

A Service of



Leibniz-Informationszentrum Wirtschaft Leibniz Information Centre

Kodila-Tedika, Oasis; Asongu, Simplice A.

#### **Working Paper**

# The Effect of Intelligence on Financial Development: A Cross-Country Comparison

AGDI Working Paper, No. WP/15/002

#### **Provided in Cooperation with:**

African Governance and Development Institute (AGDI), Yaoundé, Cameroon

Suggested Citation: Kodila-Tedika, Oasis; Asongu, Simplice A. (2015): The Effect of Intelligence on Financial Development: A Cross-Country Comparison, AGDI Working Paper, No. WP/15/002, African Governance and Development Institute (AGDI), Yaoundé

This Version is available at: https://hdl.handle.net/10419/123656

#### Standard-Nutzungsbedingungen:

Die Dokumente auf EconStor dürfen zu eigenen wissenschaftlichen Zwecken und zum Privatgebrauch gespeichert und kopiert werden.

Sie dürfen die Dokumente nicht für öffentliche oder kommerzielle Zwecke vervielfältigen, öffentlich ausstellen, öffentlich zugänglich machen, vertreiben oder anderweitig nutzen.

Sofern die Verfasser die Dokumente unter Open-Content-Lizenzen (insbesondere CC-Lizenzen) zur Verfügung gestellt haben sollten, gelten abweichend von diesen Nutzungsbedingungen die in der dort genannten Lizenz gewährten Nutzungsrechte.

#### Terms of use:

Documents in EconStor may be saved and copied for your personal and scholarly purposes.

You are not to copy documents for public or commercial purposes, to exhibit the documents publicly, to make them publicly available on the internet, or to distribute or otherwise use the documents in public.

If the documents have been made available under an Open Content Licence (especially Creative Commons Licences), you may exercise further usage rights as specified in the indicated licence.



# AFRICAN GOVERNANCE AND DEVELOPMENT INSTITUTE

# AGDI Working Paper

# WP/15/002

The Effect of Intelligence on Financial Development: A Cross-Country Comparison

#### Oasis Kodila-Tedika

University of Kinshasa Department of Economics, DRC oasiskodila@yahoo.fr

### Simplice A. Asongu

African Governance and Development Institute, Yaoundé, Cameroon.

E-mail: asongusimplice@yahoo.com

#### **AGDI Working Paper**

#### Research Department

#### The Effect of Intelligence on Financial Development: A Cross-Country Comparison

### Oasis Kodila-Tedika & Simplice A. Asongu<sup>1</sup>

February 2015

#### **Abstract**

We assess the correlations between intelligence and financial development in 123 countries using data averages from 2000-2010. Human capital is measured in terms of IQ, cognitive ability & cognitive skills, while financial development is appreciated both from financial intermediary and stock market development perspectives. Short-term financial measures are private and domestic credits whereas long-term financial indicators include: stock market capitalization, stock market value traded and turnover ratio. The following findings are established. (1) With respect to private credit, the positive correlations of IO and cognitive ability are broadly similar while that of cognitive skills is substantially higher in terms of magnitude. (2) The correlation between intelligence and other financial variables are broadly similar. (3) The underlying findings are broadly confirmed in terms of sign of correlation, though the magnitude of correlation is higher (lower) with the addition of social capital or ethnic fractionalization (institutions or income). (4) When continents are excluded to control for extreme effects, baseline results are confirmed and the following on order of continental importance in financial development is established in increasing magnitude: Africa, Americas, Oceania, Europe & Asia.

JEL Code: E01, G20 I20, I29

Keywords: Financial development, Intelligence, Skill, Human Capital

#### Acknowledgement

We are highly indebted to Ang & Kumar (2014) for sharing their data.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Simplice A. Asongu is Lead economist in the Research Department of the AGDI (<u>asongus@afridev.org</u>).

#### 1. Introduction

Financial development remains fundamental to economic growth. Despite some country-specific (Muchai, 2013) doubts, recent meta-studies have confirmed this mainstream narrative (Asongu, 2015a). The findings are consistent with perspectives of, inter alia: policy evidence (Chapili, 2013; Asongu, 2014a), financial markets (Agbloyor et al., 2015) and nexuses among saving & exports for long-run economic growth (Wang et al., 2012).

While the relationship between finance and growth has been substantially investigated, as far as we know, literature on the finance-KE (Knowledge Economy) nexus is scarce. Given the abundantly documented role of finance in economic growth, investigating the relationship between KE and finance is important since financial intermediation is indispensible for converting saving into long-term investment opportunities.

The nexus between financial development and human capital has not been the object of substantial research focus in theoretical and empirical literature. Arguments can be made to justify the relationship between the two variables. An important human capital enables access to better information, hence, a potential risk mitigating factor (Outrivelle 1999). Human capital is also positively related to savings (Kelly 1980; De Gregorio, 1992; Bernheim et al., 1997). This could be explained by the fact that developed intelligence is associated with long-term horizon planning (Potrafke, 2012). It is within this framework that Jones and Podemska (2010) have established a link between Intellectual Quotient (IQ) and savings (Podemska, 2010).

