education-2.25***0.26Newcomer, German: fluent x-1.23***0.24Upper secondary school degree0.75**0.38School-based training/technical occupation0.250.36School-based training/sales & accounting0.540.38occupation1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/business economics0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.590.44Upper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45occupation0.320.45Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.590.44Upper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/sales & accounting0.91**0.45occupation0.380.440.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation0.120.440.23Bachelor's degree/pagineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.20.45	Upper secondary school degree	-0 66**	0.26
School-based training/selminal obsequation0.25School-based training/selminal obsequation-0.59**Bachelor's degree/engineering-2.25***Bachelor's degree/business economics-1.23***Interaction: Immigrant group x education-1.23***Newcomer, German: fluent x0.25Upper secondary school degree0.75**School-based training/technical occupation0.25Bachelor's degree/engineering0.25Bachelor's degree/engineering1.28***Bachelor's degree/engineering1.28***Bachelor's degree/business economics0.12Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.91**Upper secondary school degree0.59Occupation0.32Bachelor's degree/engineering0.32Bachelor's degree/business economics0.32Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.60Upper secondary school degree0.60Occupation0.32Bachelor's degree/engineering0.32Bachelor's degree/engineering0.38Occupation0.14Bachelor's degree/business economics0.60Newcomer, German: basic x0.14Upper secondary school degree0.14Occupation0.38Bachelor's degree/engineering0.12Bachelor's degree/engineering0.12Bachelor's degree/engineering0.23Occupation0.22Bachelor's degree/engineering0.23Dachelor's degree/engineering0.23Dachelor's degree/engineering0.23<	School-based training/technical occupation	-0.29	0.26
Decoupation0.200.20Bachelor's degree/engineering-2.25***0.26Bachelor's degree/business economics-1.23***0.24Interaction: Immigrant group x educationNewcomer, German: fluent x0.75**0.38Weyper secondary school degree0.75**0.38School-based training/technical occupation0.250.36School-based training/sales & accounting0.540.38occupation1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/engineering1.28***0.37Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.120.37Upper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/sales & accounting0.91**0.45occupation2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering2.30***0.44Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45occupation0.320.450.60Bachelor's degree/engineering0.380.46School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.14Occupation0.120.440.45School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44Occupation0.230.450.23Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2 <td>School-based training/teelinieal cooupting</td> <td>-0 59**</td> <td>0.20</td>	School-based training/teelinieal cooupting	-0 59**	0.20
Bachelor's degree/engineering-2.25***0.26Bachelor's degree/business economics-1.23***0.24Interaction: Immigrant group x educationNewcomer, German: fluent x0.75**0.38School-based training/technical occupation0.250.36School-based training/sales & accounting0.540.38occupation1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/engineering1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/business economics0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.91**0.45Upper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45School-based training/sales & accounting0.91**0.45occupation2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.120.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation0.230.45Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering0.230.45Log likelihood-77	occupation	0.00	0.20
Bachelor's degree/business economics-1.23***0.24Interaction: Immigrant group x education-1.23***0.24Newcomer, German: fluent x0.250.36School-based training/technical occupation0.250.36School-based training/sales & accounting0.540.38occupation1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/engineering1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/business economics0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.91**0.45Upper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45occupation0.320.450.44Bachelor's degree/engineering2.30***0.44School-based training/sales & accounting0.91**0.45occupation0.600.440.45Newcomer, German: basic x0.120.38Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44Occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44Occupation0.380.460.12Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44Occupation0.230.450.23Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.20.45 <td>Bachelor's degree/engineering</td> <td>-2 25***</td> <td>0.26</td>	Bachelor's degree/engineering	-2 25***	0.26
Interaction: Immigrant group x educationInteraction: Immigrant group x educationNewcomer, German: fluent xUpper secondary school degree0.75**0.38School-based training/technical occupation0.250.36School-based training/sales & accounting0.540.38occupation1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/engineering1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/business economics0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.590.44Upper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45School-based training/sales & accounting0.91**0.45occupation2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation0.320.440.45School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation0.320.440.23Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.20.44	Bachelor's degree/business economics	-1 23***	0.24
Newcomer, German: fluent x0.75**0.38School-based training/technical occupation0.250.36School-based training/sales & accounting0.540.38occupation1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/engineering1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/business economics0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.91**0.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.44School-based training/sales & accounting0.91**0.45occupation2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44Occupation0.380.460.12School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44Occupation0.120.440.23Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2	Interaction: Immigrant group x education	1.20	0.21