According to Ukenna et al. (2010), skills and training can better predict human capital (HC) because they affect growth rapidly. Human capital in the financial sector in forms of competent or skilled banking professionals could contribute to enhancing the stability of banks. Evidence on complementarity between HC and financial development is provided by Evans et al. (2002) who have concluded that the former is a crucial component in manpower

development (or human resources) in the growth process. From a microeconomic study viewpoint, education has been established to be an essential component of village bank success in Thailand (Paulson, 2002).

The impact of traditional measurements (such as life expectancy, average schooling years in the primary, second & tertiary levels and life expectancy) have not resulted in a consensus due to issues in data measurement (De la Fuente & Doménech, 2006; Cohen & Soto, 2007). The marginal/negligible role played by output in these indicators of human capital has been criticized by Weede & Kämpf (2002) because of too much reliance on inputs. The criticism has motivated some authors to use evaluation tests of international standard, notably: the Program of International Student Assessment (PISA) and Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS) (HanushekandKimko, 2000; Hanushek & Woessmann, 2008, 2009).

Another current of the literature involving psychologists and Vanhanen (2001, 2002, 2006) has used Intellectual Quotient (IQ) data compiled from many countries. The data which has been employed in many published studies (Lynn & Vanhanen, 2012) is increasingly being used by a growing stream of economists, notably: Weede & Kämpf (2002), Jones & Schneider (2006), Ram (2007), Potrafke (2012), Kodila-Tedika & Kanyama-Kalonda (2014), Kodila-Tedika (2014), Rindermann et al. (2014), Kodila-Tedika & Mustacu (2014) and Kodila-Tedika & Bolito-Losembe (2014). The current data from Lynn, Hanushek & Vanhenenis which is increasingly being improved has recently been updated by Rindermann (2007ab) and Meisenberg & Lynn (2011). The updated data which we use in the present study has been recently employed by Kanyama-Kalonda (2014) and Meisenberg & Lynn, (2012).

By investigating the relationship between intelligence and financial development, the study contributes to existing literature by steering clear of the current finance-KE studies and introducing an intelligence component into the nexus. Moreover, it extends the finance-KE

literature that has been essentially focused on the African continent to a broad sample of 123 countries. In essence, a close relationship between KE and finance has been confirmed by Asongu (2014b), especially with the instrumentality of Intellectual Property Rights (IPRs) (Asongu, 2013a)<sup>2</sup>. Given the apparent linkage between IPRs, KE and IQ, it would be interesting to extend the existing literature by investigating the role of IQ in financial development.

The rest of the study is organised as follows. Section 2 discusses the data and methodology. The empirical analysis and discussion of results are covered in Section 3. Robustness checks are presented in Section 4. We conclude with Section 5.

#### 2. Empirical strategies and data

#### 2.1 *Data*

The study investigates cross-sectional average data between 2000-2010 from 123 countries. The intelligence data sources from Meisenberg & Lynn (2011). This is an update of previous versions found in Lynn & Vanhanen (2002, 2006). This dataset compiles hundreds of national IQ test averages during the 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> centuries using the best methods of practice. Average IQ measures both the nation's labor quality and general-purpose human capital (Jones & Schneider, 2006; Hanushek & Kimko, 2000).

The recent dataset has the appeal of including more nations as well as a composite indicator of intelligence in human capital form.

Three indicators of intelligence are taken into account: the measurement of IQ from Lynn & Vanhanen: an indicator for which missing values are completed with school achievement and a measure of human capital that is a composite indicator for school

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The interested reader can find more literature on KE and financial sector competition in Asongu (2014c, 2015b).

achievement and IQ. However, given that the measurement of the first is a sub-set of the second, we restrict the analysis exclusively to the second and third measures.

The dependent variables consist of proxies in financial intermediary or short-run financial development and stock market development or long-term financial development. The former is measured by private sector credit and domestic credit which are proxies of financial activity (Asongu, 2013b). It is important to note that domestic credit comprises of credit from both private and public sectors. The latter or stock market variable includes: stock market capitalization, stock market value traded and stock market turnover ratio. These variables from Ang & Kumar (2014) are consistent with the underlying stock market performance/development literature (Asongu, 2012, 2013c).

The control variables include: credit rights, trade openness, financial openness, interactions between trade openness and financial openness, legal origins (British, French, German & Scandinavian), religions (Catholic, Muslim & Protestants), latitude and tropics. These variables which are from Ang & Kumar (2014) are defined in the appendix alongside information on their corresponding sources. We discuss the expected signs concurrently with the estimations in the results sections.

#### 2.1. Empirical specification

Consistent with Ang & Kumar (2014), the specification in Eq. (1) below investigates the effect of intelligence or Human capital (HC) on financial development (FD) across 123 countries.

$$FD_i = \alpha_1 + \alpha_2 HC_i + \alpha_3 X_i + \varepsilon_i \quad (1)$$

Where:  $FD_i(HC_i)$  represents a financial development (human capital) indicator for country i  $\alpha_1$  is a constant, X is the vector of control variables, and  $\varepsilon_i$  the error term. FD includes:

private credit, domestic credit, stock market capitalisation, stock market value traded and stock market turnover ratio. HC are indicators of human capital discussed in the preceding section while X embodies creditor rights protection, financial openness, trade openness, legal origins, latitude and tropics.

Like in Ang & Kumar (2014), our main interest is to investigate if the HC coefficient is statistically and economically significant. While Eq. (1) is estimated using Ordinary Least Squares (OLS) using heteroscedasticity consistent standard errors, potential issues of endogeneity would addressed with an instrumental variable (IV) estimation technique which we describe in subsequent sections. In line with Ang & Kumar (2014), we employ private sector credit in baseline regressions and use domestic credit and three stock market performance dynamics for robustness checks.

#### 3. Estimation results

Table 1 below shows results of baseline regressions in Eq. (1). The first Column which shows univariate regressions confirms the expected positive correlation between intelligence and financial development. Hence intelligence is positively correlated with private sector credit. Columns 2 to Column 7 assess the relationship conditional on other covariates (control variables). The order of specification is consistent with Ang & Kumar (2014). From the results, the positive correlation is broadly confirmed across specifications in significance and magnitude of estimated human capital (or intelligence) coefficient. Accordingly, the estimated coefficients vary between 0.026 and 0.029 and the degree of adjustment (or explanatory power) of estimated coefficients also varies between 42.1% and 60.4%. It is logical to expect an increasing R<sup>2</sup> with more control variables into the specifications. Hence, we could infer from the baseline estimations that countries with high IQ are associated with higher degrees of financial development.

Most of the significant control variables have the expected signs. (1) Creditor rights protection has been associated with higher levels of financial development (La Porta et al., 1998). (2) Financial openness is intuitively expected to be positively linked with more availability of private credit because it offers possibilities of external financial flows. However, too much trade openness may interact with financial openness to negatively affect private domestic credit. The threshold value of the modifying variable (trade openness) which is 2.96 (0.089/0.030) is within range of 0.205 to 3.729 (Ang & Kumar, 2014, p. 54). This conclusion is broadly consistent with recent literature on the need for financial initial conditions for the benefits of openness (Asongu, 2014d). (3) Countries of British legal origin have been documented to have an edge over their French civil law counterparts (La Porta et al., 2008; Asongu, 2012b). (4) The predominantly Protestant British culture also played a substantial role in London's emergence as the financial centre of the world (Rosenberg & Birdzell, 1986)

Table 1. OLS estimates of the impact of intelligence on financial development

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Intelligence	0.028***	0.027***	0.027***	0.029***	0.026***	0.027***	0.027***
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.003)	(0.005)
Creditor Rights		0.061**					0.031
		(0.026)					(0.024)
Trade Openness			0.068				-0.001
			(0.090)				(0.111)
Financial Openness			0.089**				0.105**
			(0.035)				(0.043)
Trade Openness x Financial Openness			-0.030*				-0.027
			(0.017)				(0.023)
British Legal Origin				-0.109			0.271**
				(0.220)			(0.133)
French Legal Origin				-0.362*			0.108
				(0.215)			(0.110)
German Legal Origin				-0.400*			(dropped)
				(0.226)			
Scandinavian Legal Origin				(dropped)			0.045

							(0.279)
Latitude					0.248		-0.168
					(0.248)		(0.279)
Tropics					0.023		-0.149
					(0.076)		(0.111)
Fraction Catholic						0.095	0.143
						(0.114)	(0.119)
Fraction Muslim						-0.004	-0.015
						(0.099)	(0.119)
Fraction Protestants						0.521***	0.454*
						(0.195)	(0.261)
_cons	-1.876***	-1.864***	-1.987***	-1.634***	-1.757***	-1.868***	-0.112***
	(0.212)	(0.212)	(0.232)	(0.362)	(0.265)	(0.223)	(0.401)
Number of observations	168	168	160	167	155	166	147
R2	0.421	0.438	0.496	0.498	0.419	0.473	0.604

note: .01 - \*\*\*; .05 - \*\*; .1 - \*;

Notes: The dependent variable is private credit to GDP, averaged over the period 2000–2010. Figures in parentheses are robust standard errors.

Dropped: Not involved in the specifications due to issues of multicollinearity and overparameterization.

#### 4. Robustness checks

In Section 4, several robustness checks are performed on the baseline specification in Column 7 of Table 1. In the checks, alternative financial development measurements are used with different indicators of human capital. Concretely, the robustness checks entail: the use of alternative measurements of cognitive human capital (cognitive ability and cognitive skills) in Section 4.1; alternative indicators of financial development (domestic credit and three stock market performance dynamics) in Section 4.2; controlling for other effects (Section 4.3) and exclusion of continents (Section 4.4).