Upper secondary school degree0.75**0.38School-based training/technical occupation0.250.36School-based training/sales & accounting0.540.38occupation1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/engineering1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/business economics0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.91**0.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.44School-based training/sales & accounting0.91**0.45occupation2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44Deper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.120.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation0.120.44Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.20.44	Newcomer, German: fluent x		
School-based training/technical occupation0.250.36School-based training/sales & accounting0.540.38occupation1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/engineering1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/business economics0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.590.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45occupation0.320.44Bachelor's degree/engineering2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.120.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.20.45	Lipper secondary school degree	0 75**	0.38
School-based training/common occupation0.200.30School-based training/sales & accounting0.540.38occupation1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/engineering1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/business economics0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.590.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45occupation0.320.44Bachelor's degree/engineering2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation0.120.44Bachelor's degree/engineering0.120.44School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation0.120.440.45Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.20.45	School-based training/technical occupation	0.75	0.00
occupation1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/engineering1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/business economics0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate xUpper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45occupation0.320.45bachelor's degree/engineering2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation0.120.44Bachelor's degree/engineering0.120.44bachelor's degree/engineering0.120.44bachelor's degree/engineering0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2	School-based training/teenmeal occupation	0.20	0.00
Bachelor's degree/engineering1.28***0.38Bachelor's degree/business economics0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.120.37Upper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45School-based training/sales & accounting0.91**0.45occupation2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation0.120.44Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2	occupation	0.04	0.00
Bachelor's degree/business economics0.120.37Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.120.37Upper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45School-based training/sales & accounting0.91**0.45occupation2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation0.120.44Bachelor's degree/engineering0.120.44School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation0.120.440.12bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2	Bachelor's degree/engineering	1 28***	0.38
Newcomer, German: intermediate x0.590.44Upper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45occupation0.91**0.45bachelor's degree/engineering2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation0.120.44bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44occupation0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2	Bachelor's degree/business economics	0.12	0.37
Upper secondary school degree0.590.44School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45School-based training/sales & accounting0.91**0.45occupation2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2	Newcomer, German: intermediate x	0.12	0.07
School-based training/technical occupation0.320.45School-based training/sales & accounting0.91**0.45occupation2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.91**0.45Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2	Upper secondary school degree	0.59	0 44
School-based training/solution0.001**0.45occupation0.91**0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.91**0.45Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation0.120.44Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2-7752.2	School-based training/technical occupation	0.32	0.45
occupation2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2	School-based training/seles & accounting	0.91**	0.45
Bachelor's degree/engineering2.30***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.140.45Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2	occupation		0110
Bachelor's degree/business economics0.600.44Newcomer, German: basic x0.600.44Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2	Bachelor's degree/engineering	2.30***	0.44
Newcomer, German: basic x0.140.45Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2	Bachelor's degree/business economics	0.60	0.44
Upper secondary school degree0.140.45School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2	Newcomer, German: basic x		••••
School-based training/technical occupation0.380.46School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2	Upper secondary school degree	0.14	0.45
School-based training/sales & accounting0.120.44occupation1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2	School-based training/technical occupation	0.38	0.46
occupation1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/engineering0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2	School-based training/sales & accounting	0.12	0.44
Bachelor's degree/engineering1.95***0.44Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2-7752.2	occupation		••••
Bachelor's degree/business economics0.230.45Log likelihood-7752.2	Bachelor's degree/engineering	1.95***	0.44
Log likelihood -7752.2	Bachelor's degree/business economics	0.23	0.45
	Log likelihood	-7752.2	-