#### 4.1 Alternatives measures of cognitive human capital

Cognitive human capital has been measured in different ways in the human capital literature. As discussed in the data section, the current measurement has experienced an evolution. While that of Rindermann (2007b) proposed a measurement of *cognitive ability*, Hanushek & Woessmann (2009) have suggested an appreciation of *cognitive skills*. We exploit these

indicators to confirm the baseline findings in Table 1. The results broadly confirm the baseline findings on a positive correlation between cognitive human capital and financial development. It is also interesting to note that the variable from Rindermann (2007b) produces findings that are more consistent with those in Table 1. On the other hand, though with a lower level of significance, that of Hanushek & Woessmann (2009) substantially deviates in terms of magnitude. Two inferences are established. (1) *Cognitive ability* is more closely related to IQ in the appreciation of the correlation between human capital and financial development. (2) *Cognitive skills* potentially drive more financial development than *cognitive ability*.

Table 2. Alternatives measures of cognitive human capital

	(1)	(2)
Cognitive Ability	0.020***	
	(0.003)	
Cognitive skill		0.384**
		(0.185)
_cons	-1.343***	-0.806
	(0.308)	(0.809)
Number of observations	149	70
R2	0.601	0.511

note: .01 - \*\*\*; .05 - \*\*; .1 - \*;

A constant and all control variables (i.e., creditor rights, trade openness, financial openness, trade openness x financial openness, legal origins dummies, geographic variables and religion variables) used in Tables 1 are included in the estimations but the results are not reported to conserve space. Figures in parentheses are robust standard errors.

#### 4.2 Alternative indicators of financial development

In Table 3 below, we employ the alternative measurements of financial development discussed in the model specification section for further robustness purposes. These include: one measurement of financial intermediary development and three indicators of stock market performance. The resulting findings confirm the direction of the underlying correlation and further reveal that irrespective of the measurement of financial development employed, the

sensitivity of intelligence is almost the same. This is essentially because magnitudes of the estimated coefficients are broadly consistent across specifications.

Table 3.Alternative measures of financial development

	Domestic credit/GDP	Stock market capitalization/GDP	Stock market value traded /GDP	Stock market turnover ratio
Intelligence	0.029***	0.027***	0.034***	0.029***
	(0.006)	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.008)
_cons	-2.148***	-2.007***	-2.904***	-2.485***
	(0.511)	(0.683)	(0.910)	(0.825)
Number of observations	147	112	110	109
R2	0.518	0.417	0.539	0.431

note: .01 - \*\*\*; .05 - \*\*; .1 \*;

A constant and all control variables (i.e., creditor rights, trade openness, financial openness, trade openness x financial openness, legal origins dummies, geographic variables and religion variables) used in Tables 1 are included in the estimations but the results are not reported to conserve space. Figures in parentheses are robust standard errors.

#### 4.3. Controlling for other effects

In Table 4 below, we control for other effects to confirm the baseline findings. Notably, we add dimensions of: social capital, institutions, ethic fragmentation, income and continents. The definitions of these variables and their corresponding sources are provided in the Appendix. In broad terms, these additional variables can be considered as controlling for the failure to take into account the unobserved heterogeneity in baseline regressions.

We provide some justifications for the choice of additional control variables. Guiso et al. (2004) accord social capital some major role in financial development. The role of institutions has been investigated by many authors, inter alia: Girma & Shortland (2008). Ethnic diversity has been documented to substantially impair financial development (Easterly & Levine, 2003; Beck et al., 2003). The wealth of nations also fundamentally influences the level of financial development (Robinson, 1952; Ang & Kumar, 2014). Last, continent

specificities are also considered based on the intuition that some continents are less developed financially.

The underlying findings are broadly confirmed in terms of sign of correlation, though the magnitude of correlation is higher (lower) with the addition of social capital or ethnic fractionalization (institutions or income).

Most of the significant control variables have the expected signs. Accordingly, social capital, institutions and income-levels are positively correlated with private credit. This is consistent with the underpinnings from Guiso et al. (2004), Girma & Shortland (2008) and Ang & Kumar (2014) respectively.

**Table 4. Controlling for other effects** 

			Private credit/GDP		
	Add Social Capital	Add Institutions	Add Ethnic Fractionalization	Add Income	Add Continents
Intelligence	0.030***	0.016***	0.026***	0.018***	0.029***
	(0.005)	(0.004)	(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.006)
Social Capital	0.715**				
	(0.312)				
Institutions		0.065***			
		(0.010)			
Ethnic Fractionalization			-0.194		
			(0.159)		
Income				0.107**	
				(0.045)	
Europe					0.013
					(0.189)
Asia					-0.040
					(0.089)
Americas					-0.070
					(0.129)
Oceania					-0.128
					(0.197)
_cons	-2.403***	-1.220***	-1.866***	-2.072***	-2.218***
	(0.452)	(0.382)	(0.486)	(0.413)	(0.583)
Number of observations	105	147	146	146	147
R2	0.649	0.681	0.608	0.627	0.607

note: .01 - \*\*\*; .05 - \*\*; .1 - \*;

A constant and all control variables (i.e., creditor rights, trade openness, financial openness, trade openness x financial openness, legal origins dummies, geographic variables and religion variables) used in Tables 1 are

included in the estimations but the results are not reported to conserve space. Figures in parentheses are robust standard errors.

#### 4.4. Exclusion of continents

Table 5 below presents a further robustness check in which we exclude continents. The interest is to assess the behaviour of the variables of interest when a continent is excluded from the sample. This is also a means of controlling for extreme values that could influence the baseline findings. The relatively lower correlation coefficient observed when continents are excluded implies the excluded continent has a higher level of financial development. In the same line of intuition, a relatively higher correlation coefficient upon the exclusion of a continent means the excluded continent has a lower level of financial development. In addition to the baseline findings being confirmed in terms of magnitude of and significance in the correlation coefficients, the following is the order of continental importance in financial development in increasing magnitude: Africa, Americas, Oceania, Europe & Asia.

**Table 5. Exclusion of continents** 

	Exclusion Europe	Exclusion Africa	Exclusion Oceania	Exclusion Americas	Exclusion Asia
Intelligence	0.025***	0.031***	0.028***	0.030***	0.021***
	(0.005)	(0.008)	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.006)
_cons	-1.684***	-2.489***	-2.143***	-1.908***	-1.991***
	(0.511)	(0.783)	(0.418)	(0.398)	(0.475)
Number of observations	109	100	145	123	111
R2	0.511	0.631	0.594	0.630	0.668

note: .01 - \*\*\*; .05 - \*\*; .1 - \*;

A constant and all control variables (i.e., creditor rights, trade openness, financial openness, trade openness x financial openness, legal origins dummies, geographic variables and religion variables) used in Tables 1 are included in the estimations but the results are not reported to conserve space. Figures in parentheses are robust standard errors.

#### 5. Concluding implications

The purpose of this study has been to assess the relationship between intelligence and financial development in 123 countries using cross-sectional data between 2001-2010. Our findings broadly contradict the perspective that human development can be enhanced only at the expense financial development. Accordingly, the view of a trade-off substantially misstates the fundamental purpose of human development and at the same time underestimates the return to education, especially if it is construed as resulting in more risk-taking.

Human capital is measured in terms of IQ, cognitive ability & cognitive skills, while financial development is appreciated both from financial intermediary and stock market development perspectives. Short-term financial measures are private and domestic credits whereas long-term financial indicators include: stock market capitalization, stock market value traded and turnover ratio. The following findings have been established. (1) With respect to private credit, the positive correlations of IQ and cognitive ability are broadly similar while that of cognitive skills is substantially higher in terms of magnitude. (2) The correlation between intelligence and other financial variables are broadly similar. (3) The underlying findings are broadly confirmed in terms of sign of correlation, though the magnitude of correlation is higher (lower) with the addition of social capital or ethnic fractionalization (institutions or income). (4) When continents are excluded to control for extreme effects, baseline results are confirmed and the following on order of continental importance in financial development is established in increasing magnitude: Africa, Americas, Oceania, Europe & Asia.

The findings have strong implications for countries in Sub-Saharan Africa where low literacy rate influences people to hold wealth in physical assets as opposed to financial assets, hence, marring financial development. Moreover, as sustained by Hakeem & Oluitan (2012),

high literacy may push citizens to engage in financial transactions among themselves without the intermediary of the formal financial system. Therefore, high education is needed for stock market development. In the same vein, education also increases banking patronage.

It is also important to note that the type of education matter and financial development project also matters. For instance, many analysts think the Douala Stock Exchange of Cameroon has not picked-up well since its launch because the business community was not properly informed/educated of the benefits of financial markets before it was launched. Hence the stock market has failed to affect economic growth (Ake & Ognaligui, 2010). The above evidence is not definitive, fundamentally because it points to the associations between indicators of human capital and financial development, which are not causalities but correlations. Hence, assessing the causal nexuses with data endowed with more degrees of

freedom is an interesting future research direction.

## Appendix

# Appendix A. Data sources and summary statistics of variables

Table A1 Definitions and Sources of variables.