sd_employer	1.876
sd_vignette	2.202
Rho	0.421

* p<0.1; ** p<0.05; *** p<0.01; se = standard error.

Dependent variable employer ratings is measured from 1 (very unlikely) to 10 (very likely) that applicants are invited for a follow-up selection stage, model includes all predictors of model 3, Table 2.

Number of observations: 3,289 (vignettes); 661 (employers).

Source: BIBB Training Panel 2014 (doi:10.7803/371.14.1.2.10), authors' own calculations.

</Table ends>

<Table head – goes before table>**Table A4** Interaction of applicants' immigrant group and gender by firms' post-apprenticeship hiring rate; separate linear random-intercept models

	Firms with		Firms with	
	low hiring rate		high hiring rate	
	Model A4a		Model A4b	
	coeff.	se	coeff.	se
Gender (ref. male)	-0.54**	0.29	-1.01***	0.29
Immigrant group (ref. immigrant desce	ndants)			
Newcomer, German: fluent	-0.26	0.20	-0.80***	0.21
Newcomer, German: intermediate	-1.97***	0.22	-1.81***	0.24
Newcomer, German: basic	-2.04***	0.22	-2.52***	0.24
Interaction: Gender x immigrant group				
x Newcomer, German: fluent	-0.21	0.28	0.25	0.30
x intermediate	0.51	0.31	0.13	0.33
x basic	0.06	0.31	0.37	0.33
Log likelihood	-3968.2		-3801.1	
sd_employer	1.963		1.803	
sd_vignette	2.19		2.249	
Rho	0.445		0.391	
N vignettes/employers	1,682	338	1,607	323

* p<0.1; ** p<0.05; *** p<0.01; se = standard error.

Dependent variable employer ratings is measured from 1 (very unlikely) to 10 (very likely) that applicants are invited for a follow-up selection stage, model includes all predictors of model 3, Table 2.

Source: BIBB Training Panel 2014 (doi:10.7803/371.14.1.2.10), authors' own calculations.

</Table ends>

<Table head – goes before table>**Table A5** Employer ratings by the occupations' gender domination; separate linear random-intercept models

	Male-		Non male-	
	dominated		dominat	ed
	occupations		occupat	ions
	coeff.	se	coeff.	se
Vignette-level variables				
Immigrant group (ref. immigrant				
descendant)				
Newcomer, German: fluent	-0.59***	0.14	-0.38***	0.15
Newcomer, German: intermediate	-1.44***	0.15	-1.99***	0.16
Newcomer, German: basic	-1.73***	0.15	-2.60***	0.16
Education type & level (ref.				
intermediate school degree)				
Upper secondary school degree	-0.70***	0.19	0.04	0.20
School-based training/technical	0.10	0.19	-0.30	0.20
occupation				••
School-based training/sales &	-0.76***	0.19	0.27	0.20
accounting occupation			•	••
Bachelor's degree/engineering	-1.26***	0.19	-0.71***	0.20
Bachelor's degree/business	-1.61***	0.18	-0.46**	0.20
economics				0.20
Gender (ref. male)	-1.34***	0.24	-0.03	0.22
Relatives live in town (ref. no	0.09	0.11	0.12	0.11
information)			•••	
Additional financial support (ref. no	-0.09	0.11	-0.29**	0.11
information)		••••	0.20	••••
Firm-level variables				
East Germany (ref. West Germany)	0.21	0.27	0.57**	0.28
Economic sector (ref. agric	•			••
production. construction)				
Sales, maintenance, business	1.12***	0.28	-0.20	0.31
support and other services				
Public sector, education, medical and	0.13	0.50	-0.57*	0.33
care				
Firm size (ref. 1 to 19 employees)				
20 to 99 employees	0.42	0.34	-0.27	0.32
100 to 199 employees	0.55	0.41	-0.19	0.38
200 and more employees	0.31	0.32	0.21	0.31
		-		

High post-apprenticeship hiring rate (ref. no/low hiring)	0.29	0.27	0.10	0.25
Constant	6.74***	0.12	7.85***	0.29
Log likelihood	-		-3797.1	
	3925.03			
sd_employer	1.736		1.960	
sd_vignette	2.236		2.140	
rho	0.376		0.456	
N vignettes/employers	1,677	338	1,612	323

* *p*<0.1; ** *p*<0.05; *** *p*<0.01; se = standard errors.

Dependent variable *employer ratings* is measured from 1 (very unlikely) to 10 (very likely) that applicants are invited for a follow-up selection stage. East Germany includes Berlin.

Source: BIBB Training Panel 2014 (doi:10.7803/371.14.1.2.10), authors' own calculations.

</Table ends>

<notes>

¹ Comparing natives with immigrants is not the focus here. The factorial survey design needed for such a comparison would have required either too large a sample of employers or the deletion of another dimension to be considered, such as applicants' gender.

¹ Information for earlier years was not available to us.

¹ Differentiating the analysis by the occupations' gender domination (see Table A5, online appendix) shows that the gender difference is only significant within the male-dominated occupations – indicating that employer discrimination in male-dominated occupations is a likely explanation.