Variables	Definition	Source
Privatecredit	"Value of financial intermediaries credits to the private	World Bank WDI online
	sector as a share of GDP (excludes credit to the public sector	database; Beck et al. (2010)
	and credit issued by central and development banks),	
	average over 2000–2010"	
Domesticcredit	"Comprised of private credit as well as credit to the public	World Bank WDI online
	sector (central and local governments and public enterprise)	database; Beck et al. (2010)
	as a share of GDP, average over 2000–2010"	, , ,
Stock	"Value of listed companies shares on domestic exchanges as	World Bank WDI online
marketcapitalization	a share of GDP, average over 2000–2010"	database; Beck et al. (2010)
Total value of stock	"Total value of domestic shares traded (on domestic	World Bank WDI online
market Trade	exchanges) during the period as a share of GDP,	database; Beck et al. (2010)
market Trade	average over 2000–2010 »	dutubuse, Beek et ul. (2010)
Stock market turnover	"Ratio of trades in domestic shares divided by market	World Bank WDI online
ratio	capitalization, average over 2000–2010"	database; Beck et al. (2010)
Creditorrights	"An index of the protection of creditor rights in 2000. It	Djankov et al. (2007)
Cicultoffights	reflects the ease with which creditors can secure assets in the	Djankov et al. (2007)
	event of bankruptcy. It takes on discrete values of 0 (weak	
T 1	creditor rights) to 4 (strong creditor rights)"	W. 11D. 1 WDI . 1.
Trade openness	"Sum of exports and imports of goods and services as a	World Bank WDI online
TT' ' 1	share of GDP in 2000"	Database
Financial openness	"Sum of gross stock of foreign assets and liabilities as a	Lane et al. (2007)
T 10 ! !	share of GDP in 2000"	T. D. (2000)
LegalOrigins	"Dummy variable that takes a value of one if a country's	La Porta et al. (2008)
	legal system is of French, German or Scandinavian Civil	
	Law origin and zero otherwise"	
Latitude	"Absolute value of the latitude of a country, scaled between	La Porta et al. (1999)
	zero and one, where zero is for the location of the equator	
	and one is for the poles"	
Tropics	"The percentage of land area classified as tropical and	Gallup et al. (1999)
	subtropical based on the Koeppen-Geiger system"	
Religion variables	"A set of three variables that identifies the percentage of a	La Porta et al. (1999)
	country's population in the 1980s that follows Catholic,	
	Muslim and Other religion"	
EthnicFractionalization	"An index of ethnic fractionalization, constructed as one	Alesina et al. (2003)
	minus the Herfindahl index of the share of the largest ethnic	
	groups. It reflects the probability that two individuals,	
	selected at random from a country's population, will belong	
	to different ethnic groups. The index ranges from 0 to 1	
	where the higher the value the greater the fractionalization in	
	a country"	
InstitutionalQuality	"An overall indicator of institutional quality measured as the	Kaufmann et al. (2010)
~ · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	sum of the six sub-indices for 2000 from World Bank	(2010)
	Governance Indicators (WBGI): voice and accountability,	
	political stability and absence of violence, government	
	effectiveness, regulatory quality, rule of law, and control of	
	corruption. Countries with higher values on this index have	
	institutions of greater quality"	
Social Capital	"Data on trust between individuals in a given country.	Bjørnskov (2008)
Social Capital	Measured by taking the percentage of a population that	Djørnskov (2000)
	vicusured by taking the percentage of a population that	4.6

answers 'Yes' to the World Value Survey (WVS) question 'In general, do you think that most people can be trusted?', supplemented by data from the Danish Social Capital Project, the Latinobarometro and the Afrobarometer"

Intelligence

Meisenberg and Lynn (2011)

#### References

Agbloyor, E. K., Abor, J., Adjasi, K. D., & Yawson, A., (2015). "Private Capital Flows and Economic Growth in Africa: The Role of Domestic Financial Markets", *Journal of International Money and Finance*: Forthcoming.

Ake, B., & Ognaligui, R. W., (2010) "Financial Stock Market and Economic Growth in Developing Countries: The Case of Douala Stock Exchange in Cameroon", *International Journal of Business and Management*, 5(5), pp. 82-88.

Alesina, A., Devleeschauwer, A., Easterly, W., Kurlat, S., & Wacziarg, R. (2003). "Fractionalization". *Journal of Economic Growth* 8, pp. 155–194.

Ang, J. B., & Kumar, S., (2014). "Financial development and barriers to the cross-border diffusion of financial innovation", *Journal of Banking and Finance*, 39 (2014), pp. 43-56.

Asongu, S. A. (2012a). "Government Quality Determinant of Stock Market Performance in African Countries", *Journal of African Business*, 13 (3), pp.183-199.

Asongu, S. A., (2012b). "Law and finance in Africa", *Brussels Economic Review*, 55, (4), pp. 385-408.

Asongu, S. A., (2015a). "Finance and growth: New evidence from Meta Analysis", *Managerial Finance*, 41(6): Forthcoming.

Asongu, S. A., (2015b). "Financial sector competition and knowledge economy: evidence from SSA and MENA countries", Journal of the Knowledge Economy <a href="http://link.springer.com/article/10.1007%2Fs13132-012-0141-4">http://link.springer.com/article/10.1007%2Fs13132-012-0141-4</a>

Asongu, S. A., (2013a). "The 'Knowledge Economy'-finance nexus: how do IPRs matter in SSA and MENA countries?", *Economics Bulletin*, 33(1), pp. 78-94.

Asongu, S. A., (2013b). "Real and monetary policy convergence: EMU crisis to the CFA zone", *Journal of Financial Economic Policy*, 5,(1), pp. 20-38.

Asongu, S. A., (2013c). "African Stock Market Performance Dynamics: A Multidimensional Convergence Assessment", *Journal of African Business*, 14, (3), pp. 186-201

- Asongu, S. A., (2014a). "How Would Monetary Policy Matter In The Proposed African Monetary Unions? Evidence From Output And Prices", *African Finance Journal*, 16(2), pp. 34-63.
- Asongu, S. A., (2014b). "The "knowledge economy"—finance nexus in SSA and MENA countries", *International Journal of Islamic and Middle Eastern Finance and Management*, 7(2), pp. 200-213.
- Asongu, S. A., (2014c). "Knowledge Economy and Financial Sector Competition in African Countries", *African Development Review*, 26, (2), pp. 333-346.
- Asongu, S. A., (2014d). "Financial development dynamic thresholds of financial globalization: Evidence from Africa", *Journal of Economic Studies*, 41, (2), pp.166-195
- Baltagi, B. H., Demetriades, P., & Law, S. H. (2009). "Financial development and openness: evidence from panel data". *Journal of Development Economics* 89, pp. 285–296.
- Beck, T., Demirguc-Kunt, A., Levine, R., (2003). "Law, endowments, and finance". *Journal of Financial Economics* 70, pp. 137–181.
- Beck, T., Demirgüç-Kunt, A., & Levine, R., (2010). "Financial institutions and markets across countries and over time: the updated financial development and structure database". *World Bank Economic Review* 24, 77–92.
- Beck, T., Levine, R. & Loayza, N., (2000). "Finance and the sources of growth". *Journal of Financial Economics* 58, pp. 261–300.
- Benhabib, J., & Spiegel, M., (1994). "The Role of Human Capital in Economic Development: Evidence from Aggregate Cross-Country Data". *Journal of Monetary Economics* 34, pp. 143–173.
- Bernheim, B. D., Garrett, D. M. & Maki, D.M., (1997). "Education and savings: the long-term effects of high school curriculum mandates". Mimeo.
- Bjørnskov, C., (2008)." Social trust and fractionalization: a possible reinterpretation". *European Sociological Review* 24, pp. 271–283.
- Chapili, J., (2013). "Monetary Policy, Foreign Exchange Intervention and Exchange Rate Volatility in Zambia", *African Finance Journal*, 15(1), pp. 36-55.
- Cohen, D. &Soto, M., (2007). "Growth and Human Capital: Good Data, Good Results". *Journal of Economic Growth*, 12, pp. 51-76.
- De Gregorio, J., (1996). "Borrowing Constraints, Human Capital Accumulation and Growth". *Journal of Monetary Economics*, 37, pp. 49-71.
- De la Fuente, A., & Doménech, R., (2006). "Human Capital in Growth Regressions: How

Much Difference Does Data Quality Make?" *Journal of the European Economic Association* 4, pp. 1-36.

Djankov, S., McLiesh, C., & Shleifer, A., (2007). "Private credit in 129 countries". *Journal of Financial Economics* 84, pp. 299–329.

Evans, D., Green, C. & Murinde, V., (2002). "Human Capital and Financial Development in Economic Growth: New Evidence Using the Translog Production Function". *International Journal of Finance and Economics*, 7, pp.123-140.

Gallup, J.L., Sachs, J.D., & Mellinger, A., (1999. "Geography and Economic Development". Center for International Development (Harvard University), Working Papers No.1.

Girma, S., Shortland, A., (2008). "The political economy of financial development". *Oxford Economic Papers* 60, pp. 567–596.

Guiso, L., Sapienza, P., & Zingales, L., (2004). "The role of social capital in financial development". *American Economic Review* 94, pp. 526–556.

Hanushek, E. A., & Kimko, D. D., (2000). "Schooling, Labor-Force Quality, and the Growth of Nations". *American Economic Review*, 90, pp. 1184-1208.

Hanushek, E. A., & Woessmann, L., (2008). "The Role of Cognitive Skills in Economic Development". *Journal of Economic Literature*, 46(3), pp. 607-668.

Hanushek, E. A. & Woessmann, L., (2009). "Do better schools lead to more growth? Cognitive skills, economic outcomes, and causation". *IZA Discussion Papers* No. 4575.

Hakeem, M., & Oluitan, O., (2012). "Financial Development and Human Capital in South Africa: A Time-Series Approach", *Research in Applied Economics*, 4(3), pp. 18-38.

Jones, G., & Podemska, M., (2010). "IQ in the utility function: Cognitive skills, time preference, and cross-country differences in savings rates". Retrieved 17 Dec. 2010 from http://mason.gmu.edu/~gjonesb/IQsavings.pdf

Jones, G., &Schneider, W. J., (2006). "Intelligence, human capital, and economic growth: A Bayesian Averaging of Classical Estimates (BACE) approach". *Journal of Economic Growth*, 11, pp. 71-93.

Kalonda-Kanyama I., & Kodila-Tedika, O., (2012). "Quality of Institutions: Does Intelligence Matter?", *Working Papers* 308. Economic Research Southern Africa.

Kaufmann, D., Kraay, A., Mastruzzi, M., (2010). "The Worldwide Governance Indicators: Methodology and Analytical Issues". *Policy Research Working Paper Series* 5430, The World Bank

Kodila-Tedika, O., (2014), "Governance and Intelligence: Empirical Analysis from African Data", *Journal of African Development*, 16(1), pp. 83-97.

Kodila-Tedika, O., & Bolito-Losembe, R., (2014). "Poverty and Intelligence: Evidence Using Quantile Regression", *EconomiicResearrchGuarrdiian*, (1), pp. 25-32.

Kodila-Tedika, O., & Mutascu, M., (2014). "Tax Revenues and Intelligence: Cross-Sectional Evidence". *MPRA Paper 57581*, University Library of Munich, Germany.

La Porta, R., Florencio, L.-d.-S., Shleifer, A., & Vishny, R. W., (1997). "Legal determinants of external finance". *Journal of Finance* 52, pp. 1131–1150.

La Porta, R., Florencio, L.-d.-S., Shleifer, A., & Vishny, R. W., (1998). "Law and finance" *Journal of Political Economy* 106, pp. 1113–1155.

La Porta, R., Lopez-de-Silanes, F., Shleifer, A., 2008. "The economic consequences of legal origins". *Journal of Economic Literature* 46, 285–332.

La Porta, R., Lopez-de-Silanes, F., Shleifer, A., Vishny, R., (1999). "The quality of government". *Journal of Law, Economics and Organization* 15, pp. 222–279.

Lane, P. R., Milesi-Ferretti, & Maria, G., (2007). "The external wealth of nations market: Revised and extended estimates of foreign assets and liabilities, 1970–2004". *Journal of International Economics* 73, 223–250.

Lynn, R., & Vanhanen, T., (2001). "National IQ and economic development: a study of eighty-one nations". *Mankind Quarterly* 41, pp. 415-435.

Lynn, R., & Vanhanen, T., (2002). IQ and the Wealth of Nations. Westport CT: Praeger.

Lynn, R., & Vanhanen, T., (2006). *IQ and Global Inequality*. Augusta GA: Washington Summit.

Lynn, R., & Vanhanen, T., (2012a). *Intelligence.A Unifying Construct for the Social Sciences*. London: Ulster Institute.

Lynn, R., & Vanhanen, T. (2012b). National IQs: A review of their educational, cognitive, economic, political, demographic, sociological, epidemiological, geographic and climatic correlates. *Intelligence*, <a href="http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.intell.2011.11.004">http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.intell.2011.11.004</a>.

Mankiw, G. Romer, D., & Weil, D., (1992). "A contribution to the empirics of growth." *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 107, pp. 407–437.

Meisenberg, G., & Lynn, R., (2011). "Intelligence: A measure of human capital in nations". *Journal of Social, Political and Economic Studies*, 36(4), pp. 421-454.

Meisenberg, G., & Lynn, R., (2012). "Cognitive Human Capital and Economic Growth: Defining the Causal Paths". *Journal of Social, Political and Economic Studies*, 37(4), pp. 141-179.

Muchai, J., (2013). "Assessing The Finance-Growth Channel in Kenya: A VAR Analysis", *African Finance Journal*, 15(2), pp. 66-84.

Outreville, J., (1999). "Financial Development, Human Capital and Political Stability". *UNCTAD Discussion Paper* No 142.

Potrafke, N., (2012). "Intelligence and corruption". Economics Letters, 114,109-112.

Ram, R., (2007). "IQ and economic growth: Further augmentation of Mankiw-Romer-Weil model". *Economics Letters*, 94, 7-11.

Rindermann, H., (2007a). "Intelligence, cognitive abilities, human capital, and rationality at different levels". *PsychologischeRundschau*, 58(2), 137-145.

Rindermann, H. (2007b). "The g-factor of international cognitive ability comparisons: The homogeneity of results in PISA, TIMSS, PIRLS and IQ-tests across nations". *European Journal of Personality*, 21, pp. 667-706.

Rindermann, H., Kodila-Tedika, O., & Christainsen, G., (2014). "Cognitive capital, governance, and the wealth of nations". *MPRA Paper 57563*, University Library of Munich, Germany.

Robinson, J., (1952). The Rate of Interest and Other Essays. Macmillan, London.

Rosenberg, N., & Birdzell, L., (1986). How The West Grew Rich: The Economic Transformation of The Industrial World. Basic Books, New York.

Stulz, R.M., & Williamson, R., (2003). "Culture, openness, and finance". *Journal of Financial Economics* 70, pp. 313–349.

Ukenna, S., Ijeoma, N., Anionwu, C., & Olise, M., (2010). "Effect of Investment in Human Capital Development on Organisational Performance: Empirical Examination of the Perception of Small Business Owners in Nigeria". *European Journal of Economics, Finance and Administrative Sciences*, Issue 26.

Wang, V., Yun, H-C., & Lee S-H., (2012). "An Empirical Study of Taiwan's 1978-2006 Financial Development, Export, Saving and Economic Growth", *African Finance Journal*, 14(1), pp. 87-101.

Weede, E., & Kämpf, S., (2002). "The impact of intelligence and institutional improvements on economic growth". *Kyklos*, 55, pp. 361-380.